

# Notes

## I. THE PUZZLE OF REFORM

1. Among a range of important multicountry studies on civil service reform in Africa, see for example: Ladipo Adamolekun, ed., *Public Administration in Africa: Main Issues and Selected Country Studies* (Westview Press, 1999); Brian Levy and Sahr Kpundeh, eds., *Building State Capacity in Africa: New Approaches, Emerging Lessons* (World Bank Institute, 2004); Joseph R. A. Ayee, *Reforming the African Public Sector: Retrospect and Prospects* (CODESRIA Green Book, 2008); Gelase Mutahaba, ed., “Human Resource Management in African Public Sector: Current State and Future Direction” (African Public Sector Human Resource Managers’ Network, 2013); Benon C. Basheka and Lukamba-Muhiya Tshombe, *New Public Management in Africa: Emerging Issues and Lessons* (Routledge, 2017); as well as numerous other studies cited elsewhere in this book.
2. I am grateful for Henry for describing his own impossibly ambitious but important project in these terms and for allowing me to borrow the phrase.
3. A full review of this vast literature is beyond the scope of this book, but see, for example, recent reviews by: Frederico Finan et al., “The Personnel Economics of the Developing State,” in *Handbook of Economic Field Experiments*, ed. Abhijit V. Banerjee and Esther Duflo (Elsevier, 2017), 467–514; Thomas Pepinsky et al., “Bureaucracy and Service Delivery,” *Annual Review of Political Science* 20 (2017): 249–68; Timothy Besley et al., “Bureaucracy and Development,” *Annual Review of Economics* 14 (2022): 397–424. For a focused application of this literature to the challenges of bureaucratic reform in a particular context, see Karthik Muralidharan, *Accelerating India’s Development: A State-Led Roadmap for Effective Governance* (Penguin, 2024).
4. See, for example, Imran Rasul et al., “Management, Organizational Performance, and Task Clarity: Evidence from Ghana’s Civil Service,” *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 31, no. 2 (2021): 259–77; Martin J. Williams and Liah Yecaló-Teclé, “Innovation, Voice, and Hierarchy in the Civil Service: Evidence from Ghana’s Civil Service,” *Governance* 33, no. 4 (2020): 789–807; Margherita Fornasari et al., “Ideas Generation in Hierarchical Bureaucracies: Evidence from a Field Experiment and Qualitative Data” (Working paper, June 2025).
5. See, for example, on measuring performance see: Colin Talbot, *Theories of Performance: Organizational and Service Improvement in the Public Domain* (Oxford University Press, 2010). On multiple competing goals: James Q. Wilson, *Bureaucracy* (Basic Books, 1989); Avinash Dixit, “Incentives and Organizations in the Public Sector: An Interpretative Review,” *Journal of Human Resources* 37, no. 4

- (2002): 696–727; Young Han Chun and Hal G. Rainey, “Goal Ambiguity and Organizational Performance in U.S. Federal Agencies,” *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 15 (2005): 529–57. On the differential measurability and joint production of bureaucratic tasks: Imran Rasul and Daniel Rogger, “Management of Bureaucrats and Public Service Delivery: Evidence from the Nigerian Civil Service,” *Economic Journal* 128, no. 608 (2018): 413–46; Rasul et al., “Management, Organizational Performance, and Task Clarity”; Muhammad Yasir Khan, “Mission Motivation and Public Sector Performance: Experimental Evidence from Pakistan,” (Mimeo, September 14, 2023). For more generalized discussions on methodological challenges of evaluating systemic reforms: Jonathan Boston, “The Challenge of Evaluating Systemic Change: The Case of Public Management Reform,” *International Public Management Journal* 3 (2000): 23–46; Yuen Yuen Ang, *How China Escaped the Poverty Trap* (Cornell University Press, 2017).
6. “On the macrohistorical determinants of governance quality, see for example: Timothy Besley and Torsten Persson, *Pillars of Prosperity: The Political Economics of Development Clusters* (Princeton University Press, 2011); Daron Acemoglu and James A. Robinson, *Why Nations Fail: The Origins of Power, Prosperity, and Poverty* (Crown, 2012); Martha Wilfahrt, *Precolonial Legacies in Postcolonial Politics Representation and Redistribution in Decentralized West Africa* (Cambridge University Press, 2021). On geographical determinants of state capacity: Jeffrey Herbst, *States and Power in Africa: Comparative Lessons in Authority and Control* (Princeton University Press, 2000). On the impact of political economy context on reform: Brian Levy, *Working with the Grain: Integrating Governance and Growth in Development Strategies* (Oxford University Press, 2014); Daniel Appiah and Abdul-Gafaru Abdulai, “Competitive Clientelism and the Politics of Core Public Sector Reform in Ghana,” ESID Working Paper 82 (March 2017); Sam Hickey and Naomi Hossain, eds., *The Politics of Education in Developing Countries: From Schooling to Learning* (Oxford University Press, 2019).
  7. This is referred to as research about “the effects of causes” and the “causes of effects,” respectively, in Gary Goertz and James Mahoney, *A Tale of Two Cultures: Qualitative and Quantitative Research in the Social Sciences* (Princeton University Press, 2012).
  8. The distinction between core and frontline civil servants is blurry both conceptually and in practice. There is also significant variation across countries in the extent to which frontline staff like nurses or teachers are part of the same organizational structures and personnel management systems as administrators or technical experts sitting in ministry headquarters, and, hence, variation in whether such frontline staff are covered by the reforms I study. I try as much as possible to maintain the conceptual distinction in my data collection and analysis, although official documents and interviewees do not always make this same distinction. This notwithstanding, my analysis should be read as applying directly to reform of the core civil service only.
  9. See Talbot, *Theories of Performance*, for a discussion on debates around the definition of performance and the nuances of conceptualizing it in civil service organizations.
  10. By “whole civil service” I mean the whole of the core civil service, subject to the conceptual and practical blurriness discussed above.
  11. This distinction builds on the concept of verifiability, introduced by Oliver Williamson, *The Economic Institutions of Capitalism* (Free Press, 1985) and subsequently foundational to much of contract theory and organizational economics, and adapts it to a public sector bureaucracy context in which the undertaking actions and tasks is a more suitable basis for analysis of performance than transactions (to which the terminology was originally applied).
  12. On mimetic pressures and the transplantation of models that are inappropriate fits for context, see for example (within a large literature): Matt Andrews, *The Limits of Institutional Reform in Development: Changing Rules for Realistic Solutions* (Cambridge University Press, 2013); Matt Andrews et al., *Building State Capability: Evidence, Analysis, Action* (Oxford University Press, 2017); Rosina Foli and Frank L. K. Ohemeng, “The Role and Impact of International Bureaucrats in Policymaking in Africa,” in *Routledge Handbook of Public Policy in Africa*, ed. Gedion Onyango (Routledge, 2021).

- 117–27. On political resistance to reform, see for example: Nicholas van de Walle, *African Economies and the Politics of Permanent Crisis* (Cambridge University Press, 2001); Sylvester Odhiambo Obong'o, "Political Influence, Appointments and Public Sector Management Reform In Kenya, 1963–2014" (PhD diss., University of Newcastle, Australia, 2015).
13. On the political economy of reform, see for example (in addition to works cited earlier): Frank L. Kwaku Ohemeng and Felix K. Anebo, "The Politics of Administrative Reforms in Ghana: Perspectives from Path Dependency and Punctuated Equilibrium Theories," *International Journal of Public Administration* 35, no. 3 (2012): 161–76; Vivek Srivastava and Marco Larizza, "Working with the Grain for Reforming the Public Service: A Live Example from Sierra Leone," *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 79, no. 3 (2013): 458–85; Mai Hassan and Ahmed Kodouda, "Dismantling Old—or Forging New—Clientelistic Ties? Sudan's Civil Service Reform After Uprising" (Mimeo, 2022).
14. On bottom-up reform approaches, see for example: Charles Polidano, "Why Civil Service Reforms Fail," *Public Management Review* 3, no. 3 (2001): 345–61; Christopher Pollitt and Geert Bouckaert, *Public Management Reform: A Comparative Analysis* (Oxford University Press, 2004); Ayece, *Reforming the African Public Sector*; Willy McCourt, "Models of Public Service Reform: A Problem-Solving Approach," World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 6428 (2013). On relational contracts approaches to management practices: Robert Gibbons and Rebecca Henderson, "Relational Contracts and Organizational Capabilities," *Organization Science* 23, no. 5 (2012): 1350–64; James N. Baron and David M. Kreps, "Employment as an Economic and Social Relationship," in *The Handbook of Organizational Economics*, ed. Robert Gibbons and John Roberts (Princeton University Press, 2013), 315–41. On backward mapping: Richard F. Elmore, "Backward Mapping: Implementation Research and Policy Decisions," *Political Science Quarterly* 94, no. 4 (1979): 601–16. On continuous improvement: Donald M. Berwick, "Continuous Improvement as an Ideal in Health Care," *New England Journal of Medicine* 320, no. 1 (1989): 53–56; Nadia Bhuiyan and Amit Baghel, "An Overview of Continuous Improvement: From the Past to the Present," *Management Decision* 43, no. 5 (2005): 761–771; Maxwell M. Yurkofsky et al., "Research on Continuous Improvement: Exploring the Complexities of Managing Educational Change," *Review of Research in Education* 44 (2020): 403–33; Anthony S. Bryk et al., *How a City Learned to Improve Its Schools* (Harvard University Press, 2023). On process approaches to organizational change: Andrew M. Pettigrew, "Longitudinal Field Research on Change: Theory and Practice," *Organization Science* 1, no. 3 (1990): 267–92; Wanda J. Orlikowski, "Improvising Organizational Transformation over Time: A Situated Change Perspective," *Information Systems Research* 7, no. 1 (1996): 63–92; Martha S. Feldman, "Organizational Routines as a Source of Continuous Change," *Organization Science* 11, no. 6 (2000): 611–29; Haridimos Tsoukas and Robert Chia, "On Organizational Becoming: Rethinking Organizational Change," *Organization Science* 13, no. 5 (2002): 567–82. On muddling and problem-solving: Charles E. Lindblom, "The Science of 'Muddling Through,'" *Public Administration Review* 19, no. 2 (1959): 79–88; Hugh Hecllo, *Modern Social Politics in Britain and Sweden* (Yale University Press, 1974); Andrews, *Limits of Institutional Reform*; Katherine Bersch, *When Democracies Deliver: Governance Reform in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 2019). On bureaucratic cultures, autonomy, and organizational effectiveness: Merilee Grindle, "Divergent Cultures? When Public Organizations Perform Well in Developing Countries," *World Development* 25 (1997): 481–95; Judith Tendler, *Good Government in the Tropics* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997); David Leonard, "Pockets of Effective Agencies in Weak Governance States: Where Are They Likely and Why Does It Matter?" *Public Administration and Development* 30 (2010): 91–101; Michael Roll, ed., *The Politics of Public Sector Performance: Pockets of Effectiveness in Developing Countries* (Routledge, 2013); Dan Honig, *Navigation by Judgment: Why and When Top-Down Management of Foreign Aid Doesn't Work* (Oxford University Press, 2018); Erin McDonnell, *Patchwork Leviathan: Pockets of Bureaucratic Effectiveness in Developing States* (Princeton University Press, 2020); Akshay Mangla, *Making*

*Bureaucracy Work: Norms, Education and Public Service Delivery in Rural India* (Cambridge University Press, 2022). On agile government: Ines Mergel et al., “Agile: A New Way of Governing,” *Public Administration Review* 18, no. 1 (2020): 161–65. On complexity and problem-driven iterative adaptation: Tunji Olaopa, *Managing Complex Reforms: A Public Sector Respective* (Bookcraft, 2011); Andrews et al., *Building State Capability*. Chapter 7 discusses these areas of literature more extensively.

## 2. THEORY AND EVIDENCE ON ORGANIZATIONAL PERFORMANCE

1. For an excellent review and discussion, see: Colin Talbot, *Theories of Performance: Organizational and Service Improvement in the Public Domain* (Oxford University Press, 2010).
2. Of course, issues can arise from the tensions among bureaucracies’ multiple goals or between goals and rules. As these are the focus of a great deal of existing research and are not core to my study, I do not discuss these in the abstract here but instead discuss them as they arise in the context of specific reforms in the subsequent empirical parts of the book.
3. See, for example, Oliver Williamson, *The Economic Institutions of Capitalism* (Free Press, 1985); George P. Baker, “Incentive Contracts and Performance Measurement,” *Journal of Political Economy* 100, no. 3 (1992): 598–614; George P. Baker et al., “Relational Contracts and the Theory of the Firm,” *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 117, no. 1 (2002): 39–84.
4. James Q. Wilson. *Bureaucracy* (Basic Books, 1989).
5. Lant Pritchett, and Michael Woolcock, “Solutions When the Solution Is the Problem: Arraying the Disarray in Development,” *World Development* 32, no. 2 (2004): 191–212; Matt Andrews et al., *Building State Capability: Evidence, Analysis, Action* (Oxford University Press, 2017).
6. See, for example, Herbert Kaufmann, *The Forest Ranger: A Study in Administrative Behavior* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 1960); Wilson, *Bureaucracy*; e.g., Canice Prendergast, “The Limits of Bureaucratic Efficiency,” *Journal of Political Economy* 111, no. 5 (2003): 929–58; Young Han Chun and Hal G. Rainey, “Goal Ambiguity and Organizational Performance in U.S. Federal Agencies,” *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 15 (2005): 529–57.
7. See, for example, Avinash Dixit, “Incentives and Organizations in the Public Sector: An Interpretative Review,” *Journal of Human Resources* 37, no. 4 (2002): 696–727; Muhammad Yasir Khan, “Mission Motivation and Public Sector Performance: Experimental Evidence from Pakistan” (Mimeo, September 14, 2023).
8. See, for example, Gwyn Bevan, and Christopher Hood, “What’s Measured Is What Matters: Targets and Gaming in the English Health Care System,” *Public Administration* 84, no. 3 (2006): 517–38; Steven Kelman and John N. Friedman, “Performance Improvement and Performance Dysfunction: An Empirical Examination of Distortionary Impacts of the Emergency Room Wait-Time Target in the English National Health Service,” *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 19 (2009): 917–46.
9. This discussion is based on Imran Rasul et al., “Management, Organizational Performance, and Task Clarity: Evidence from Ghana’s Civil Service,” *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 31, no. 2 (2021): 259–277. For a broader methodological discussion, see Imran Rasul et al., “Government Analytics Using Data on Task and Project Completion,” in *The Government Analytics Handbook: Leveraging Data to Strengthen Public Administration*, ed. Daniel Rogger and Christian Schuster (World Bank, 2023), 365–83.
10. Rasul et al., “Management, Organizational Performance, and Task Clarity,” 266.
11. Rasul et al., “Management, Organizational Performance, and Task Clarity,” 260, 266.

12. This and other sections draw in part on material from: Martin J. Williams, "From Institutions to Organizations: Management and Informality in Ghana's Bureaucracies," Working paper (London School of Economics and Political Science, September 9, 2015); and Martin J. Williams, "There Is More Than One 'Public Sector Way': The Diversity of Management Practices in Ghana's Government," Policy brief (November 2013).
13. The Office of the Head of Civil Service and Public Services Commission in Ghana are heavily involved in almost all human resources decisions pertaining to pay, promotion, hiring, and firing, including the definition of the staff appraisal process. Most of the organizations I interviewed were part of the civil service, while others were part of the public service but not civil service. For all intents and purposes the staff appraisal process was formally identical within the civil service and public service, although, in general, the public service organizations have a slightly higher degree of autonomy in making personnel decisions than the civil service organizations.
14. Justice N. Bawole et al., "Performance Appraisal or Praising Performance The Culture of Rhetoric in Performance Management in Ghana Civil Service," *International Journal of Public Administration* 36, no. 13 (2013): 953.
15. Frank L. Kwaku Ohemeng et al., "Performance Appraisal and Its Use for Individual and Organizational Improvement in the Civil Service of Ghana: The Case of Much Ado About Nothing?" *Public Administration and Development* 35 (2015): 179.
16. Within organizational economics, for example, see: Robert Gibbons and Rebecca Henderson, "Relational Contracts and Organizational Capabilities," *Organization Science* 23, no. 5 (2012): 1350–64; James N. Baron and David M. Kreps, "Employment as an Economic and Social Relationship," in *The Handbook of Organizational Economics*, ed. Robert Gibbons and John Roberts (Princeton University Press, 2013), 315–341.
17. See, for example, Douglass C. North, *Institutions, Institutional Change and Economic Performance* (Cambridge University Press, 1990); Peter Evans and James Rauch, "Bureaucracy and Growth: A Cross-National Analysis of the Effects of 'Weberian' State Structures on Economic Growth," *American Sociological Review* 64, no. 5 (1999): 748–65; Mushtaq H. Khan, "Political Settlements and the Governance of Growth-Enhancing Institutions" (Mimeo, 2010); Timothy Besley and Torsten Persson, *Pillars of Prosperity: The Political Economics of Development Clusters* (Princeton University Press, 2011); Daron Acemoglu and James A. Robinson, *Why Nations Fail: The Origins of Power, Prosperity, and Poverty* (Crown, 2012).
18. See, among many others, Nicholas Bloom and John Van Reenen, "Measuring and Explaining Management Practices Across Firms and Countries," *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 122 (2007): 1351–1408; Nicholas Bloom et al., "The Organization of Firms Across Countries," *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 127, no. 4 (2012): 1663–1705.
19. Following Bloom and Van Reenen, "Measuring and Explaining Management," these included: asking about de facto rather than de jure practices; scoring by the interviewer against an absolute scale with qualitative benchmarks rather than a relative, Likert-style scale; and beginning asking about each process with open, nonleading questions followed by probing follow-ups and requests for examples. See Williams, "From Institutions to Organizations," for additional details of data and methodology.
20. Practice-level scores were normalized first and averaged to compute organizational management scores, which were then renormalized for presentational purposes.
21. As Rasul et al., "Management, Organizational Performance, and Task Clarity," 265, describes, we matched the tasks listed in our reports to data to a subsample of tasks that had been audited by consultants commissioned by OHCS for another purpose. We were able to corroborate 94 percent of the reported completion levels from the reports we used, and the rare discrepancies were minor, suggesting that the data on task completion in the organizational self-reports was largely accurate.
22. Rasul et al., "Management, Organizational Performance, and Task Clarity," 265.

