

On Tocharian A cognates of the Tocharian B words meaning 'spleen' and 'liver'^{*}

In 2022 A. Huard and R. Chen independently established that words meaning 'spleen' and 'liver' can be reliably identified in Tocharian B. These words, *spalce* (Acc *spalc**) 'spleen' and *yakär** 'liver', go back to Indo-European. In this article, we show that the names of both of these organs can be identified with the same degree of reliability in Tocharian A, where they look as *spälcik* and *ykär*.

Keywords: Tocharian A language; Tocharian B language; Indo-European proto-language; basic lexicon; body part terms; *Garbhāvakrāntisutra*.

Recently, two well-known specialists in Buddhism of Southern and Central Asia, Athanaric Huard and Ruixuan Chen, almost simultaneously and independently demonstrated in a convincing way that there were certain parallels between the Tocharian B fragments PK AS 7M and PK AS 7K and *Yogācārabhūmi* — a treatise on spiritual practices of yoga composed by the Buddhist philosopher Saṅgharakṣa (Huard 2022: 127–243; Chen 2022). This allowed them to make a number of clarifications in the reading and interpretation of the Tocharian text. Maybe the most important of them concerns the line PK AS 7M b5, which contains the sequence *ya* (–) *r spalyco* (the syllable after *ya* is missing). For the first of the two given words, the conjecture *ya(sa)r* 'blood' has been generally accepted (this lexeme is well attested in the Tocharian B texts), the second one remained without translation. A. Huard and R. Chen showed that this sequence should in fact be read as *ya(kä)r spalyco* 'liver [and] spleen', both words having a perfect Indo-European etymology: IE **iekʷ-ṛ* → Toch. B (N-Acc Sg) *yakär** /yákär/, IE **sb̄l̄gʰ-ē¹* → Toch. B (N Sg) *spalce* /späl'ce/ (see immediately below), (Acc Sg) *spalc** /späl'cä/ (in the form *spalyco* one can find the so-called "bewegliche -o" — a vowel which was in certain cases added at the end of Tocharian B word forms to meet the required number of syllables in poetry; see especially Malzahn 2012).

The reading *ya(kä)r spalyco* can be supported by comparison with another Tocharian B text. The beginning of the line B 121 a2 looks like this (the right edge of the previous line is torn off): *kär spalce po yasar* ♦. Definitely, there is the same collocation 'liver [and] spleen' (this time in the N form), and the entire syntagma can be read as *(ya)kär spalce po yasar* ♦ 'liver, spleen [and] all the blood' (Huard 2022: 210, 213; note that in the Toch. B, unlike the Toch. A, the final *-Vkär* is rarely seen). The undoubtedly connection between the forms *spalce* and *spalyco* was already pointed out by D.Q. Adams (2013: 784). About the *lc* ~ *lyc* fluctuation see below.

* The author sincerely thanks S. I. Pereverzeva for the English translation, R. Chen, A. Huard, A. V. Kuritsyna, S. V. Malyshev, M. V. Vyzhlakov, and I. S. Yakubovich for the various help in the preparation of this article, and an anonymous reviewer for valuable remarks.

¹ Our notation of the Indo-European protoform of the word 'spleen' slightly differs from the reconstruction of R. Chen (**sp̄lh₂gʰ-ēn*). However, since reflexes of the name for the spleen are irregular in different IE languages, any reconstruction will actually consider only part of them. For a significant set of previously proposed reconstructions, see the article by M. N. Saenko (in print).

Discovering the Toch. B lexemes with the meaning ‘spleen’ and ‘liver’ is the key for interpreting some difficult passages in the Tocharian A texts. More specifically, we mean texts A 150 and A 375, as well as the unpublished fragment THT 2339.

The text A 150 (precisely, A 150ext, because there are two small fragments, THT 2444 and THT 3149, which pertain to the same leaf, see Itkin 2019: 21) belongs to *Garbhāvakrāntisutra* — a teaching of the weekly development of the embryo in the womb (on the different versions of *Garbhāvakrāntisutra* see the excellent monograph Kritzer 2014).

The text A 375 is a glaring example of the Buddhist *contemptus mundi*; it mentions the worms, the mud, the cemetery, etc. (Burlak, Itkin 2010: 354).

