2 Festive Days of Killing: Enacting a New Social Order in Rwanda, 1994

Mass murder is a loud process, but the case of Rwanda is special. From April 6 to early July 1994, between 500,000 and 800,000 Tutsis were killed under the Rwandan state (80 percent of all Tutsis in the country), along with tens of thousands of Hutus, and another 30,000 to 50,000 civilians killed by the victorious Rwandan Patriotic Front (RPF) rebels.[1] The mass participation in the brutal slaughter of Tutsis is notorious.

This chapter links this violence with the social situation and trends in Rwanda. It analyses the soundscape in the months of the massacres, which was dominated by various loud noises from persecutors, and argues that it expressed the new social order that they strove for. The emotions surfacing in these sounds are telling, but the chapter also deals with audible challenges to this new order and the associated conflicts. Contrasts in religious practice provide particularly powerful evidence. By primarily drawing from survivor accounts and placing less emphasis on political leadership and technology than on social interaction between ordinary people and on human voice, I try to help overcome the hegemonic political history in the field and shed more light[2] on the question of why and how many people participated in the violence and how they related to those they attacked.

By limiting the analysis to 'Hutu power'-related killings, I mean in no way to condone the mass violence committed by RPF-led forces in Rwanda in 1994 and especially in the neighboring country of Zaire/Congo in the second half of the 1990s and later, which may have caused as many or even more victims than the 1994 killings but is less often cited. Much more research on this other kind of violence is sorely needed.

1 Alison Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge darf überleben: Der Genozid in Ruanda* (Hamburg: Hamburger Edition, 2002), 34–35; Philip Verwimp, *Peasants in Power: The Political Economy of Development and Genocide in Rwanda* (Heidelberg et al.: Springer, 2013), 1–2; Philip Verwimp, "Death and survival during the 1994 genocide in Rwanda", *Population Studies* 58, 2 (2004): 235; Lee Ann Fujii, *Show Time: The Logic and Power of Violent Display* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 2021), 141–151.

2 I use this metaphor in lack of a better one. Most metaphors in the language of research are from the visual sphere and few from the aural one.

https://doi.org/10.1515/9783111568737-002

The State of Research

Rwanda is a small, hilly landlocked country in East Africa that had a population of eight million in the early 1990s, 95 percent of which lived in the countryside. Unlike many African countries, it was very densely populated and had long traditions of a tight-knit administration. Most people were very poor, and many became poorer in the late 1980s and early 1990s as the result of a deep economic crisis that involved a decline in the price of coffee – the most important export product – and several refugee waves. Agricultural land ownership was relatively, and increasingly, unequal, and landlessness was on the rise.[3] Between 1984 and 1993, life expectancy declined dramatically (reportedly from 49.9 years to 26.7 years), and there was a famine in the south.[4] Average personal income stagnated and then declined especially in 1993 and 1994.[5]

The socioeconomic crisis went hand in hand with political upheaval and civil war.[6] The refugee waves had to do with ethnicized social conflicts between the so-called Hutus and Tutsis. Up to the 19th century, divisions had emerged between a social elite (with livestock being a marker of wealth and status) named Tutsis, and a mass of peasants living in semi-serfdom named Hutus. Although transitions across this status line always occurred, these groups were solidified and ethnicized from the 19th century onward, a process that was intensified under German and Belgian colonialism from the 1880s to the 1950s.[7] To a degree, Hutu and Tutsi remained fluid concepts, and the number of intermarriages was sizable, though limited.[8]

3 See Peter Uvin, *Aiding Violence: The Development Enterprise in Rwanda* (West Hartford: Kumarian, 1998), 111–113; Jean-Paul Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide* (Boulder and London: Lynne Rienner, 2016), 69; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 72, 159, 313, 363; Florent Piton, *Le génocide des Tutsi du Rwanda* (Paris: La Découverte, 2018), 53; Michel Chossudowsky, "Economic Genocide in Rwanda", in *Economic and Political Weekly* 31, 15 (1996): 939–941; Saskia van Hoyweghen, "The Urgency of Land and Agrarian Reform in Rwanda", *African Affairs* 98, 392 (1999): 356–357.

4 Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 66–67; Uvin, *Aiding Violence*, 54, 111–112; Verwimp, *Peasants*, 65, 102–116.

5 Verwimp, *Peasants*, 61.

6 With strong social and geographical mobility intertwined with political conflict, Rwanda was a classic case of an extremely violent society. See Gerlach, *Extremely Violent Societies*.

7 For a sketch, see Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 55–93; see also Richard Benda, *The Test of Faith: Christians and Muslims in the Rwandan Genocide* (Ph.D dissertation, University of Manchester, 2012), 41.

8 Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 196–200, 318–320; Scott Straus, *The Order of Genocide: Race, Power and War in Rwanda* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 2006), 128.

A movement demanding power for the Hutus as an oppressed majority took power during decolonization in 1959–1962 (unlike in neighboring Burundi), in part through violent means, and their authoritarian regime stayed in power until 1994, governed by the Revolutionary Movement for National Development party (MRND) since 1975. Hundreds of thousands of Tutsis fled Rwanda after 1959, mainly to Uganda, and repeatedly tried to return and seize power again with military means. From 1990 to 1994, another such attempt by the RPF led to a civil war that coincided with economic misery and violent Rwandan party politics that developed after a multi-party system was introduced under the robust influence of foreign industrial countries and domestic political pressure. Rwanda was also destabilized by repeated large inflows of refugees from Burundi between 1972 and 1993, who fled violence against Hutus and were frustrated by economic marginalization in Rwanda. In addition, up to one million domestic refugees arrived from the north of Rwanda where the RPF operated.[9] Several thousand Tutsi civilians were killed in 1990–1993.[10] After Rwanda's president Juvenal Habyarimana and Burundi's president Cyprien Ntaryamira were killed when their plane was shot down near Kigali on April 6, 1994, the 'Hutu power' pro-government forces argued that all Tutsis were enemies in the civil war, and most were slaughtered. In July 1994, the RPF won the civil war and has ruled ever since. Up to one million refugees (mainly Tutsis) from earlier decades entered Rwanda, two million (mostly Hutus) fled in 1994, and 1.3 million of them returned later, forced by Rwandan military violence in Zaire and as a result of diplomatic pressure on Tanzania. Many refugees perished in Zaire.[11]

In independent Rwanda, Tutsis were largely excluded from politics and the "state class" (or administration) until 1994, including the military. Most were in fact peasants, but Tutsis continued to hold important social positions, which were often related to advantages in education. For example, they constituted the majority in lower and middle ranks of Catholic clergy; had a strong presence among teachers, medical staff and university students; a lower birthrate than Hutus; and were overrepresented among the urban population, which was, on average, wealthier than rural dwellers.[12] Gérard Prunier has stated that "there was no contradiction between the ethnic and the social aspects of the killing since, in Kigali

9 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 145, 175, 427, 510, 834.

10 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 119.

11 Van Hoyweghen, "Urgency", 354, 362–363.

12 See Uvin, *Aiding Violence*, 115, 207 (quote); Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 30, 34, 70, 503, 561; Verwimp, *Peasants*, 47 and for Tutsi agriculturalism 55. For Hutu propaganda with exaggerated portrayals of the Tutsi position, see ibid., 56, and Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 106–107.

at least, the Tutsi tended to be better off than the Hutu".[13] However, there is little specific evidence available in support or against this claim,[14] neither in terms of income nor land ownership.[15] In any case, most Rwandan Tutsis were poor, as were most Hutus.

During the 1994 mass murders, Tutsi men and women were killed in similar numbers (the Hutus killed were usually men). Over half of Tutsi victims were children under 15, some of whom were killed by male adolescents.[16] The murder of most of the Tutsis took place within a few weeks in April.[17] The biggest section was killed in large massacres in places where many refugees had assembled such as church compounds, sports stadiums and health centers, but many others died in their homes, in their neighborhoods or at roadblocks.[18] From the beginning, observers were amazed by the level of active mass participation in the violence,[19] which far exceeded the often-cited radical killing formations called "Interahamwe", a name under which many witnesses subsumed all attackers.[20] Scholarly estimates of perhaps 200,000 perpetrators were surpassed by determinations in gacaca (traditional) courts, which found more than 400,000 people guilty of killings or severe physical violence, and more than 1.2 million of looting in a country of eight million.[21] This mass participation was also reflected in the main methods of killing: only 14.8 percent received their death from firearms, 37.9 percent from *pangas* (a kind of machete), 16.8 percent were killed with *masus* (nail-

13 Gérard Prunier, *The Rwanda Crisis: History of a Genocide* (London: Hurst & Company, 1995), 232.

14 Uvin, *Aiding Violence*, 209.

15 For some contradictory clues concerning the question whether Tutsis still owned more land on average than Hutus in the early 1990s, see Jean Bigagaza et al., "Land Scarcity, Distribution and Conflict in Rwanda", J. Lind and K. Sturmon, eds., *The Ecology of Africa's Conflicts* (Pretoria: Institute for Security Studies, 2004), 66–70; see also Verwimp, *Peasants*, 48, 75–76.

16 Hélène Dumas, "Enfants victimes, enfants tueurs: Expériences infantines (Rwanda, 1994)", *Vingtième Siècle* 122 (2014): 75–86, esp. 77, 84; see also Piton, *Génocide*, 118.

17 Piton, *Génocide*, 106, 112; Verwimp, "Death", 240–241; Straus, *Order*, 55–62; Scott Straus, "What Is the Relationship between Hate Radio and Violence? Rethinking Rwanda's 'Radio Machete'", *Politics and Society* 35, 4 (2007): 621. Thereafter killings were continued in a more tightly controlled way: Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 337–349.

18 Verwimp, "Death", 236; Piton, *Génocide*, 153 offers other figures.

19 See Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, esp. 353 and title; Mahmood Mamdani, *When Victims Become Killers: Colonialism, Nativism, and the Genocide in Rwanda* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001), 199; Uvin, *Aiding Violence*, 206; Adam Jones and Nicholas Robins, "Introduction: Subaltern Genocide in Theory and Practice", Nicholas Robins and Adam Jones, eds., *Genocides by the Oppressed* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2009), 6.

20 See Straus, *Order*, 27.

21 Piton, *Génocide*, 198.

fortified clubs) and 8.7 percent with hoes; 4.2 percent were drowned, 3.7 percent thrown into latrines and 2.3 percent were burned to death.[22] Some ways of killing and torturing people, but also responses of those persecuted, resembled the 1972 mass killings against Hutus in the neighboring country of Burundi.[23]

Early scholarship emphasized ethnic hatred, tight and centralized organization, long-term preparation and radio propaganda as causes for the mass murders in Rwanda.[24] During a wave of revisionism, in studies often based on interviews with persecutors, Scott Straus instead offered a war/civil war situation, insecurity and "group pressure", together with "ethnic categorization" in a tightly organized state, as explanations.[25] Mahmood Mamdani and Omar McDoom added the factor of fear to the equation, further emphasizing Hutu persecutors' defensive outlook.[26] Constructing a "social interaction argument", Lee Ann Fujii found "local ties and group dynamics", including not only friendship between persecutors but also between Hutu and Tutsi, which she considered crucial for the violence.[27]

Many have argued that the mass murders of 1994 were propelled by misery and land pressure.[28] Existing research has established that although most Hutu killers were peasants, technical professionals, administrators and those working in the service sector were overrepresented among them, as were those with a higher education than average.[29] A large group among the persecutors was land-poor but more than the average population was involved in off-farm economic

22 According to a 2004 Rwandan government report, which Piton, *Génocide*, 127 refers to.

23 Liisa Malkki, *Purity and Exile: Violence, Memory, and National Cosmology among Hutu Refugees in Tanzania* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1995), esp. 89–92, 95–96, 108. See Christopher Taylor, "The Cultural Face of Terror in the Rwandan Genocide of 1994", Alexander Laban Hinton, ed., *Annihilating Difference: The Anthropology of Genocide* (Berkeley et al.: University of California Press, 2002), 140–141.

24 The best among the early studies is Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge* (published in English in 1999).