23. Imran Rasul and Daniel Rogger, "Management of Bureaucrats and Public Service Delivery: Evidence from the Nigerian Civil Service," *Economic Journal* 128, no. 608 (2018): 413–46.
24. Francis Owusu, "Differences in the Performance of Public Organisations in Ghana: Implications for Public-Sector Reform Policy," *Development Policy Review* 24, no. 6 (2006): 693–705.
25. Erin McDonnell, "Patchwork Leviathan: How Pockets of Bureaucratic Governance Flourish Within Institutionally Diverse Developing States," *American Sociological Review* 82, no. 3 (2017): 476–510; Erin McDonnell, *Patchwork Leviathan: Pockets of Bureaucratic Effectiveness in Developing States* (Princeton University Press, 2020).
26. See, for example, Merilee Grindle, "Divergent Cultures? When Public Organizations Perform Well in Developing Countries," *World Development* 25 (1997): 481–95; Judith Tendler, *Good Government in the Tropics* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997); David Leonard, "‘Pockets’ of Effective Agencies in Weak Governance States: Where Are They Likely and Why Does It Matter?" *Public Administration and Development* 30 (2010): 91–101; Michael Roll, ed., *The Politics of Public Sector Performance: Pockets of Effectiveness in Developing Countries* (Routledge, 2013).
27. McDonnell, *Patchwork Leviathan*, 20–21.
28. Daniel Gingerich, "Governance Indicators and the Level of Analysis Problem: Empirical Findings from South America," *British Journal of Political Science* 43, no. 3 (2013), 505–40; Katherine Bersch et al., "State Capacity, Bureaucratic Politicization, and Corruption in the Brazilian State," *Governance* 30, no. 1 (2016): 105–24.
29. Michael Carlos Best et al., "Individuals and Organizations as Sources of State Effectiveness," *American Economic Review* 113, no. 8 (2023): 2121–67.
30. Patricia W. Ingraham et al., *Government Performance: Why Management Matters* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003).
31. See, for example, Bloom and Van Reenen, "Measuring and Explaining Management"; Gibbons and Henderson, "Relational Contracts and Organizational Capabilities"; Chad Syverson, "What Determines Productivity?" *Journal of Economic Literature* 49, no. 2 (2011): 326–65.

### 3. WHAT DOES REFORM LOOK LIKE? MAPPING REFORM EFFORTS OVER TIME

1. World Bank, *Report and Recommendation of the President of the International Development Association to the Executive Directors on a Proposed Credit in the Amount Equivalent to US\$200 Million to the Republic of Zambia for a Privatization and Industrial Reform Adjustment Credit* (report P-5786-ZA, June 3, 1992), 6.
2. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report—Zambia—Economic and Social Adjustment Credit (Credit 2577-ZA)* (report 15837, June 28, 1996), 3. The PSRP also included a component on decentralization, which is beyond the scope of this book.
3. Interview, ZAM11.
4. Interview, Ndashe Yumba.
5. Interview, Moses Kondowe.
6. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (Ida-33290 Ppfi-Q1440 Ppfi-Q1441) on a Credit in the Amount of Sdr 20.4 Million (US\$28 Million Equivalent) to the Republic of Zambia for a Public Service Capacity Building Project in Support of the First Phase of the Public Service Capacity Building Program* (Report 34450, December 28, 2005), 9.
7. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (Ida-33290 Ppfi-Q1440 Ppfi-Q1441)*, 9.
8. Mike Stevens and Stefanie Teggemann, "Comparative Experience with Public Service Reform in Ghana, Tanzania, and Zambia," in *Building State Capacity in Africa: New Approaches, Emerging Lessons*, ed. Brian Levy and Sahr Kpundeh, 43–86 (World Bank Institute, 2004), 72.



9. Interview, Moses Kondowe.
10. Theodore R. Valentine, *A Medium-Term Strategy for Enhancing Pay and Conditions of Service in the Zambian Public Service* (Crown Consultants International, 2002), 92.
11. University of Zambia, *Report on The Public Service Reform Programme (PSRP) and the Public Service Capacity Building Programme (PSCAP) Impact Assessment*, April 15, 2005, quoted in Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance Management System Final Report* (Legend Consulting Services and Universalia, 2008), 3.
12. Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance Management System*, 25.
13. Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance Management System*, 27.
14. Interview, John Kasanga.
15. Valentine, *A Medium-Term Strategy*, 88.
16. Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance Management System*, 29.
17. Interview, GHA7.
18. I am grateful to Leonardo Arriola for suggesting that I include this figure.
19. The reform content tables in the appendix distinguish among reform episodes in a more aggregated way than the reform timelines, in order to avoid “double-counting” overlapping or linked efforts to introduce a particular type of reform. The figures for how many times countries tried to introduce different types of reforms are therefore not commensurable with the total number of reform efforts listed earlier in the chapter, which correspond to the number of discrete entries on the reform timelines.
20. Interview, William Kartey; Interview, GHA7; Joseph R. A. Ayee, “Civil Service Reform in Ghana: A Case Study of Contemporary Reform Problems in Africa,” *African Association of Political Science*, 6, no. 1 (2001), 1–41.
21. Government of Ghana, “Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme: The Way Forward” (pamphlet, n.d); Ayee, “Civil Service Reform in Ghana”; Stephen Adei and Yaw Boachie-Danquah, “The Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme (CSPIP) in Ghana: Lessons of Experience” (paper presented at the 24th AAPAM Annual Roundtable Conference on the African Public Service in the 21st Century—New Initiatives in Performance Management, November 25–29, 2002); Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena; Interview, William Kartey; Interview, GHA7. That said, some rank-and-file officers reported seeing little impact from these activities on their day-to-day work (Interview, GHA12), and Adei and Boachie-Danquah, “The Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme,” are strongly critical of CSPIP.
22. Interview, GHA7.
23. National Institutional Renewal Programme, *Annual Report for 1997* (NIRP Secretariat, Office of the President, Accra, 1997); National Institutional Renewal Programme, *Annual Report for 1998* (NIRP Secretariat, Office of the President, Accra, 1998).
24. Interview, William Kartey.
25. Stevens and Teggemann, “Comparative Experience with Public Service Reform,” 70.
26. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
27. Interview, GHA7.
28. Interview, Moses Kondowe.
29. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (Ida-33290 Ppfi-Q1440 Ppfi-Q1441)*, 9.
30. Interview, GHA2.
31. Interview, Kwame Adorbor.
32. See, among many others: Christopher Pollitt and Geert Bouckaert, *Public Management Reform: A Comparative Analysis* (Oxford University Press, 2004); John Halligan, *Reforming Public Management and Governance: Impact and Lessons from Anglophone Countries* (Edward Elgar, 2020).
33. Charles Polidano, “Why Civil Service Reforms Fail,” *Public Management Review* 3, no. 3 (2001): 346.
34. Mai Hassan, *Regime Threats and State Solutions: Bureaucratic Loyalty and Embeddedness in Kenya* (Cambridge University Press, 2020); Sylvester Odhiambo Obong’o, “Political Influence,

Appointments and Public Sector Management Reform In Kenya, 1963–2014” (PhD diss., University of Newcastle, Australia, 2015).

35. Daniel Appiah and Abdul-Gafaru Abdulai, “Competitive Clientelism and the Politics of Core Public Sector Reform in Ghana,” ESID Working Paper 82 (March 2017); Frank L. Kwaku Ohemeng and Felix K. Anebo, “The Politics of Administrative Reforms in Ghana: Perspectives from Path Dependency and Punctuated Equilibrium Theories,” *International Journal of Public Administration* 35, no. 3 (2012): 161–76.
36. République du Sénégal, “Rapport national sur la gouvernance au Senegal,” Secrétariat General de la Présidence de la République, Delegation a la Reforme de l’Etat et a l’Assistance Technique, Programme National de Bonne Gouvernance, 2011, 64; République du Sénégal, “Schema Directeur de Modernisation de l’Administration Publique (SDMAP) 2015–2022,” (presentation, Bureau Organisation et Méthodes, Présidence de la République, Secrétariat Général. n.d.), 10.
37. Reform start and end dates were coded as per the timelines in the appendix. Reform start or end dates that occur in the same year as an election are coded as zero. Since data is not always available on the exact month of start/end, some of the reforms coded as zero may have started before/ended after the election and thus would be assigned to different year bins if full data were available. Reforms that extended past 2019 were not assigned an end date, and reforms that started before the start of the democratic era in each country were excluded. In general, start dates for each reform are clear and easy to code, while coding end dates sometimes involved a judgment about when a reform ceased being active since many reforms are never formally terminated or repealed but rather cease being de facto relevant. In particular, some reforms (such as the passing of laws) by definition occur at single points in time and then remain in force indefinitely unless amended or repealed. On the timeline, such reforms are generally coded as lasting one year both for clarity and because the timeline represents reforms that are active at each point in time as *active reforms*, not necessarily which policies are in force at different points in time. Although assigning an end year to such reforms is an imperfect approach, the alternatives of excluding them altogether or coding them as active indefinitely would be more misleading. In any case, these challenges serve to reinforce the more important point that the boundaries of reforms are often blurry and ambiguous. I coded dates of elections as the years in which presidential elections actually took place in each country, including by-elections and delayed elections.
38. One might expect that government reforms may be more likely to conform to electoral cycles than donor-driven reforms, but excluding the thirty-one donor reforms identified later in this chapter does not change these general patterns.
39. Nicholas van de Walle, *African Economies and the Politics of Permanent Crisis* (Cambridge University Press, 2001).
40. Matt Andrews, *The Limits of Institutional Reform in Development: Changing Rules for Realistic Solutions* (Cambridge University Press, 2013), 215.
41. Rosina Foli and Frank L. K. Ohemeng, “The Role and Impact of International Bureaucrats in Policymaking in Africa,” in *Routledge Handbook of Public Policy in Africa*, ed. Gedion Onyango (Routledge, 2021), 117–27.
42. Mark T. Buntaine et al., “Aiming at the Wrong Targets: The Domestic Consequences of International Efforts to Build Institutions,” *International Studies Quarterly* 61 (2017): 471–88.
43. Tunji Olaopa. *The Nigerian Civil Service of the Future: A Prospective Analysis* (Bookcraft, 2014), 92.
44. See, for example: John Boli and George M. Thomas, eds., *Constructing World Culture: International Nongovernmental Organizations Since 1875* (Stanford University Press, 1999); Ngaire Woods, *The Globalizers: The IMF, the World Bank, and Their Borrowers* (Cornell University Press, 2014); Liam Swiss, *The Globalization of Foreign Aid: Developing Consensus* (Routledge, 2018).
45. There is some variation across countries and time in the extent to which donors were involved in reform efforts, which largely follows the expected pattern of donors being more involved during periods of fiscal stress and in countries with relatively less own-source revenue.
46. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena; Interview, GHA7.



47. Interview, ZAM11.
48. Interview, KEN2; Interview, Gemma Mbaya; Sylvester Odhiambo Obong’o, “Political Influence”; Chweya Ludeki, “Democratization and Civil Service Reform in Kenya” (PhD diss., Queen’s University, Kingston, Ontario, Canada, 2003).
49. Interview, Kithinji Kiragu.
50. Interview, KEN6.
51. Interview, GHA4.
52. Folashadé Soulé-Kohndou, “Bureaucratic Agency and Power Asymmetry in Benin-China Relations,” in *New Directions in Africa-China Studies*, ed. Chris Alden and Daniel Large (Routledge, 2018) 189–204.
53. Lindsay Whitfield, ed., *The Politics of Aid: African Strategies for Dealing with Donors* (Oxford University Press, 2009).
54. Obong’o, “Political Influence.” Obong’o locates the cause of the failure of both these eras of reforms in the resistance of Kenyan politicians to reforms that would have diluted their patronage powers.
55. Interview, GHA15.
56. Interview, SA5.
57. Robert Doodoo, “Performance Standards and Measuring Performance in Ghana,” *Public Administration and Development* 17 (1997): 115–21.
58. Margaret Kobia and Nura Mohammed, “The Kenyan Experience with Performance Contracting” (African Association for Public Administration and Management 28th Annual Roundtable Conference, Arusha, Tanzania, December 4–8, 2006).
59. Geraldine Joslyn Fraser-Moleketi, “Public Service Reform In South Africa: An Overview Of Selected Case Studies From 1994–2004” (MA thesis, University of Pretoria, South Africa, 2006).
60. Interview, KEN6; Innovations for Successful Societies, “Building A Culture Of Results Institutionalizing Rapid Results Initiatives In Kenya, 2005–2009,” 2012; Abraham Rugo Muriu, “Performance Management in Kenya’s Public Service: A Study on Performance Information Use” (PhD diss., University of Potsdam, Potsdam, Germany, 2017).
61. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya.
62. Interview, John Kasanga; Interview, ZAM7; Interview, Moses Kondowe.
63. Innovations for Successful Societies, “Interview of Robertson Nii Akwei Allotey by Ashley McCants,” Interview C-2, August 20, 2008.

#### 4. THE “WHAT” OF REFORM

1. See, for example, Antoinette Weibel et al., “Pay for Performance in the Public Sector—Benefits and (Hidden) Costs,” *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 20, no. 2 (2010): 387–412; Zahid Hasnain et al., “The Promise of Performance Pay? Reasons for Caution in Policy Prescriptions in the Core Civil Service,” *World Bank Research Observer* 29 (2014): 235–64; Frederico Finan et al., “The Personnel Economics of the Developing State,” in *Handbook of Economic Field Experiments*, ed. Abhijit V. Banerjee and Esther Duflo (Elsevier, 2017), 467–514.
2. Author’s calculations from table 6.6 in Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), *Government at a Glance 2019* (OECD, 2019) 123. For this purpose, I count a country as having an individual-level performance-linked incentive policy if it is recorded as having at least one of the following in place for its senior managers: existence of a performance-management regime for senior managers; performance related pay; performance agreement with the minister; performance agreement with the administrative head of the civil service; promotion for good performance; dismissal for bad performance. Comparable figures for rank-and-file officers were not available for 2019.

3. Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance Management System Final Report* (Legend Consulting Services and Universalia, 2008), 25–28.
4. J. J. Rawlings, “New Year Broadcast to the Nation,” *Daily Graphic*, January 2, 1991, quoted in Joseph R. A. Ayee, “Civil Service Reform in Ghana: A Case Study of Contemporary Reform Problems in Africa,” *African Association of Political Science* 6, no. 1 (2001): 18.
5. Interview, ZAM21.
6. Interview, Gemma Mbaya.
7. Office of the Head of Civil Service, *Towards an Effective Performance Appraisal System in the Civil Service* (report, Dr. S. A. Nkrumah, OHCS Archives, n.d.).
8. Office of the Head of Civil Service, *Introduction of Merit/Performance Award System in the Civil Service*, circular ref. no. PNDC/SCR/A.08/15 (OHCS Archives, 1991).
9. Office of the Head of Civil Service, “Minutes of Meeting of Steering Committee on CSRP Held at the Conference Room of the Government Secretarial School Accra, on Wednesday, 17th November, 1993,” 1993.
10. Theodore R. Valentine, *A Medium-Term Strategy for Enhancing Pay and Conditions of Service in the Zambian Public Service* (Crown Consultants International, 2002), 92.
11. See, for example, Interview, GHA9; Interview, GHA17; Interview, ZAM17; Interview, ZAM21; Interview, ZAM26.
12. Office of the Head of Civil Service, “Minutes of Meeting of Steering Committee on CSRP.”
13. Office of the Head of Civil Service, *Merit/Performance Award Scheme in the Civil Service*, circular ref. no. OHCS/GEN/BC98/231/01 (OHCS Archives, 1995).
14. Government of Ghana, “National Public Sector Reform Strategy 2018–2023,” Office of the Senior Minister, 2017.
15. As the appendix discusses, there is disagreement among sources about how many years this actually was delivered for, with one source reporting two years and others reporting around six years.
16. Interview, SA6.
17. Interview, GHA7; Public Services Commission Ghana, “Performance Management Policy for the Public Services of Ghana,” n.d.
18. Interview, ZAM22.
19. Office of the Head of Civil Service, *Introduction of Merit/Performance Award System*.
20. Interview, Sylvester Obong’o.
21. Universalia, “Assessment of the Current Performance Management System,” 31.
22. Danny Sing, “Human Resource Challenges Confronting the Senior Management Service of the South African Public Service,” *Public Personnel Management* 41, no. 2 (2012): 383–84.
23. Interview, ZAM22.
24. Interview, Felix Mushabati; Interview, ZAM11.
25. Interview, Roland Msiska.
26. Interview, SA5.
27. Interview, KEN6.
28. Abraham Rugo Muriu, “Performance Management in Kenya’s Public Service: A Study on Performance Information Use” (PhD diss., University of Potsdam, Potsdam, Germany, 2017), 70.
29. Interview, Sean Phillips.
30. Interview, Chandiwira Nyirenda.
31. Interview, Joe Abah.
32. Interview, GHA13.
33. Interview, SA1.
34. Several sources cited unions’ resistance to high-powered performance incentives, noting that unions feared that such systems could be subject to political manipulation (e.g. interview, Kodjo Mensah-Abrampa).
35. Interview, SA5.