Below we list the relevant parts of three lines from these two texts according to the edition of Sieg, Siegling 1921: 80, 208:

A 150 b2: //// || śäkñupiñcinäs špä koṁsam̄ cami ----- [s]p[ä] lc̄k tä ---

A 150 b4: //// lycäk mäskatär śalyās po <next follows the gap sized 8 syllabic signs>
A 375 a2: //// [späm̄] lycäk mukr[am̄] ♫

The lines A 150 b4 and A 375 a2 were already earlier compared in the article Carling 2021: 86–87. G. Carling relies upon the word division accepted in the edition, and, respectively, regards *lycäk* as a separate word form (adjective). For the line A 150 b4 she proposes the translation ‘(it) becomes *lycäk* on the left side’ (ibid.: 87). Since this is a prose fragment, the words *śalyās po*(*śāsā*) ‘on the left side’ most likely belong to the beginning of the next sentence, so in terms of its content this line is not very informative. Regarding ἄπαξ λεγόμενον *mukr[am̄]* (which is likely to be Loc Sg of an unattested *mukär**, though theoretically other options are possible), G. Carling rates as doubtful the guess of G.-J. Pinault that this word is a borrowing from Sanskrit *mukura-*, *mukara-* ‘mirror’ and proposes the meaning ‘crow, raven’ (also from Sanskrit *mukhara-* ‘crow’) for this word, and for *lycäk*, respectively, the meaning ‘dark, black, grey’ vel sim. (ibid.).

In our point of view, the line A 150 b2, which is not mentioned in the article by G. Carling, is crucial for understanding the structure and meaning of the syntagms in question. This line allows for a partial, but highly possible reconstruction:

|| śäkñupiñcinäs špä<t> koṁsam̄ cami (ācoyis) ----- X tä(mnästär) ‘In the nineteenth week this (embryo’s) ... X appears (lit. ‘is born’).

Each division of *Garbhāvakrāntisutra* as a rule begins with the statement about which of the embryo’s organs appears in the respective week after conception — cf., for example, a whole series of such constructions in the text A 151:

|| wiki(wepiñci)näs špät koṁsam̄ āyäntwam̄ mässunt tämnästr=äm || (A 151 a2) ‘In the twenty-second week his marrow appears’, etc.

The expression *cami ācoyis* ‘this embryo’s’ is also found in *Garbhāvakrāntisutra* many times, including the line A 150 b5.

Comparison with the data of Toch. B allows us to state with certainty that the lines A 150 b2, A 150 b4 и A 375 b2 contain the same word with the meaning ‘spleen’², which is preserved

² Mentions of the spleen (and the liver) are found in the Tibetan version of *Garbhāvakrāntisutra* — particularly, in the rhymed monologue of Buddha (Kritzer 2014: 107). As A. Huard pointed out to us (p.c.), the treatise *Yogācārabhūmi* also includes one of the versions of *Garbhāvakrāntisutra*, according to which “in the fourteenth seven days, the fetus grows the liver, lungs, heart, spleen, and kidneys” (Choo 2012: 220; Huard 2022: 206). Meanwhile,

there as, respectively, *[s]p[ä]lc(ä)k*, *(spä)lycäk* and *[spä]lycäk*³. The correlation between the word stems A *spälc-* ~ B *spalc-* is absolutely regular; yet the extension *-äk* remains unclear: such a suffix is unknown in the Toch. A (the assumption that all three times the word 'spleen' is accompanied by the intensifying particle *=äk* is obviously unlikely). As for the fluctuation *lc* ~ *ly* /l'/ before palatal consonants — cf., for example, the same variation in the Toch. B suffix of substantiva verbalia *-lñe* ~ *-lyñe*. Notably, despite the relative rarity of the word 'spleen' in Tocharian texts, it occurs with *l* as well as with *ly* in both Tocharian languages.

In the index Itkin 2019: 36 the one-side fragments THT 2339 and THT 2352 are regarded as separate and are not attributed to any manuscript. It was after the publication of the index that we established that these two fragments are, respectively, the recto and the verso of the same exfoliated flap⁴. The single fragment THT 2339/2352 resulting from their imposition adjoins the leaf A 375 on the left. The word at the end of the line THT 2339, 2 and, thus, immediately preceding the word *[spä]lycäk* in the line A 375 a2, with a fair degree of certainty can be read as *ykär*, which is exactly as the Toch. A cognate for the Toch. B *yakär** 'liver' should look like.

From all appearances, in the line THT 2339/2352 + A 375 a2 there is a *Gruppenflexion*, typical for the Tocharian languages — a construction in which the last of the homogeneous parts of sentence is in the indirect case, whereas all the previous ones are in Acc (for inanimate nouns, Acc in Toch. A always coincides with N). In this case, the syntagm *ykär [spä]lycäk mukr[am]* means 'in the liver, spleen [and] mukär', so the word *mukär** is also a name of some inner organ. However, the precise meaning and, respectively, the etymology of this word remain unclear.