25 He also found correlations between early killings and the strongholds of the leading party, the MRND: Straus, *Order*, 7–9, 60–62, 136, 139, 155, 245 (quotes); see also Charles Mironko, "'Ibitero': Means and Motive in the Rwandan Genocide", Susan Cook, ed., *Genocide in Cambodia and Rwanda: New Perspectives* (New Brunswick and London: Transaction, 2006), 163–189.

26 Mamdani, *When Victims*, esp. 191, 231; Omar Shahabudin McDoom, "The Psychology of Threat in Intergroup Conflict: Emotions, Rationality, and Opportunity in the Rwandan Genocide", *International Security* 37, 2 (2012): 119–155.

27 Lee Ann Fujii, *Killing Neighbors: Webs of Violence in Rwanda* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University, 2009), 185, 187. In some ways, Hélène Dumas, *Le génocide au village: Les massacres des Tutsi au Rwand*a (Paris: Seuil, 2014) is similar.

28 Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 6, 143–167, 215–263; Uvin, *Aiding Violence*, 206.

29 Straus, *Order*, 104–108; Philip Verwimp, "An economic profile of peasant perpetrators of genocide: Micro-level evidence from Rwanda", *Journal of Development Economics* 77 (2005): 307.

activities, including wage labor and small businesses.[30] In this light, it was argued that there were some wealthier people among persecutors who had something to lose and many poor who had something to gain.[31]

Scholarship dealing with cultural patterns of the 1994 mass murders has concentrated on the visual realm such as violations of the body and the sexual imaginary. Christopher Taylor identified them as a "massive ritual of purification".[32] Fujii pointed to performative aspects of the violence[33] while Hélène Dumas identified local "investment of popular intelligence" in the murders.[34] By contrast, there has been little analysis of aural aspects.[35]

This chapter attempts to link socioeconomic and cultural aspects by pursuing a social history of the mass violence in 1994 with sound history as its tool. The sources mainly consist of published accounts by approximately 250 witnesses and survivors. Its core is a collection of early statements (1994–1995), compiled by Rakiya Omaar and Alex de Waal from the London-based NGO African Rights.[36] Two volumes by Jean Hatzfeld with excerpts from extensive and telling interviews pertaining to events in one local rural area in Rwanda, one of which included persecutor statements, and three smaller collections, including one published by Samuel Totten and Rafiki Ubaldo, complement the material used.[37] The compilation by African Rights has the advantage of presenting accounts from all parts of Rwanda, made very early after the killings (most were collected between May and July 1994) and, thus, with little interference by memory politics and movies, which is important for sound history. But that publication also has its downsides as it presents interview excerpts, and occasionally just snippets, and although people from all walks of life were interviewed, the intelligentsia (in a wide sense)

30 Verwimp, "Economic profile", 307–308, 318.

31 Verwimp, "Economic profile", 319.

32 Taylor, "Cultural Face", 137–178, quote 139.

33 Fujii, *Killing*, esp. 12; Fujii, *Show Time*.

34 Dumas, *Génocide*, 241.

35 Dumas, *Génocide*, 45–46; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 902.

36 African Rights, *Rwanda: Death, Despair and Defiance* (London: African Rights, 1995, second revised edition).

37 Jean Hatzfeld, *Nur das nackte Leben: Berichte aus den Sümpfen Ruandas* (Giessen: Haland & Wirth and Psychosozial-Verlag, 2004); Jean Hatzfeld, *Zeit der Macheten: Gespräche mit den Tätern des Völkermords in Ruanda* (Giessen: Haland & Wirth and Psychosozial-Verlag, 2004); Samuel Totten and Rafiki Ubaldo, eds., *We Cannot Forget: Interviews with Survivors of the 1994 Genocide in Rwanda* (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 2011); Rwanda Youth & Children's Testimonies, University of Southern Florida, http://genocide.lib.usf.edu/taxonomy/term/1435 (accessed September 5, 2018; cited: Rwanda YCT); Aimable Twagilimana, ed., *Teenage Refugees From Rwanda Speak Out* (New York: Rosen, 1997).

is overrepresented and peasants underrepresented. The book, produced in a feverish effort, has also been criticized for lack of proper scholarly documentation and part of the interviews having been produced in cooperation with the RPF and, consequently, possibly echoing an RPF narrative.[38] In some ways, the analysis of the accounts' 'soundtrack' does not support the latter claim. However, any study based on survivor narratives must take into account that Rwandans' dealing with deceased family members focuses not on a "cult of the corpse" but on a careful construction of remembrance.[39]

Noisy Killers, Festive Behavior

Persecutors in Rwanda made many loud sounds. This appears dysfunctional if one thinks within categories of deception, surprise attack, and military discipline and professionalism. Here, I am referring to loud, open threats and announcements when attackers would come to kill individuals or large groups. But the longer I thought about it, the more I wondered whether one should be content with musing about the function of noises for the killings or whether one should instead start to ask questions about the function of the mass murders, judging from the sounds.

In many cases, large groups of Tutsis (usually refugees) were attacked by people in great numbers, described as crowds, rural dwellers, villagers or neighbors, usually without marching formation.[40] They were often accompanied by various types of militias, and sometimes by military soldiers. According to accounts by persecutors and persecuted, crowds of attackers approached noisily so that they could be heard over long distances, singing, shouting, and using musical instruments.[41] They were agitated and agitated each other by shouting murderous

38 Luc Reydams, "NGO Justice: African Rights as Pseudo-Prosecutor of the Rwandan Genocide", *Human Rights Quarterly* 38, 3 (2016): 547–588, esp. 561, 566–567, 569–570. See also Alex de Waal, "Writing Human Rights and Getting It Wrong", *Boston Review*, June 6, 2016, http://bostonreview.net/world/alex-de-waal-writing-human-rights/ (last accessed September 22, 2018). Reydams is ambiguous about the authenticity of the interviews gathered in the African Rights volume but does not substantiate any claim that they were not. See Reydams, "NGO Justice", 549, 576; Luc Reydams, "Protesting Too Much: A Response to Linda Melvern et al.", *Human Rights Quarterly* 40 (2018): 472.

39 Fujii, *Show Time*, 143.

40 Then most Rwandans lived in dispersed settlements, not necessarily villages.

41 Accounts by Cassisus Niyonsaba, Angélique Mukamanzi, Innocent Rwililiza, Berthe Mwanankabandi and Claudine Kayitesi, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 17, 77, 92–93, 167, 182; account by Alphonse Hitiyaremye, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 264; accounts by Mathias Habimana, Félicitée Mukabashima, Claver

phrases and slogans, thus drawing in residents to join.[42] In some places, the hills resounded with calls to assemble and move against the Tutsis.[43] When crowds or groups closed in on Tutsis, who were, for instance, hiding in swamps, they yelled death threats and matching slogans in many variations,[44] and this frightened those who were targeted.[45] They were noted to be "singing in excitement",[46] bellowing at hidden people to come out and sometimes banging on doors.[47] They also shouted at people trying to protect those they had come to kill,[48] while other onlookers, on the contrary, shouted at the militias to kill Tutsis.[49] Loud insults and threats were also frequently heard at roadblocks.[50]

Singing and the use of sound devices were reported from the countryside. People recalled that the attackers used a variety of musical instruments when they approached them, including drums, tins, empty jerricans and whistles (for more on whistles, see below).[51] Drums were employed to call upon people to gather and attack.[52] Drumming rhythms were at times still used as their own language for this purpose.[53] Drums were also used for misleading public announcements that "peace had been restored" and persecuted people should gather at a

---

Munyandinda, a staff member of Nkanka health center and Egide Kayitore, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 187, 434, 444, 503–504, 531; accounts by "Umulisa" and "Ruberwa", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 52, 147–148; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 387, 390.

42 Account by Pancrace Hakizamungili, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 235; account by Emmanuel Karemera, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 518–519; Fujii, *Killing*, 155; Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 242; account by "Emmanuel Murangira", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 88; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 407.

43 Account by Charlotte Mupenzi, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 597.

44 Account by Berthe Mwanankabandi, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 167; accounts by Albert Majaro, Valentine Mulisa, "Pascasie" and Marguerite Karuhimbi, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 216, 266, 484–485, 1057; account by "Edith Muhaza", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 131.

45 Accounts by Marie-Gorette Mukalinda and Augustin Mubiligi, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 321, 957.

46 Account by Josephine Uwamahoro, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 830.

47 Accounts by Diane Muyebwayire, Joram Mugwaneza and Sister Ernest [sic] Nyiramuganga, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 314, 618, 924; account by "Edith Muhaza", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 129.

48 Account by Edith Uwanyiligira, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 153.

49 Account by Marie-Gorette Mukalinda, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 322.

50 For example, account by Josephine Mukandori, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 1042–1043; account by "Kwibuka", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 102; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 549.

51 Account by Angélique Mukamanzi, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 77; Fujii, *Killing*, 172; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 440, 566.

52 Accounts by Gaëtan Kabanda and Egide Kayitore, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 466, 531; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 526.

53 Account by Athanase Hodari, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 479.

specific location.[54] What the attacking crowds sang was described as traditional songs,[55] but they also also intoned improvised songs that called for killing.[56] There were chants of "Power, power!" (in Kinyarwanda: pawa, pawa), a slogan by the radical pro-Hutu party Republican Democratic Movement (MDR).[57] Elements of this music resemble historic battle music in its often popular character, rhythmic structure and purpose to create collectivity. But in other ways, both differed. In Rwanda, many participants had had no military training which involved music; in most cases it was neither linked to organizational structure nor did it instill discipline; and it was not used to overcome any impulse to run away out of fear.[58]

Massacres, as such, were very loud due to the shouts made by killers against their victims, to encourage each other or instruct each other in the use of arms. The intense sounds of blows and slashes, shots, and screams of those under attack were also often described.[59] The same (i.e., that there was noise all around) was said about killing scenes involving smaller groups of people.[60] Some murderers taunted and mocked individuals and hurled abuses at them (which some found "refreshing") before killing them,[61] and they also screamed that they would kill the Tutsis while doing it.[62] An exceptional report stated that the attackers started killing people "without saying a single word",[63] and killers came silently out of the Ntar-

54 Accounts by Félicitée Mukabashima and Cômes Kayinamura, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 432, 436; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 312.

55 Account by Ignace Rukiramacumu, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 16; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 55.

56 Dumas, *Génocide*, 231; Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 339; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 246, 313; anonymous account, Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 71.

57 Account by Françoise Nyirasabera, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 956 (quote); Fujii, *Killing*, 172; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 313, 522, 566.

58 For battle music, I draw from an excellent presentation by Morag Josephine Grant, "What did battle music sound like – and why?", keynote at the workshop "Sound and Music in War from the Middle Ages to the Present", University of Fribourg, November 12, 2018.

59 Account by Christine Nyiransabimana, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 127; accounts by Pancrace Hakizamungili and Alphonse Hitiyaremye, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 40, 245; accounts by Consolée Gwizimpundu, Félicien Bahizi, Odette Mukaranakusi and a staff member of Nkanka health center, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 418, 459, 469, 504; Dumas, *Génocide*, 245.

60 Account by Pancrace Hakizamungili, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 25.

61 Accounts by Adalbert Munzingura, Fulgence Bunani and Elie Mizinge, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 142 (quote), 143, 155; account by "Isa", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 817 (this killing was called off).

