

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments	XI
INTRODUCTION	1
1. Object and background	1
2. Method	2
3. Status quaestionis	5
4. Content	6
PART 1: The Aristotelian background	9
1.1 Introduction	9
1.2 The <i>Categoriae</i>	10
1.3 The <i>Analytica Posteriora</i>	15
1.4 The <i>Physica</i>	18
1.5 The <i>Metaphysica</i>	21
1.6 Conclusion	28
PART 2: The status of Eucharistic accidents ‘sine subiecto’ in early scholasticism	31
2.1 Berengarius and his adversaries	31
2.1.1 Berengarius and his use of Boethius and Porphyrius	31
2.1.2 His principal adversaries: Lanfranc of Bec, Guitmund of Aversa, Gilbert Crispin and Alger of Liège	35
2.2 The philosophical elements in theologians of the early 12 th century	38
2.2.1 The school of Anselm of Laon and William of Champeaux	38
2.2.2 Hugh of St. Victor and his school	40
2.3 Petrus Abelardus, his school and his adversaries	41
2.3.1 <i>Theologia Summi Boni, Theologia Scholarum</i>	41

2.3.2	The replies by William of St. Thierry, Bernard of Clairvaux and the author of <i>Capitula Haeresum XIV</i>	42
2.3.3	Various collections and works from the school of Abelardus	43
2.3.4	Magister Rolandus	45
2.4	De Magistri before Petrus Lombardus	45
2.4.1	Magister Simon	45
2.4.2	Robertus Pullus	46
2.4.3	Robert of Melun	46
2.5	Petrus Lombardus and his early adherents	47
2.5.1	Petrus Lombardus and his <i>Sententiae</i>	47
2.5.2	Abbreviations and early <i>Summae</i> on the <i>Sententiae</i> : Magister Bandinus and Gandulphus Bononiensis	49
2.5.3	Petrus Manducator (Comestor)	49
2.5.4	Petrus Pictavensis	50
2.6	Monastic theology: Balduinus de Forda	52
2.7	Gilbertus Porretanus and the Porretani	53
2.7.1	Gilbertus Porretanus and the <i>Sententiae Gisleberti</i>	53
2.7.2	The Porretani	55
2.7.2.1	The <i>Sententiae Divinitatis</i>	55
2.7.2.2	The <i>Commentarius Porretanus in primam epistolam ad Corinthios</i>	56
2.7.2.3	The <i>Summa Zwettlensis</i>	57
2.7.2.4	The <i>Summa de sacramentis</i> ‘ <i>Totus Homo</i> ’	58
2.7.2.5	Alanus of Lille	59
2.7.2.6	Simon of Tournai	60
2.7.2.7	Radulfus Ardens	61
2.7.2.8	Magister Martinus	63
2.8	Pastoral <i>Summae</i>	64
2.8.1	The genre of the <i>Expositiones Missae</i> : Lothar of Segni (Pope Innocentius III)	64
2.8.2	The genre of the <i>Summae confessorum</i> : Thomas of Chobham	70
2.9	<i>Summae</i> at the transition of the 12 th to the 13 th century	71
2.9.1	Praepositinus of Cremona	71
2.9.2	Petrus Cantor	72
2.9.3	Robert Courson	74
2.9.4	Stephen Langton	75
2.9.5	Guido of Orchelles	76

PART 3: The status of Eucharistic accidents ‘sine subiecto’ in high scholasticism before Thomas Aquinas	79
3.1 Secular masters	79
3.1.1 William of Auxerre	79
3.1.2 William of Auvergne	81
3.2 Early Franciscans	83
3.2.1 Alexander of Hales	83
3.2.2 Codex Troyes 1862 (Ps. Odo Rigaldi)	86
3.2.3 William of Melitona	87
3.3 Early Dominicans	94
3.3.1 Roland of Cremona	94
3.3.2 Richard Fishacre	99
3.4 Albertus Magnus	108
3.4.1 <i>De Sacramentis</i>	108
3.4.2 Commentary on the Sentences	112
3.4.3 The treatise <i>De corpore Domini</i> , attributed to Albertus Magnus	127
3.4.3.1 Transubstantiation	128
3.4.3.2 Accidents ‘sine subiecto’	131
3.4.3.2.1 <i>Objectiones fortissimae</i>	132
3.4.3.2.2 Invoking a miracle	135
3.4.3.2.3 Rejection of the arguments in favor of accidents ‘sine subiecto’	138
3.4.3.2.4 The position of <i>De corpore Domini</i>	141
3.4.3.2.5 A reply to the three objections in part 1	145
3.4.3.2.6 The question of a development in Albertus’s thought	147
3.5 Bonaventure, Richardus Rufus and Walter of Bruges	152
3.5.1 Bonaventure	152
3.5.2 Richard Rufus	159
3.5.3 Walter of Bruges	165
 PART 4: The status of Eucharistic accidents ‘sine subiecto’ in Thomas Aquinas and early reactions	 173
4.1 Commentaries on the Sentences of Petrus Lombardus	173
4.1.1 Thomas’ <i>Scriptum super Sententias</i>	173
4.1.1.1 <i>Scriptum super Sententias</i> , Book IV, distinction 11	173
4.1.1.2 <i>Scriptum super Sententias</i> , Book IV, distinction 12	177

