10 Translanguaging and Poetry

Adrian Blackledge and Angela Creese

In research on translanguaging, we aim to make sense of people's lives from their perspective. That is, we gather evidence of social and linguistic practice over time and make an analysis of what that evidence tells us about the individuals and groups under investigation. We endeavor to explain the meaning of the social practices of those individuals and groups who are often in some way different from ourselves. However, instead of presuming to endow the translanguaging practices of others with meaning, we resist the urge to explain. Rather than seeking to make the lives of others transparent, we try to allow them to remain opaque. Édouard Glissant (1997) proposed that if the other remains opaque, if we do not grasp the other, or seek to explain the other, we can still stand in solidarity with them. For Glissant (1997: 194), 'widespread consent to specific opacities is the most straightforward equivalent of non-barbarism. We clamor for the right to opacity for everyone'. Glissant argued that the impetus to explain the other is the opposite of accepting difference, and that to accept opacity is to accept people's differences as they are. If we want to resist the urge to make too readily transparent the lives of others but retain the complexity and sophistication of human interaction, we may need to add to our academic repertoire. In this chapter, we discuss a large research project which investigated translanguaging in UK cities, as we moved from the urge to know to a position of not knowing. In the course of this journey, we took a step back from the urge to explain the lives of others and adopted poetry as a means to articulate our observations of social practice.

Translanguaging

Over the course of four months of detailed observation in a busy city market in the UK, in particular, a stall run by a Chinese butcher, we accumulated a sizeable dataset of transcripts and field notes. Analysis revealed that human interaction in the process of buying and selling meat was characterised by good humor, conviviality, generosity of spirit and

people's willingness to get on with others. We saw and heard, in the butchers' interactions in the market, their humor, sales patter, clowning around, haggling, complaining, mocking and much more. We saw and heard them engage in complex language exchanges with people who brought different histories and backgrounds to the interaction. We saw and heard communication that went beyond 'languages', as people made meaning by whatever means possible, including through embodied communication. We also saw that communicative practices were not universally successful. We saw that elaborate performance, including gesture and mime, was a feature of the spatial repertoire of the market, as people with different proficiencies in different languages conducted commercial interactions. Communicative encounters included movement across languages, but languages were by no means the most significant dimension of the translanguaging event, as spaces for communication were opened up and people responded creatively.

Translanguaging is far more than communicative interaction involving two or more languages. It incorporates digital and online interaction. It embraces embodied practice. It refers to linguistic landscapes. It entails everyday translation. But translanguaging also encompasses aspects of experience which are 'invisible and invisibilised' (Deumert, 2022: 15), and which may not be readily observable, including beliefs, ideologies and attitudes to difference and diversity. Translanguaging is both a tangible and intangible practice, which extends 'beyond language to embrace a wide variety of semiotics and modalities for meaning-making' (Li, 2023: 3). Translanguaging incorporates the attitudes and practices with which people seek to forge connections, accommodating a diversity of worldviews, beliefs and perspectives. Such attitudes and practices seek to enable communication, not so much by mitigating difference as by transforming difference into a resource for successful interaction. Li Wei (2022) proposes that rather than understanding language as an abstractable object, translanguaging focuses on the language user in a specific ideological world and also focuses on communicative practices that are purposeful and meaningful in particular contexts. Similarly, we argue that translanguaging is more concerned with the ideologically significant than with the linguistic. We propose that translanguaging is a means of making sense of the world that extends beyond the naming and co-existence of languages. In fact, translanguaging is about breaking through boundaries (Li, 2023).

What we saw and heard on a daily basis in the city market can certainly be described as translanguaging. We frequently observed communicative interactions that incorporated different biographies and learning trajectories, and encounters that included performance, gesture and physical humour. Translanguaging events were records of mobility and experience; they were responsive to the marketplace in which, and the people with whom, they occurred. During these communicative events,

spaces for communication were opened up, and people engaged with each other in whatever ways they were able. The market was a place where communicative resources could be tried out in translanguaging spaces. Fundamentally, it was a place for buying and selling. Translanguaging was a means by which this was successfully and convivially managed.