62 Accounts by Jean Paul Gashegu, Paulin Ndagijimana, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 277, 510.

63 Account by Egide Kayitore, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 538 (church of Shangi).

ama church after the massacre.[64] When Tutsis still put up resistance, there was, as it was called in one instance, a "thundering stone-throwing match".[65]

If murders were more selective, soldiers, gendarmes or militia called out lists of names of people from among the crowds of refugees that should report to them, usually to be killed.[66] Rape attempts led to laughter in many incidents, whether it be persecutors mocking a colleague trying to do it or to abduct a female or rapists laughing at their victims.[67] Rape itself was accompanied by insults hurled at the female victims.[68]

Sometimes, large enthusiastic crowds watched the killings and shouted encouragement for the murderers, providing hints regarding where Tutsis might be hiding. This happened during large massacres[69] as well as the slaughter of a few individuals.[70] In one village, the Tutsis who were caught were dragged to the center and then tortured to death in the presence of onlookers. "There were shouts from all sides. These were noisy popular festivals, very rare, but well attended."[71]

People accused of being Tutsi were loudly threatened by their neighbors, or neighbors of those who were hiding them.[72] Hutu children "were running around repeating the threats they heard from their parents".[73] Many survivors described scenes such as that of Gloriose Mukakanimba's escape: "Everywhere neighbours were screaming: 'Here she is, here she is.'"[74] In Bweyeye, Cyangugu prefecture, "[t]he population were chanting: 'Hand him [a priest] over to us, we will kill him.'"[75] Refugees reported witnessing many diatribes and insults from residents

64 Account by "Emmanuel Muhinda", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 120.

65 Account by "Chantal", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 514.

66 Accounts by Deus Ndayishimiye, Jacqueline Nyiranzeyimana, Gorette Uwimana, Salvador Nshimiyimana and Théodore Nylinkwaya, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 501, 526 and 529, 692, 715, 729.

67 Account by "Juliana", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 752, 754.

68 Accounts by "Beata" and "Alexia", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 791–792, 794.

69 Account by Christine Nyiransabimana, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 127, 129; account by "Isaïe", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 556.

70 See Fujii, *Show Time*.

71 Account by Clémentine Murebwayre, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 144.

72 Account by Christine Nyiransabimana, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 131; account by "Isa", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 816.

73 Account by Philomène Cyulinyana, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 995.

74 African Rights, *Rwanda*, 591. See also accounts by Marthe Mukamurenzi and "Caritas", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 678, 759; account by Evariste Habimana, Rwanda YCT.

75 Account by Anglican priest from Banda parish, Belancille Muhimrundu, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 890 (quote), 1037 (in Rurana, Cyangugu prefecture, people demanded with shouts that somebody be arrested). See also account by "Edith Muhaza", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 129.

being directed against Tutsis.[76] When killers searched in vain for specific people to kill, they occasionally also voiced their anger.[77]

Some Hutu neighbors, often in groups, had already voiced loud public threats in the months and years before April 6, 1994, which included death threats. Survivors described some as having been in a good mood.[78] With this intimidating behavior, they occupied the streets acoustically. Militias (often subsumed in the reports under the term "interahamwe") were loud and verbally aggressive, especially in and around bars.[79] Neighbors and teachers had also started to call Tutsis "inyenzi" (cockroaches) in the years before 1994.[80] Some cursed Tutsis all day, also in private.[81] A few survivors also alluded to frequent arguments between Hutus and Tutsis.[82] Singing was customary at public political party meetings and Interahamwe gatherings before April 1994,[83] in celebration of *kubohoza* (enforced changes of political party),[84] and especially during or after *umuganda* (mandatory communal work).[85]

When they returned from massacres, killers were said to have been tired but chatting.[86] In the evenings, they held parties,[87] where they would invite each other and sing loudly near private homes or in bars,[88] shouting and boasting of their misdeeds and occasionally joking about the behavior of their victims in what one murderer called later a "cheerful mood".[89] "It was the most exciting

76 Account by Edith Uwanyiligira, Hatzfeld, *Nur* 154; account by "Rosalie", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 743 (Red Cross staff).

77 Account by Evergiste Habihirwe, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 107.

78 Accounts by Cassius Niyonsaba, Francine Niyetegeka, Odette Mukamusoni and Claudine Kayitesi, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 15, 37, 141, 181; account by Innocent Rwililiza, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 50.

79 Account by Jean-Baptiste Munyankore, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 67; accounts by Clémentine Murebwayre and Evergiste Habihirwe, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 36, 103, 106; account by "Mugabo Arnaud", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 179.

80 Accounts by "Angelique Isimbi", "Mugabo Arnaud", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 157, 178–179.

81 Account by Clémentine Murebwayre, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 36.

82 Account by Cassius Niyonsaba and Jean-Baptiste Munyankore, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 15, 67.

83 Account by Jean-Baptiste Murangira, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 195.

84 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 420.

85 Darryl Li, "Echoes of violence: considerations on radio and genocide in Rwanda", *Journal of Genocide Research* 6, 1 (2004): 23.

86 Account by Angélique Mukamanzi, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 77.

87 Emmerence Mujawamariya reported about a party by dignitaries and functionaries held *before* the massacre at the parish of Nyange: African Rights, *Rwanda*, 409.

88 Account by Innocent Rwililiza, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 93; account by Alphonse Hitiyaremye, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 89, 100; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 526, 568.

89 Account by Marie-Louise Kagoyire, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 129; account by Clémentine Murebwayre, Alphonse Hitiyaremye, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 69, 264; account by Egide Kayatore and "Odette", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 532, 781. Quote: account by Pancrace Hakizamungili, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 101.

feast that you can imagine," said another.[90] Rwandan and Burundian folk and pop music would play through looted radios and cassette recorders.[91] As one witness put it: "They became never tired of killing, jeering, drinking, laughing and celebrating."[92] Often, they sat near to fireplaces where meat would be grilled. The smell of barbecue lingered on the hills of the Rwandan countryside. People ate meat from slaughtered cows formerly owned by Tutsis and drank alcohol. Before the weeks of killing, most had only eaten meat on special holidays, but now some did so every evening and a few during breakfast as well.[93]

These cows deserve some consideration. Most cattle in Rwanda were the property of Tutsis (who were traditionally more involved in animal raising than farming) and killed.[94] Calixte Nzabonimana, a MDR politician and Minister for Youth and Cooperatives, called men to kill Tutsis by saying that their cows waited to be slaughtered, and in Nyakiza, Burundian refugees received cattle as promised after they massacred Tutsis.[95] Along with regarding cattle as the "material/symbolic capital necessary to the social reproduction of human beings",[96] many Hutus also judged them as a source of Tutsi wealth and Hutu misery and as a symbol of Tutsi lifestyle. In addition, cows had been a source of petty trouble between farmers and pastoralists because they sometimes trampled agricultural fields.[97] One murderer later said that after he would be released from prison, "compromises between farming and husbandry" would need to be made.[98] But with this, he may also have referred to the distribution of land use. After all, the number of bovines in the country had increased significantly between 1959 and the 1980s, to reach approximately 800,000 head of cattle.[99] At the same time, the

90 Account by Alphonse Hitiyaremye, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 100.

91 Account by Clémentine Murebwayre, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 102.

92 Account by Clémentine Murebwayre, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 103.

93 Accounts by Angélique Mukamanzi and Marie-Louise Kagoyire, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 77, 129; accounts by Pancrace Hakizamungili and Adalbert Munzingura, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 13, 64; Fujii, *Show Time*, 61; Verwimp, *Peasants*, 229.

94 Taylor, "Cultural Face", 164; account by "Kwibuka", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 105.

95 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 325–326, 436.

96 Taylor, "Cultural Face", 164.

97 This is alluded to in the accounts by Alphonse Hitiyaremye and Adalbert Munzingura, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 206, 235. For popular historical narratives, see Malkki, *Purity*, 68–70. See also Christopher Taylor, *Milk, Honey, and Money: Changing Concepts in Rwandan Healing* (Washington and London: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1992), esp. 7. The fact that many Rwandan proverbs refer to cattle can be taken from Pierre Crepeau, *Parole et sagesse: Valeurs sociales dans les proverbes du Rwanda* ([Brussels:] Musée Royal de l'Afrique Centrale, 1985).

98 Account by Pancrace Hakizamungili, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 208.

99 Uvin, *Aiding Violence*, 194.

cropped area had expanded at the expense of pastures.[100] Hutus killed not only Tutsis as competitors for land ownership, but also their cows because after their death, some pastures could be converted into cropland in a country with great land scarcity.

Despite the many chases for Tutsis and opponents, I see less importance in hunting metaphors of persecutors than some other scholars do,[101] although one killer also remembered that the Tutsis had been like prey and, for him, had lost their human status.[102] But hunters wait in silence for the prey or, in a drive hunt, use noise to trick animals so that they start running away and become visible targets to be easily shot, whereas in Rwanda in 1994, the persecutors used noise in relation to intimidate, overwhelm and paralyze their victims (as known from war cries).

However, the sounds they made served not only to facilitate the killings but also for communication which went far beyond this purpose. The killers showed enthusiasm and passion, an emotionality which was a sign of a new social order in itself. The feelings expressed by their noises were joy, happiness, anger and hatred; these were no sounds of fear.[103]

Feelings of joy and happiness were, for the most part, associated with the carefree life of modest prosperity that seemed to begin through the plunder of furniture, bikes, radios, other electrical appliances, corrugated metal sheets and windows.[104] "It was like a fest", said a witness about the looting of movable possessions after a massacre.[105] Killers spoke to each other about the "promising times that had started" and the "new life that would begin now".[106] Above all, their exaltation had to do with the hope gaining land, which will be discussed below.

100 Verwimp, *Peasants*, 60–61.

101 For such scholarship, see Mironko, "'Ibitero'", 180; Jeannie Burnet, *Genocide Lives in Us: Women, Memory, and Silence in Rwanda* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2012), 230 note 2. For a survivor statement under the same impression, see account by a staff member of the Nkanka health center, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 503.

102 Account by Elie Mizinge, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 51.

103 Mamdani, *When Victims*, 191, 233, argues that fear drove the Hutu attackers.

104 See Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 64–69, esp. account by Alphonse Hitiyaremye, ibid., 64, 102. See also Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 553.

105 Quoted in Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 442 (quote retranslated from German, C.G.).

106 Accounts by Alphonse Hitiyaremye, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 100, 264.

Murderers in Costumes

In many cases, the killers' festive mode included some form of masquerade. It seems worthwhile to dwell on how they were dressed and where this happened, although this requires deviating from sound history as an approach. The fact that some attackers wore costumes is not new to scholarship but has not been discussed in detail.[107] Masquerade was observed in different parts of the country, but most available reports on this are from the south. In most cases, survivors and witnesses reported that their assaulters wore banana leaves, sometimes specified as dried ones.[108] Those with such costumes were either described as local villagers, people from another commune or group of leaders.[109] Sometimes banana leaves were combined with painting one's face with chalk and/or ash.[110]

In other cases, the attackers put manioc leaves in their hair,[111] wore leaves of tea or coffee plants if these were widely grown in their region,[112] a woman killer was described as having been "dressed in straw",[113] or assaulters wore jingles on their legs and arms.[114] These differences contradict the assumption that wearing costumes had been centrally ordered from Kigali.[115]

Attackers dressed for the occasion. Nearly all available reports regarding this were related to big massacres, all of which happened in April 1994. As the costumes document, many people must have made some preparations, and the dressing style hardly suggests any reluctance from them.

Observers have interpreted these dressing choices very differently. Undecided, Lee Ann Fujii characterized them as "costume or 'disguise'".[116] Alison Des Forges

107 See in particular Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 281, 285, 382, 402, 446–447, 463, 521, 526, 558, 693 and also Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 250; Timothy Longman, *Christianity and Genocide in Rwanda* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 6.

108 Accounts by Second Twagirumukiza and Vestine Nyirafurere (parish of Kibeho) and Ignace Ruzindana (Butare), African Rights, *Rwanda*, 292, 297–298, 341; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 382 (Kaduho), 402 (Gikongoro), 521 (two communes in Butare prefecture), 556 (Butare town); McDoom, "Psychology", 149; a witness account is in Verwimp, *Peasants*, 229.

109 For leaders, see for example account by Felicien Bahizi, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 459 (parish of Nyamasheke); for people from another commune, see Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 382.

110 Account by Josephien Mukandori (Butare) and "Catherine" (Massaka, a suburb of Kigali), African Rights, *Rwanda*, 355, 769; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 526 (Ngoma).

111 Account by Cassius Niyonsaba, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 17. See also account by Berthe Mwanankabandi, ibid., 169.

112 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 281.