36. Interview, GHA7.
37. Interview, SA5.
38. Interview, Moses Kondowe. Interview, SA1 also noted similar tensions in South Africa: “One of our big [battles] was about who’s the employer of the DG [director-general]. Constitutionally the President appoints DGs, but their performance management is done mostly by Ministers. So there were some issues about ‘if you don’t appoint me you can’t fire me.’”
39. Interview, SA6.
40. Interview, Sylvester Obong’o.
41. Universalis, “Assessment of the Current Performance Management System,” 27.
42. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya.
43. Allan Schick, “Why Most Developing Countries Should Not Try New Zealand’s Reforms,” *World Bank Research Observer* 13, no. 1 (1998): 123–31.
44. Office of the Head of Civil Service, “Minutes of Meeting of Steering Committee on CSR,” 7.
45. Republic of South Africa, *Report of the Presidential Review Commission on the Reform and Transformation of the Public Service in South Africa* (1998).
46. Interview, Roland Msiska.
47. Interview, Ian Ball.
48. Ian Ball, “Reinventing Government: Lessons Learned from the New Zealand Treasury,” *Government Accountants Journal* 43, no. 3 (1994).
49. Interview, Ian Ball.
50. Ian Ball, “Presentation to the NZSA Public Sector Convention,” November 1992.
51. Allan Schick, *The Spirit Of Reform: Managing the New Zealand State Sector in a Time of Change* (report prepared for the State Services Commission and The Treasury, New Zealand, August 1996), 74.
52. Ball, “Reinventing Government.”
53. Schick, *The Spirit Of Reform*.
54. Interview, Ian Ball. Interestingly, one interviewee commented that the nontransparent confidential appraisal system that existed in Kenya prior to the CSR reforms actually allowed for more differentiation in performance ratings—“good performers were actually noted, and good performers were actually promoted”—while also noting that nontransparent systems were also at risk of politically driven unfairness (interview, Sylvester Obong’o).
55. Interview, Ian Ball.
56. Schick, *The Spirit Of Reform*, 49.
57. In addition to works already cited, see (among many others): Graham Scott et al., “Reform of the Core Public Sector: New Zealand Experience,” *Governance* 3, no. 2 (1990): 138–67; Jonathan Boston, “Assessing the Performance of Departmental Chief Executives: Perspectives from New Zealand,” *Public Administration* 70 (1992): 405–28; Enid Wistrich, “Restructuring Government New Zealand Style,” *Public Administration* 70 (1992): 119–35.
58. Government Accountability Office (GAO), “Federal Workforce: Distribution of Performance Ratings Across the Federal Government, 2013,” response to Ron Johnson, May 9 2016, GAO-16-520R Federal Employee Performance Ratings.
59. Alessandro Spano and Patrizio Monfardini, “Performance-Related Payments in Local Governments: Do They Improve Performance or Only Increase Salary?” *International Journal of Public Administration* 41, no. 4 (2018): 327.
60. Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), *Performance-Related Pay Policies for Government Employees* (OECD, 2005), 11, 13–14.
61. OECD, “Performance-Related Pay Policies,” 65.
62. Beryl Radin, *Challenging the Performance Movement* (Georgetown University Press, 2006); Donald P. Moynihan, *The Dynamics of Performance Management: Constructing Information and Reform* (Georgetown University Press, 2008).

63. Christian Schuster et al., “The Global Survey of Public Servants: Evidence from 1,300,000 Public Servants in 1,300 Government Institutions in 23 Countries,” *Public Administration Review* 83, no. 4 (2023): 982–93.
64. Interview, SA1.
65. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya.
66. Matt Andrews, *The Limits of Institutional Reform in Development: Changing Rules for Realistic Solutions* (Cambridge University Press, 2013).
67. Kate Bridges and Michael Woolcock, “How (Not) to Fix Problems That Matter: Assessing and Responding to Malawi’s History of Institutional Reform,” World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 8289 (2017), 15.
68. Jeffrey Braithwaite, “Changing How We Think About Healthcare Improvement,” *British Medical Journal* 361 (1998): 2.
69. C.f. Weibel et al., “Pay for Performance in the Public Sector”; Hasnain et al., “The Promise of Performance Pay?”; Finan et al., “The Personnel Economics of the Developing State.”
70. See, for example, Tessa Bold et al., “Experimental Evidence on Scaling Up Education Reforms in Kenya,” *Journal of Public Economics* 168 (2018): 1–20.
71. Tunji Olaopa, *The Nigerian Civil Service of the Future: A Prospective Analysis* (Bookcraft, 2014, 94).
72. Interview, Joe Abah.
73. Interview, Joe Abah.

## 5. THE “HOW” OF REFORM

1. Kurt Lewin, *Field Theory in Social Science* (Harper and Row, 1951). The use of the term *episodic* to describe Lewinian models of change is drawn from the seminal review by Karl E. Weick and Robert E. Quinn, “Organizational Change and Development,” *Annual Review of Psychology* 50 (1999): 361–86.
2. World Bank, *ICR Review—Public Service Capacity Building Project (PSCAP)* (Independent Evaluation Group Report ICRR12372, 2006). In the end, PSCAP was cancelled after phase 1 fell short of its objectives.
3. Government of Ghana, “Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme: The Way Forward” (pamphlet, n.d.), 4, 6, 9.
4. Interview, Roland Msiska.
5. Daniel Kahneman and Amos Tversky, “Intuitive Prediction: Biases and Corrective Procedures,” *TIMS Studies in Management Science* 12 (1979): 313–27.
6. Interview, Anand Rajaram.
7. Gael Raballand et al., “How Civil Servants and Bank Staff Incentives and Behaviors Explain Outcomes of World Bank Public Sector Projects? Lessons from World Bank Completion Reports from 2000” (draft, 2016), quoted in Kate Bridges and Michael Woolcock, “How (Not) to Fix Problems That Matter: Assessing and Responding to Malawi’s History of Institutional Reform,” World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 8289 (2017), 21.
8. Bent Flyvbjerg, “Policy and Planning for Large-Infrastructure Projects: Problems, Causes, Cures,” *Environment and Planning B: Planning and Design* 34 (2007): 578.
9. Flyvbjerg, “Policy and Planning,” 584.
10. Stefan Sveningsson and Nadja Sorgarde, *Managing Change in Organizations: How, What, and Why?* (SAGE Publications, 2019), 3.
11. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
12. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.

13. Interview, Anand Rajaram.
14. Lavagnon Ika, “Project Management for Development in Africa: Why Projects Are Failing and What Can Be Done About It,” *Project Management Journal* 43, no. 4 (2011): 27–41; Matt Andrews, *The Limits of Institutional Reform in Development: Changing Rules for Realistic Solutions* (Cambridge University Press, 2013); Matt Andrews et al., *Building State Capability: Evidence, Analysis, Action* (Oxford University Press, 2017); Mark T. Buntaine et al., “Aiming at the Wrong Targets: The Domestic Consequences of International Efforts to Build Institutions,” *International Studies Quarterly* 61 (2017): 471–88; Kate Bridges and Michael Woolcock, “How (Not) to Fix Problems That Matter: Assessing and Responding to Malawi’s History of Institutional Reform,” World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 8289 (2017).
15. Anand Rajaram et al., “Public Sector Reform—Changing Behavior with Cars and Computers?” World Bank Blogs, February 16 2010, <https://blogs.worldbank.org/africacan/public-sector-reform-changing-behavior-with-cars-and-computers>.
16. Interview, Sean Phillips.
17. Interview, SA1.
18. Interview, GHA13.
19. Interview, GHA13.
20. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
21. World Bank, *Implementation Completion And Results Report (IDA-51040) On Three Credits In The Amount Of SDF 51.5 Million (US\$ 80 Million Equivalent) To The Republic Of Zambia For Poverty Reduction Support Credits (PRSC) I, II And III* (report ICR2761, June 24 2013), 16.
22. Interview, ZAM14.
23. Interview, GHA7.
24. Interview, NIG1.
25. Interview, Sean Phillips.
26. Interview, ZAM5.
27. Herman Aguinis, *Performance Management*, 3rd edition (Pearson, 2013), quoted in Sabina Schnell et al., “Performance Management in the Public Administration: Seven Success Factors” (World Bank Equitable Growth, Finance, and Institutions Insight, 2021), 8.
28. E.g., Interview, GHA18; Interview, GHA21; Interview, GHA22; Interview, GHA30; Interview, GHA31.
29. Abraham Rugo Muriu, “Performance Management in Kenya’s Public Service: A Study on Performance Information Use” (PhD diss., University of Potsdam, Potsdam, Germany, 2017); Frank L. Kwaku Ohemeng, “Institutionalizing the Performance Management System in Public Organizations in Ghana,” *Public Performance & Management Review* 34, no. 4 (2011): 467–88.
30. Robert Dodoo, “Performance Standards and Measuring Performance in Ghana,” *Public Administration and Development* 17 (1997): 115–21; Stephen Adei and Yaw Boachie-Danquah, “The Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme (CSPIP) in Ghana: Lessons of Experience” (paper presented at the 24th AAPAM Annual Roundtable Conference on the African Public Service in the 21st Century-New Initiatives in Performance Management, November 25–29, 2002); Joseph R. A. Ayee, “Civil Service Reform in Ghana: A Case Study of Contemporary Reform Problems in Africa,” *African Association of Political Science*, 6, no. 1 (2001): 1–41; The top-down vs. bottom-up language and tension in public sector reform and development is also explored by numerous other authors, such as: Joseph R. A. Ayee, *Reforming the African Public Sector: Retrospect and Prospects* (CODESRIA Green Book, 2008); Willy McCourt, “Models of Public Service Reform: A Problem-Solving Approach,” World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 6428 (2013); Frank L. Kwaku Ohemeng and Joseph R. A. Ayee, “The ‘New Approach’ to Public Sector Reforms in Ghana: A Case of Politics as Usual or a Genuine Attempt at Reform?” *Development Policy Review* 34, no. 2 (2016): 277–300. However, some authors use this language to refer to the tension between

government-led versus civil society- and voter-led instigation of change. In this book, I use these terms only to refer to the locus of change efforts and leadership within the bureaucracy.

31. Andrews, *The Limits of Institutional Reform in Development*.
32. Interview, NIG1.
33. Interview, Joe Abah.
34. Interview, NIG3; Interview, Nnenna Akajemeli.
35. Interview, Joe Abah.
36. Interview, NIG1.
37. Interview, Roland Msiska.
38. Interview, anonymous.
39. Interview, GHA13.
40. Interview, Tunji Olaopa.
41. Rogerio F. Pinto, “Projectizing the Governance Approach to Civil Service Reform: An Institutional Environment Assessment for Preparing a Sectoral Adjustment Loan in the Gambia,” World Bank Discussion Paper 252 (1994).
42. Peter D. Toon, “Projectitis? Supporting Health Reform,” *British Medical Journal* 331 (2005); Harald Schutzeichel, “Projectitis Is Curable,” *Sun-Connect-News*, 2014, <https://www.sun-connect-news.org/articles/business/details/projectitis-is-curable>; Larisa Owen, “Projectitis vs. Systems Change: The Infusion of the Broader System Instead of Staying Inside the Silo of the Project,” *PA Times Online* February 18, 2020, <https://patimes.org/projectitis-vs-systems-change-the-infusion-of-the-broader-system-instead-of-staying-inside-the-silo-of-the-project/>.
43. Arvi Kuura, “25 Years of Projectification Research,” *PM World Journal* 9, no. 8 (2020): 2, referring to R. Müller, *Project Governance* (Routledge, 2009). See also P. D. Turnbull, “Effective Investment in Information Infrastructures,” *Information and Software Technology* 33, no. 3 (1991): 191–99.
44. Charlotte Pickles and James Sweetland, “Breaking Down the Barriers: Why Whitehall Is so Hard to Reform,” *Reform*, August 2023, 9.

## 6. MECHANISMS OF SUCCESS

1. Interview, GHA32.
2. Interview, ZAM27.
3. Interview, GHA10.
4. Universalialia, *Assessment of the Current Performance Management System Final Report*, (Legend Consulting Services and Universalialia, 2008), 5.
5. Interview, SA1.
6. Interview, Sylvester Obong’o.
7. Interview, SA1; interview, Sean Phillips.
8. Interview, SA5.
9. Interview, SA5.
10. Interview, NIG1; interview, Joe Abah; interview, NIG3; interview, Nnenna Akajemeli.
11. République du Sénégal, “Programme Nationale de Bonne Gouvernance,” April 2002; Serigne Ahmadou Gaye, “La construction de l’administration du Senegal: entre realites societates et genie de modernisation?” Mimeo, 2020; interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
12. Innovations for Successful Societies, “Building A Culture Of Results Institutionalizing Rapid Results Initiatives In Kenya, 2005–2009,” 2012; interview, Gemma Mbaya; interview, Sylvester Obong’o; interview KEN6.
13. Interview, Sean Phillips.



14. Republic of South Africa, "White Paper on Public Service Delivery," Government Gazette Notice 1459 of 1997, vol. 388, no. 18340, (October 1, 1997), 12–13.
15. Mashwale Diphofa, "Towards Intensifying the Batho Pele Campaign," *Service Delivery Review: A Learning Journal for Public Managers* 1, no. 1 (2002): 35.
16. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya.
17. Geraldine Joslyn Fraser-Moleketi, "Public Service Reform In South Africa: An Overview Of Selected Case Studies From 1994–2004" (MA thesis, University of Pretoria, South Africa, 2006), 71.
18. Public Service Commission, *Report on the Assessment of the Effectiveness of the Batho Pele Policy in Public Service Delivery* (June 2012).
19. Interview, Kithinji Kiragu; Interview KEN6.
20. Interview, Tunji Olaopa.
21. Interview, Sean Phillips.
22. Donald P. Moynihan, *The Dynamics of Performance Management: Constructing Information and Reform* (Georgetown University Press, 2008).
23. Sabina Schnell et al., "Performance Management in the Public Administration: Seven Success Factors" (World Bank Equitable Growth, Finance, and Institutions Insight, 2021), 21.

## 7. REFORM AS PROCESS: THEORY

1. James N. Baron and David M. Kreps, "Employment as an Economic and Social Relationship," in *The Handbook of Organizational Economics*, ed. Robert Gibbons and John Roberts (Princeton University Press, 2013), 321.
2. Robert Gibbons and Rebecca Henderson, "Relational Contracts and Organizational Capabilities," *Organization Science* 23, no. 5 (2012): 1350–64.
3. C.f. Marc Esteve and Christian Schuster, *Motivating Public Employees* (Cambridge Elements, 2017); James Perry, *Managing Organizations to Sustain Passion for Public Service* (Cambridge University Press, 2020); Dan Honig, *Mission Driven Bureaucrats: Empowering People to Help Government Do Better* (Oxford University Press, 2024).
4. Among others, see: Armen A. Alchian and Harold Demsetz, "Production, Information Costs, and Economic Organization," *American Economic Review* 62, no. 5 (1972): 777–95; Jack H. Knott, "Comparing Public and Private Management: Cooperative Effort and Principal-Agent Relationships," *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 3, no. 1 (1993): 93–119; Gary Miller and Andrew B. Whitford, "The Principal's Moral Hazard: Constraints on the Use of Incentives in Hierarchy," *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 17, no. 2 (2007): 213–33.
5. Sean Nicholson et al., "Measuring the Effects of Work Loss on Productivity With Team Production," *Health Economics* 15 (2006): 115–16.
6. For generality, I do not make strong assumptions about the production function through which individual tasks are aggregated into team-produced outputs. All that is necessary for the team-production aspect of this theory to be relevant is that performance across workers is not completely substitutable, such that poor performance from worker 1 can't be fully made up for by extra effort from worker 2, and so on. An extreme version of team-production would be an "O-ring" production function (Michael Kremer, "The O-Ring Theory of Economic Development," *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 108, no. 3 [1993]: 551–75) such that the quality of the output is determined by the minimum performance of contributing workers.
7. Baron and Kreps, "Employment as an Economic and Social Relationship"; Robert Gibbons and Rebecca Henderson, "What Do Managers Do?" in *The Handbook of Organizational Economics*, ed. Robert Gibbons and John Roberts (Princeton University Press, 2013), 680–731.