Writing Translanguaging

We have suggested that included in the usual aims of research on translanguaging is an intention to explain the motivations and meanings of the voices and actions of the social actors participating in the research. Often, explanation is corroborated with reference to research of a similar kind that has gone before, to situate the study in the context of existing theory and method. Analytical commentary on selected examples of data illustrates theoretical points. In this way, arguments are built and theory invoked. Meanings of aspects of social life emerge and are tentatively asserted. An open-access working paper reports the research we conducted in the city market (Blackledge *et al.*, 2015). Eleven articles in peer-reviewed journals and edited book collections also report various academic outcomes of the research. Having engaged in the process of writing ethnography conventionally, we wanted to do more. We also wanted to do less. We wanted to do more to allow the voices and actions of the market to stand for themselves. We also wanted to do less to explain the meaning of those voices and actions. Literary scholar Mikhail Bakhtin (1963/1984) points out, with reference to Dostoevsky's novels, that the human being cannot finally be explained and that there are things only characters themselves can reveal. In writing a book-length account of our research in the city market, we wanted to let the characters we encountered in the market hall speak for themselves, without academic explanation. Influenced by the polyphonic documentary writing of Nobel laureate Svetlana Aleksievich (2005, 2015, 2016; Prendergast *et al.*, 2009), we wanted to write in a way that articulated the translanguaging of the market.

The book-length account, *Voices of a City Market: An Ethnography* (Blackledge & Creese, 2019), represents the voice and action, the sound and smell, the taste and touch of the market. Taking the butcher's stall run by husband-and-wife migrants from China and Malaysia as its starting point, the text represents the shout-outs of butchers selling their wares, the haggling of customers seeking discounted prices, sharp-edged banter between stallholders, conversations at the family dinner table, stories of becoming and belonging, signage on posters and notices around the market hall, and much more. There are pigs' hearts, chickens' feet, goats' heads and exotic fish. There are children's shoes and Wellington boots, music tee-shirts and balaclavas, nail bars and tattoo parlors, greasy spoon cafés and noodle shops. This part of the book is constructed

from a total of more than 100,000 words of observational field notes; 35 hours of audio recordings and video recordings in the market hall; 30 hours of audio recordings in the butcher's home; more than 200 photographs; 150 online, digital and social media screenshots; and transcripts of 18 interviews with market stallholders. *Voices of a City Market: An Ethnography* represents the actions, sounds, interactions, opinions, memories, digital communications and linguistic landscape of the market. In total, 150 of the 304 excerpts of data are from field notes. Ninety sections are extracted from interviews with market stallholders. Eighteen sections rely on transcripts from audio and video recordings. Seventeen sections represent examples of signage from the semiotic landscape of the market. Twelve photographs taken in the market are included. Offering no explanation, the sections of text stand for themselves. They call attention to the mundane, and they represent the translanguaging of the market. The intention is not to explain characters in sociohistorical or sociopolitical terms. Nor is the purpose to represent the internal life of the characters of the market, but rather to represent the external world of their everyday practice. Here, we see and hear a plurality of voices, which combine but are not merged in the unity of the event. The text allows the closest possible approximation of translanguaging in the market. At once a curation and a creation, the text orchestrates translanguaging through authorial framing, the speech of narrators and the speech of characters. The voices of the market stand without authorial explanation. Alongside the excerpts from data, we include 15 poems that articulate the sounds, smells, tastes, textures, and visual experience of the city centre market.

Poetry

Poetry, like the poet, contains multitudes (Whitman, 1892). In the 'supercharged semic field' (Paterson, 2018: 176), which is a collusion between the poem and its reader (or listener), everything denotes something and often connotes something else. The poetic contract between poet and reader proposes that the poem is doubly charged, because both are 'hell-bent on expressing themselves' (Paterson, 2018: 176). Poetry may be constrained in its form but it is very often expansive in its sense. In the poem, 'language is placed under an excessive degree of formal pressure and emotional urgency' (Paterson, 2018: 165), and something is made anew, as connections and associations offer themselves to both the poet and the reader. The word is no longer merely itself, but is over-connoting, demanding that the reader make connections to other possible senses and domains. The poem has the potential to open out to become something beyond itself, through metaphor, metonymy, rhythm and rhyme. It proposes connections beyond itself, but it has no responsibility to explain itself.