113 Account by Marie-Gorette Mukalinda, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 322.

114 Account by Alphonsine Undimwana, Rwanda YCT.

115 This assumption is in Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 285.

116 Fujii, *Killing*, 172.

noted that during the change of political party enforced by groups of violent men in early 1990s Rwanda (known as *kubohoza*), some attackers wore banana leaves and had whitened their face with chalk.[117] So, wearing costumes was known from political conflict situations. She argued that the masquerade in 1994 was intended to make attackers recognizable so that they would not hurt each other.[118] People at the time were unsure about the meaning of the costumes. Some survivors felt reminded of traditional performances such as the *intore* dance (a traditional war dance with strong Tutsi connotations), *kubandwa* practices (used in the *ryangombe* cult, a Hutu tradition)[119] and the "Imparamba Dancers".[120] To one survivor it appeared that the first attackers in Butare, dressed in banana leaves, were not fully convinced of what they were doing; to him, they appeared as if they were playing a sort of game.[121] Another stated: "I did not know what the [banana] leaves meant because this was the first time seeing such a thing"; the person thought this attire was for "camouflage" because they all looked the same.[122] This, however, was unlikely because banana leaves worn across the upper body, as some reported,[123] did not make people unidentifiable. Another survivor said that the killers were dressed as devils.[124]

The fact that some killers were dressed in banana leaves was so widely known that some Tutsis fleeing across the countryside wore them as well after someone had advised them that this would make them look like "Interahamwe" rather than potential victims and, thus, protect them.[125]

In any case, masquerades are another confirmation of the festive character of the killings. The agricultural symbolism of the dresses was commensurate with the mindset of Hutu peasants. Drawing from different cultural and political traditions, aggressive people invented their own, special festivity. At least temporarily, this replaced others: "During the [time of the] killings only one wedding was cele-

117 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 86.

118 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 281, 285. See also account by "Emmanuel Murangira", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 83.

119 See the statement by a survivor who was on his way to the Burundian border in Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 463. For general information on the *intore* dance (known for grass wigs worn) and *kubandwa* (painting face and body), see Julius Adekunle, *Culture and Customs of Rwanda* (Westport and London: Greenwood, 2007), 92, 117–118, 139, 141–142.

120 Account by Second Twagirumukiza, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 292.

121 See Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 693.

122 Account from Kigembe, prefecture of Butare, quoted in Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 250.

123 See Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 387, 446, 463, 558.

124 Account by Berthe Mwanankabandi, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 169.

125 Account by "Ruberwa", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 140; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 576.

brated, no baptism took place, no football game was played, no church service held, for example on Easter. Nobody was interested any more in such festivities", said a former killer, who added that the latter appeared to them as "inanities" at the time.[126]

After giving it some consideration, I do not find it appropriate to call this carnivalesque. Rwandans do not celebrate carnival,[127] and although the assaulters in 1994 tried to invert the existing social order and used elements known from carnival like masquerade, the suspension of the separation between performers and audience, collective singing, dancing, going on a rampage and getting drunk in the end, they did not mean to do that only in a temporary, passing manner, as customary in a carnival.[128] Carnival is especially widespread as momentary liberation and outlet of emotions in predominantly Catholic environments,[129] but what happened in Rwanda in 1994, even though the majority religion was Catholicism, was totally opposed to the national habit of strict discipline and self-control. The new order was meant to last, and with it, new customs.

Conflicts Among Persecutors: Property and Other Issues

There were two situations during which loud conflict arose between persecutors. The most common one involved arguments about the possessions of their victims, such as furniture.[130] This was no coincidence because pillaging was widespread, with over a million people later being convicted for it. Other conflicts between Hutus often had to do with robbery among them and sometimes with the murder of Tutsi wives of Hutus.[131]

126 Account by Alphonse Hitiyaremye, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 101.

127 Amanda Carlson and Courtnay Micots, "Carnival in Africa: Join the Party!", *African Arts* 55, 4 (2022): 17 note 10 (the article provides a survey of carnivals in Africa); see also Daniel Crowley, "The Sacred and the Profane in African and African-Derived Carnivals", *Western Folklore* 58, 3–4 (1999): 223–228; Taylor, *Milk*, 23 and 233 note 1.

128 Early on, Gérard Prunier called the killings in Kigali a "dark carnival". Prunier, *Rwanda Crisis*, 232.

129 Scholarly concepts of carnival are in Mikhail Bakhtin, *Problems of Dostoevski's Poetics* (no place: Ardis, 1973), 100–106; and, on political crowds in a carnevalesque mode, in Jeffrey Verhey, *Der "Geist von 1914" und die Erfindung der Volksgemeinschaft* (Hamburg: Hamburger Edition, 2000), 50, 144–155.

130 Account by Marie-Louise Kagoyire, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 115. See also Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 355; account by "Emmanuel Murangira", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 84.

131 See Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 492–498, 657–662.

The struggle for the land of those killed was the most heated, loud and at times violent.[132] Hutu men hunted for certain people to murder them and take over their parcels of land.[133] Or they even tried to kill even the last potential heir for the same purpose.[134] In one instance, a man stabbed his immediate neighbor and then danced on his corpse while singing.[135] One persecutor, a functionary in charge of changing land titles, later stated that Tutsis were killed "primarily by people wanting their land".[136] This confirms the descriptions already provided by Alison des Forges. Since the murderers claimed the land of their victims but other locals did too, local administrations tried to register vacant land and created various regulations for distributing it to new users. People who had personally committed murders apparently had an advantage, and they were probably among those who simply occupied the land.[137] Valuable land robbed from murdered Tutsi was sometimes divided among several Hutus.[138] On the other hand, acoustic evidence from villages does not support that Hutu peasants murdered Tutsis in defense of their own land, businesses or possessions.[139]

Lee Ann Fujii has argued that looting and stealing had been unthinkable before "war and genocide", became "a radically new way of relating to one's neighbors"[140] and, thus, a sign of a new social order. However, similar things had happened during the violence in 1959, 1962 and 1973, and Kimonyo has pointed to the "striking rise of the level of violent crime at the grassroots level [in the last years] before the genocide caused by hunger and intense land pressure".[141] The social crisis had been brewing over several years, but the acoustic evidence described so far supports Kimonyo's (and Fujii's) thesis that Rwanda's Hutu masses acted out of a desire for social change in the early 1990s and the mass murders constituted a revolt of the rural poor though not the poorest[142] albeit this seems to have been rarely expressed as in the words of the crowds screaming from the

132 Accounts by Elie Mizinge, Adalbert Munzingura and Pancrace Hakizamungili, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 88, 92–93, 101; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 407.

133 Account by Pancrace Hakizamungili, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 130; Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 246.

134 Account by Joséphine Kampire according to Dumas, *Génocide*, 296.

135 Account by Angélique Mukamanzi, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 78.

136 Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 340–341.

137 See Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 289, 355–356, 407, 409, 474, 498, 666, 669.

138 Account by "Mugabo Arnaud", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 172; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 669.

139 This claim was made by Mandani, *When Victims*, 231.

140 Fujii, *Show Time*, 61.

141 Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 6 (quote), 143–167, 215–263.

142 Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 356, 358; see also Verwimp, "Economic profile".

hills of Kivuru sector, "'The Hutu revolution has begun'".[143] The persecutors of 1994 may have committed mass murder in defense of the prevailing political order, but in social terms, many killers rather went for a new order in an attempt to overturn the existing conditions and make gains.[144]

As for other conflicts among persecutors, part of those returning from killings were generally described as aggressive, menacing and hollering even among Hutus so they had to be calmed down,[145] although many seem to have stopped short of physical violence against each other.[146]

Reports about women's behavior varied. Because of the promise of quick prosperity through plunder, "one did not hear them [i.e., wives] complaining anymore", according to one murderer,[147] while other women agitated and hurled insults against Tutsi women or argued about the loot.[148] But one was scolding her husband for being a too-eager perpetrator.[149]

It has to be noted that loud arguments also arose in cases of disagreement concerning a certain case of murder.[150] If this was about whether entire massacres should go on, those in crowds who opposed murders were said to have been less loud than those cheering for them, although this was not always the case.[151] Moreover, those manning roadblocks sometimes argued among themselves,[152] often about what to do with a suspect.[153] The question of whether a woman or a girl should be raped or not could also lead to an argument.[154] This means that at least some killings and rapes were not uncontroversial among Hutus and that

143 Quoted in Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 244.

144 This matches Adam Jones' claim that "genocides by the oppressed" seek a new, just order and a world turned upside down. See Adam Jones, "On the Genocidal Aspects of Certain Subaltern Uprisings", in: Robins and Jones, *Genocides*, 52. Contemporary Rwandan propaganda was divided on whether people should seek a new order or defend the old, i.e., whether "feudalism" (or serfdom) was still to be abolished or had already been terminated after 1959 and its return was to be prevented: see, for example, Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 108–109; Mamdani, *When Victims*, 233.

145 Accounts by Jean-Baptiste Murangira, Alphonse Hitiyaremye, Fulgence Bunani and Clémentine Murebwayre, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 53, 55, 100, 121.

146 Account by Jean-Baptiste Murangira, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 42.

147 Account by Ignace Rukiramucumu, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 68.

148 Account by Jean-Baptiste Murangira, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 118.

149 Account by Fulgence Bunani, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 116, 118.

150 Account by "Edith Muhaza", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 130.

151 Account by Christine Nyiransabimana, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 127, 129; account by Hamidou Omar, an Angelican priest from the parish of Banda and Belancille Muhimrundu, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 560, 889, 1037; Dumas, *Génocide*, 206–207, 211.

152 Account by François Xavier Nsanzuwera, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 723.

153 Accounts by "Pascasie" and "Catherine", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 484, 772.

154 Account by "Pascasie", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 482.

some Hutus could loudly, and occasionally successfully, object to them, apparently without fear of severe negative consequences for themselves. Society is complex, and even among armed Hutu men, attitudes were not unanimous. Violence was hegemonic but not uncontested.

Arguments could also be hierarchical. In some cases, leaders of groups that attacked people yelled abuses toward men who were late or, in their view, showed too little murderous effort.[155] Only those who protested loudly against taking part in killings received punishment such as fines; consequently, few people objected openly.[156] Those hesitant to kill were mocked and berated.[157] This indicates what was predominant but also, once more, that there was a great variety of behavior.

Confronting Noise with Quiet Dignity: a Last Statement of Social Superiority

Some victims countered the noise in an unlikely manner. When being hacked to death, Jeannette Ayinkamiye's mother only muttered "Holy Cecily" but did not lament.[158] Similar behavior was occasionally even reported about children.[159] Several survivors said that during the big massacre at the church of Nyamata, those under attack remained silent, in contrast to the noise of shouting and machete blows all around.[160] Some of the accounts by relatives of victims where this is conveyed are slightly contradictory in themselves,[161] but they emphasize the discipline, composure and dignity of the dying. Besides, such accounts are confirmed by several statements made by attackers.[162] The group of killers extensively interviewed by Jean Hatzfeld were irritated, even worried, and discussed in the eve-

155 Account by Pancrace Hakizamungili, Léopord Twagirayezu, Fulgence Bunani and Ignace Rukiramacumu, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 13, 17, 67, 76.

156 Accounts by Ignace Rukiramacumu, Adalbert Munzingura and Pio Mutungirehe, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 76, 78, 81.

157 Account by Alphonse Hitiyaremye, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 245.

158 Account by Jeannette Ayinkamiye, *Nur*, 27–28.

159 Account by Innocent Rwililiza, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 96; account by Pio Mutungirehe, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 155.

160 Accounts by Cassius Niyonsaba and Janvier Munyaneza, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 17, 49; account by Valentine Muslisa, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 266.

161 Also, one account speaks of screams of fear among those attacked in the church of Nyamata: account by Christine Nyiransabimana (a Hutu onlooker), Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 127.