4.1.2	First Dominican reactions: Petrus de Tarentasia and Hannibaldus de Hannibaldis	193
4.1.2.1	Petrus de Tarentasia	193
4.1.2.2	Hannibaldus de Hannibaldis	204
4.2	During the 1st Parisian Magistracy	208
4.2.1	Thomas' Quodlibet IX, q. 3, a. un.	208
4.2.2	Adenulphus de Anagnia, Quodlibetum, q. 7	219
4.3	<i>Summa contra Gentiles</i> , Book IV, c. 62–67	223
4.3.1	The contours of <i>Summa contra Gentiles</i> , Book IV, c. 62–63	223
4.3.2	<i>Summa contra Gentiles</i> , Book IV, c. 65	229
4.3.3	<i>Summa contra Gentiles</i> , Book IV, c. 66–67	236
4.4	From the <i>Summa contra Gentiles</i> to the <i>Summa Theologiae</i>	238
4.5	<i>Summa Theologiae</i> III, questions 75, 77	242
4.5.1	<i>Summa Theologiae</i> III, question 75	243
4.5.2	<i>Summa Theologiae</i> III, question 77	246
4.6	Conclusion	259
PART 5: The status of Eucharistic accidents 'sine subiecto' in selected reactions to Thomas Aquinas		261
5.1	Siger of Brabant and the Parisian Condemnation of 1277	261
5.1.1	The Parisian Condemnation of 1277	261
5.1.2	Accidents 'sine subiecto' in the Faculty of Arts	269
5.1.3	Siger of Brabant on accidents 'sine subiecto'	272
5.1.3.1	Theology versus philosophy	272
5.1.3.2	Siger of Brabant on accidents	276
5.1.3.3	Siger of Brabant on accidents 'sine subiecto'	279
5.2	Godfrey of Fontaines	289
5.3	Aegidius Romanus	293
5.4	Dietrich of Freiberg on accidents 'sine subiecto'	311
5.5	John of Paris (Quidort)	323
5.6	The anonymous Sentences commentary in Ms. Brugge, Stadsbibliotheek, 491	330
5.7	John of Sterngassen	341
General conclusion		353
Annexes: Transcripts		
Annex 1: ANONYMUS (PS.-ODO RIGALDI), IV SENT. D. 11 (EXCERPTUM): COD. TROYES, MÉDIATHÈQUE DE L'AGGLOMÉRATION TROYENNE 1862 (=T), FOL. 158vb–159vb, 161va		357

Annex 2: RICHARDUS CORNUBIENSIS, SENTENTIA PARISIENSIS: ASSISI. BIBL. SACRO CONVENTO 176, FOL. 109va–110vb	363
Annex 3: ADENULPHUS DE ANAGNIA: QUODLIBETUM, QUAESTIO 7: UTRUM DEUS POSSIT FACERE, QUOD ACCIDENS SIT SINE SUBIECTO: PARIS, BNF LAT. 14899, FOL. 145rb–145va	368
Annex 4: ANONYMUS, IV SENT. D. 12 : CODEX BRUGGE, STADSBIBLIOTHEEK 491, FOL. 313rb–313va	370
Sigla	375
Bibliography	381
Manuscripts	381
Printed Sources	382
Secondary literature	389
INDEXES	405
1. Index locorum (Thomas Aquinas)	405
2. Index nominum	407

IN PIAM MEMORIAM PATRIS MEI

XAVIER VIJGEN

(1946–1981)