8. Robert Axelrod, *The Evolution of Cooperation* (Basic Books, 1984).
9. c.f. Sylvain Chassang, "Building Routines: Learning, Cooperation, and the Dynamics of Incomplete Relational Contracts," *American Economic Review* 100, no. 1 (2010): 448–65; Robert Gibbons et al., "What Situation Is This? Shared Frames and Collective Performance" (mimeo, June 2020).
10. Michael Lipsky, "Toward a Theory of Street-Level Bureaucracy," IRP Discussion Papers no. 48–69, Madison, WI (1969); Jeffrey L. Pressman, and Aaron Wildavsky, *Implementation* (University of California Press, 1974).
11. Yamini Aiyar et al., *Rewriting the Grammar of the Education System: Delhi's Education Reform (A Tale of Creative Resistance and Creative Disruption)* (Research on Improving Systems of Education [RISE], 2021), 3.
12. Richard F. Elmore, "Backward Mapping: Implementation Research and Policy Decisions," *Political Science Quarterly* 94, no. 4 (1979): 601–16.
13. See for example: Andrew M. Pettigrew, "Longitudinal Field Research on Change: Theory and Practice," *Organization Science* 1, no. 3 (1990): 267–92; Wanda J. Orlikowski, "Improvising Organizational Transformation Over Time: A Situated Change Perspective," *Information Systems Research* 7, no. 1 (1996): 63–92; Martha S. Feldman, "Organizational Routines as a Source of Continuous Change," *Organization Science* 11, no. 6 (2000): 611–29; Haridimos Tsoukas and Robert Chia, "On Organizational Becoming: Rethinking Organizational Change," *Organization Science* 13, no. 5 (2002): 567–82; Leni Wild et al., *Doing Development Differently: Who We Are, What We're Doing and What We're Learning* (Overseas Development Institute, 2016); Matt Andrews et al., *Building State Capability: Evidence, Analysis, Action* (Oxford University Press, 2017).
14. David Kreps, "Corporate Culture and Economic Theory," in *Perspectives on Positive Political Economy*, ed. James Alt and Kenneth Shepsle (Cambridge University Press, 1990), 90–143; Sylvain Chassang, "Building Routines: Learning, Cooperation, and the Dynamics of Incomplete Relational Contracts," *American Economic Review* 100, no. 1 (2010): 448–65; Gibbons and Henderson, "Relational Contracts and Organizational Capabilities"; Gibbons et al., "What Situation Is This?"
15. Peter Madsen et al., "Mitigating Hazards Through Continuing Design: The Birth and Evolution of a Pediatric Intensive Care Unit," *Organization Science* 17, no. 2 (2006): 239.
16. Quoted in Robert Gibbons, "Visible Hands: Governance of Value Creation—Within Firms and Beyond," *American Economic Review Papers and Proceedings* 110, no. 5 (2020): 175.
17. This use of the phrase is slightly different than Feldman's reference to organizational routines as "ongoing accomplishments" (in Feldman, "Organizational Routines," 613; quoted in Tsoukas and Chia, "On Organizational Becoming," 572), though in a similar spirit.
18. As very rough and suggestive evidence of the divergence between the (each enormous) literature on continuous improvement and on continuous/process-focused approaches to studying organizational change/process, the phrase "continuous improvement" appears only once across four classic articles on models of organizational change (Orlikowski, "Improvising Organizational Transformation"; Tsoukas and Chia, "On Organizational Becoming"; Karl E. Weick and Robert E. Quinn, "Organizational Change and Development," *Annual Review of Psychology* 50 (1999): 361–86; Andrew H. Van de Ven and Marshall Scott Poole, "Alternative Approaches for Studying Organizational Change," *Organization Studies* 26, no. 9 (2005): 1377–1404.
19. Nadia Bhuiyan and Amit Baghel, "An Overview of Continuous Improvement: From the Past to the Present," *Management Decision* 43, no. 5 (2005): 761.
20. Donald M. Berwick, "Continuous Improvement as an Ideal in Health Care," *New England Journal of Medicine* 320, no. 1 (1989): 54, summarizing M. Imai, *Kaizen: The Key to Japanese Competitive Success* (Random House, 1986).
21. c.f. Berwick, "Continuous Improvement"; Braithwaite, "Changing How We Think About Healthcare Improvement," *British Medical Journal* 361 (1998): 1–5; Maxwell M. Yurkofsky et al., "Research

- on Continuous Improvement: Exploring the Complexities of Managing Educational Change,” *Review of Research in Education* 44 (2020): 403–33; Anthony S. Bryk et al., *How a City Learned to Improve Its Schools* (Harvard University Press, 2023).
22. Bhuiyan and Baghel, “An Overview,” 766.
  23. Matt Andrews, *The Limits of Institutional Reform in Development: Changing Rules for Realistic Solutions* (Cambridge University Press, 2013); Matt Andrews et al., *Building State Capability: Evidence, Analysis, Action* (Oxford University Press, 2017).
  24. T. Reay et al., “Legitimizing a New Role: Small Wins and Microprocesses of Change,” *Academy of Management Journal* 49, no. 5 (2006): 977.
  25. e.g. Edgar H. Schein, *Organizational Culture and Leadership* (Jossey-Bass, 1985); D. M. Rousseau, *Psychological Contracts in Organizations: Understanding Written and Unwritten Agreements* (Sage Publications, 1995); Luigi Guiso et al., “The Value of Corporate Culture,” *Journal of Financial Economics* 117 (2015): 60–76; Elizabeth Martinez et al., “Organizational Culture and Performance,” *American Economic Review Papers and Proceedings* 105, no. 5 (2015): 331–35.
  26. For a review and synthesis, see Martha S. Feldman and Wanda J. Orlikowski, “Theorizing Practice and Practicing Theory,” *Organization Science* 22, no. 5 (2011): 1240–53.
  27. Aung Hein, “Essays on the Organizational Socialization of New Recruits in the Public Sector” (PhD diss., University of Oxford, 2023).
  28. W. Warner Burke, *Organization Change: Theory and Practice*, 5th ed. (SAGE, 2018), 255. Capitalization has been changed from title case to sentence case. For related discussion, see, among others, Anne M. Khademian, “Leading Through Cultural Change,” in *The Oxford Handbook of American Bureaucracy*, ed. Robert F. Durant (Oxford University Press, 2010), 303–23.
  29. e.g. Orlikowski, “Improvising Organizational Transformation”; Weick and Quinn, “Organizational Change and Development”; Ben S. Kuipers et al., “The Management of Change in Public Organizations: A Literature Review,” *Public Administration* 92, no. 1, (2014): 1–20 make this point in their excellent review of the public sector literature on organizational change.
  30. Karl E. Weick, “Small Wins: Redefining the Scale of Social Problems,” *American Psychologist* 39, no. 1 (1984): 40–49.
  31. Interview, Kithinji Kiragu; Interview, KEN6.
  32. I am grateful to Clare Leaver for this point.
  33. Jillian Chown, “The Appealing Illusion of Frontline Employee-Driven Continuous Improvement: The Challenges of Empowering Frontline Employees to Solve Organizational Problems” (mimeo, November 2021).
  34. Andrews et al., *Building State Capability*.
  35. Judith Tendler. *Good Government in the Tropics* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997); Merilee Grindle, “Divergent Cultures? When Public Organizations Perform Well in Developing Countries,” *World Development* 25 (1997): 481–95; Erin McDonnell, “Patchwork Leviathan: How Pockets of Bureaucratic Governance Flourish Within Institutionally Diverse Developing States,” *American Sociological Review* 82, no. 3 (2017): 476–510; Erin McDonnell, *Patchwork Leviathan: Pockets of Bureaucratic Effectiveness in Developing States* (Princeton University Press, 2020); Akshay Mangla, *Making Bureaucracy Work: Norms, Education and Public Service Delivery in Rural India* (Cambridge University Press, 2022).
  36. Charles Polidano, “Why Civil Service Reforms Fail,” *Public Management Review* 3, no. 3 (2001): 345–61; Joseph R. A. Ayee, *Reforming the African Public Sector: Retrospect and Prospects* (CODESRIA Green Book, 2008); Christopher Pollitt and Geert Bouckaert, *Public Management Reform: A Comparative Analysis* (Oxford University Press, 2004); Willy McCourt, “Models of Public Service Reform: A Problem-Solving Approach,” World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 6428 (2013); Ben S. Kuipers et al., “The Management of Change in Public Organizations: A Literature Review,” *Public Administration* 92, no. 1 (2014): 1–20.

37. Robert Dadoo, draft speech on theme “Civil Service Reform in Africa: Past Experience and Future Trends,” for panel discussion on “The Core Elements of Civil Service Reform: An Assessment of Relevance and Impact,” prepared for African Association for Public Administration and Management (AAPAM) 17th Roundtable Conference, Egypt, March 2–5, 1996, OHCS archives.
38. McCourt, “Models of Public Service Reform”; Katherine Bersch, *When Democracies Deliver: Governance Reform in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 2019).
39. Andrews et al., *Building State Capability*.
40. Hugh Hecllo, *Modern Social Politics in Britain and Sweden* (Yale University Press, 1974); Charles E. Lindblom, “The Science of ‘Muddling Through,’” *Public Administration Review* 19, no. 2 (1959): 79–88.
41. Leni Wild et al., *Doing Development Differently: Who We Are, What We’re Doing and What We’re Learning* (Overseas Development Institute, 2016); World Bank, “GovEnable: Locally Co-Created Solutions to Government Service Delivery Challenges,” accessed April 19, 2024, <https://shorturl.at/TSh3>.
42. Imran Rasul and Daniel Rogger, “Management of Bureaucrats and Public Service Delivery: Evidence from the Nigerian Civil Service,” *Economic Journal* 128, no. 608 (2018): 413–46; Imran Rasul et al., “Management, Organizational Performance, and Task Clarity: Evidence from Ghana’s Civil Service,” *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 31, no. 2 (2021): 259–77; Oriana Bandiera et al., “The Allocation Of Authority In Organizations: A Field Experiment With Bureaucrats,” *Quarterly Journal of Economics* (2021), 2195–2242.
43. Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), *Public Employment and Management 2021: The Future Of The Public Service* (OECD, 2021).
44. McDonnell, “Patchwork Leviathan”; McDonnell, *Patchwork Leviathan*.
45. c.f. Bernard M. Bass, *Leadership and Performance Beyond Expectations* (Free Press, 1985); Ulrich Thy Jensen et al., “Conceptualizing and Measuring Transformational and Transactional Leadership,” *Administration and Society* 51, no. 1 (2019): 3–33.
46. For an education-focused review, see Alma Harris et al., “System Leaders and System Leadership: Exploring the Contemporary Evidence Base,” *School Leadership & Management* 41, nos. 4–5 (2021), 387–408. For a health-focused review, see Lucy Gilson and Irene Akua Agyepong, “Strengthening Health System Leadership for Better Governance: What Does It Take?” *Health Policy and Planning* 33 (2018): ii1–ii4.
47. Thubelihle Mathole et al., “Leadership and the Functioning of Maternal Health Services in Two Rural District Hospitals in South Africa,” *Health Policy and Planning* 33 (2018): ii5.
48. For excellent reviews, see Elinor Ostrom, “Beyond Markets and States: Polycentric Governance of Complex Economic Systems,” *American Economic Review* 100 (2010), 641–72; Andreas Thiel et al., eds., *Governing Complexity: Analyzing and Applying Polycentricity* (Cambridge University Press, 2019). Much of this work focuses on scenarios where these decisionmakers are formally independent; this can sometimes be the case within bureaucratic systems, although de facto and partial independence of power bases and decision authorities tends to be more common.
49. For a review, see Zahra Mansoor and Martin J. Williams, “Systems Approaches to Public Service Delivery: Methods and Frameworks,” *Journal of Public Policy* 44, no. 2 (2024): 258–83.
50. Tunji Olaopa, *Managing Complex Reforms: A Public Sector Respective* (Bookcraft, 2011). Quote is from Andrews et al., *Building State Capability*, 1.
51. Douglas C. Engelbart, “Toward High-Performance Organizations: A Strategic Role for Groupware,” in *Proceedings of the GroupWare ’92 Conference* (Morgan Kaufmann Publishers, 1992), 77–100; Jennifer Lin Russell et al., “A Framework for the Initiation of Networked Improvement Communities,” *Teachers College Record* 119 (2017): 1–36.

## 8. REFORM AS PROCESS IN GHANA, 2014–2019

1. Parts of this chapter draw on a longer teaching case I coauthored with Sarah McAra, which is available for free online and can be used in classes, executive education, trainings, meetings, and workshops to animate group discussion of these issues. The main case and epilogue can be downloaded at: <https://www.thecasecentre.org/products/view?id=189062>. Instructors can request the teaching note through the same website (all free of charge). A Portuguese translation is also available at: <https://www.thecasecentre.org/products/view?id=189065>.
2. Given the nature of this chapter, I shared a complete draft with Agyekum-Dwamena to ensure that my analysis of his approach resonated with his own thinking and perspective on what he tried to do. At his request, minor changes of emphasis and corrections were made, though the core analysis of the chapter remains mine.
3. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
4. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
5. Personal communication, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
6. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
7. Various in Martin J. Williams and Sarah McAra, “Civil Service Reform in Ghana,” *Blavatnik School of Government Teaching Case*, 2022.
8. Personal communication, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
9. Francis Owusu, “Differences in the Performance of Public Organisations in Ghana: Implications for Public-Sector Reform Policy,” *Development Policy Review* 24, no. 6 (2006): 693–705; Martin J. Williams, “From Institutions to Organizations: Management and Informality in Ghana’s Bureaucracies,” Working paper, London School of Economics and Political Science, (September 9, 2015); Erin McDonnell, “Patchwork Leviathan: How Pockets of Bureaucratic Governance Flourish Within Institutionally Diverse Developing States,” *American Sociological Review* 82, no. 3 (2017): 476–510.
10. Rachel Sigman, “Which Jobs for Which Boys? Party Financing, Patronage and State Capacity in African Democracies” (PhD diss., Maxwell School Syracuse University, 2015), 147.
11. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
12. Various in Williams and McAra, “Civil Service Reform in Ghana.”
13. Interview, Nana-Agyekum-Dwamena.
14. Interview, Nana-Agyekum-Dwamena.
15. Interview, Nana-Agyekum-Dwamena.
16. Ghana News Agency, “The Civil Service Endorses Punctuality Campaign,” GhanaWeb, October 4, 2018, <https://www.ghanaweb.com/GhanaHomePage/NewsArchive/The-Civil-Service-endorses-Punctuality-Campaign-690024>.
17. Nana Agyekum-Dwamena, interview with case writers, April 7, 2022.
18. Blavatnik School of Government “Public Sector Deep Dive: Professionalism for Performance: Innovative Public Management,” Presentation by Nana Agyekum-Dwamena, Challenges of Government Conference, June 20, 2017, 1 hour, 11 min., 31 sec., YouTube video, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=txAnw8YA-Ns>.
19. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
20. Interview, Nana-Agyekum-Dwamena.
21. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
22. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
23. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
24. Interview and personal communication, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
25. Interview and personal communication, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.

26. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
27. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
28. Personal communication, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
29. Interview and personal communication, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
30. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
31. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
32. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
33. Personal communication, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
34. Ernest Zume, "PSRRP Implementation: The Journey so Far," *Modern Ghana*, May 16, 2022, <https://www.modernghana.com/news/1158400/psrrp-implementation-the-journey-so.html>; Freedom Radio, "COVID-19 Pandemic: Civil Service Goes Digital," August 9, 2021, accessed June 2022, <https://freedomradiogh.com/covid-19-pandemic-civil-service-goes-digital/>; interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
35. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
36. Interview, GHA15; personal communication, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
37. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
38. Interview, GHA15.
39. Interview, GHA20; interview, GHA29.
40. Interview, Dora Dei-Tumi; interview GHA7.
41. E.g., interview, GHA23; interview, GHA28; interview GHA32.
42. Interview, GHA14; interview, GHA17; interview, GHA31.
43. Interview, GHA9.
44. Interview, GHA10.
45. Interview, GHA19.
46. Interview, GHA15.
47. Interview, GHA11.
48. Interview, GHA15; interview, GHA17; interview, GHA22; interview, GHA29; interview, GHA30.
49. Interview, William Kartey.
50. Interview, GHA13.
51. Interview, GHA22.
52. Interview, GHA28.
53. Interview, GHA9.
54. Interview, GHA26.
55. Interview, GHA7.
56. Interview, GHA17.
57. Interview, GHA7.
58. Interview, GHA26.
59. E.g., interview, GHA9; interview, GHA11, interview, GHA29; interview, GHA31; interview, GHA32.
60. Interview, GHA18.
61. Interview, GHA29.
62. Interview, GHA21; interview, GHA22; interview, GHA24.
63. Imran Rasul et al., "How Do Management Practices in Government Change Over Time? Evidence from Ghana" (Policy brief for International Growth Centre and Economic Development and Institutions research initiative, 2019).
64. This figure is based on comparing the averages of individual-level management indices across approximately three thousand interviewees per survey wave. Comparing organization-level average management indices yields a larger estimated increase (0.17 standard deviations) but is less statistically significant due to the smaller sample size.



65. All quotes in paragraph from interview, GHA13.
66. Interview, Dora Dei-Tumi.
67. Interview, Dora Dei-Tumi.
68. Interview, Dora Dei-Tumi.
69. Interview, Dora Dei-Tumi; interview, William Kartey; interview GHA7; interview GHA29.
70. Among many studies, see for example, Martin J. Williams and Liah Yecalo-Teclé, “Innovation, Voice, and Hierarchy in the Civil Service: Evidence from Ghana’s Civil Service,” *Governance* 33, no. 4 (2020): 789–807; James Perry, *Managing Organizations to Sustain Passion for Public Service* (Cambridge University Press, 2020); Dan Honig, *Mission Driven Bureaucrats: Empowering People to Help Government Do Better* (Oxford University Press, 2024).
71. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
72. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
73. Personal communication, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
74. Interview and personal communication, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena. This quote should be read as Agyekum-Dwamena’s account of the meeting. Due to the nature of the conversations, I have not attempted to independently verify them.
75. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
76. Interview, GHA7.
77. Interview, GHA27.
78. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.