162 Account by Léopord Twagirayezu and Alphonse Hitiyaremye, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 31, 153; account by "Mashimangu", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 853.

nings among themselves why it was that many Tutsis did not ask them for mercy, protest and did not even talk to them in the moments before and during their killing; instead, they either prayed or said nothing at all, and a few even suppressed any screams of pain.[163]

Some killers placed their blows in ways intended to make their victims scream and drew pleasure when those whom they hunted down asked for mercy.[164] Not all of them did so; gendarmes told Théophile Zigirumugabe "to say nothing and above all not to ask for mercy" before they deliberated on his fate, and spared him.[165] Elsewhere, leaders instructed killers to hit the victims in ways so that they would not scream.[166]

In addition, many Tutsis reputedly stopped moving before the deadly blows, according to one murderer.[167] This finds confirmation in forensic evidence from the church in Kibuye, the site of another big massacre, where "few bodies showed any defensive wounds" and people thus had not tried to "ward off blows".[168]

Survivors offer several explanations for the silence with which some victims met their deaths, suggesting that those under attack were too "stunned" to scream,[169] exhausted, or thought that resistance made no sense anymore.[170] However, one important root of this near-incredible composure lay in the Rwandan custom of exercising restraint, discipline and emotional control, which was already taught to children and all the more valid for adults. This custom also entailed that people, particularly men, should not cry in public, even while mourning.[171] Often, this kind of demeanor

163 Accounts by Elie Mizinge, Pio Mutungirehe and Léopord Twagirayezu, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 155–156, 253.

164 Accounts by Adalbert Munzingura and Alphonse Hitiyaremye, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 140, 264.

165 African Rights, *Rwanda*, 303.

166 Account by Léon Mukihira, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 606.

167 Account by Pio Mutungirehe, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 41.

168 Fujii, *Show Time*, 140.

169 Account by Spéciose Mukayiraba, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 217.

170 Account by "Ruberwa", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 147.

171 See Crepeau, *Parole*; Déogratias Bagilishya, "Mourning and Recovery from Trauma: In Rwanda, Tears Flow Within," *Transcultural Psychology* 37, 3 (2000): 337, 341, 347–348; Prosper Harerimana, "Death and Life after Death in Rwandan Culture", 2009, https://deathinafrica.wordpress.com/2009/05/02/death-and-life-after-death-in-rwandan-culture-by-prosper-harerimana-hare prosyahoofr/ (last accessed February 21, 2019); Fujii, *Killing*, 34; Fujii, *Show Time*, 111; Andrea Mariko Grant, "Noise and Silence in Rwanda's Postgenocide Religious Soundscape," *Journal of Religion in Africa* 48 (2018): 47; Benda, *Test*, 37. See also Gerard van't Spijker, *Les usages funéraires et la mission de l'église: Une étude anthropologique et theologique des rites funéraires au Rwanda* (Kampen: Uitgeversmaatschappij, 1990); Claudine Vidal, *Sociologie des passions: Côte d'Ivoire, Rwanda* (Paris: Karthala, 1991).- Similar observations have been made recently. See Patrick Im-

has been especially attributed to Tutsis who had the reputation to act in more formal, emotionally restrained, sober and polite ways than Hutus, who were sometimes collectively characterized as "frank" and "impulsive".[172] Internationally, it is not uncommon that the norms of an elite come to shape those of a country. By refusing to beg, scream and wail, and by meeting their death in silence, Tutsis not only tried to keep their personal dignity but also performed their class. They made a final statement not only of their own moral superiority but also of social superiority, negating the social order that their attackers sought.

Emotional Responses

Others under persecution were forced into behaviors that displayed emotions and contradicted tradition. They occasionally challenged the forces of violence by shouting provocatively at them, sometimes even if they were previously undiscovered,[173] pleading to kill them too,[174] and screaming loudly while attempting a counterattack to scare them off.[175]

Except for some summary remarks, I will not detail here the sounds made by dying people, which are frequently mentioned in accounts. They were as could be expected from any people in such a terrible situation. Given the great pain and slow death that attacks with *pangas* and *masus* inflicted on them, many vocal expressions were described as groans, screams and howls. It may have been because of severe loss of blood, stunning head injuries, paralysis or emotional restraint that the noises heard afterward from those in agony were often described as being in a low voice or subdued.

What does require more consideration is the act of crying. General scholarship has established that weeping is not pure emotion and not simply a natural reaction to certain events but is influenced by gender roles, age, social norms, political expectations, cultural values and religion; moreover, it is subject to educa-

---

hasly, "Wo ist das Gewusel Afrikas?", *Neue Zürcher Zeitung*, July 17, 2022, 14 ("Loud music, and noise more generally, are being frowned upon in Rwanda"; my translation).

172 Crepeau, *Parole*, 183; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 140 (citing Théoneste Bagosora, a leading organizer of the mass murders; quotes); accounts by Francine Niyetegeka (a Tutsi) and Christine Nyiransabimana, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 40, 135. For a similar colonial perception, see Piton, *Génocide*, 28.

173 Accounts by Laurent Ngonkoli and Caritas Kabagwiza, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 231, 429; accounts by "Rose Marie Mukamwiza" and "Ruberwa", Totten and Ubald, *We*, 50, 143.

174 In this case, the person was not killed. Accounts by Liberata Mukasakindi and "Odette", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 625, 780.

175 Account by "Emmanuel Murangira", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 83.

tion as well as historical change. Crying is a form of communication.[176] Here, it is of interest to note what practices of crying say about emotional regimes and, through this, social relations and norms.

Generally, many people under persecution were said to be crying, although killers' narratives omitted this fact.[177] Survivors reported having wept out of fear when they were under attack, threatened with death or in the act of fleeing,[178] under stress when their spouse was abducted by attackers,[179] dealing with the impact of a recent attack on them,[180] in pain due to physical injuries[181] and in horror when they found corpses, especially if they were found naked.[182] Women cried during attempts of rape or after they were raped.[183] Children were often crying bent over their dead parents' bodies, a sight unforgettable to witnesses, or if a parent was severely injured or missing.[184] Some adults also cried about the death of their relatives.[185] What survivors remembered most distinctively were the cries of children dying, facing immediate death, or walking around "sobbing and calling out for their parents", as well as the "sobbing whispers" of babies.[186] Child survivors were also haunted by memories of the death of their relatives or close friends who had been injured and crying, feeling guilty that they had not been able to help.[187]

---

176 For example, see Tom Lutz, *Crying: the natural and cultural history of tears* (New York: W.W. Norton, 1999).

177 See Hatzfeld, *Zeit*.

178 Accounts by Théophile Zigurumugabe, Emmerence Mujawamariya, Claudien Kanamugire, Chantal Uwimana, Mamerita Uwamariya and an anonymous nun, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 301, 411, 471, 810, 947, 1042; anonymous account, Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 70; Jean Louis Mazimpaka, "I survived the Rwandan genocide", *Guardian* online, 18 July 2009; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 577.

179 Account by "Mugabo Arnaud", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 184.

180 Account by "Yvette", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 310.

181 Account by "Kwibuka", Totten and Ubaldo, *We* 103.

182 Account by Francine Niyitegeka, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 37

183 Account by "Pascasie", "Juliana", "Odette" and "Beata", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 483, 753, 781, 792.

184 Accounts by Spéciose Mukayiraba, Emile Karuranga, Oreste Incimatata, Beatrice Mukandinda, Immaculée Mukeshimana and Célestin Mukeshimana, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 217, 346, 384, 857, 936, 962; account by Jacqueline Hagenimana, Rwanda YCT.

185 Account by "Annonciata", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 813; account by "Kwibuka", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 103.

186 Accounts by Second Twagirumukiza, Marie-Gorette Mukakalinda, "Emmanuel" (quote, from a scene in the church of Murambi), Eugène Busa and Marthe Mukamurenzi, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 293, 321, 386, 563, 678; account by "Emmanuel Murangira", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 87.

187 See Sara Brown, *Gender and Genocide in Rwanda: Women as Rescuers and Perpetrators* (New York: Routledge, 2018), 68–69 and account by "Ruberwa", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 144.

Many persecuted children also cried from hunger or stress, which could attract killers.[188] At one roadblock, the guards were slapping children who cried, and some murder gangs tried to deceive children who were being led to their execution to avoid making them cry.[189] In another scene, three girls crying in front of a crowd before they were murdered made some people call for mercy on their behalf, although others were left indifferent and still others mocked them.[190] Some female Hutu students complained that the babies of a crowd of Tutsi refugees disturbed their sleep.[191] To prevent them from making noises, children of refugees were given sleeping pills by their mothers or instructed not to cry. Often, they purportedly obeyed, as in the case of a child of eighteen months who spent an entire night alone hidden in a closet.[192] At massacre sites, murderers sometimes used tear gas or pepper gas to find survivors of any age among the bodies by inducing crying and sneezing.[193]

Those who cried included women, children and men, and they tended to weep more often when they were in a group or in front of others than when they were alone. Survivors also wept a lot in memory of their murdered relatives[194] or because of their own suffering. In contrast, people crying out of relief when they were reunited with their families was very rare.[195] Those who were weeping included some who were not under persecution. A Hutu relative of a Tutsi mother also cried when explaining that he felt that he could not save her child because it "looked very Tutsi",[196] while a Hutu man wept when he succeeded in bringing a group of children to their mother.[197] A man from Zaire cried while watching kill-

188 See account by "Chantal", Lidie Utagoma and "Vestine", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 512, 618, 785; account by "Rose Marie Mukamwiza", "Emmanuel Murangira", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 29, 85; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 458.

189 Account by François Xavier Nsanzuwera, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 723; Dumas, *Génocide*, 251–252.

190 See Dumas, *Génocide*, 211 and for a similar scene 263.

191 Account by "Yvette", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 308. For Hutu complaints about Tutsi refugees in general being too noisy, with the implication that they should be removed or killed, see accounts by Marie-Gorette Mukalinda and Jerôme Banyingana, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 320, 448.

192 Accounts by "Caritas" and Therèse Mukarusagara, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 758, 1032.

193 See accounts by Louis Rutaganira, Elia Gashi and Françoise Nyirasabura, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 421, 446, 956.

194 Accounts by "Ruberwa" and "Murorunkwere", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 140, 175.

195 Account by Jean Paul Birmavu, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 570; account by "Ruberwa", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 140.

196 Account by Mamerita Uwamariya, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 821.

197 Account by "Mugabo Arnaud", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 182.

ings at the Rwandan border,[198] and priests also wept when they left or abandoned Tutsi refugees in a parish.[199]

What most of this suggests is that many Tutsis did openly show emotions like fear, pain and sadness by crying, which was in violation of traditional social norms. While some of this may have been instinctive and involuntary, in other cases – and through collective, public weeping in particular – crying served to strengthen community ties among those who were still there and signaled the need for help to others. Self-control gave way to loud expressions of emotion to garner social support or express one's authentic personality.

Religious Practice

Rwanda is the only case of mass violence that I have examined through sound history where religious practice played a major role. Praying, having mass and reciting religious songs are acts that are often mentioned in survivor accounts. This contrast to other cases requires an explanation. The strength of organized religion in Rwanda is only part of it. The circumstances matter, too – whether these practices were individual or collective, supervised by clergy or not, and occurred on church grounds or elsewhere. (The other cases that I examined include Chuknagar, East Pakistan, in 1971; the murder of European Jews and German mass killings of Belarusian villagers in the course of anti-partisan warfare in World War II; Indonesia in and after 1965; and Hiroshima and Nagasaki after the nuclear attacks.[200])

Research on Rwanda thus far has concentrated on the role of the clergy in the violence and emphasized that the Christian churches – and the Catholic church in particular – waited a long time before condemning the 1994 mass murders (if they did at all), rather than justifying or concealing the massacres as before. Owing to a close relationship between church leaders and the leading party, MRND, large parts of the clergy did little to support the faithful, especially foreign and Hutu priests, when church and monasterial compounds were crowded with refugees desperately looking for help. Moreover, many Tutsi clergy were mur-

198 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 541.

199 Anonymous account and account by Sicolas Mukarugaba, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 461, 489.

200 For Chuknagar, see chapter 3 of this study; otherwise, see Christian Gerlach, "Echoes of persecution: sounds in early post-liberation Jewish memories," *Holocaust Studies* 24, 1 (2018): 1–25; and idem, "Indonesian Narratives of Survival in and after 1965 and Their Relation to Societal Persecution", in: Christian Gerlach and Clemens Six, eds. *The Palgrave Handbook of Anti-Communist Persecutions* (Cham: PalgraveMacmillan, 2020), 441–458.

dered by attackers, and so were most refugees at Christian compounds in some of the biggest massacres during the 1994 killings.[201] More than 60 percent of Rwandans were Catholic and about 90 percent were Christians. The indifference of the clergy is supported by the fact that I could only find one account in which a church bell was rung in alarm.[202] But my analysis differs from earlier ones in that I am focusing on religious practice rather than political action as well as on the behavior of lay people rather than the clergy.