Thus, from now on we have the following names for 'spleen' and 'liver' in both Tocharian languages:

'spleen': Toch. A *spälcäk* ~ Toch. B *spalce* (Acc *spalc**)

'liver': Toch. A *ykär* ~ Toch. B *yakär**

Remarkably, in 2020 the name for the liver was discovered by D. Sasseville (2020: 562–563) in Luvian: *ik-ku-wa-a[r]* (KUB 35.72:8'). This way, the list of languages for which the reflexes of IE **iek^w-r* are known has increased by a whole three points in just a few years.

Abbreviations and conventions

Acc = accusativus; Loc = locativus; N = nominativus; N-Acc = nominativus-accusativus; Sg = singularis; ||, ♦♦ — punctuation marks of the Tocharian script.

no direct analogue of the text A 150, as far as we know, has been found yet either in Tibetan, Sanskrit or in any other language.

³ If the dot above the ligature *spä* in A 375 b2 is really an anusvāra (the sign of the nasalization of the vowel, which is transliterated as *ŋ*), the scribe must have made a mistake; but it is more likely to be just an accidental ink blot.

⁴ Perhaps the point here is some specific feature of the paper on which the manuscript A 375–378 is written: the leaves numbered A 377 and A 378 in the edition are, in fact, also the recto and the verso of the same leaf.

References

Burlak, Svetlana A., Ilya B. Itkin. 2010. *Yreki et autres addenda et corrigenda-2*. In: T. M. Nikolaeva (ed.). *Issledovaniya po lingvistike i semiotike: Sbornik statej k jubileju Vyach. Vs. Ivanova*: 342–358. Moskva: Jazyki slav’anskix kul’tur.

Itkin, Ilya B. 2019. *Ukazatel’ slovoform k neopublikovannym toxarskim A tekstam iz sobranija Berlinskoy biblioteki*. Moskva: Institut vostokovedenija RAN.

Saenko, Mikhail N. 2023. Praslav’anskoe nazvanie selezenki: problemy etimologii. *Russkij jazyk v nauchnom osveshchenii 1* (in print).

Adams, Douglas Q. 2013. *A Dictionary of Tocharian B. Revised and greatly enlarged. I-II*. Amsterdam / New York: Rodopi.

Carling, Gerd. 2021. Flat mirror or well-shaped disc? Tocharian A *tāpaki* (B *tapākye*) and A *mukär** // *lyuke wmer ra*. In: Hannes A. Fellner, Melanie Malzahn, Michaël Peyrot (eds.). *Indo-European Studies in Honor of Georges-Jean Pinault*: 84–89. Ann Arbor / New York: Beech Stave Press.

Chen, Ruixuan. 2022. Gone with the Winds: A Tocharian B witness to Saṅgharakṣa’s *Yogācārabhūmi*. Report at 34. Deutscher Orientalistentag 12–17.09.2022. Freie Universität Berlin.

Choo, Jessey J. C. 2012. That “Fatty Lump”: Discourses on the Fetus, Fetal Development, and Filial Piety in China Before the Eleventh Century CE. *Nan Nü* 14: 177–221.

Huard, Athanaric. 2022. *Recherches sur les textes de méditation en tokharien*. Thèse de doctorat, Université Paris sciences et lettres.

Kritzer, Robert. 2014. *Garbhāvakrāntisūtra: The Sūtra on Entry into the Womb (Studia Philologica Buddhica, Monograph Series XXXI)*. Tokyo: The International Institute for Buddhist Studies of the International College for Post-graduate Buddhist Studies.

Malzahn, Melanie. 2012. *Now you see it, now you don’t — Bewegliches -o in Tocharisch B*. In: Olav Hackstein, Ronald Kim (eds.). *Linguistic developments along the Silk Road: Archaism and Innovation in Tocharian*: 33–82. Wien: Verlag der ÖAW.

Sasseville, David. 2020. *Anatolian verbal stem formation: Luwian, Lycian and Lydian* (BSIEL 21). Leiden / Boston: Brill.

Sieg, Emil, Wilhelm Siegling (Hrsg.). 1921. *Tocharische Sprachreste. Bd. 1. Die Texte*. Berlin / Leipzig: De Gruyter.

И. Б. Иткин. О тохарских А соответствиях тохарским В словам со значением ‘селезенка’ и ‘печень’

В 2022 году А. Юар и Р. Чень независимо друг от друга установили, что в тохарском В языке могут быть надежно идентифицированы слова со значением ‘селезенка’ и ‘печень’, восходящие к соответствующим индоевропейским лексемам: *spalce* (Acc *spalc**) ‘селезенка’ и *yakär** ‘печень’. В настоящей статье мы показываем, что названия обоих этих органов столь же надежно выявляются и в тохарском А, где они имеют вид *spälcäk* и *ykär*.

Ключевые слова: тохарский А язык; тохарский В язык; индоевропейский прайзык; базисная лексика; названия частей тела; *Garbhāvakrāntisutra*.