The poet Don Paterson (2018) suggests that the most efficient and natural way to represent sophistication and complexity is through a shift in emphasis from denotative to connotative meaning. For Paterson,

> The denotative sense of a word is singular; the connotative meaning of a word is potentially infinite and contains all possible terms. (Paterson, 2018: 28)

The poem pursues an economy of expression. In the limited parameters within which a poem operates, connotative speech is better able than denotative speech to express complexity and ambiguity. The poem is therefore equipped for connotative meaning in ways in which prose fiction and other narrative genres are not. If one of our aims in writing translanguaging is to engender its multiplicity, its 'manyness' (Deumert, 2022: 9), we require a literary means that is at least plural, preferably multiple and, where possible, infinite. Any word's connotations contain terms which overlap with those possessed by other words. Paterson (2018) proposes that while the denotative sense is capable of paraphrase, the connotative sense is not. The denotative sense aims for differentiation rather than connection. Poetry asks that the reader/listener make connections, often through identifying the shared properties of sound and sense. Poetry always has the potential to expand, to move beyond the literal. Academic explanation, on the other hand, is tied to the literal and runs the risk of reduction.

Paterson defines a poem as 'a piece of text identifiable as a poem by its brazen lack of self-explanation' (2018: 16). The poem's purpose is not to explain the world, but to enact and embody it. The poem in research on translanguaging can be a creative response to questions of representation (Prendergast *et al.*, 2009). It offers analytical and reflexive approaches, as well as representational form. It is a means of inquiry which acknowledges complexity, and contests the single, unimpeachable account of events (Butler-Kisber & Stewart, 2009). It is in the enhancement of and elaboration upon social research outcomes that the poem has rich potential. Poems rely on their ability to speak to something universal, or to clarify some part of the human condition. The poem orchestrates the music of time (Burnside, 2019), incorporating the rhythm and rhyme of everyday life. The poet and researcher share commonalities in their approach: both ground their work in meticulous observation of the empirical world and both are often reflexive about their experience. Poems have the potential to embody the rhythms, time and space of observed practice.

Poetry and Translanguaging

Voices of a City Market: An Ethnography includes poems which represent the translanguaging of the market: its sounds, smells, tastes,

textures and visual experience. At the heart of the book is a poem in 51 sections, each one a rhyming haiku. The poem offers a panoptic view of everyday life in the market. It is based on field notes, interviews, photographs, audio recordings, and video recordings. It is also based on impressions of the market conceived during 4 months of fieldwork observation, and during additional visits both before and after the formal observation period. The poem is written from the perspective of one of the characters in the market, the Health and Safety Operative, as he makes his rounds of the market hall and speaks with stallholders. It also includes the voices of the traders with whom he speaks. Here, we reproduce just 14 of the sections, with brief commentary.

I do have a chat
with some of the stallholders
about this and that.
**

The butcher told me
to get rid of stomach cramps
drink Chinese green tea.
**

For gratis and free
Zuzana from *Global Foods*
slips me a lychee.
**

I pretend to flirt
with the girl on frozen fish
in a cheesecloth shirt.
**

The way they rampage
through the grafter repertoire
they should be on stage.
**

So says the gaffer:
lutjanus campechanus
is the red snapper.
**

It isn't my place
to say whether people should
stick studs in their face.
**

The butchers at *Chik's*
do like to take the mick but
I give them some stick.
**

A man from Tabuk
teaches me how to say thanks
in street Arabic.
**

She was so chatty
I ended up purchasing
salt fish and ackee.
**

He just strokes his chin
when asked the simplest method
to cook sea urchin.
**

Mrs Belkedi
on the candied fruit counter
suggests fennel tea.
**

The story I told
of a fugitive lobster
is centuries old.
**

I spoke to a man
said he'd walked most of the way
from Tajikistan.