Many survivors tell stories of piety, strength of faith and martyrdom, often through drastic examples. When attackers burned down the church in Kibeho and children inside screamed while burning or suffocating, a group of adults in the building sang a Kinyarwanda song that translates to "We were created for heaven. That's where all shall be happy for ever [sic]."[203] Another group of students at the same parish prayed together when being surrounded.[204] When militias burned down a private house near Nyamata which had ten refugees inside, those inside rushed out with burns when the silence indicated that the attackers had left and one woman shouted "Jesus is alive!"[205] Inside the infamous church of Nyamata, people were singing from the start of the attack, one of the bloodiest in Rwanda's history, "Onward, Christian soldiers", without putting up a fight.[206] Nuns in Nyapubuye assembled refugees for holding mass, praying the rosary and singing hymns until their death.[207] According to the reports, these practices were mostly for emotional in-group community building and in preparation for death and hardly intended to include, and thus appease, attackers.

On the other hand, when facing those who were about to kill them, some Tutsis abstained from praying.[208] At the health center in Nkanka, many people "prayed to god for help" before the attack, but during it many were reportedly "unable to pray" despite being in the center's chapel.[209] One of the Tutsis who

201 See Longman, *Christianity*.

202 Account by Egide Kayitare, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 533 (parish of Shangi).

203 Account by Vestine Nyirafurere, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 298. Spelling as in the original.

204 Account by "Yvette", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 309.

205 Account by Pélagie Mukashema, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 631.

206 Account by "Emmanuel Muhinda", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 119. For a similar scene from Shangi, see account by Egide Kayitare, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 538.

207 Account by Ernest [sic] Nyiramuganga, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 903.

208 Account by Pio Mutungirehe, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 155; see also account by Félicien Bahizi (a seminarian), African Rights, *Rwanda*, 459 for a crowd of refugees where some took to praying and others did not.

209 Account by a staff member by the Nkanka health center, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 504, 505.

spent weeks and months in hiding reported that the refugees either lost their faith or forgot to pray after a while.[210]

According to an official Rwandan study, close to 40 percent of all Tutsi victims were killed at church compounds.[211] People went there because the many who had taken refuge in churches in the previous sprees of violence in Rwanda had been spared. This part of the 1994 killings is central to many survivor accounts, which is why many cases of religious practice described in them also occurred in or near churches. Some people who were under persecution also said that they went to a church to say their prayers together;[212] others (including Christians) fled to mosques, just as some Muslims fled to churches, where they too were murdered.[213]

As several of the aforementioned examples show, even in consecrated spaces not everybody who turned to audible religious practice collectively did so in the presence of clergy. On rare occasions, priests were reported to have held a last mass with refugees or conducted other rites, but some of these men were depicted as dishonest.[214] In the church of Gishamvu, a priest baptized children among the refugees and gave other people the last sacraments.[215] Mass services held for murdered people were exceptional as there seemed to be not enough time or energy for them.[216] The same goes for individual prayers for those who had been killed.[217] Most victims stayed without proper burial and rites, a constant concern for many survivors.[218] In the parish of Nyamasheke, as in many other places, the believers were abandoned by the priests (in this case, a bishop). As the peasant Gaëtan Kabanda recounted: "We tried to organize ourselves. But all we

210 Account by Janvier Munyaneza, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 52.

211 Dumas, *Génocide*, 58.

212 Accounts by Emerithe Uwinera and Jeanne Kanyana, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 269, 282

213 Account by Fréderic Mutagwera, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 226. Muslims have often been praised for mass abstention from the killings and protecting persecuted people, although there were prominent cases of the opposite so that their faith did not immunize members from becoming violent. See the paper Kristin Doughty and David Moussa Ntambara, *Resistance and Protection: Muslim Community Actions During the Rwandan Genocide* (Cambridge, 2005), and the cautionary thoughts in Benda, *Test*, 127–152.

214 Longman, *Christianity*, 287; for dishonesty, see account by Jean-Baptiste Sibomana, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 327.

215 Account by Zayasi Kanamugere, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 353.

216 Account by "Consolata", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 1046. They also contradicted the Rwandan customs of mourning in silence and privately: Harerimana, "Death".

217 Allan Thompson, "Introduction", in Allan Thompson, ed., *The Media and the Rwandan Genocide* (New York: Pluto, 2007), 3.

218 Burnet, *Genocide*, 95. For the context, see Bagilishya, "Mourning,", 347.

could do was pray. It felt like the end of all our lives." After the killers left, the survivors were "praying throughout the night".[219]

There were also many instances of *individual* audible religious practice, more often elsewhere than in church areas. People often said last prayers alone when being wounded and facing their death or while hiding during an attack or in the fields[220] and also during rape.[221] Sometimes, this made persecutors revise their decision to kill, as in the case where a mother started singing a hymn after two men came to pick up her family to murder them. The men changed their minds and told the family before leaving: "Be quiet". But after a while, the family loudly praised God.[222]

On some occasions, it was the persecutors who told the victims to say their last prayers.[223] The fact that groups prayed and sang Christian songs together when facing their attackers is less frequently mentioned.[224] In one case, a Tutsi family took turns praying day and night while hidden at home.[225]

In the weeks of the mass murders, the attackers did not make religious utterances. During massacres, they desecrated and destroyed many churches, and occasionally their anti-Tutsi slurs were openly heretic in terms of religious dogma, as observed in the church compound of Murambi, where they shouted: "The God of Tutsis is no longer around", "There is only the God of the Hutus remaining!"[226] At home and in public, they either did not pray or only for their own sake, in part out of fear.[227] One murderer claimed that in the months of the slaughter, the radio no longer broadcast Sunday mass or sermons, and religious songs were put on the air only a few times.[228] Another murderer from the same area added that no local church services were held in these months.[229]

219 African Rights, *Rwanda*, 465, 467.

220 Accounts by Théophile Zigirumugabe, Léon Mukihira, Laetitia Ugiriwabo, "Isa" and Joseph Sibomana (a retired bishop), African Rights, *Rwanda*, 302, 607, 808, 816, 883; account by "Ruberwa", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 145.

221 Account by "Alexia", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 794.

222 Account by "Pierre", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 575; another case is mentioned in Brown, *Gender*, 65, and see account by "Umulisa", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 53.

223 Account by "Edith Muhaza", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 129.

224 Accounts by Félicien Bahizi and "Pascasie", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 460, 481.

225 Account by "Umulisa", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 50.

226 See account by "Emmanuel Murangira", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 83.

227 See above; for praying, see accounts by Alphonse Hitayaremye and Léopord Twagirayezu, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 153 (also for desecration), 157, 159.

228 Account by Elie Mizinge, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 158.

229 Account by Alphonse Hitiyaremye, *Zeit*, 101.

Along with religious activities, people also took up regional traditions that transcended ethnic groups. Hutus in Burundi who were facing their murder in 1972 were also said to have done "nothing but praying and singing only".[230] That said, some aspects of the behavior demonstrated in 1994 are noteworthy. Often, Christians who prayed, chanted and sang religious songs, whether individually or collectively during the persecution, were not under the instruction of clergy. This displayed quite an individualized, quasi-protestant relationship to God, foreshadowing the turn to Protestantism in a broad sense (although most post-1994 converts were Hutus) and the surge of piety after 1994.[231] Religious practice in the months of mass killings can therefore be understood as popular action and social activity.

It is significant that, according to the accounts accessible to me, persecuted Tutsi would only sing religious songs during that time, in contrast with the secular ones that were all what persecutors were singing (and secular music was also most of what they listened to from the radio and cassette players): folk music, political songs, improvised hate chants and African pop music.[232] With this, the former claimed universal values and social inclusion (though, in a Rwandan context, with overtones of foreign colonial domination – while secular songs and ethnic connotations, including with past Tutsi splendor, were missing) whereas the latter took the justification for their exclusionist particularism of the majority from political discourse and past and present popular struggles with connotations of a lower-class perspective and not from their religious creed. This audible difference between religious vs. non-religious practice shows the wide social gap between these groups and their different concepts of society. With the Catholic church, aggressive Hutus challenged or attacked the social order and some social norms ascribed to Catholicism, like silent composure and passive obedience to traditional elites.

Sound Technology and Social Situation

Of course, the emergence of this new order was not without inner contradictions, as one piece of sound equipment proves. Whistles were reported as having served various purposes, most frequently for organizing killings. They were command-

230 Malkki, *Purity*, 100.

231 For both developments, see Anne Kubai, "Post-Genocide Rwanda: The Changing Religious Landscape", *Exchange* 36 (2007): 198–214, and Grant, "Noise", 35–64.

232 See above. One killer claimed that Hutus and Tutsi still sang chorals together in Nyamata on 7 April 1994. Account by Adalbert Munzingura, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 152.

like blown to mark the beginning and the end of killings and searches for victims.[233] This points to the existing hierarchies as well as, together with a recurrent daily schedule in some places, also a work-like attitude.[234] Scholars have already pointed to persecutors likening their killings to work,[235] reminiscent of the rural labor which the MRND regime had propagated.[236] In fact, some killers later complained about having been disciplined this way, as one peasant described: "We were not used to work, march and return according to whistle signals."[237] This was less of a culture shock for the many rural dwellers who were already used to day labor or employment in service jobs.

There were also other aspects of organization and mobilization in the ways whistles were used. In many places, groups or crowds were called using whistles to assemble for the hunt for Tutsis.[238] Sometimes they served to attract people to join a murderous crowd on the way spontaneously.[239] Whistles were apparently also used by persecutors to exchange signals during chases and on guard, day or night,[240] or as start signal for an attack on crowds.[241] Or they were instrumental to tell others what to do, such as signaling Hutus to leave a place where many Tutsi had gathered, or to wake up local residents in the morning.[242]

But their carriers adopted whistles also for purposes other than hierarchical organization, such as during celebrations of the killings of the day[243] or to make

233 Accounts by Janvier Munyaneza and Claudine Kavitezi, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 51, 183; account by Innocent Rwililiza, a survivor, or Elie Mizinge, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 51.

234 Account by Angélique Mukamanzi, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 77. But whistles were hardly proof of central national organization, as Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 285, argued.

235 For example, see Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 178 note 126; Taylor, "Cultural Face", 169.

236 See Philip Verwimp, "Development ideology, the peasantry and genocide: Rwanda represented in Habyarimana's speeches", *Journal of Genocide Research* 2, 3 (2000): 325–361.

237 Account by Fulgence Bunani, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 67 (quote translated from German). See also account by Ignace Rukiramacumu, ibid., 16. Taylor, "Face", 169 argued that persecutors rather used metaphors of labor to allude to their alleged service to the nation and make a claim to state compensation.

238 Account by Charlotte Mupenzi, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 596; account by Justin Karangwa, Rwanda YCT.

239 Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 245; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 383.

240 Accounts by Spéciose Mukayiraba, "Cathérine", Claudine Muyebwayire and eyewitness from ICRC hospital, Kigali, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 216, 218, 772, 828, 938; account by "Kwibuka", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 102; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 440.

241 Account by Célestin Mazimpaka, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 373; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 460.

242 Account by Théophile Zigirumugabe, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 300; account by "Rose Marie Mukamwiza", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 25.

243 Account by Adalbert Munzingura, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 100; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 528.

intimidating noise with various instruments.[244] Whatever their use, whistles were often remembered and mentioned by survivors because they always constituted a menacing sign, and a symbol of the new order.