## 9. A PRAGMATIC APPROACH TO REFORM

1. Abhijit Banerjee et al., “Decision Theoretic Approaches to Experiment Design and External Validity,” in *Handbook of Economic Field Experiments*, ed. A. V. Banerjee and E. Duflo (Elsevier, 2017), 141–74.
2. For related discussions on how task type might affect management and reform strategies, see: Lant Pritchett and Michael Woolcock, “Solutions When the Solution Is the Problem: Arraying the Disarray in Development,” *World Development* 32, no. 2 (2004): 191–12; Matt Andrews et al., *Building State Capability: Evidence, Analysis, Action* (Oxford University Press, 2017).
3. c.f., Steven Levitsky and Maria Victoria Murrillo, “Variation in Institutional Strength,” *Annual Review of Political Science* 12 (2009): 115–33; Robert Gibbons and Woody Powell, “Why Are Organizations So Full of Rules That Are Not Followed or Enforced?” Presentation to Economic History Association, October 29, 2021.
4. I am grateful to Jurgen Blum for helpful prompting and discussions on this point.
5. For an especially thoughtful and balanced discussion on this issue in the context of post-conflict settings, see Jurgen Rene Blum et al., *Building Public Services in Postconflict Countries: A Comparative Analysis of Reform Trajectories in Afghanistan, Liberia, Sierra Leone, South Sudan, and Timor-Leste* (World Bank, 2019).
6. Dana Qarout, “The Accountability Paradox: Delivery Units in Jordan’s Education Sector 2010–2019,” DeliverEd Initiative Working Paper (November 2022).
7. Among many others, see for example: Tim Kelsall and David Booth, “Developmental Patrimonialism? Questioning the Orthodoxy on Political Governance and Economic Progress in Africa,” Africa Power and Politics Programme Working Paper 9 (2010); Mushtaq H. Khan, “Political Settlements and the Governance of Growth-Enhancing Institutions” (mimeo, 2010); Brian Levy, *Working with the Grain: Integrating Governance and Growth in Development Strategies* (Oxford University Press, 2014); Daniel Appiah and Abdul-Gafaru Abdulai, “Competitive Clientelism and the Politics of Core Public Sector Reform in Ghana,” ESID Working Paper 82 (March 2017); Pablo Yanguas,



“Varieties of State-Building in Africa: Elites, Ideas and the Politics of Public Sector Reform,” ESID Working Paper no. 89 (August 2017).

8. Sylvester Odhiambo Obong'o, “Particularistic Exchanges and Pacts of Domination In Africa: Examining How Patronage Appointments May Have Increased Resistance to Public Sector Reforms in Kenya,” *International Public Management Review* 14, no. 1, (2013): 27–46; Sylvester Odhiambo Obong'o, “Political Influence, Appointments and Public Sector Management Reform In Kenya, 1963–2014” (PhD diss., University of Newcastle, Australia, 2015); Appiah and Abdulai, “Competitive Clientelism.”

## APPENDIX: COUNTRY REFORM HISTORIES

1. I was fortunate to have support in compiling these reform histories from a number of excellent research assistants: Aisha Ali, Bashar Hobbi, Morgan DaCosta, Allan Kasapa, Oshmita Ray, and Liah Yecaló-Teclé.
2. These were the AidData Research Release v3.1 (AidDataCore\_ResearchRelease\_Level1\_v3, released October 6, 2017) and Dan Honig's Project Performance Database (July 3, 2018 release). Projects with CRS/AidData purpose codes 15110 (public sector policy and administrative management) or 15111 (public finance management) were flagged as potentially fitting the definition of reform.
3. For example, “Ghana” + “civil service reform,” “Nigeria” + “government performance improvement,” “South Africa” + “Department of Public Service and Administration.” Searches were undertaken on: Google Scholar; Oxford's SOLO search system that covers numerous databases of journal articles, media, books, and other material; and Google.
4. I conducted interviews with elite interviewees (i.e., reform designers and implementers) myself, sometimes in conjunction with a research assistant. Interviews with rank-and-file civil servants in Ghana and Zambia and one elite interviewee in Zambia were undertaken by Liah Yecaló-Teclé under my supervision. Elite interviewees were each offered a choice about whether they would prefer to be named or to be anonymous and whether their interview would be audio recorded; all rank-and-file interviews were undertaken anonymously and without recording by default. Direct quotations reported from elite interviewees are verbatim (from recording transcripts or from typed/handwritten notes where it was possible to capture certain phrases verbatim), while quotations from rank-and-file interviewees are close paraphrases. The research received ethical approval from the University of Oxford.
5. In Ghana, the ministries involved were the Ministry of Food and Agriculture, Ministry of Transport, and Ministry of Youth and Sport. Within these ministries, participants came from two divisions: Policy, Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation (PPME) and Human Resource Management (HRM). In Zambia, the ministries involved were the Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Transport and Communications, and Ministry of Youth, Sport and Child Development. Within these ministries, participants came from three divisions: Human Resource and Administration (HRA), Planning and Policy (P&P), and Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E).
6. Joseph R. A. Ayee, “Civil Service Reform in Ghana: A Case Study of Contemporary Reform Problems in Africa,” *African Association of Political Science*, 6, no. 1 (2001): 1–41.
7. Ben Eghan, “Enhancing the Performance of the Public Service in a Developmental State: Ghana Case Study,” African Association for Public Administration and Management 30th Annual Roundtable Conference, Accra, Ghana, October 6–10, 2008; interview, Ben Eghan.
8. World Bank, “*Staff Appraisal Report: Republic of Ghana Structural Adjustment Institutional Support Project*,” (World Bank, 20 March 20, 1987); Stephen Adei and Yaw Boachie-Danquah, “The Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme (CSPIP) in Ghana: Lessons of Experience,” Paper presented at the 24th AAPAM Annual Roundtable Conference on the African Public Service in the 21st Century—New Initiatives in Performance Management, 25th–29th November 25–29, 2002.
9. Ayee, “Civil Service Reform in Ghana,” 1.

10. World Bank, *Project Completion Report: Republic of Ghana Structural Adjustment Institutional Support Project (Credit 1778-GH)* (World Bank Report No. 12502, November 15, 1993), 2.
11. Office of the Head of Civil Service, *Introduction of Merit/Performance Award System in the Civil Service*, Circular Ref. No. PNDC/SCR/A.08/15 (OHCS Archives, 1991), 1.
12. United Kingdom Overseas Development Administration, "Evaluation of the Ghana Civil Service Reform Project" (ODA Evaluation Department, April 1993). Cited in International Labour Organization, "Improving the Performance of the Public Sector in LDCs: New Approaches to Human Resource Planning and Management," Interdepartmental Project on Structural Adjustment, Occasional Paper 25 (P. Bennell, 1994).
13. Office of the Head of Civil Service, "Minutes of the Special Chief Directors Meeting Held on Wednesday, 22nd March, 1995" (OHCS Archives, 1995).
14. World Bank, *Project Completion Report*.
15. Government of Ghana, "Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme: The Way Forward," (pamphlet, n.d.); Ayee, "Civil Service Reform in Ghana"; Department for International Development (DFID), *Ghana Civil Service Reform Programme* (summary report, 2004).
16. Ayee, "Civil Service Reform in Ghana."
17. J. J. Rawlings, "New Year Broadcast to the Nation," *Daily Graphic*, January 2, 1991, quoted in Ayee, "Civil Service Reform in Ghana," 18.
18. Office of the Head of Civil Service, *Towards an Effective Performance Appraisal System in the Civil Service* (Dr. S. A. Nkrumah, OHCS Archives, n.d.), 5.
19. Public Services Commission Ghana, "Performance Management Policy for the Public Services of Ghana" (n.d.)
20. Office of the Head of Civil Service, *Towards an Effective Performance Appraisal*, 5.
21. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
22. Office of the Head of Civil Service, *Introduction of Merit/Performance Award System*.
23. World Bank, *Project Completion Report*, 1, 7.
24. Robert Dodoo, draft speech on theme, "Civil Service Reform in Africa: Past Experience and Future Trends," for panel discussion on "The Core Elements of Civil Service Reform: An Assessment of Relevance and Impact," prepared for African Association for Public Administration and Management (AAPAM) 17th Roundtable Conference, Egypt, March 2–5, 1996, OHCS archives, 15. In this passage, Dodoo is referring both to Ghana's Civil Service Reform Programme and to similar reforms undertaken by other African countries under structural adjustment programs.
25. Government of Ghana, "Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme," 8.
26. Office of the Head of Civil Service, *Merit/Performance Award Scheme in the Civil Service*, Circular Ref. No. OHCS/GEN/BC98/231/01 (OHCS Archives, 1995); interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
27. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena; interview, GHA12; interview, GHA13.
28. Interview, GHA9.
29. Office of the Head of Civil Service, "Minutes of the Special Chief Directors Meeting,"
30. Dodoo, "Civil Service Reform in Africa," 18.
31. Interview, William Kartey; interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
32. See for example: G. W. Glentworth, *Ghana Developments in Civil Service Reform and UK Support: Report on a Visit to Ghana, 1–9 June 1995*, OHCS Archives, GID.95/021 (ODA, June 1995); Office of the Head of Civil Service, "Minutes of Meeting of Steering Committee on CSRП Held at the Conference Room of the Government Secretarial School Accra, on Wednesday, 17th November, 1993," (1993). Archived OHCS correspondence indicates that the program was initially called the Public Service Performance Improvement Support Programme (PIMSUP) by the ODA's Garth Glentworth (Glentworth, *Ghana Developments in Civil Service Reform*); in his opening remarks to a 2000 workshop, Dodoo stated that the name CSPIП also came from Glentworth (Office of the Head of Civil Service, *Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme (CSPIП: 1996–2001) Second Joint CSPIП-DFID Internal Review at Sogakope 5th–8th July, 2000* [OHCS Archives, 2000], 1).

33. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
34. Office of the Head of Civil Service, "Letter OHCS/SCR/AD100/201/01," (Office of the Head of Civil Service Archives, October 20, 1994).
35. Office of the Head of Civil Service, "Minutes of Meeting of Steering Committee."
36. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
37. Interview, William Kartey; interview, GHA7; Robert Dadoo, "Performance Standards and Measuring Performance in Ghana," *Public Administration and Development* 17 (1997): 115–121.
38. Government of Ghana (n.d.).
39. Dadoo, "Performance Standards"; Ayee, "Civil Service Reform in Ghana"; United Nations Economic Commission for Africa, *Innovations and Best Practices in Public Sector Reforms: The Case of Civil Service in Ghana, Kenya, Nigeria and South Africa* (report, December 2010); interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
40. Government of Ghana, "Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme"; Ayee, "Civil Service Reform in Ghana"; Adei and Boachie-Danquah, "Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme"; interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena; interview, William Kartey.
41. Interview, GHA7.
42. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
43. Interview, GHA12.
44. Office of the Head of Civil Service, *Towards an Effective Performance Appraisal*; United Nations Economic Commission for Africa, *Innovations and Best Practices*.
45. Interview, William Kartey; Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena. Interestingly, both interviewees reported that Ghana's local governments were more successful at CSPIP implementation than national level ministries and departments. Their hypotheses for this included greater political enthusiasm at local level because of more direct service delivery impacts as well as district assemblies being more creative in coming up with strategies that made use of existing resources rather than requiring new ones.
46. Office of the Head of Civil Service, *Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme*.
47. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena; interview, GHA32.
48. Public Services Commission, "Performance Management Policy."
49. Office of Head of Civil Service, *Merit/Performance Award Scheme*.
50. Interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
51. Office of the Head of Civil Service, *Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme*; interview, William Kartey; interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena
52. Frank L. Kwaku Ohemeng and Felix K. Anebo, "The Politics of Administrative Reforms in Ghana: Perspectives from Path Dependency and Punctuated Equilibrium Theories," *International Journal of Public Administration* 35, no. 3 (2012): 161–76.
53. Samiatu Bogobiri Seidu, "Institutionalizing Reforms in the Public Sector: A Comparative Study of Public Sector Reform Agencies in Ghana and Nigeria" (master's thesis, Erasmus University, Rotterdam, 2010).
54. Interview, GHA4.
55. Ministry of Public Sector Reform, "Work Programme to Coordinate the Implementation of Public Sector Reforms: Reference Document" (Ministry of Public Sector Reform, OHCS Archives, January 2006).
56. Ministry of Public Sector Reform, "Work Programme to Coordinate"; interview, William Kartey; interview GHA7; interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena.
57. Interview, Kwame Adorbor.
58. Interview, GHA12.
59. Interview, Kodjo Mensah-Abrampa.
60. Elizabeth Annan-Prah and Frank L. Kwaku Ohemeng, "Improving Productivity Through Performance Management in Public Sector Organizations in Ghana—Is Change Management the Answer?" Paper prepared for XVII annual meeting of the International Research Society for Public Management (IRSPM), University of Birmingham, UK, March 30–April 1, 2015.

61. Seth Oppong et al., "Implementation of Single Spine Pay Policy in Public Sector of Ghana: Analysis and Recommendations from Organizational Development Perspective," *Poslovna Izurnost Zagreb* IX, no. 2 (2015): 83–100; Innovations for Successful Societies, "Interview of Robertson Nii Akwei Allotey by Ashley McCants," interview C-2, August 20, 2008.
62. Interview, Kwame Adorbor.
63. Oppong et al., "Implementation of Single Spine Pay Policy."
64. Interview, Kwame Adorbor; interview, Kodjo Mensah-Abrampa; Oppong et al., "Implementation of Single Spine Pay Policy"; Innovations for Successful Societies, "Interview of Robertson Nii Akwei Allotey."
65. Interview, Kodjo Mensah-Abrampa.
66. Interview, GHA4.
67. Annan-Prah and Ohemeng, "Improving Productivity."
68. Interview, Ben Eghan.
69. Interview, Ben Eghan.
70. Interview, William Kartey; interview, GHA7.
71. Frank L. Kwaku Ohemeng and Joseph R. A. Ayee, "The 'New Approach' to Public Sector Reforms in Ghana: A Case of Politics as Usual or a Genuine Attempt at Reform?" *Development Policy Review* 34, no. 2 (2016): 277–300.
72. Commonwealth, *Key Principles of Public Sector Reforms Case Studies and Frameworks* (Commonwealth Secretariat, December 2016).
73. Frank L. Kwaku Ohemeng et al., "Performance Appraisal and Its Use for Individual and Organizational Improvement in the Civil Service of Ghana: The Case of Much Ado About Nothing?" *Public Administration and Development* 35 (2015): 179; Justice N. Bawole et al., "Performance Appraisal or Praising Performance The Culture of Rhetoric in Performance Management in Ghana Civil Service," *International Journal of Public Administration* 36, no. 13 (2013): 953; Martin J. Williams, "From Institutions to Organizations: Management and Informality in Ghana's Bureaucracies," working paper, London School of Economics and Political Science (September 9, 2015).
74. Interview, GHA10; interview, GHA11; interview, GHA32.
75. Interview, GHA11.
76. Interview, GHA10.
77. e.g., interview, GHA17.
78. Interview, GHA7.
79. Interview, Dora Dei-Tumi.
80. Public Services Commission, "Performance Management Policy," 3.
81. Interview, William Kartey; interview, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena; interview, GHA7; interview, GHA13; interview GHA32.
82. Interview, GHA13.
83. Interview, GHA9.
84. Interview, GHA10.
85. Interview, GHA7.
86. Interview, GHA32.
87. Interview, Ben Eghan; interview GHA7.
88. Ghana News Agency, "Gov't Explains Performance Contract with Ministers," Ghana Business News, June 25, 2013, <https://www.ghanabusinessnews.com/2013/06/25/govt-explains-performance-contract-with-ministers/>.
89. Peace FM, "Mahama's Appraisal of Ministers Is Deceitful—NPP," Ghana Web, 2013, <https://mobile.ghanaweb.com/GhanaHomePage/business/Mahama-s-appraisal-of-ministers-is-deceitful-NPP-295630>.
90. Interview, Samuel Abu-Bonsrah.
91. Interview, Kodjo Mensah-Abrampa.