Each of the 51 sections of the poem is a rhyming haiku (a poem of three lines of, respectively, five, seven, and five syllables). The haiku is not habitually a musical form. Originating in Japan, haiku depend on syllable count rather than metre. The English ear does not generally count syllables but strong-stressed vowels. However, any arbitrary or random scheme can prove productive for the poet; stress-counts and syllabics both have the capacity to drag strange things from the mind (Paterson, 2018). Furthermore, haiku do not normally rhyme. The emphasis is traditionally on a meditative image, which quietly implies more than it says. Poetic representation of translanguaging is always looking for the poetry implicit in speech. Consequently, poetics from spoken interaction demand constant awareness of the raw material of the speaker's voice, in order to uphold the integrity of the dialogue and search for a speaker's vocal timbre and rhythm (Rapport & Harthill, 2012). The poem may exaggerate or at least call attention to the rhythms of everyday speech. Cahnmann (2003) proposes that it is in paying attention to the rhythms of speech in communities where we carry out research, and in learning how to adapt that speech to the page, that we learn to ask new questions. Poetry emerges from speech as the immediate consequence of emotional urgency and a desire to communicate this urgency by organising and intensifying the

features of language which best carry it (Paterson, 2018). Through poetic structure and form, we may represent and interpret the complexity of translanguaging in human interactions. In empirical research, we are comfortable with the notion that the truth, or at least a truth, may be represented through verbatim transcription of the spoken word. In poetic speech, sound and meaning rise like a tide out of language to carry individual utterance away on a current stronger and deeper than the individual could have anticipated (Heaney, 1989). That is, poetry both represents and goes beyond observable truth.

While the poem articulates the sensuality of the market hall – the smells, sounds, tastes, textures and sights of the busy commercial environment – it also represents the translanguaging of the market. Here, implied or reported, or even silenced or unspoken, are the voices of the stallholders, the butcher, Zuzana from Global Foods, the girl on the frozen fish stall, young traders as they advertise their wares, the gaffer and so on, through to Mrs Belkedi on the candied fruit counter, a man from Tabuk and a man from Tajikistan. The different voices represent different social positions, different biographies, and different histories. They are almost fragments, offering little more than suggestions of encounters and fleeting relations, but connoting and conjuring a thousand associations. They begin to create the texture of the market. The haiku, like other poems in the book, find their source in fieldwork observations. Some of these we can trace directly to the research material. One of the haiku reports advice offered by 'the butcher', who recommends tea as a remedy for a health complaint:

> The butcher told me
> to get rid of stomach cramps
> drink Chinese green tea.

Among the corpus of more than 100,000 words of field notes written during our observations in the market is the following, from researcher Rachel Hu (KC, May and Bradley all work on the Chinese butchers' stall):

> KC and May both asked me if I knew some '土方' <traditional Chinese remedy> to cure a stomach infection. They said that Bradley doesn't feel well these days and always has this acute pain in his stomach. He went to see his doctor the other day but was sent back with only some pain killers. 'You know what the doctors are like here,' they said. They didn't seem impressed by the doctor's prescription, and were trying to persuade Bradley to see a Chinese herbal doctor. 'We told him to eat more garlic every day and not to drink too much Coke, you know,' May said to me. 'He only drinks Coke, and now there's a problem.'

The haiku is not a simple recontextualisation of the field notes. However, it is certainly informed by them. In this instance we are able to make a direct connection between the field note and the poem, both of them concerned with the butchers' ongoing discourse about diet and

health. In its urgent, disciplined structure, the haiku conjures the voices of the butchers and the voice of Bradley and, in so doing, contributes to the polyphony of the overall text.

One of the fishmongers in the market displayed posters of fish on the wall behind his counter. When we interviewed him about this, he said:

> We have got posters there with all the Latin names on. So it's easy; if we're not quite sure, we go to the poster with all the Latin names. So if a customer sees a fish they're used to buying in their own country, we can see the Latin name, and then we can see if we can get that particular variety of fish. If they've got the Latin name, then we know the variety of fish we can get. There is an influx of people from different countries now moving into the UK, so we can try and get the fish that they're used to buying in their own country and keep the trade moving.

One of the haiku picks up the fishmonger's discourse, introducing the Latin name of a species of fish on the stall:

> So says the gaffer:
> *lutjanus campechanus*
> is the red snapper.

Cahnmann (2003: 33) proposes that 'Just as important as what is included in the poem is what is left out'. The concise version of the fishmonger's discourse offers more snap, perhaps, in its condensed form. This is not to say that each of the 51 haiku is a recontextualisation of a source directly traceable in the field notes, or in other ethnographic material generated on site. The poem does not attempt to hold up a mirror to the indoor market as much as it aims to construct an artistic version of translanguaging in the busy commercial setting.

