

Contents

Preface	xi
1. Introduction to the Strategy of Argument for Moral Relativity and its Normative Implications	1
1.1 Explaining moral experience	1
1.2 Why we need new analyses of moral language	5
1.3 Reconciling moral objectivity with subjectivity	6
1.4 The normative implications of moral relativity	8
2. The Importance of Moral Truth	10
2.1 The purpose of surveying the analyses of Stevenson and Hare	10
2.2 Stevenson's moral individualism	10
2.3 Hare's principled moral individualism	12
2.4 Using the work of Tarski and Davidson on truth	16
3. Relativist Analyses of Morality as Social Creation	23
3.1 Harman's analysis of morality as social creation	23
3.2 Castañeda's analysis of morality as social creation	26
4. The Recommended Relativist Analysis of Moral "A ought to do X" Statements	37
4.1 Rules and moral statements	37
4.2 An analysis of the moral "A ought to do X"	40

5. The Analysis of "A ought to do X" Statements Completed	48
5.1 Applying theories of reference	48
5.2 A causal theory of moral reference?	52
5.3 The case for applying the descriptive theory	59
5.4 Advantages over the previous relativist analyses	63
5.5 The general use of "A ought to do X" statements	66
6. The Recommended Relativist Analysis of "X is a good Y" Statements and Consideration of Objections	68
6.1 Evaluating according to standards	68
6.2 A general analysis of "X is a good Y" statements	69
6.3 Possible objections to the analyses	71
7. Absolutist Analyses of Moral Statements	80
7.1 Three kinds of absolutist analysis	80
7.2 Gewirth's Kantianism	80
7.3 Nagel's Kantianism	83
7.4 Kantian analyses of moral language	87
7.5 McDowell's Aristotelianism and corresponding analyses of moral language	91
7.6 Foot's Aristotelianism and corresponding analyses of moral statements	96
7.7 Moore's Platonism	100
7.8 Platts' Platonism and corresponding analyses of moral language	102
8. The Method for Explaining Diversity and Disagreement in Moral Belief	105
8.1 Why we need a principle of translation	105
8.2 Quine's principle of charity	106
8.3 Grandy's principle of humanity	107
8.4 The principle of the best explanation	112
8.5 Charity versus the best explanation in translation of moral language	114
8.6 A possible objection to the principle of the best explanation	116
8.7 Absolutist methods of accounting for diversity and disagreement	117
9. Virtue-Centered and Rights-Centered Moralities	121
9.1 The claims to be made for moral relativity	121

CONTENTS	ix
9.2 MacIntyre's theory of moral catastrophe	122
9.3 Are rights-centered moralities less objective than virtue-centered moralities?	131
10. Moral Relativity Within Virtue-Centered and Rights-Centered Moralities	139
10.1 A statement of the hypothesis that there are indeterminacies and variations in truth conditions within rights-centered moralities	139
10.2 A statement of the hypothesis that there are indeterminacies and variations in truth conditions within virtue-centered moralities	142
10.3 An explanation of the Rawls-Nozick disagreement that is consistent with the relativist hypothesis	146
10.4 Will the absolutist explanations of the Rawls-Nozick disagreement work?	150
10.5 Cross-cultural differences between virtue-centered moralities	153
10.6 Do the cross-cultural differences correspond to differences in truth conditions?	156
11. Comparing the Truth of Virtue-Centered and Rights-Centered Moralities	160
11.1 Identifying the differences	160
11.2 Are there differences over the value of freedom?	162
11.3 The case for variation in truth conditions	168
11.4 Accepting moral relativity	175
12. Tolerance and Nonintervention as Implications of Moral Relativity	177
12.1 Does anything follow from moral relativity?	177
12.2 Criticisms of relativist arguments for tolerance	177
12.3 A valid relativist argument for tolerance	179
12.4 Problems posed for the argument	184
12.5 Applying the relativist argument to abortion	190
13. Moral Relativity and the Problem of Equal Worth	198
13.1 Why there is a problem of equal worth	198
13.2 The costs of according unequal worth	203

13.3 Moral relativity, Taoism, and equal worth	206
13.4 Social structures conducive to the attitude of according equal worth	208
13.5 Taoism reconsidered	213
Appendix A	216
Appendix B	220
Notes	223
Bibliography	237
Index	243