92. Interview, Kodjo Mensah-Abrampa.
93. Interview, Samuel Abu-Bonsrah.
94. Interview, Kodjo Mensah-Abrampa.
95. World Bank, *Public Sector Reform for Results Project (P164665): Implementation Status and Results Report* (February 14, 2019).
96. Interview, Kodjo Mensah-Abrampa.
97. Government of Ghana, "National Public Sector Reform Strategy 2018–2023" (Office of the Senior Minister, 2017).
98. Frank L. Kwaku Ohemeng and Augustina Akonnor, "The New Public Sector Reform Strategy in Ghana: Creating a New Path for a Better Public Service?" *Public Organization Review* 23 (2022): 839–55.
99. Given the scope of this book, I focus my attention on reforms from 1992 onward, but Sylvester Odhiambo Obong'o, "Political Influence, Appointments and Public Sector Management Reform In Kenya, 1963–2014" (PhD diss., University of Newcastle, Australia, 2015) discusses at length the reform thinking and commissions of the 1960s and 1970s that prefigured these reforms, and one interviewee traced the roots of the 1992/1993 central government reforms to district-level reforms beginning in 1983 (interview, Gemma Mbaya).
100. Chweya Ludeki, "Democratization and Civil Service Reform in Kenya" (PhD diss., Queen's University, Kingston, Ontario, Canada, 2003), 139.
101. Obong'o, "Political Influence, Appointments and Public Sector."
102. Ludeki, "Democratization and Civil Service Reform in Kenya."
103. Interview, KEN6.
104. Kempe Ronald Hope Sr., "Managing the Public Sector in Kenya: Reform and Transformation for Improved Performance," *Journal of Public Administration and Governance*, 2, no. 4 (2012): 128–43; Ludeki, "Democratization and Civil Service Reform in Kenya"; Obong'o, "Political Influence, Appointments and Public Sector"; United Nations Economic Commission for Africa, *Innovations and Best Practices*.
105. Interview, KEN6; Abraham Rugo Muriu, "Performance Management in Kenya's Public Service: A Study on Performance Information Use" (PhD diss., University of Potsdam, Potsdam, Germany, 2017).
106. Ludeki, "Democratization and Civil Service Reform in Kenya."
107. Stephen Mworsho Lorete, "The Kenya Civil Service Reform Programme: Analysis of the Design and Implementation of Retrenchment Policy" (master's thesis, Institute of Social Studies of Erasmus University Rotterdam, The Hague, Netherlands, 2002); Ludeki, "Democratization and Civil Service Reform in Kenya."
108. Ludeki, "Democratization and Civil Service Reform in Kenya."
109. Figures calculated from (respectively): Lorete, "The Kenya Civil Service Reform Programme," 43; Kithinji Kiragu, "Civil Service Reform in Southern & Eastern Africa, Lessons of Experience," report on Proceedings of a Consultative Workshop held at Arusha, Tanzania, March 4–8, 1998, 19; and Ludeki, "Democratization and Civil Service Reform in Kenya," 180. It is unclear where this discrepancy arises from. These figures do not include additional nominal reductions in staff strength due to the elimination of ghost workers and abolishing of vacant posts.
110. Ludeki, "Democratization and Civil Service Reform in Kenya," 167.
111. Lorete, "The Kenya Civil Service Reform Programme," 38.
112. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (IDA-26710) on a Credit in the Amount of SDRs 17.2 Million to the Government of the Republic of Kenya for an Institutional Development and Civil Service Reform Project*, report No. 21363 (March 29, 2001); Lorete, "The Kenya Civil Service Reform Programme"; Ludeki, "Democratization and Civil Service Reform in Kenya"; interview, KEN6.
113. Lorete, "The Kenya Civil Service Reform Programme."



114. Interview, KEN6.
115. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (IDA-26710)*, 7–8, 19.
116. Ludeki, “Democratization and Civil Service Reform in Kenya.”
117. Lorete, “The Kenya Civil Service Reform Programme,” 46–47.
118. Ludeki, “Democratization and Civil Service Reform in Kenya”; Obong’o, “Political Influence, Appointments and Public Sector.”
119. Interview, KEN6; Lorete, “The Kenya Civil Service Reform Programme.”
120. Ludeki, “Democratization and Civil Service Reform in Kenya.”
121. Interview, Sylvester Obong’o.
122. Interview, Gemma Mbaya.
123. Obong’o, “Political Influence, Appointments and Public Sector.”
124. Interview, Gemma Mbaya.
125. Interview, KEN2.
126. Interview, KEN2; interview, Gemma Mbaya.
127. Interview, Kithinji Kiragu.
128. Interview, Kithinji Kiragu.
129. Interview, KEN6.
130. Interview, KEN6.
131. Government of Kenya, *Economic Recovery Strategy for Wealth and Employment Creation 2003–2007* (Ministry of Planning and National Development, 2003), 12.
132. Interview, Kithinji Kiragu.
133. Interview, KEN6.
134. Interview, KEN6; Innovations for Successful Societies, “Building A Culture Of Results: Institutionalizing Rapid Results Initiatives In Kenya, 2005–2009” (2012); Muriu, “Performance Management in Kenya’s Public Service.” Some official documents refer to the program as “Results for Kenyans” while others refer to “Results for Kenya”; I use “Results for Kenya” throughout for consistency.
135. Interview, Gemma Mbaya.
136. Interview, KEN6.
137. Innovations for Successful Societies, “Interview of Stanley Murage by Rushda Majeed” (Interview ZP3, July 12, 2012), 1.
138. Interview, KEN2.
139. Performance contracts were rolled out to ministries, departments, and agencies (MDAs); I refer simply to “ministries” or “institutions” here for brevity and convenience.
140. Sylvester Odhiambo Obong’o, “Implementation of Performance Contracting in Kenya,” *International Public Management Review* 10, no. 2 (2009): 66–84.
141. Interview, KEN2; interview KEN6.
142. Obong’o, “Implementation of Performance Contracting in Kenya”; Margaret Kobia and Nura Mohammed, “The Kenyan Experience with Performance Contracting,” African Association for Public Administration and Management 28th Annual Roundtable Conference, Arusha, Tanzania, December 4–8, 2006; Interview, KEN6. As these sources note, the first use of performance contracts in Kenya actually dates to the early 1990s when they were used with a handful of state-owned enterprises for a short period. Following their revival in 2003, they were also rolled out to numerous state-owned enterprises and local governments. These institutions are beyond the scope of this book, so here, I focus exclusively on their use in central government ministries.
143. Obong’o, “Implementation of Performance Contracting in Kenya.”
144. Obong’o, “Implementation of Performance Contracting in Kenya,” 78.
145. Department for International Development (DFID), “Project Completion Review: Results for Kenya Public Sector Reform Programme (PSR)” (2012).
146. Interview, KEN2.

147. Interview, KEN6.
148. Interview, KEN2; interview, KEN6.
149. Obong'o, "Implementation of Performance Contracting in Kenya." The "thousands" figure refers to staff from the whole public sector (state-owned enterprises, central government institutions, and local governments), not just the central civil service.
150. Obong'o, "Implementation of Performance Contracting in Kenya"; interview, KEN2.
151. Interview, Sylvester Obong'o; interview, KEN6. Muriu ("Performance Management in Kenya's Public Service," 80) reports that "most respondents at the ministry studied indicated how in 2006, they each got a 13th salary (bonus) after their ministry was ranked first in the evaluation of the implementation of the performance contracts of the 2005/2006 financial year. However, this rewarding practice seems to have ended after only two years of implementation."
152. Interview, KEN2; interview, Kithinji Kiragu; interview, KEN6; Muriu, "Performance Management in Kenya's Public Service."
153. Interview, KEN2; Interview, KEN6.
154. Interview, Sylvester Obong'o.
155. Interview, Kithinji Kiragu.
156. Interview, KEN6.
157. Muriu, "Performance Management in Kenya's Public Service," 70.
158. Roselyn W. Gakure et al., "Role of Performance Contracting in Enhancing Effectiveness of Performance in the Civil Service in Kenya, State Department of Infrastructure," *IOSR Journal of Business and Management* 14, no. 6 (2013): 78–79.
159. Innovations for Successful Societies, "Building A Culture Of Results."
160. Innovations for Successful Societies, "Building A Culture Of Results"; interview, KEN6. The RRI secretariat was initially based in the Ministry of Planning and National Development during its pilot phase before shifting to PSRDS.
161. Interview, Sylvester Obong'o.
162. Innovations for Successful Societies, "Building A Culture Of Results."
163. Interview, Sylvester Obong'o.
164. Interview, KEN6.
165. Interview, Sylvester Obong'o; World Bank, *Implementation Completion And Results Report (Ida41460-Trust Fund No.:TJ57287,TJ56158) On A Credit In The Amount Of Sdr 17.3 Million (Us\$ 25.12 Million Equivalent) To The Government Of Kenya For An Institutional Reform & Capacity Building Project*, Report No ICR2.129 (March 29 2012); Innovations for Successful Societies, "Building A Culture Of Results."
166. Interview, Sylvester Obong'o; Innovations for Successful Societies, "Building A Culture Of Results."
167. Interview, Sylvester Obong'o.
168. Interview, Gemma Mbaya.
169. Innovations for Successful Societies, "Building A Culture Of Results."
170. World Bank, *Implementation Completion And Results Report (Ida41460)*, 55.
171. Department for International Development (DFID), "Project Completion Review," 7.
172. Department for International Development (DFID), "Project Completion Review: "; interview, KEN6.
173. Interview, Kithinji Kiragu.
174. Africa Development Professional Group, *End Phase Evaluation of the Results for Kenya Programme* (unpublished, 2011), cited in United Nations Development Program (UNDP), *From Reform to Transformation: UNDP's Support to Public Sector Reforms in Kenya. Lessons Learnt for Devolution* (Joseph L. M. Mugore, Mugore Associates, June 2015), 11.
175. Government of Kenya, *Sector Plan for Public Sector Reforms 2013–2017* (Ministry of Transport and Infrastructure, 2013), 2–3.
176. Department for International Development (DFID), "Project Completion Review," 14.
177. Innovations for Successful Societies, "Building A Culture Of Results."

178. Interview, Sylvester Obong'o; interview KEN6.
179. Muriu, "Performance Management in Kenya's Public Service," 69.
180. Interview, Sylvester Obong'o; interview, KEN6; Innovations for Successful Societies, "Building A Culture Of Results"; Muriu, "Performance Management in Kenya's Public Service."
181. Interview, Kithinji Kiragu; interview, Gemma Mbaya; interview, Sylvester Obong'o.
182. Department for International Development (DFID), "Project Completion Review"; World Bank, *Implementation Completion And Results Report (Ida41460)*.
183. Muriu, "Performance Management in Kenya's Public Service," 80–82.
184. World Bank, *Implementation Completion And Results Report (Ida41460)*, 54.
185. Interview, Sylvester Obong'o.
186. Author's calculations from data in Obong'o, "Political Influence, Appointments and Public Sector," 253–57.
187. World Bank, *Implementation Completion And Results Report (Ida41460)*, 54.
188. Department for International Development (DFID), "Project Completion Review," 5.
189. World Bank, *Implementation Completion And Results Report (Ida41460)*, 53–54; interview, Gemma Mbaya.
190. Salome C. R. Korir et al., "Performance Management and Public Service Delivery in Kenya," *European Journal of Research and Reflection in Management Sciences* 3, no. 4 (2015): 42–54.
191. United Nations Development Program (UNDP), *End of Programme Evaluation: Public Sector Reforms Programme, Phase II* (PWC, May 2013).
192. Department for International Development (DFID), *An Evaluation of DFID-Funded Technical Cooperation for Economic Management in Sub-Saharan Africa* (evaluation report, vol. 2, EV667, 2006), 80; Government of Kenya, *Investment Programme For The Economic Recovery Strategy For Wealth And Employment Creation, 2003–2007* (March 12 2004, revised), 63–64.
193. Department for International Development (DFID), "Project Completion Review"; interview, KEN6.
194. Muriu, "Performance Management in Kenya's Public Service."
195. World Bank, *Implementation Completion And Results Report (Ida41460)*; Department for International Development (DFID), "Project Completion Review"; United Nations Development Program (UNDP), *End of Programme Evaluation*.
196. Interview, KEN6.
197. Hope, "Managing the Public Sector in Kenya."
198. World Bank, *Implementation Completion And Results Report (Ida41460)*, 54; Department for International Development, "Project Completion Review," 5.
199. United Nations Development Program (UNDP), *End of Programme Evaluation*.
200. United Nations Development Program (UNDP), *Project Closure Report: 00045420-Public Sector Reforms* (2013); Government of Kenya, *Sector Plan for Public Sector Reforms 2013–2017*, 3; interview, Gemma Mbaya.
201. Interview, Kithinji Kiragu.
202. Interview, Gemma Mbaya; interview KEN6; Rachel Sohn Firestone et al., *Citizen Service Centers in Kenya: The Role of Huduma Centers in Advancing Citizen-Centered Service Delivery in a Context of Devolution and Digitization* (World Bank, Citizen Service Centers: Pathways Toward Improved Public Service Delivery, 2017).
203. Muriu, "Performance Management in Kenya's Public Service," 92; interview, Gemma Mbaya.
204. Firestone et al., *Citizen Service Centers in Kenya*.
205. Firestone et al., *Citizen Service Centers in Kenya*; interview, Kithinji Kiragu.
206. Firestone et al., *Citizen Service Centers in Kenya*. This source also reports that rewards are associated with these rankings, but it is unclear what these constitute or how they are given.
207. Firestone et al., *Citizen Service Centers in Kenya*.

208. Interview, Gemma Mbay.
209. Government of Kenya, *Sector Plan for Public Sector Reforms 2013–2017*.
210. Firestone et al., *Citizen Service Centers in Kenya*.
211. Alfred Ong'era and Beverly Musili, *Public Sector Reforms In Kenya: Challenges And Opportunities* (Kenya Institute for Public Policy Research and Analysis WP/29/2019, 2019); interview, Sylvester Obong'o. These devolution-driven reforms fall outside the scope of this book.
212. Muriu, "Performance Management in Kenya's Public Service."
213. Muriu, "Performance Management in Kenya's Public Service," 69.
214. Government of Kenya, *Sector Plan for Public Sector Reforms 2013–2017*; Government of Kenya, *Public Service Transformation Framework* (Presidency, Ministry of Public Service, Youth and Gender Affairs, 2017).
215. Interview, Mahmud Yayale Ahmed; interview, Tunji Olaopa; Haruna Dantaro Dlakwa, "Salient Features of the 1988 Civil Service Reforms in Nigeria," *Public Administration and Development* 12 (1992): 297–311.
216. Alex Sekwat, "Civil Service Reform in Post-Independence Nigeria: Issues and Challenges," *Public Administration Quarterly* 25, no. 2 (2002): 498–517.
217. Interview, Mahmud Yayale Ahmed; Dlakwa, "Salient Features."
218. Interview, Tunji Olaopa.
219. Cornelius Ofobuisi Okorie and Sunday O. Onwe, "Appraisal of Civil Service Reforms in Nigeria and Options for Stability," *Public Policy and Administration Research* 6, no. 9 (2016): 15–24; Solomon Adebayo Adedire, "Reinventing Nigerian Civil Service for Effective Service Delivery in the 21st Century," *Fountain Journal of Management and Social Sciences* 4, no. 1 (2014): 104–19.
220. Okorie and Onwe, "Appraisal of Civil Service Reforms."
221. Caleb Imuetinyan Ogbegie, "The Need for a Civil Service Reform in Nigeria" (master's thesis, University of Vaasa, 2008), 46–47; Sekwat, "Civil Service Reform."
222. Cornelius Ofobuisi Okorie and Stella Odo, "A Survey of Public Service Reforms in Nigeria: 1999–2013," *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 4, no. 10 (2014): 267–75.
223. Interview, Tunji Olaopa.
224. Interview, Mahmud Yayale Ahmed.
225. Joseph Okwesili Nkwede, "Public Sector Restructuring and Governance in Nigeria: Perspectives, Processes and Challenges," *Journal of Business and Management* 2, no. 3 (2013): 32–44.
226. Interview, Mahmud Yayale Ahmed; interview, Tunji Olaopa.
227. Interview, Tunji Olaopa.
228. Interview, Mahmud Yayale Ahmed; interview, Tunji Olaopa.
229. Interview, Mahmud Yayale Ahmed; interview, Tunji Olaopa.
230. Interview NIGI; iInterview, Nnenna Akajemeli; Interviewinterview, Mahmud Yayale Ahmed.
231. Interview, Tunji Olaopa.
232. Interview, Mahmud Yayale Ahmed; interview, Tunji Olaopa. The public service reform strategy was subsequently integrated into the broader national economic empowerment development strategy (NEEDS) national development plan as its public administration component; I therefore do not include NEEDS as a distinct reform effort on its own in the timeline even though it was under the NEEDS banner that many people encountered these reforms.
233. Interview, Mahmud Yayale Ahmed.
234. Interview, Tunji Olaopa; Okorie and Odo, "A Survey of Public Service Reforms."
235. Okorie and Odo, "A Survey of Public Service Reforms"; Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *Public Service Reforms in Nigeria: 1999–2014, A Comprehensive Review* (April 2015); interview, Joe Abah; interview, Mahmud Yayale Ahmed.
236. Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *Public Service Reforms*.
237. Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *Public Service Reforms*, 28.
238. Interview, Tunji Olaopa.