Most types of electric sound equipment surface less frequently in the accounts, and they once again indicate organized action by the persecutors. This includes the honking horns of trucks and buses loaded with militias[245] and loudspeaker announcements by officials (in some cases, the witnesses were perhaps also referring to megaphones), which were often misleading,[246] or transmitting names of persons among a crowd of domestic refugees who were supposed to surrender to the killers.[247]

While loud instruments used by persecutors, and especially their leaders, dominated the Rwandan soundscape over these months, a less loud and more concealed acoustic tool was used by people under persecution (both Tutsis and Hutus): the telephone.[248] However, back then, only the upper classes had access to phones. These were usually members of the intelligentsia in a broad sense (politicians, civil servants, military and gendarmerie officers, clergy, school directors, medical staff, lawyers, journalists, 'aid' workers and foreigners), mostly male, and more likely to live in urban than rural areas. They used their phones to ask for help for themselves and/or their families or for refugees,[249] to gain information about the violence happening and share it with family, friends and colleagues,[250]

244 Accounts by Egide Kayitare, "Cathérine" and Marguerite Karuhimbi, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 531 (the men were also beating drums), 769 (the men were also beating tins), 1057; account by "Emmanuel Murangira", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 83; account by Jacqueline Hagenimana, Rwanda YCT; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 390, 440, 522.

245 Account by Fulgence Bunani, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 13.

246 Accounts by Jean Muragizi and "Catherine", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 621, 769 (loudspeakers installed on the roofs of cars), accounts by Sébastien Garsana, Virginie Musabyemariya, Christine Uwanyirigire and Mamerita Uwamariya, ibid., 477, 541, 842, 1094; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 312, 439. See also Carrie Sperling, "Mother of Atrocities: Pauline Nyiramasuhuko's Role in the Rwandan Genocide", *Fordham Urban Law Journal* 33, 2 (2006): 649.

247 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 251.

248 Soldiers, but also persecuted civilians, are sometimes also depicted of having used walkie-talkies: accounts by François Xavier Nsamzuwera, Hamidou Omar, Léon Mukihira and Mariette Kabanda, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 232, 561, 605, 836.

249 Account by "William Jean-Robert", Twagilimana, *Teenage Refugees*, 44; accounts by Pierre Claver Rwangabo, Catherine Kanyundo, Jacqueline Nyiranzeyimana, François Xavier Nsanzuwera and Médecins sans Frontières employee, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 181–182, 523, 525, 721, 975; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 572.

250 Accounts by Marc Rugenera, Pierre Claver Rwangabo, Joseph Nsengimana, Kamoso Pie, Jean Népumucène Nayinzara, Médard Rutijanwa, Gaspard Karemera, Spéciose Mukayiraba, Fréderic Mutagwera, Ismail Amri Swed, Nkonko health center staff member, Marie Leimalda Munyakazi,

to warn people[251] and to report to others about the situation.[252] Officials called politicians and the military, but this was mostly in vain if they asked for support to restrain the murderers.[253] Thus, information exchange was the single most important reason for making calls. What is less often reported are instances of threatening phone calls[254] or instructions provided by phone to assist in the persecution.[255]

These activities were hampered by individual phone lines being interrupted or connections between prefectures or within regions breaking down.[256] If people had their phones cut off, this indicates authorities' awareness that phones were often used to evade or locally stop the violence and thus utilized by people under persecution or those opposing the murders. However, with phones, people could only undermine the new order but not openly challenge it. Even undermining it usually did not work, as most calls were made in the early period of the mass murders; the callers eventually gave up, lost their access to phones or left the country. Nonetheless, phone lines constituted an elite network that was relatively often used with success to gain protection or exit opportunities, a chance that most peasants or day laborers did not have.

The most cited acoustic medium in the Rwandan mass murders is the radio, and its uses illuminate the social situation. According to the standard narrative in scholarship and courtrooms, the organizers of the 'genocide' steered, instructed and manipulated perpetrators nationwide using radio propaganda, namely through *Radio-Télévision Libre Mille Collines* (RTLM), a private station founded in 1993 by Rwandan business leaders and politicians that is known for its interactive format, informal and flexible style, fashionable music mix, and radical content.[257] Many

---

anonymous African missionary, Mamerita Uwamariya and Paul Rusesabagina, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 179, 181–182, 184–185, 190, 194, 196, 204–205, 215, 225–226, 234, 503, 674–675, 874, 947, 1001.

251 Account by Gaspard Karemera, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 205, in addition to some other calls referenced in the previous footnote.

252 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 251.

253 Accounts by Kamoso Pie, "Luc", "Monique", Célestin Mazimpaka, Félicien Bahizi, anonymous parishioner, Maurice Kalisa, Paul Rusesabagina and Beatrice Uwamwezi, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 191, 368, 370, 373, 375, 457, 459, 461, 478, 719, 849–851; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 390.

254 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 512, 547; nurse from university hospital in Butare, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 945.

255 Accounts by Paul Rusesabigana and Emmanuel Sagahutu, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 719, 1020.

256 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 375 (Gikongoro prefecture), 393 (Kivu area), 514 (various prefectures); individual cases: accounts by Marc Rugenera, Joseph Nsengimana, "Marianne", Léon Mukihira and Paul Rusesabigana, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 180, 184–185, 239, 605, 719.

257 See, for example, Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 98–100. Straus, "What", 610, 612–614 sums up the dominant narrative.

scholars found radio to be of enormous importance to the mass murders in a country where 34 percent of the people over the age of six were illiterate in 1994 (and, thus, many adults).[258] Existing research has concentrated on RTLM and broadcasts' contents.[259] RTLM focused on a defensive war narrative and often implied that all Tutsi were the enemy (even though it rarely said so openly and unequivocally).[260] Some studies revised the standard narrative to an extent, stating that although RTLM informed and influenced persecutors' actions, it did not determine or remote-control them; that the peak of killings did not correlate with inciting broadcasts; that RTLM's content was more contradictory than is often portrayed, including calls for stopping violence broadcast alongside more frequent and fervent demands for violence; and that the radio was not a decisive factor in the mass murders.[261] Even a field survey commissioned by the Senate of the Republic of Rwanda found that 34 percent of respondents considered the "media" to be the major tool for mobilization in the 1994 mass murders, a sizable but limited percentage,[262] while the International Tribunal for Rwanda found a direct impact of RTLM airings was only proven in a few cases.[263]

In this context, the operations of the official and rather rigid Radio Rwanda have been neglected. The same goes for the station installed by the RPF, *Radio Muhabura* (Beacon), but because of its dogmatic and radical style, even some RPF soldiers preferred to listen to RTLM.[264] It has to be added that most scholarship has inquired into what persecutors heard, with most attention paid to urban areas. Therefore, examining survivors' experiences adds some crucial aspects and helps modify earlier findings.

One such insight pertains to the places where RTLM was heard. About 27 percent of rural households in Rwanda and 59 percent of urban ones owned a radio

258 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 96.

259 For example, see Thompson, *Media*; McDoom, "Psychology", 141–143, 146–147, 151–152.

260 See also Dumas, *Génocide*, 117–128.

261 Straus, "What", especially 611, 622–628, 630; Li, "Echoes", 9–27; Charles Mironko, "The Effect of RTLM's Rhetoric of Ethnic Hatred in Rural Rwanda", Thompson, *Media*, 134; Mary Kimoni, "RTLM: the Medium That Became a Tool for Mass Murder", in: Thompson, *Media*, 120. See also Piton, *Génocide*, 93; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 247–248, 318, 339, 342, 346; Balthasar Grüter, *Aufstachelung zum Massenmord? Das Radioprogramm von Radio Télévision Libre des Mille Collines in Ruanda von Juli 1993 bis Juli 1994*, Master's thesis, University of Bern, June 2016.

262 Republic of Rwanda, Parliament, The Senate, *Rwanda: Genocide Ideology and Strategies for Its Eradication* (Kigali: Senate, 2006), 85.

263 "Summary Judgment of the Media Trial" (ICTR-99–52-T, 3 December 2003), Thompson, *Media*, 277–306.

264 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 98; Li, "Echoes", 8; Prunier, *Rwanda Crisis*, 189.

in 1991.[265] Accordingly, people from Kigali reported more often that they listened to the radio than those from the countryside.[266] Usually, radio sets were battery-driven and often in the form of boom boxes with integrated cassette players. Outside Kigali, survivors, who talked of Radio Rwanda more often, rarely listened to, or received, RTLM. A few did so in the western prefectures of Kibuye and Cyangugu, but also in Kibungo, Gikongoro and Butare.[267] This matches Charles Mironko's findings that RTLM was received throughout the country – although more often in Kigali – better than Scott Straus' that it reached only Kigali and parts of central and western Rwanda.[268]

Unlike in most cases of mass violence that I have studied where it played only a marginal role,[269] listening to the radio is an important feature in survivor accounts from Rwanda. This requires explanations. In the following discussion, I distinguish among three functions of radio broadcasts: information, organization and agitation/incitement, starting with the latter.[270] Radio propaganda was a factor that some persecutors strongly emphasized, arguing that they had been manipulated into killing.[271] Many survivors also referred to the rabble-rousing in the broadcasts.[272] More than a few reported that this baiting had already been going on in the early 1990s, and most of it was thus done through Radio Rwanda.[273] During the 1994 massacres, radio stations also spread misleadingly calming informa-

265 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 96; Adekunle, *Culture*, 61 note 15; McDoom, "Psychology", 138. Straus, "What", 616 suggests that it was less than ten percent, based on UNESCO data.

266 For Kigali, see African Rights, *Rwanda*, 179–239.

267 Elie Mizinge, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 102; accounts by "Luc" (Kibungo), Emmanuel Nsabimana and Nelson Nsengiyumva, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 368 (Kibungo), 400 (Kibuye), 612 (Cyangugu), see also 588 (Kibuye); accounts by "Rose Marie Mukamwiza", "Emmanuel Murangira", "Angelique Isimbi", "Mugabo Arnaud", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 24–25 (Butare), 82 (Gikongoro), 158 (Butare), 179 (Cyangugu).

268 See Mironko, "Effect", 126–127; Li, "Echoes", 25 note 2; and McDoom, "Psychology", 139–140, opposing Straus, "What", 617.

269 See chapter 3 of this study; Gerlach, "Echoes"; and idem, "Indonesian Narratives".

270 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 28, 301–304.

271 Accounts by Adalbert Munzingura and Pancrace Hakizamungili, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 55, 76, 98, 235, 239–240, 246; Kimonyo, *Rwanda's Popular Genocide*, 340. In another defense strategy, other persecutors strongly claimed ignorance of RTLM; see Mironko, "Effect", 129–134.

272 Accounts by Innocent Rwililiza and Christine Nyiransabimana, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 103, 130; accounts by "Umulisa", anonymous, "Emmanuel Murangira", "Emmanuel Muhinda", "Angelique Isimbi" and "Mugabo Arnaud", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 48, 68–69, 82, 116, 158, 179; two examples are in Brown, *Gender*, 46–47.

273 Account by Jean-Baptiste Munyankore, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 67; account by Nelson Nsengiyumva, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 614; accounts by "Umulisa" and anonymous, Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 42–43 and 45, 65 and 68. As for persecutors, see accounts by Joseph-Désiré Bitero, Elie Mizinge and Pancrace Hakizamungili, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 192, 194, 238.

tion that was obviously intended to lure Tutsis out of hiding or refuge, such as a speech by President Sindikubwabo.[274]

However, propaganda and incitement are mentioned more often in accounts made years after the event, probably because the interviewers asked specific questions about it, than in the early reports in the collection of African Rights, where people rather emphasized the radio's role in informing.[275] Some of these early accounts, in turn, accused Radio Rwanda of having aired misleading or inciting propaganda and called for it to be held accountable.[276] Within that radio station, employees organized a "witchhunt" against other colleagues, some of whom fled to the Hotel "Mille Collines" in Kigali.[277] Moreover, the initial prefects of Gikongoro and Butare warned citizens to evaluate what they heard on the radio critically.[278]

RTLM was also accused of having helped organize concrete killing operations.[279] It named people who should be apprehended (or killed)[280] and pointed to places where many refugees (mostly Tutsis) had gathered as alleged security risks, warned that the crowds included infiltrators, and openly told people to attack them.[281] Some persecutors and people manning roadblocks reported hearing such broadcasts.[282] But, unlike some foreigners, of the many survivors who mentioned roadblocks, almost none said anything about guards listening to the radio, let alone RTLM.[283] All things considered, there is little evidence in these sources

274 Account by "Joseph", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 1005; accounts by "Umulisa" and anonymous, Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 51, 69.

