

# DIAGNOSIS

OFFICIAL JOURNAL OF THE SOCIETY TO IMPROVE  
DIAGNOSIS IN MEDICINE

## EDITORS-IN-CHIEF

*Mark L. Graber, Plymouth, MA*

*Mario Plebani, Padova, Italy*

## ASSOCIATE EDITORS

*Paul Epner, Evanston, IL*

*Giuseppe Lippi, Verona, Italy*

*Andrew Olson, Minneapolis, MN*

*Hardeep Singh, Houston, TX*

*Satid Thammasitboon, Houston, TX*

## SECTION EDITORS - CASE REPORTS

*Andrew Parsons, Charlottesville, VA*

*Melissa Plesac, Minneapolis, MN*

*Verity Schaye, New York, NY*

## EDITORIAL BOARD

*Daniela Basso, Padova, Italy*

*Carmel Crock, Melbourne, Australia*

*Pat Croskerry, Halifax, Canada*

*Gurpreet Dhaliwal, San Francisco, CA*

*John Ely, Iowa City, IA*

*Evangelos Giannitsis, Heidelberg, Germany*

*Hugo A. Katus, Heidelberg, Germany*

*Michael Laposata, Galveston, TX*

*Yoryos Lyratzopoulos, London, United Kingdom*

*Jason Maude, Surrey, United Kingdom*

*David Newman-Toker, Baltimore, MD*

*Joseph J. Rencic, Boston, MA*

*Taro Shimizu, Tochigi, Japan*

*Geeta Singhal, Houston, TX*

*Dean Sittig, Houston, TX*

*Alexander von Meyer, Weiden, Germany*

*Laura Zwaan, Amsterdam, The Netherlands*

DE GRUYTER

**ABSTRACTED/INDEXED IN** Baidu Scholar; Case; CNKI Scholar (China National Knowledge Infrastructure); CNPIEC - cnpLINKer; Dimensions; EBSCO (relevant databases); EBSCO Discovery Service; Embase; EMCare; Google Scholar; Japan Science and Technology Agency (JST); J-Gate; JournalTOCs; KESLI-NDSL (Korean National Discovery for Science Leaders); Medline; Meta; Microsoft Academic; MyScienceWork; Naver Academic; Naviga (Softweco); Primo Central (ExLibris); Publons; PubMed; QOAM (Quality Open Access Market); ReadCube; Reaxys; SCImago (SJR); SCOPUS; Semantic Scholar; Summon (ProQuest); TDNet; Text Mining; Ulrich's Periodicals Directory/ulrichsweb; WanFang Data; Web of Science - Emerging Sources Citation Index; WorldCat (OCLC).

The publisher, together with the authors and editors, has taken great pains to ensure that all information presented in this work (programs, applications, amounts, dosages, etc.) reflects the standard of knowledge at the time of publication. Despite careful manuscript preparation and proof correction, errors can nevertheless occur. Authors, editors and publisher disclaim all responsibility for any errors or omissions or liability for the results obtained from use of the information, or parts thereof, contained in this work.

The citation of registered names, trade names, trademarks, etc. in this work does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from laws and regulations protecting trademarks etc. and therefore free for general use.

ISSN 2194-8011 · e-ISSN 2194-802X

All information regarding notes for contributors, subscriptions, Open access, back volumes and orders is available online at [www.degruyter.com/dx](http://www.degruyter.com/dx).

**RESPONSIBLE EDITOR(S)** Dr. Mark L. Graber, The Society to Improve Diagnosis in Medicine, 5 Hitching Post, Plymouth, MA 02360, United States. Tel.: +1 919 667-8585, Fax: +1 631 862-6992, E-mail: [mark.graber@improvediagnosis.org](mailto:mark.graber@improvediagnosis.org); Prof. Dr. Mario Plebani, Università di Padova, Dipartimento di Medicina di Laboratorio, Azienda Ospedaliera di Padova, Via Nicolo Giustiniani 2, 35131 Padova, Italy. Tel.: +390 (0)49 821 2792, Fax: +390 (0)49 663 240, Email: [mario.plebani@unipd.it](mailto:mario.plebani@unipd.it)

**JOURNAL MANAGER** Heike Jahnke, De Gruyter, Genthiner Str. 13, 10785 Berlin, Germany, Tel.: +49 (0)30 260 05 – 220, Fax: +49 (0)30 260 05 – 325, Email: [diagnosis.editorial@degruyter.com](mailto:diagnosis.editorial@degruyter.com)

**RESPONSIBLE FOR ADVERTISEMENTS** top-ad Bernd Beutel, Schlossergässchen 10, 69469 Weinheim, Germany, Tel.: +49 (0)62 01 290 92-0, Fax: +49 (0)62 01 290 92-20, E-mail: [info@top-ad-online.de](mailto:info@top-ad-online.de)

© 2020 Walter de Gruyter GmbH, Berlin/Boston

**TYPESETTING** TNQ Technologies, Chennai, India

**PRINTING** Franz X. Stückle Druck und Verlag e.K., Ettenheim

**COVER ILLUSTRATION** iStockphoto/Thinkstock



## Contents

### Special issue: Situativity: A Family of Social Cognitive Theories for Clinical Reasoning and Error

Issue Editors: Steven Durning, Eric Holmboe, Mark L. Graber

#### Editorials

Mark L. Graber

**Progress understanding diagnosis and diagnostic errors: thoughts at year 10 — 151**

Eric S. Holmboe and Steven J. Durning

**Understanding the social in diagnosis and error: a family of theories known as situativity to better inform diagnosis and error — 161**