239. Interview, Tunji Olaopa.
240. Interview, NIG1; interview, Nnenna Akajemeli.
241. SERVICOM, “Delivering Service in Nigeria: A Roadmap” (2004).
242. Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *Public Service Reforms*; Okorie and Odo, “A Survey of Public Service Reforms.”
243. Interview, NIG1; Okorie and Odo, “A Survey of Public Service Reforms.”
244. Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *Public Service Reforms*.
245. Florence O. Ogunrin and Andrew E.O. Erhijakpor, “SERVICOM Policy Intervention: Improving Service Quality in Nigerian Public Sector,” *Global Journal of Social Sciences* 8, no. 1 (2009): 51–60.
246. Interview, Joe Abah.
247. Interview, NIG1.
248. Interview, Nnenna Akajemeli.
249. Interview, NIG1.
250. Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *Public Service Reforms*, 155.
251. SERVICOM, “Delivering Service in Nigeria”; Interview, Nnenna Akajemeli.
252. Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *Public Service Reforms*.
253. Interview, Joe Abah.
254. Interview, Joe Abah.
255. Interview, NIG1.
256. Interview, NIG3
257. Interview, Joe Abah.
258. Interview, Joe Abah.
259. Okorie and Odo, “A Survey of Public Service Reforms”; John Olushola Magbadelo, “Reforming Nigeria’s Federal Civil Service,” *India Quarterly* 72, no. 1 (2016): 78, 80.
260. Interview, Tunji Olaopa.
261. Interview, Tunji Olaopa.
262. Federal Republic of Nigeria, “National Strategy for Public Service Reform” (July 2017).
263. Federal Republic of Nigeria, “National Strategy for Public Service Reform,” 27.
264. Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *Public Service Reforms*.
265. Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *Public Service Reforms*; interview, Mahmud Yayale Ahmed.
266. John Olushola Magbadelo, “The Problematics of Service Delivery in Nigeria,” (*Annals of Social Sciences and Management Studies* 5, no. 3, (2020),): 0053–0059.
267. Lawal Bello Dogarawa, “A New Model for Performance Measurement in the Nigerian Public Service,” *International Journal of Business and Management* 6, no. 12 (2011): 212–21; interview, Joe Abah.
268. Interview, Tunji Olaopa.
269. Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *Public Service Reforms*, 33; Folasade Yemi-Esan, “FG Replaces APER with PMS to Assess Civil Servants’ Performance,” This Day, November 17, 2020, <https://www.thisdaylive.com/index.php/2020/11/17/fg-replaces-aper-with-pms-to-assess-civil-servants-performance/>.
270. Interview, Tunji Olaopa; interview, Joe Abah; interview, NIG6.
271. Amina M. B. Shamaki, “An Effective Performance Management System For The Federal Public Service,” presentation, Office of the Head of the Civil Service, accessed August 22, 2022, <https://studylib.net/doc/9713525/final-an-effective-performance-management-system>.
272. Interview, Joe Abah.
273. Interview, Joe Abah.
274. Interview, Joe Abah.
275. Interview, Joe Abah.
276. Okorie and Odo, “A Survey of Public Service Reforms.” The committee also had a mandate to examine issues related to personnel management. Its chief recommendation on this was the

- 2009 reform of tenure policy for permanent secretaries discussed earlier, which was subsequently reversed in 2015.
277. Okorie and Odo, "A Survey of Public Service Reforms"; Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *Public Service Reforms*; interview, Dozie Okpalaobieri.
278. Interview, Dozie Okpalaobieri.
279. Federal Republic of Nigeria, "White Paper on the Report of the Presidential Committee on Restructuring and Rationalization of Federal Government Parastatals, Commissions and Agencies" (March 2014); interview, Dozie Okpalaobieri.
280. Interview, Joe Abah.
281. Interview, NIG1.
282. Interview, Nnenna Akajemeli.
283. Interview, NIG1; Interview interview, Nnenna Akajemeli; Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *"Public Service Reforms."*
284. Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *"Public Service Reforms,"* 156.
285. Office of the Secretary to the Government of the Federation, *Public Service Reforms,* 156.
286. Interview, NIG1; Otiye Igbuzor, "An Overview Of Service Delivery Initiative: 12 Years After," paper presented at the National Policy Dialogue on Strategies for Improving Service Delivery in Government Parastatals, Agencies and Commissions in Nigeria, State House, Abuja, March 27, 2017, <https://thewillnews.com/opinion-an-overview-of-service-delivery-initiative-12-years-after/>.
287. Interview, NIG1.
288. Okey Marcellus Ikeanyibe, "New Public Management and Administrative Reforms in Nigeria," *International Journal of Public Administration* 39, no. 7 (2015): 563–76.
289. Federal Republic of Nigeria, "National Strategy for Public Service Reform," 14.
290. Federal Republic of Nigeria, "National Strategy for Public Service Reform."
291. Federal Republic of Nigeria, "National Strategy for Public Service Reform," 149.
292. République du Sénégal, "Bureau Organisation et Méthodes: Evolution institutionnelle," accessed September 14, 2022, <https://www.bom.gouv.sn/?q=node/9>; Aminatou Ahne, "Quand l'Etat perd son cerveau," *Enquête+*, June 10, 2015, <https://www.enqueteplus.com/content/bom-absence-de-statut-recrutement-sans-epreuves-ecrites...-quand-l-etat-perd-son-cerveau>; Mamadou Ndiaye and Babacar Aw, "The M&E System in Senegal," in *African Monitoring and Evaluation Systems: Exploratory Case Studies* (University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, 2012); République du Sénégal, *Etude Diagnostique Du Service Public: Tome 1: Analyse de Synthèse des Reformes Publiques* (Ministère De La Fonction Publique, De La Rationalisation Des Effectifs Et Du Renouveau Du Service Public, EXA-Consulting, May 18, 2016).
293. International Labour Organization, "Improving the Performance"; République du Sénégal, *Etude Diagnostique Du Service Public*; interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane. All translations from French in this section are the author's. The original French is included in some endnotes for cases in which the English translation is ambiguous or loses some of the meaning of the original text.
294. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane. « Moins d'état, et mieux d'état ».
295. International Labour Organization, "Improving the Performance."
296. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane; International Labour Organization, "Improving the Performance"; Abdoul Aziz Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public: et la gestion des ressources humaines: Le cas du Senegal," S.A.P. 4.33/W.P. 87, International Labor Organization, 1995.
297. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
298. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane; Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public."
299. Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public."
300. Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public."
301. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
302. Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public"; interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.

303. World Bank, *Rapport d'évaluation Retrospective—Senegal - Quatrieme Credit d'Ajustement Structurel—Credit 2090 SE - Credit d'Ajustement du Secteur Financier—Credit 2077 SE—May 3, 1995* (WB IBRD/IDA/AFR 44001, P002338, May 3, 1995).
304. Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public."
305. International Labour Organization, "Improving the Performance."
306. World Bank, *Rapport d'évaluation Retrospective*, 23.
307. Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public"; interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
308. Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public," 46.
309. Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public," 42. « accessoire ».
310. International Labour Organization, "Improving the Performance," 26.
311. Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public," 46.
312. Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public."
313. World Bank, *Rapport d'évaluation Retrospective*, 24.
314. Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public," 20.
315. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
316. World Bank, *Rapport d'évaluation Retrospective*, 23–24.
317. République du Sénégal, *Etude Diagnostique Du Service Public*, 90.
318. World Bank, *Rapport d'évaluation Retrospective*, 25.
319. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
320. Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public," 27.
321. Tall, "L'ajustement dans le secteur public," 27.
322. République du Sénégal, "Programme Nationale de Bonne Gouvernance" (April 2002), 15; Serigne Ahmadou Gaye, "La construction de l'administration du Senegal: Entre realites sociales et genie de modernisation?" (mimeo, 2020), 18.
323. Ahne, "Quand l'Etat perd son cerveau"; interview, Ibrahima Ndiaye.
324. International Monetary Fund (IMF), "Senegal—Enhanced Structural Adjustment Facility Policy Framework Paper, 1998–2000," accessed June 21, 2021, <https://www.imf.org/external/np/pfp/senegal/seng-01.htm>.
325. International Monetary Fund (IMF), "Enhanced Structural Adjustment Facility Economic and Financial Policy Framework Paper (1999–2001)," accessed September 14, 2022, <https://www.imf.org/external/np/pfp/1999/senegal/>.
326. Gaye, "La construction de l'administration du Senegal," 16.
327. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
328. République du Sénégal, "Programme Nationale de Bonne Gouvernance," 15.
329. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
330. Gaye, "La construction de l'administration du Senegal," 18.
331. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
332. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
333. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
334. Interview, SEN3.
335. Interview, Ibrahima Ndiaye.
336. République du Sénégal, "Programme Nationale de Bonne Gouvernance," 27–28.
337. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
338. Interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
339. République du Sénégal, "Programme Nationale de Bonne Gouvernance," 16.
340. Interview, SEN3.
341. Interview, Ibrahima Ndiaye; République du Sénégal, *Rapport national sur la gouvernance au Senegal* (Secretariat General de la Presidence de la République, Delegation a la Reforme de l'Etat et a l'Assistance Technique, Programme National de Bonne Gouvernance, 2011).



342. République du Sénégal, “Programme Nationale de Bonne Gouvernance,” 18.
343. CODESRIA, “État De La Gouvernance En Afrique De L’ouest : Sénégal.” Project de Suivi de la Gouvernance en Afrique de l’Ouest, Mamadou Dansokho, Babacar Gueye, and Mbathio Samb, 2011, 12.
344. République du Sénégal, *Etude Diagnostique Du Service Public*, 91.
345. CODESRIA, “État De La Gouvernance En Afrique De L’ouest,” 12.
346. République du Sénégal, “Programme Nationale de Bonne Gouvernance,” 7.
347. République du Sénégal, “Programme Nationale de Bonne Gouvernance”; Interview, Ibrahima Ndiaye.
348. République du Sénégal, “Programme Nationale de Bonne Gouvernance,” 54.
349. Interview, Ibrahima Ndiaye.
350. République du Sénégal, “Programme Nationale de Bonne Gouvernance,” 55.
351. République du Sénégal, “Programme Nationale de Bonne Gouvernance,” 55, 66.
352. République du Sénégal, “Programme Nationale de Bonne Gouvernance,” 71. « gestion de proximité des ressources humaines ».
353. République du Sénégal, *Rapport national sur la gouvernance au Senegal*.
354. Interview, Ibrahima Ndiaye.
355. Interview, Ibrahima Ndiaye.
356. United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), “Projet de Renforcement des Capacités de Bonne Gouvernance (PRECABG)” (n.d.), 3.
357. Interview, Abdoul Wahab Ba.
358. Interview, SEN3; interview, Abdoul Wahab Ba.
359. République du Sénégal, *Rapport national sur la gouvernance au Senegal*, 69.
360. Interview, SEN3.
361. Interview, Ibrahima Ndiaye.
362. Interview, Ibrahima Ndiaye.
363. Gaye, “La construction de l’administration du Senegal,” 18–19.
364. République du Sénégal, *Rapport national sur la gouvernance au Senegal*, 65.
365. Interview, Abdoul Wahab Ba.
366. Interview, Abdoul Wahab Ba; interview, Souleymane Nasser Niane.
367. Interview, Abdoul Wahab Ba.
368. Interview, Abdoul Wahab Ba.
369. République du Sénégal, *Rapport national sur la gouvernance au Senegal*, 64; République du Sénégal, “Schema Directeur de Modernisation de l’Administration Publique (SDMAP) 2015–2022,” Presentation, Bureau Organisation et Méthodes, Présidence de la République, Secrétariat Général, n.d., 10.
370. République du Sénégal, *Rapport national sur la gouvernance au Senegal*; République du Sénégal, “Schema Directeur de Modernisation de l’Administration Publique.” The SDRE/SDMAP are perhaps most different from preceding reforms in their emphasis on deconcentration and decentralization, although these are beyond the scope of this book.
371. Interview, Abdoul Wahab Ba.
372. République du Sénégal. “Bureau Organisation et Méthodes”; interview, Ibrahima Ndiaye.
373. République du Sénégal, “DECRET n° 2010–1812 en date du 31 décembre 2010,” Journal Officiel N. 6577 du Samedi March 19, 2011.
374. Interview, SEN3.
375. Interview, Ibrahima Ndiaye.
376. République du Sénégal, “Arrêté ministériel n° 8625 en date du 23 mai 2017 fixant les modalités d’organisation et de fonctionnement du Comité de modernisation de l’Administration publique,” Journal Officiel du Sénégal, 2017. « à favoriser l’appropriation par les acteurs de la culture d’innovation et l’efficacité des actions de modernisation au sein des ministères. »
377. Interview, Ibrahima Ndiaye.
378. Interview, Ibrahima Ndiaye.

379. Geraldine Joslyn Fraser-Moleketi, "Public Service Reform in South Africa: An Overview of Selected Case Studies From 1994–2004" (master's thesis, University of Pretoria, South Africa, 2006), 18.
380. Ministry for the Public Service and Administration, "White Paper on the Transformation of the Public Service," notice 1227 of 1995 (November 15, 1995), 8.
381. Republic of South Africa, *Report of the Presidential Review Commission on the Reform and Transformation of the Public Service in South Africa* (1998).
382. Robert Cameron, "Public Service Reform in South Africa: From Apartheid to New Public Management," in *The International Handbook of Public Administration and Governance*, ed. Andrew Massey and Karen Johnston (Edward Elgar Press, 2015), 135–57; interview, SA1; interview, SA5.
383. Republic of South Africa, "White Paper on Human Resource Management of the Public Service" (n.d.), 27.
384. Cameron, "Public Service Reform in South Africa."
385. Nyana Faith Rakate, "Transformation In The South African Public Service: The Case Of Service Delivery in the Department of Health" (master's thesis, University of Pretoria, South Africa, 2006), 12. See also Ministry for the Public Service and Administration, "White Paper on the Transformation of the Public Service."
386. Paseka Ncholo et al., "Reforming the Public Service in South Africa: A Policy Framework," *Public Administration and Development* 20, no. 2 (2000), 87–102; Fraser-Moleketi, "Public Service Reform in South Africa"; Jerry O. Kuye, "Public Sector Reforms: The Case for South Africa—1994–2005," *Journal of Public Administration* 41, no. 2.2 (2006), 290–309; Rakate, "Transformation In The South African Public Service"; Zwelakhe Tshandu and Samuel Kariuki, "Public Administration and Service Delivery Reforms: A Post-1994 South African Case," *South African Journal of International Affairs* 17, no. 2 (2010): 189–208.
387. Cameron, "Public Service Reform in South Africa," 141.
388. Ministry for the Public Service and Administration, "White Paper on the Transformation of the Public Service," 5. The white paper distinguishes this short-term transformation from administrative reform more generally, which it presumes will be ongoing.
389. Department of Public Service and Administration (DPSA), "White Paper: Affirmative Action in the Public Service," March, general notice 564 of 1998, *Government Gazette* 394, no. 18800 (April 23, 1998): 19.
390. Department of Public Service and Administration (DPSA), "White Paper."
391. Fraser-Moleketi, "Public Service Reform in South Africa"; Ncholo et al., "Reforming the Public Service in South Africa"; Kuye, "Public Sector Reforms"; interview, SA1.
392. Sergio Fernandez, *Representative Bureaucracy and Performance: Public Service Transformation in South Africa* (Palgrave MacMillan, 2020).
393. Fraser-Moleketi, "Public Service Reform in South Africa," 87.
394. Cameron, "Public Service Reform in South Africa," 144–45.
395. Cameron, "Public Service Reform in South Africa," 144–145.
396. Interview, Ruan Kitshoff.
397. Cameron, "Public Service Reform in South Africa."
398. Interview, Ruan Kitshoff.
399. Republic of South Africa, "White Paper on Public Service Delivery," *Government Gazette* 388, no. 18340, notice 1459 of 1997 (October 1, 1997): 12–13.
400. Republic of South Africa, "White Paper on Public Service Delivery," 11.
401. Mashwale Diphofa, "Towards Intensifying the Batho Pele Campaign," *Service Delivery Review* 1, no. 1 (2002): 35.
402. Fraser-Moleketi, "Public Service Reform in South Africa."
403. Public Service Commission, *Report on the Assessment of the Effectiveness of the Batho Pele Policy in Public Service Delivery* (June 2012), 7–8.

404. Interview, SA1; interview, Ruan Kitshoff.
405. Centre for Public Service Innovation, “Ten Years of Unearthing Innovation: CPSI Showcasing and Rewarding Public Sector Innovative Solutions” (n.d.); Centre for Public Service Innovation, “CPSI Entrenching Innovation in the Public Sector: Selected Case Studies” (n.d.).
406. Fraser-Moleketi, “Public Service Reform in South Africa,” 70–71.
407. Interview, Ruan Kitshoff.
408. Interview, Ruan Kitshoff.
409. Department of Public Service and Administration (DPSA), “Batho Pele Handbook” (n.d.).
410. Department of Public Service and Administration (DPSA), “Batho Pele Handbook,” 11.
411. Fraser-Moleketi, “Public Service Reform in South Africa.”
412. Fraser-Moleketi, “Public Service Reform in South Africa,” 71.
413. e.g. BusinessTech, “Home Affairs Considers Banning Staff Mobile Phones,” January 14, 2019, <https://businesstech.co.za/news/technology/293412/home-affairs-considers-banning-staff-mobile-phones/>; Patricia de Lille, “Paying Suppliers on Time Keeps Economy Growing,” City Press, August 22, 2019, <https://www.news24.com/citypress/business/patricia-de-lille-paying-suppliers-on-time-keeps-economy-growing-20190822>.
414. Department of Public Service and Administration (DPSA), *Report on the Implementation of the Batho Pele Programmes in the Public Service, July 2018* (2018).
415. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya; interview, Ruan Kitshoff; Public Service Commission, *Report on the Assessment*.
416. Public Service Commission, “*Report on the Assessment of the Effectiveness of the Batho Pele Policy in Public Service Delivery*.”
417. Public Service Commission, *Report on the Assessment*.
418. Interview, SA1.
419. Interview, SA1.
420. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya.
421. Interview, SA5.
422. Public Service Commission, *Report on the Assessment*.
423. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya.
424. Interview, SA5.
425. Interview, Ruan Kitshoff.
426. Interview, SA5.
427. Interview, Sean Phillips.
428. Interview, SA1.
429. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya.
430. Department of Performance Monitoring and Evaluation (DPME), “Management Performance Assessment Tool (MPAT) User’s Guide” (n.d.).
431. Precious Tirivanhu et al., “Advancing Evidence-Based Practice for Improved Public Sector Performance: Lessons from the Implementation of the Management Performance Assessment Tool in South Africa,” *Journal of Public Administration* 52, no. 4 (2017): 681–704.
432. Interview, SA5.
433. Department of Performance Monitoring and Evaluation (DPME), “Management Performance Assessment Tool,” 4.
434. Department of Performance Monitoring and Evaluation (DPME), “DPME Practice Note No. 4.1.1: Process for Implementing Management Performance Assessment Tool (MPAT) in National Departments” (November 1, 2011, updated), 2.
435. Tirivanhu et al., “Advancing Evidence-Based Practice,” 698.
436. Interview, SA1.
437. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya.