Taken together, the 51 haiku in *Voices of a City Market*: *An Ethnography* make audible the music of what happens in the diverse spaces of the market. Perhaps the most defining characteristic of the poem is its strong rhyme across each of the haiku. This is achieved most clearly when the poem is read aloud, or when the sound of the poem is imagined (in what is sometimes called 'the auditory imagination') by the silent reader. When we speak of rhyme, we often refer to the repetition of the same or similar sounds at the ends of lines in the poem, as in the set of haiku. However, rhyme also includes the repetition of the same or similar sounds within lines in the poem. That is, we are interested in the repetition of sounds at the ends of lines, repetition within individual lines and repetitions of sounds between lines which are not at the ends of lines. We are interested in the repetition of vowel sounds, consonant sounds and combinations of these. Furthermore, we are interested in the repetition of sounds within words. Nor is rhyme merely a matter of surface finish or verbal ingenuity. As well as adding aesthetic quality, it has a structural function, binding together the poem and intensifying logical (or even illogical) connections.

Rhyme is important because sound and sense are aspects of the same thing. The sound of a word or phrase is fundamental to how we understand the poem (Paterson, 2018). In the 51 haiku, rhyme is so frequent, so insistent, that the cacophony of the market is immediately brought into being. These haiku are not in the tradition of meditation and contemplation. They are urgent, in the vernacular and at times discordant. They speak with the voice of the people: 'take the mick'/'give them some stick'. Rhyme in the poem offers technical challenges to the writer, holding things up and slowing things down. Rhyme becomes resistance in the writing process, limiting the words available to those that chime with words elsewhere in the poem. Paradoxically, however, at the same time as this apparent limitation, options proliferate. In the need for end-rhyme, in particular, words suggest themselves which would otherwise have remained out of sight and out of mind. The difficulty of finding a rhyme guarantees that it will take time – and in that enforced delay, we often find out what it is we think and discover what we did not know (Paterson, 2018).

End-rhyme is one of the defining characteristics of what are known as verse forms or poetic forms. That is, long-established frameworks are available to act as structures to support the poem. The great advantage of making use of traditional frameworks in the poem is that the given structure offers both resistance and catalysis in the making of the poem. The chosen form requires adherence to both metrical and rhyming patterns. Verse forms offer resistance because they guide the poem to be concise, economical and rigorous. They offer catalysis because the prescribed rhythm and rhyme offer to the poem words which would otherwise have remained beyond its scope. Formal resistance such as rhyme and meter force the poet into rewriting, into trying again to make the line of poetry feel right. A great deal of trial and error, of adjustment and amendment, drafting and re-drafting, go into the production of a line that sounds as if it clicks and, at the same time, is in some way surprising. So we spend several hours adding a comma only to spend several more taking it away. Paterson (2018) suggests that the better poet is often just the one prepared to stare at the line for an hour longer than anyone else. Poems need originality if they are to breathe. Yet originality is hard to come by. Everything we want to say has been said before, and probably in the way we want to say it. We need whatever assistance we can find to pull originality from its hiding place. The surprising rhyme, the word we would never have found in our imagination without the requirement for rhyme, can bring originality out into the open.

Another common characteristic of the poem is the trope. 'Trope' describes the way in which one idea turns into another, and in doing so, creates an original expression to reflect this new or composite thought. A trope is the process through which we give ideas new expression in language (Paterson, 2018: 106). The structural framework of the poem is flexible and permissive. That is, it allows the poem to indulge its creative

impulses. One of the ways in which the poem does this is to refer to one thing in terms of another and, in doing so, to find relationships between things. As with rhyme, one of the attractions of figures of speech in the poem, which denote or connote one thing in terms of another, is that they are likely to prompt originality. Examples of tropes which compare the literal to the non-literal include metaphor, simile, metonymy and synecdoche. When we say 'it's raining cats and dogs', 'stuck in a traffic-jam', or 'life in lockdown', we are comparing one thing to another and finding a relationship between them. The challenge for the poem is to expand the meaning of the literal by invoking a comparison to the non-literal in a way that is surprising and original. Metaphors work through the shared content, the common ground, of the literal and the non-literal. Metaphor and simile are not independent of the material of the poem. They succeed when they are relevant to the poem, expanding the literal by means of comparison to the non-literal. The comparison should be sufficiently relevant to the poem's concerns to expand on its material, and sufficiently unanticipated to surprise. Metonymy and synecdoche are also figures of speech which allow a comparison of one thing to another in the poem. Again, they are familiar in everyday speech. Metonymy is the substitution of the name of an object for that of something else, usually a larger concept to which it is related. An example of metonymy is 'Downing Street made no comment', in which 'Downing Street' stands in for the UK's Prime Minister or the UK government. In the phrase 'the palace is in mourning', the palace (a building) stands in for the royal family and their staff. Synecdoche is a figure of speech in which a part of something stands for the whole, or vice versa. An example of synecdoche is 'the US put boots on the ground', in which 'boots' stands in for soldiers.