Pat Croskerry

***Sapere aude* in the diagnostic process — 165**

#### Perspectives

Jerusalem Merkebu, Michael Battistone, Kevin McMains, Kathrine McOwen, Catherine Witkop, Abigail Konopasky, Dario Torre, Eric Holmboe and Steven J. Durning  
**Situativity: a family of social cognitive theories for understanding clinical reasoning and diagnostic error — 169**

James G. Boyle, Matthew R. Walters, Susan Jamieson and Steven J. Durning  
**Clinical reasoning in the wild: premature closure during the COVID-19 pandemic — 177**

Dario Torre, Steven J. Durning, Joseph Rencic, Valerie Lang, Eric Holmboe and Michelle Daniel  
**Widening the lens on teaching and assessing clinical reasoning: from “in the head” to “out in the world” — 181**

Lambert W.T. Schuwirth, Steven J. Durning and Svetlana M. King  
**Assessment of clinical reasoning: three evolutions of thought — 191**

Stephen W. Russell, Sanjay V. Desai, Paul O'Rourke, Neera Ahuja, Anand Patel, Christopher G. Myers, Donna Zulman, Heather F. Sateia, Gail V. Berkenblit, Erica N. Johnson and Brian T. Garibaldi  
**The genealogy of teaching clinical reasoning and diagnostic skill: the GEL Study — 197**

Carl T. Berdahl and David L. Schriger

**Study design and ethical considerations related to using direct observation to evaluate physician behavior: reflections after a recent study — 205**

Vineet Chopra

**Focused ethnography: a new tool to study diagnostic errors? — 211**

Mindaugas Briedis and Ruta Briediene

**Phenomenological analysis of diagnostic radiology: description and relevance to diagnostic errors — 215**

#### Original Articles

Joseph Rencic, Lambert W.T. Schuwirth, Larry D. Gruppen and Steven J. Durning  
**A situated cognition model for clinical reasoning performance assessment: a narrative review — 227**

Joseph Rencic, Lambert W.T. Schuwirth, Larry D. Gruppen and Steven J. Durning  
**Clinical reasoning performance assessment: using situated cognition theory as a conceptual framework — 241**

Alan Schwartz, Steven Peskin, Alan Spiro and Saul J. Weiner  
**Direct observation of depression screening: identifying diagnostic error and improving accuracy through unannounced standardized patients — 251**

Abigail Konopasky, Anthony R. Artino, Alexis Battista, Megan Ohmer, Paul A. Hemmer, Dario Torre, Divya Ramani, Jeroen van Merrienboer, Pim W. Teunissen, Elexis McBee, Temple Ratcliffe and Steven J. Durning  
**Understanding context specificity: the effect of contextual factors on clinical reasoning — 257**

Sandra Monteiro, Jonathan Sherbino, Jonathan S. Ilgen, Emily M. Hayden, Elizabeth Howey and Geoff Norman  
**The effect of prior experience on diagnostic reasoning: exploration of availability bias — 265**

Abigail Konopasky, Steven J. Durning, Anthony R. Artino, Divya Ramani and Alexis Battista

**The Linguistic Effects of Context Specificity: Exploring Affect, Cognitive Processing, and Agency in Physicians' Think-Aloud Reflections — 273**

Michael Soh, Abigail Konopasky, Steven J. Durning, Divya Ramani, Elexis McBee, Temple Ratcliffe and Jerusalem Merkebu  
**Sequence matters: patterns in task-based clinical reasoning — 281**

Abigail Konopasky, Steven J. Durning, Alexis Battista, Anthony R. Artino, Jr, Divya Ramani, Zachary A. Haynes, Catherine Woodard and Dario Torre  
**Challenges in mitigating context specificity in clinical reasoning: a report and reflection — 291**

Divya Ramani, Michael Soh, Jerusalem Merkebu, Steven J. Durning, Alexis Battista, Elexis McBee, Temple Ratcliffe and Abigail Konopasky  
**Examining the patterns of uncertainty across clinical reasoning tasks: effects of contextual factors on the clinical reasoning process — 299**

Andrew P.J. Olson, Steven J. Durning, Carolina Fernandez Branson, Brian Sick, Kathleen P. Lane and Joseph J. Rencic  
**Teamwork in clinical reasoning – cooperative or parallel play? — 307**

Jeffrey A. Wilhite, Khemraj Hardowar, Harriet Fisher, Barbara Porter, Andrew B. Wallach, Lisa Altshuler, Kathleen Hanley, Sondra R. Zabar and Colleen C. Gillespie  
**Clinical problem solving and social determinants of health: a descriptive study using unannounced standardized**

**patients to directly observe how resident physicians respond to social determinants of health — 313**

Marcia A. Docherty

**Sociocultural learning in emergency medicine: a holistic examination of competence — 325**

## Scholarly Illustrations

Michelle Daniel, Eric Wilson, Colleen Seifert, Steven J. Durning, Eric Holmboe, Joseph J. Rencic, Valerie Lang and Dario Torre  
**Expanding boundaries: a transtheoretical model of clinical reasoning and diagnostic error — 333**

Michelle Daniel, Eric Wilson, Dario Torre, Steven J. Durning and Valerie Lang  
**Embodied cognition: knowing in the head is not enough — 337**

Michelle Daniel, Dario Torre, Steven J. Durning, Eric Wilson and Joseph J. Rencic  
**Ecological psychology: diagnosing and treating patients in complex environments — 339**

Michelle Daniel, Steven J. Durning, Eric Wilson, Emily Abdoler and Dario Torre  
**Situated cognition: clinical reasoning and error are context dependent — 341**

Eric Wilson, Colleen Seifert, Steven J. Durning, Dario Torre and Michelle Daniel  
**Distributed cognition: interactions between individuals and artifacts — 343**