438. Department of Performance Monitoring and Evaluation (DPME), “MPAT 2012 to 2015: Lessons and Support to the Public Service” (n.d.), 16.
439. Fraser-Moleketi, “Public Service Reform in South Africa,” 72.
440. Dieketseng Gail Maphela, “Implementation of the Management Performance Assessment Tool (MPAT)” (master’s thesis, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa, 2015).
441. Interview, Sean Phillips.
442. Interview, SA1; interview, Ismail Akhalwaya; Aisha Ali, “Introducing Context-Based Reforms: Comparative Case Studies on Management Performance Assessment Tool in South Africa and Uganda” (MA diss., University of Witwatersrand, April 2019).
443. Interview, SA1.
444. Interview, SA1.
445. Ali, “Introducing Context-Based Reforms,” 64.
446. Interview, SA5.
447. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya.
448. Management Performance Assessment Tool, “MPAT 1.3: Good Practice Cases” (n.d.); Department of Performance Monitoring and Evaluation (DPME), “MPAT 2012 to 2015.”
449. Interview, Sean Phillips.
450. Department of Performance Monitoring and Evaluation (DPME), “MPAT 2012 to 2015,” 10–11.
451. Interview, SA1.
452. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya.
453. Interview, Sean Phillips.
454. Interview, SA6.
455. Interview, SA6.
456. Interview, SA1.
457. Interview, SA6.
458. Interview, SA1.
459. Ali, “Introducing Context-Based Reforms,” 62.
460. Interview, SA1.
461. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya.
462. Interview, SA5.
463. In 2019, the DPME announced a “new MPAT,” but the design details and implementation of this were not defined within the temporal scope of this book (Republic of South Africa, “Deputy Minister Thembi Siweya/ Planning and Monitoring Dept Budget Vote 2019/20,” DPME Budget Vote Address by Thembi Siweya, Old Assembly of the Parliament of the Republic of South Africa, Cape Town, 2019). One anonymous official with knowledge of the process remarked that this new tool would “try to move away from scoring and focus on just improving, we don’t want this to be part of accountability frameworks or nothing.”
464. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya.
465. Interview, Ismail Akhalwaya.
466. Danny Sing, “Human Resource Challenges Confronting the Senior Management Service of the South African Public Service,” *Public Personnel Management* 41, no. 2 (2012).
467. Interview, SA1.
468. For more discussion on state capture and related debates, see (among many others): Ivor Chipkin and Mark Swilling, eds., *Shadow State: The Politics of State Capture* (Wits University Press, 2018); *Representative Bureaucracy and Performance*.
469. Interview, SA6.
470. Cameron, “Public Service Reform in South Africa.”
471. Jonathan Friedman, “Sticking to the Numbers: Performance Monitoring in South Africa, 2009–2011” (*Innovations for Successful Societies*, 2011), 2–3.

- 472. Sing, "Human Resource Challenges, Confronting the Senior Management Service of the South African Public Service," 384.
- 473. Sing, "Human Resource Challenges," 383–84.
- 474. Interview, SA1.
- 475. Interview, SA5.
- 476. Interview, SA5.
- 477. Interview, SA6.
- 478. Interview, SA5.
- 479. Interview, SA5; Interview, Ruan Kitshoff.
- 480. Interview, SA5.
- 481. Interview, Sean Phillips.
- 482. Interview, SA1.
- 483. Interview, Sean Phillips.
- 484. Interview, Ruan Kitshoff.
- 485. Interview, SA5, Interview SA6.
- 486. Interview, SA5.
- 487. Interview, SA6.
- 488. Interview, SA1.
- 489. Interview, Ruan Kitshoff.
- 490. Interview, SA1.
- 491. Interview, SA1.
- 492. Interview, SA1.
- 493. Interview, SA1.
- 494. Interview, SA1.
- 495. Interview, Ruan Kitshoff.
- 496. Interview, SA5.
- 497. Interview, Sean Phillips.
- 498. Jacob Zuma, "Address by President Jacob Zuma at the Launch of Operation Phakisa Big Fast Results Implementation Methodology, Inkosi Albert Luthuli International Convention Centre, Durban," July 19, 2014; Kathrin A. Plangemann, "Strengthening Performance Monitoring and Evaluation," in *Making It Happen: Selected Case Studies of Institutional Reforms in South Africa*, ed. Asad Alam et al. (World Bank Group, 2016), 71–89; Gabi Khumalo, "Building the Ideal Clinic," *Service Delivery Review* 10, no. 3 (2015): 49–51.
- 499. Interview, SA1.
- 500. Interview, SA1.
- 501. Brighton Litula, "An Evaluation of Public Service Reform Programme [PSRP] Being Implemented in Zambia's Public Service," Copperbelt University, School of Business, Department of Postgraduate Studies, MBA Class 2000/2001, 2001, 5; interview, Ngosa Chisupa.
- 502. Interview, Chandiwira Nyirenda; interview, Jacob Mwanza.
- 503. World Bank, *Report and Recommendation of the President of the International Development Association to the Executive Directors on a Proposed Credit in the Amount Equivalent to US\$200 Million to the Republic of Zambia for a Privatization and Industrial Reform Adjustment Credit*, Report P-5786-ZA (June 3, 1992).
- 504. Litula, "Evaluation of Public Service"; interview, ZAM11; interview, Ndashe Yumba.
- 505. Clever Madimutsa, "Implications of Public Sector Reform for Public Sector Unions in Zambia: A Case Study of the Civil Servants and Allied Workers Union of Zambia in Lusaka District" (PhD diss., School of Government, University of Western Cape, 2016).
- 506. World Bank, *Report and Recommendation*, 6.

507. Theodore R. Valentine, *A Medium-Term Strategy for Enhancing Pay and Conditions of Service in the Zambian Public Service* (Crown Consultants International, 2002), xiii.
508. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report—Zambia—Economic and Social Adjustment Credit (Credit 2577-ZA)*, report 15837 (June 28, 1996), 3.
509. World Bank, *Report and Recommendation*, 3; Valentine, *Medium-Term Strategy*, 17.
510. World Bank, *Report and Recommendation*, 3.
511. Mike Stevens and Stefanie Teggemann, “Comparative Experience with Public Service Reform in Ghana, Tanzania, and Zambia,” in *Building State Capacity in Africa: New Approaches, Emerging Lessons*, ed. Brian Levy and Sahr Kpundeh, 43–86 (World Bank Institute, 2004), 58.
512. Valentine, *Medium-Term Strategy*, 17; Stevens and Teggemann, “Comparative Experience,” 82.
513. Litula, “Evaluation of Public Service,” 57.
514. Stevens and Teggemann, “Comparative Experience,” 58; World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report—Zambia*, 7.
515. Valentine, “*A Medium-Term Strategy*.”
516. Interview, ZAM11.
517. Interview, Chandiwira Nyirenda.
518. Interview, Jacob Mwanza.
519. Interview, Jacob Mwanza.
520. Interview, Jacob Mwanza.
521. Interview, Moses Kondowe.
522. Stevens and Teggemann, “Comparative Experience,” 52.
523. Interview, Leonard Hikaumba.
524. Interview, Roland Msiska.
525. Interview, Moses Kondowe.
526. Interview, Moses Kondowe.
527. Interview, Moses Kondowe; interview, ZAM11; interview, Ngosa Chisupa; interview, Jacob Mwanza.
528. Interview, ZAM11.
529. Interview, Ngosa Chisupa.
530. Interview, Moses Kondowe.
531. Interview, Ndashe Yumba.
532. Interview, Ndashe Yumba.
533. Interview, Ndashe Yumba.
534. Interview, Moses Kondowe; interview, Leonard Hikaumba.
535. Madimutsa, “Implications of Public Sector Reform”; interview, Leonard Hikaumba.
536. Interview, ZAM21.
537. Kiragu, “Civil Service Reform in Southern & Eastern Africa”; interview, Chandiwira Nyirenda; interview, Leonard Hikaumba.
538. Litula, “Evaluation of Public Service,” 57.
539. Universalialia, *Assessment of the Current Performance Management System Final Report* (Legend Consulting Services Ltd and Universalialia, 2008), 5.
540. University of Zambia, *The Public Service Reform Programme (PSRP) and the Public Service Capacity Building Programme (PSCAP) Impact Assessment* (April 15, 2005), quoted in Universalialia, *Assessment of the Current Performance*.
541. Interview, ZAM11.
542. Litula, “Evaluation of Public Service,” 67, 73.
543. The PSRP did not formally cease in 1999 and stayed in existence as an umbrella for subsequent reforms. However, I refer to PSRP in the narrow sense commonly used in Zambia under which PSRP refers only to the pre-PSCAP reforms in the 1990s.

544. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (Ida-33290 Ppfi-Q1440 Ppfi-Q1441) on a Credit in the Amount of Sdr 20.4 Million (US\$28 Million Equivalent) to the Republic of Zambia for a Public Service Capacity Building Project in Support of the First Phase of the Public Service Capacity Building Program*, Report 34450 (December 28, 2005), 14.
545. Interview, ZAM11.
546. Interview, John Kasanga.
547. Interview, Moses Kondowe.
548. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (Ida-33290 Ppfi-Q1440 Ppfi-Q1441)*; interview, Moses Kondowe.
549. Interview, Moses Kondowe; interview, ZAM15.
550. Stevens and Teggemann, "Comparative Experience."
551. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (Ida-33290 Ppfi-Q1440 Ppfi-Q1441)*, 9.
552. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (Ida-33290 Ppfi-Q1440 Ppfi-Q1441)*, 9.
553. Interview, ZAM15.
554. Stevens and Teggemann, "Comparative Experience," 72.
555. Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance*, 5.
556. Interview, Moses Kondowe.
557. World Bank, *ICR Review—Public Service Capacity Building Project (PSCAP)*, (Independent Evaluation Group Report ICRR12372, 2006), 4.
558. World Bank, *Project Appraisal Document on a Proposed Credit in the Amount of SDR 20.4 Million (US\$28 Million Equivalent) to the Republic of Zambia for a Public Service Capacity Building Project in Support of the First Phase of the Public Service Capacity Building Program*, (February 22, 2000); Annie Chitentu Malambo, "Retirement and the Zambia Public Service Reform Programme in the Ministry of Agriculture and Cooperatives 1993–2003" (Master's thesis, University of Zambia, 2013); interview, John Kasanga.
559. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (Ida-33290 Ppfi-Q1440 Ppfi-Q1441)*.
560. Interview, Moses Kondowe.
561. Valentine, *Medium-Term Strategy*, 92.
562. University of Zambia, *The Public Service Reform Programme (PSRP)*; Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance*.
563. University of Zambia, *The Public Service Reform Programme (PSRP)*, 3.
564. Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance*, 25.
565. Universalia, "Assessment of the Current Performance Management System", 26.
566. Universalia, "Assessment of the Current Performance Management System", 26.
567. Universalia, "Assessment of the Current Performance Management System", 27.
568. Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance*, 26, 27, 31.
569. Interview, Chandiwira Nyirenda.
570. Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance*, 27.
571. Interview, Chandiwira Nyirenda.
572. Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance*, 28.
573. Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance*, 27–28.
574. Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance*, 27.
575. Interview, Roland Msiska; Valentine, *Medium-Term Strategy*.
576. Interview, ZAM11.
577. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (Ida-33290 Ppfi-Q1440 Ppfi-Q1441)*, 6; interview, Roland Msiska.
578. Interview, Roland Msiska.
579. Interview, John Kasanga.
580. Interview, ZAM11.
581. Valentine, *Medium-Term Strategy*, 88.



582. Universalia, *Assessment of the Current Performance*, 29.
583. World Bank, *Implementation Status & Results—Zambia—Public Sector Management Program Support Project (Po82452)*, Report ISR6541 (2012).
584. World Bank, *Implementation Status & Results*, 2.
585. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (Ida-33290 Ppfi-Q1440 Ppfi-Q1441)*; interview, ZAM11. PSMP also had two major components that were out of the scope of this book, related to decentralization and public financial management.
586. Interview, ZAM14.
587. World Bank, *Implementation Completion and Results Report (IDA-51040) on Three Credits in the Amount of SDF 51.5 Million (US\$ 80 Million Equivalent) to the Republic of Zambia for Poverty Reduction Support Credits (PRSC) I, II And III*, report ICR2761 (June 24 2013), 16.
588. Interview, ZAM20, for instance, speaks of a service charter being adopted in one ministry in 2015/2016.
589. World Bank, *Implementation Completion And Results Report (IDA-51040)*, 16.
590. Interview, ZAM24.
591. Interview, ZAM20.
592. Interview, ZAM26.
593. Interview, ZAM20.
594. Interview, ZAM20.
595. Interview, ZAM14.
596. World Bank, *Implementation Completion And Results Report (IDA-51040)*.
597. Valentine, *Medium-Term Strategy*; World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (Ida-33290 Ppfi-Q1440 Ppfi-Q1441)*, 6.
598. World Bank, *Implementation Status & Results*, 7.
599. World Bank, *Implementation Status & Results*, 7.
600. Interview, ZAM11; World Bank, *Implementation Status & Results*.
601. Interview, Ndashe Yumba.
602. Interview, Roland Msiska; interview ZAM11; interview ZAM15.
603. World Bank, *Implementation Completion Report (Ida-33290 Ppfi-Q1440 Ppfi-Q1441)*, 6.
604. Interview, ZAM5; interview ZAM15; interview, Felix Mushubati.
605. Interview, Roland Msiska.
606. Interview, ZAM15.
607. Interview, Roland Msiska.
608. Interview, Felix Mushubati; Interview, Roland Msiska.
609. Interview, ZAM5.
610. Interview, Roland Msiska.
611. Interview, Roland Msiska.
612. Interview, Felix Mushubati.
613. Interview, Oliver Saasa.
614. Interview, Felix Mushubati.
615. Interview, ZAM15.
616. Interview, ZAM5.
617. Interview, Felix Mushubati.
618. Interview, ZAM20.
619. Interview, ZAM23, Interview, ZAM27.
620. Interview, Oliver Saasa.
621. Interview, Oliver Saasa.
622. Republic of Zambia, “Strategy for the Public Service Transformation Programme for Improved Service Delivery 2013–2018,” (Public Service Management Secretariat, Management Development Division, 2012).

- 623. e.g. Interview, Roland Msiska; interview, Felix Mushubati; interview ZAM14; interview, Leonard Hikaumba.
- 624. Interview, ZAM17.
- 625. Interview, ZAM24.
- 626. e.g. Interview, ZAM17, interview, ZAM21, interview, ZAM26.
- 627. Interview, Felix Mushubati; interview, ZAM14.
- 628. Interview, ZAM17.
- 629. Interview, ZAM14.
- 630. Interview, ZAM14.
- 631. Interview, ZAM27.
- 632. Interview, ZAM18.
- 633. Interview, ZAM26.
- 634. Interview, ZAM18.
- 635. Interview, ZAM11, interview, ZAM14.
- 636. Interview, Roland Msiska; interview, Felix Mushubati.
- 637. Lusaka Times, “Performance Based Contracts Extended to Directors-Msiska,” March 24, 2017, <https://www.lusakatimes.com/2017/03/24/performance-based-contract-system-extended-directors-msiska/>; interview, Felix Mushubati.
- 638. Interview, ZAM14.
- 639. Interview, Roland Msiska.
- 640. Interview, Roland Msiska; interview, Felix Mushubati; interview, ZAM11.
- 641. Interview, ZAM2.
- 642. Interview, Roland Msiska.
- 643. Interview, ZAM14.
- 644. Interview, ZAM14.
- 645. Interview, Roland Msiska.
- 646. Interview, Moses Kondowe.
- 647. Interview, Felix Mushubati.
- 648. Interview, ZAM14.
- 649. Interview, ZAM11.
- 650. Interview, ZAM22.
- 651. Interview, ZAM20.
- 652. Interview, ZAM11.
- 653. Interview, Roland Msiska.
- 654. Interview, ZAM14.
- 655. Interview, ZAM11.
- 656. Interview, ZAM2.
- 657. Department for International Development (DFID), “Annual Review—Summary Sheet—Public Sector Performance (PSP) Programme,” 2019, vi; interview ZAM2.
- 658. Interview, Roland Msiska.
- 659. Interview, Roland Msiska.