A second series of poems in *Voices of a City Market: An Ethnography* responds not so much to the voices of the market as to the striking visual world of the butchers' stalls. This series of six poems is based on close observation of the translanguaging spaces of the market. Although the six poems are dispersed throughout the volume, they are linked in terms of form. They are each made up of eight lines, and each one takes a description of goods available on the butchers' counters in the market as its starting point. Here, we consider two of the six poems. The first of them refers to a butcher's stall which, among other things, sold cuts of meat known as 'beef mask':

A week until Hallowe'en
and all the scraps of beef mask have gone.
Each day now needles dip and dart
as the pieces join and take shape.

Bullock heads, cow heads, faces of heifers
will wander the streets for one night.
Last year a half-bull–half-devil
oozed fire and smoke from its eyes and nose and mouth.

The poem makes hay with the name of the low-end cut of beef, creating a world in which the meat market becomes a resource for material to make Hallowe'en masks before the masks themselves are transformed into ghoulish creatures wandering the streets at night. The setting seems to be transformed into a textile factory, as 'needles dip and dart' (these verbs are themselves metaphorical, invoking tropes) to make masks out of scraps of beef. The pieces of beef mask, implicitly once abundant, have gone, perhaps scooped up by those with the skills and imagination to transform them. The pieces of meat are finally no longer scraps but are reformed as disembodied bullock heads, cow heads and faces of heifers. Scraps of beef mask are remade as Hallowe'en masks, accorded agency of their own, as they, in their turn, come to life as macabre beings. A narrative emerges, telling a tale of a nightmarish beast at large on a previous Hallowe'en night. The music of the final two lines, 'half-bull–half-devil', 'fire' half-rhyming with 'eyes', as 'smoke' chimes with 'nose', seems to play a devilish tune for All Hallows' Eve. The poem is playful and a little grotesque, but not irrelevant to the ethnographic experience. For those unacquainted with the meat market, the less familiar cuts of meat and offal can seem exotic, even monstrous, and nudge the imagination. The poem expands the literal by invoking a comparison to the non-literal in a way that is surprising and original. The poem is literally haunted by the possibilities of the non-human, by the appearance of spectres or ghosts, as what has previously been concealed is very much alive and present (Gordon, 2008: xvi). It dreams of a world which is both present and spectral, as it responds in and through imagination to the world-that-is of the market stall. The poem allows us to imagine what was lost or what never existed to imagine that things may have been otherwise (Gordon, 2008: 57). Deumert (2022: 4) proposes that in its departure from the norm, the invocation of the spectral has much in common with 'the kind of agency that informs work on translanguaging'. If translanguaging supersedes adherence to the socially and politically defined boundaries of languages, so poetry refuses the conventional constraints of 'the naïve empiricism that has shaped sociolinguistic work over the decades' (Deumert, 2022: 1). Poetry offers a wide array of semiotic resources and enables us to challenge, through creative practice, the hegemony of 'the standard'. In the poem, 'something has been made of something else – that's what artwork entails, after all – and the more that's made of it, the better' (Heaney, 2003: 395). In the way that translanguaging constitutes an opening out, a move away from the standard, a centrifugal trajectory, so the poem has the capacity to open itself to the realms of the imagination, dream, spectral, and haunted worlds.

A second poem in the sequence makes a comparison between a particular cut of offal on the market and honeycomb lifted from a beehive. The trope is a visual one. The subject of the comparison, tripe (the lining of a pig's stomach in this case), is not referred to by name in the poem.

A tray eased from a beehive is like this:
pale, intricate honeycomb
waxy, rubbery, a tessellated maze
of irregular pentagons.

Scald, cauterize, boil for three hours
with fistfuls of salt until bleached
then drench still steaming and hot
with nothing but sweet malt vinegar.

Metaphors are tropes of correspondence and find family relationships between things (Paterson, 2018: 152). The shared content of this poem, the metaphor's common ground, is the similarity in appearance of the honeycomb in the beehive and the lining of the pig's stomach. The comparison gives the reader an opportunity to see the pig's offal with new eyes, to see it afresh, to reconsider 'the known' via an unexpected correspondence. The delicacy of the first half of the poem ('eased', 'intricate') is in stark contrast to the second half. In an interdiscursive shift, we are now in the realms of a steam-filled kitchen. The sound of the poem becomes harsher, the repetition of hard consonants evoking the energy and noise of the kitchen ('Scald, cauterize', 'fistfuls of salt/malt', 'bleached then drench still steaming'). The sibilance of repeated/s/sounds evokes the environment (the music) of the kitchen. Neither the delicate honeycomb nor a kitchen preparing offal was empirically observable in any literal (or conventionally ethnographic) sense. They enter the realm of the poem as tropes and, in doing so, expand the sense experience of the market. In the way that translanguaging breaks through the socially constructed border between 'languages', so poetry – and metaphor in particular – has the facility to break through the border between the literal and the non-literal. Just as in spoken communication, people are disposed to make meaning with whatever resources are to hand, so in poetry 'it's our instinct to connect any two things that happen to be thrown at us' (Paterson, 2018: 153) by whatever means possible.

Many poems resist explanation, trusting the reader to make the most of their music: their rhythm, their rhyme and their ability to represent one thing in terms of another. This music is played in patterns of lineation, stanza, rhyme, meter and repeated consonant and vowel sounds. As we have seen, the resistance of the structure and form of the poem (its rhythm, metre and rhyme) may act as a catalyst as much as a constraint. Catalysis contributes to originality, as words and forms of expression are newly brought to mind. The flexible framework of the poem's structure offers a space for experimentation and creativity. Rhetorical tropes allow comparison between the literal and the non-literal, expanding the scope and range of the poem. Burnside (2019) concludes that as observers of the human condition, our obligation is to stay attuned to the music of what happens.

Conclusion

In poetry, we do not seek to explain social life but to embody it and transcend it. In moving from the literal to the non-literal, in making sense out of sound, in its music and in its urgent, rhythmic engine, poetry does not so much account for experience as become and exceed experience. Representation of the communicative practices we encounter and observe in research on translanguaging requires an openness to a range of artistic forms. Accounts of the complexity of what we sense in empiricism need creativity as well as accuracy, imagination as well as precision, the figurative as well as the literal. In order to move beyond the referential in our accounts of research, we must continue to develop an expanded repertoire. This repertoire includes drama, prose fiction, visual art, dance and musical composition. It also includes poetry. The attention that translingual scholarship pays to modalities other than language allows us to formulate a sociolinguistics that attends to the world as multi-sensuous and multi-sensed (Deumert, 2022). In this chapter, we have argued that poetry offers a means to represent multiplicity in social life, without an insistence on the imposition of meaning or explanation. The poem stands alone, without commentary, able to articulate the complexity of sense experience.

When we allow ourselves to venture outside our usual approach to writing translanguaging, poetry can help us to see with new eyes. The catalytic potential of rhythm and rhyme and the expansive properties of the trope open up possibilities as we engage in analysis. Released from the requirements of reductive explanation, poetic representation can lead to powerful outcomes, interpretive freedom and a succinct display of research findings. It has the potential to be non-conformist and offer qualities that enable us to move beyond academic conventions. In Cahnmann's (2003: 34) words, 'the literary and visual arts offer ways to stretch our capacities for creativity and knowing'. This is, perhaps, where the greatest potential lies in the development of poetry in research on translanguaging. The poem reveals the 'metaphoric engine' by which language revivifies itself and the metonymic nature of all human naming (Paterson, 2018: 13). In *Voices of a City Market: An Ethnography*, poems make audible the translanguaging of the market. Poems take us beyond the observable, into the realm of the imaginative. In our ambition to represent translanguaging in social life, and to capture the complexity of what we sense, the poem offers a way of seeing and a way of saying.

Deumert (2022) suggests that translingual practice draws on a broad repertoire of meanings that are creatively configured through language and art. In educational contexts, the arts offer an ideal means to capitalise on the full range of students' semiotic practices. Whether we think of translanguaging principally in terms of communication that includes more than one language; or as speech across several dialects; or as

embodied movement; or as digital practice; or as everyday translation; or as a means of problem-solving in interaction between people of different linguistic backgrounds; or as beliefs and ideologies about difference and diversity in the contemporary world; or as a repertoire of semiotic practice which includes music, dance, visual art, poetry and online gaming; or as a means to build fluid, overlapping and versatile contexts for multilingual meaning-making – or whether we think of translanguaging as all of the above – it seems clear that a creative orientation to translanguaging offers a way of bringing the lives of students into the learning space. In research, we can break away from conventional forms of academic writing so that we enact data on stage or make them into dance forms or music, visual art, song, film or poetry. In doing so, we have the opportunity to expand understanding and generate new knowledge. When we ask students to bring something of their semiotic selves into the classroom, we value each one, relinquishing control, allowing voices which are unfinalised and which testify to everyday human life. When students' voices are not only spoken but represented as dance, music, theatre, visual art, song, film or poetry, they engage in translanguaging practice which gives them freedom to express themselves without the constraints of adherence to the standard code. Translanguaging in teaching and research is well served by artistic forms that reveal aspects of imaginative experience beyond the realms of the literal and observable. We propose that poetry offers much in this direction when it is allowed to articulate experience beyond the literal and without explanation.

References

Aleksievich, S. (2005) *Voices from Chernobyl: The Oral History of a Nuclear Disaster*. Translated by K. Gessen. Picador.

Aleksievich, S. (2015) On the battle lost. https://www.nobelprize.org/nobel_prizes/literature/laureates/2015/alexievich-lecture_en.html (Last Accessed 11 January 2025).

Aleksievich, S. (2016) *Secondhand Time: The Last of the Soviets*. Translated by B. Shayevich. Random House.

Bakhtin, M.M. (1963/1984) *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*. Edited and translated by C. Emerson. Manchester University Press.

Blackledge, A. and Creese, A. (2019) *Voices of a City Market: An Ethnography*. Multilingual Matters.

Blackledge, A., Creese A. and Hu, R. (2015) Voice and social relations in a city market. Working papers in translanguaging and translation (WP. 2). http://www.birmingham.ac.uk/generic/tlang/index.aspx (Last Accessed 11 January 2025).

Burnside, J. (2019) *The Music of Time: Poetry in the Twentieth Century*. Profile Books.

Butler-Kisber, L. and Stewart, M. (2009) The use of poetry clusters in poetic inquiry. In M. Prendergast (ed.) *Poetic Inquiry: Vibrant Voices in the Social Sciences* (pp. 3 –12). Sense.

Cahnmann, M. (2003) The craft, practice, and possibility of poetry in educational research. *Educational Researcher* 32 (3), 29–36. https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X032003

Deumert, A. (2022) The sound of absent-presence. Towards formulating a sociolinguistics of the spectre. *Australian Review of Applied Linguistics* 45 (2), 135–153.
Glissant, E. (1997) *Poetics of Relation*. The University of Michigan Press.
Gordon, A.F. (2008) *Ghostly Matters: Haunting and the Sociological Imagination*. University of Minnesota Press.
Heaney, S. (2003) *Finders Keepers: Selected Prose 1971–2001*. Faber & Faber.
Heaney, S. (1989) *The Government of the Tongue*. Faber & Faber.
Li, W. (2022) Translanguaging as a political stance: Implications for English language education. *ELT Journal* 76 (2), 172–182. https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/ccab083
Li, W. (2023) Transformative pedagogy for inclusion and social justice through translanguaging, co-learning, and transpositioning. *Language Teaching* 57 (2), 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1017/S02
Paterson, D. (2018) *The Poem: Lyric, Sign, Metre*. Faber.
Prendergast, M., Leggo, C. and Sameshima, P. (eds) (2009) Poetic inquiry: Special issue. *Educational Insights* 13 (3), 743–744.
Rapport, F. and Hartill, G. (2012) Crossing disciplines with ethnographic poetic representation. *Creative Approaches to Research* 5 (2), 11–25.
Whitman, W. (1892) Song of myself. In *Leaves of Grass* (pp. 29–79). David McKay.