275 For political agitation via the radio mentioned in African Rights, *Rwanda*, see accounts by Kamoso Pie, "Marianne", "Luc", Félicien Bahizi and "Isaie", 191, 239, 368, 457 and 460, 555.

276 Accounts by Reine Munyantore, Caritas Kabagwiza, Félicien Bahizi, "Isaie", Apolonia Mukandamage, "Juliana" and an African missionary from Gitarama, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 267, 428, 457 and 460, 555, 658–659, 757–758, 1054; account by "Didier" (a son of the director of Radio Rwanda), Twagilimana, *Teenage Refugees*, 55.

277 Account by Louise Kayibanda, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 362.

278 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 517–518.

279 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 46, 249–252.

280 Account by Emmanuel Nsabimana, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 400. Already in April 1993, Radio Rwanda had suspected eleven school students from Nyanza of supporting the RPF and specified their names: account by "Angelique Isimbi", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 158.

281 Accounts by Fréderic Mutagwera and Caritas Kabagwiza, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 226, 428, see also 566; account by "Emmanuel Muhinda", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 118; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 518.

282 Account by François Bybarumwanzi, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 220.

283 See African Rights, Rwanda, and the Rwanda YCT collection in contrast to Alison Des Forges, "Call for Genocide: Radio in Rwanda, 1994", Thompson, *Media*, 50 and Philippe Dahinden, "Information in Crisis Areas as a Tool for Peace: the Hirondelle Experiment", Thompson, *Media*, 381.

suggesting that this radio station was effective as a co-organizer of killings, except for rare cases.

By far, the most frequent way in which survivors spoke of the radio was as a source of information. Their accounts primarily mention the news about the plane crash and the death of President Habyarimana, often along with the curfew that followed.[284] Many specified that RTLM broadcast the news of the crash already in the evening of April 6, when Radio Rwanda merely switched to sending classical music, only to officially confirm the president's death the next morning while announcing the curfew.[285] (In fact, even a Tutsi journalist from Radio Rwanda recalled that she heard of the President's death only on April 7 despite having worked the evening shift the day before.[286]) Many survivors also spoke about the premonitions that they had upon hearing this news. During the following days, persecuted people listened to the news regarding the violence in Kigali and other parts of the country.[287] Sometimes they were also informed about specific political decisions.[288]

During the mass killings, information was vital, and listening to the radio was essential for getting it. Survivors from the capital as well as from the province clad this in terms like "I tried to follow things on the radio",[289] "[b]ecause of

284 Account by Edith Uwanyiligira, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 151; accounts by Albert Majaro, François Bybarumwanzi, Bernadette Kanzayire, Laurent Ngonkoli, Angelo Nkurunziza, Beata Niyoyita, Pierre Canisius Rutagengwa, Philipo Kayitore, Jeanne Kanyana, "Luc", Beatrice Uwamwezi, Jean Claude Karangumunwa, Anastase Nkinamubanzi, Félicitée Mubashima, Jerôme Bayingana, Gaëtan Kabanda, "Pascasie", "Claudine", anonymous journalist, Pierre-Simon Hitiyiza, "Pierre", Agnes Ndabubaha-Kansine, Nelson Nsengiyumva, Claver Mbugufe, "Jean", Gaston Nsengiyumva, Christian Kineza and Josephine Mukandori, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 210, 219, 221, 228, 238, 262, 268, 270, 281, 355, 368, 374, 377, 403, 431, 448, 463, 480, 486, 564, 567, 574, 599, 612, 664, 677, 682, 846, 1044; accounts by "Rose Marie Mukamwiza", "Umulisa" and anonymous, Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 24, 47, 69. Some men said that at the time of the first news in the evening of 6 April 1994 they had watched a football match on TV: accounts by Denis Kaniwabahizi, Hamidou Omar and Fréderic Mutagwera, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 96, 195, 225.

285 Account by Marc Rugenera, Pierre Claver Rwangabo, Joseph Nsengimana, Bonaventure Ubalijoro, Hamidou Omar, Gaspard Karemera, Fréderic Mutagwera, François Xavier Nsanzuwera, Ismail Amri Swed, Oreste Incimatata, Jean Paul Birmavu, Marthe Mukamurenzi, Jean Marie-Vianney Nkurunziza, Gorette Uwimana and Désiré Gashirabake, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 179, 181, 184, 189, 195, 204, 225, 232, 234, 381, 569, 678, 684, 689, 1029; account by "Beatrice", Twagilimana, *Teenage Refugees*, 31–33.

286 Account by Louise Kayibanda, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 361.

287 Account by Sylvie Umibyeyi, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 207; accounts by "Yvette" and "Chantal", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 306, 512; Mazimpaka, "I survived".

288 Account by Jean Damascène Kayitesi, Jean Paul Biramvu and a nurse from Butare university hospital, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 333, 570, 945.

289 Account by Bonaventure Niyibizi, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 697.

the curfew, we stayed at home and decided to follow events by radio",[290] and "We listened to RTLM because they would relate what was happening."[291] One survivor monitored broadcasts by RTLM, Radio Rwanda and *Radio Muhabura* "in order to try to figure out what was happening in the country".[292] Everything was about information – next to no survivor spoke about having listened to music after 6 April 1994 (unlike many persecutors).

This desire for factual orientation included efforts to recognize misinformation.[293] Some – particularly educated listeners in Kigali – found the information from RTLM unreliable,[294] whereas one, on the contrary, declared that whereas RTLM and also *Radio Muhabura* reported specific details, Radio Rwanda's broadcasts were not useful as they were vague and unspecific.[295] A nun said that radio information did not allow her to get an accurate picture of the situation.[296]

Relatively few people recounted programs by RPF's *Radio Muhabura*. A bishop warned school students in Kibeho against listening to it.[297] If this station praised a person, this endangered his life because Hutu-power advocates suspected him to be a foe.[298] To listen to foreign radio stations that could be received in Rwanda seems to have been a rare occurrence.[299]

Philippe Dahinden has argued that during the mass murders, refugees "had no real information", i.e., access to radio sets.[300] Some survivor accounts confirm that they lacked information from the radio while in hiding.[301] In rare instances, refugees did have a radio with them and listened to news about the killings while

290 Account by a peasant family from Byumba, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 366.

291 Account by "Mugabo Arnaud", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 180. See also account by "Jean-Hubert", Twagilimana, *Teenage Refugees*, 37.

292 Account by "Umulisa", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 53. Verwimp, *Peasants*, 224 mentions a similar behavior by a Hutu-manned MDR group in 1992-1993, during the civil war.

293 Account by Marc Rugenera, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 180 (he heard about his own death on an unspecified channel).

294 Accounts by Gaspard Karemera (a journalist), Fréderic Mutagwera and Ismail Amri Swed, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 204, 225, 234.

295 Account by "Umulisa", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 54.

296 See African Rights, *Rwanda*, 239.

297 See Burnet, *Genocide*, 174; account by "Umulisa", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 45, 53–54. For the bishop, see account by "Yvette", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 309.

298 See Prunier, *Rwanda Crisis*, 259.

299 Accounts by Béatrice Uzayizaba, Egide Kayitare and "Jean", African Rights, *Rwanda*, 492, 531 (both unspecified), 677 (BBC); Burnet, *Genocide*, 174 (BBC and Radio France International). For technical details, see Straus, "What", 612 and 634 note 14.

300 Dahinden, "Experiment", 381.

301 Account by Francine Niyitegeka, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 39.

in hiding,[302] and this was certainly the case in places where hundreds or thousands of refugees had gathered in April 1994. Unlike before April 6,[303] listening to the radio had become a segregated practice, separating Hutus and Tutsis.

However, the main point is this: dominated as it was by power holders, the radio was not only an instrument for the persecutors, as discussed by scholars thus far, but also a tool in the hands of those under persecution (and other people). Survivors primarily describe the radio as a source of information. They were not passive victims, but actors. In order to find a way of survival, they tried to 'read' the persecution, its rules, means and local course. Thus, people under persecution were active and, for the most part, critical media consumers trying to monitor the situation, often switching channels to do so. RTLM in particular, with its participatory character, represented the new social order in which those under persecution had near unsurmountable difficulties in finding a place. At least in many early accounts, the propagandistic function of the radio appears secondary in terms of how often it was mentioned, and the co-organization of murder by radio stations seems marginal.

Among the reasons why many Tutsis soon lost their access to radio was that they were coveted commodity among murderers and looters.[304] One of the looters remembered his greed upon seeing "a neighbor riding a new bicycle or proudly brandishing a radio set".[305] Reportedly, *Interahamwe* members and soldiers received the first or best radio sets.[306] Looters also gave radios away as a gift or sold them, and their price dropped locally to ten percent of their earlier value.[307] In the evenings, these sets were used to play Rwandan or Burundian modern or traditional music at parties, which involved plenty of alcohol and raucous singing.[308] Unlike in earlier years, the sound of music was often heard around because people no longer thought they needed to save battery power.[309] This could be read as symbolic of a period of plenty and pleasure.

302 Account by Innocent Rwililiza, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 103; account by Théodore Nyilinkwaya, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 726; account by "Emmanuel Muhinda", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 123. Hutus who fled from Burundi to Tanzania in 1972 also carried radio sets with them: Malkki, *Purity*, 108.

303 Account by Pancrace Hakizamungili, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 120.

304 Account by Alphonse Hitiyaremye, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 69; accounts by Spéciose Mukayiraba, Jean Paul Biramvu, William Rutaremara, "Eugenia" and an African missionary from Gitarama, African Rights, *Rwanda*, 215, 570, 644, 802, 1055; Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 553.

305 Account by Adalbert Munzingura, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 90.

306 Account by Alphonse Hitiyaremye, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 88–89.

307 Des Forges, *Kein Zeuge*, 448.

308 Account by Clémentine Murebwayre, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 102.

309 Account by Elie Mizinge, Hatzfeld, *Zeit*, 102.

Conclusion

More could be said about the soundscape in Rwanda in the months of the mass killings in 1994, such as the fact that most survivors – at least among those interviewed early on – heard shots, which were often intended to intimidate rather than kill; there were a startling number of grenade explosions; and people in hiding often listened to menacing footsteps nearby.

In this chapter, I have argued that many Hutu attackers in 1994 sought a new social order, which had both socioeconomic and normative aspects. Especially the poor among the murderers were committing murder for a better life, agricultural land or to gain a few possessions. Not much in the available acoustic evidence speaks of their fear and insecurity, despite the ongoing civil war and scholarly claims that they defended the existing political order, as justified as these may be. The attackers acted passionately, often in a festive mode, expressing themselves in secular rather than religious terms, but not because of an "atheism of fear".[310] The use of violence became a matter of prestige, perhaps of male attractiveness; however, unlike in the Chuknagar massacre and the COVID-19 pandemic (see chapters 3 and 7), one could not describe it as a 'cool' or relaxed demeanor.

The acoustic evidence also points to broader, long-run social trends in Rwanda. Whether it be the struggles among Hutus for the loot or Tutsis praying and singing religious songs alone or with laypersons, both were signs of growing individualism. Loud religious practice, screams of fear and emphatic crying in public, as well as shouts of hatred, anger and joy, reflected a trend toward emotionalism in Rwanda, which violated the older social norms of exercising restraint, a trend that had already been fueled by early 1990s party politics and, presumably, the social crisis of the late 1980s and the early 1990s, and one which found one expression in new, noisy religious rituals shared by Hutus and Tutsis in several protestant churches in the 21st century.[311] Narrowing circles of private social interaction (outside the church)[312] were not only in response to an authoritarian government but also driven by a growing distrust in everyday life. All of this is to say that there were social currents that outlasted the political-military defeat of Hutu power policies and the RPF victory in 1994 and encompassed Tutsis and Hutus, and were also made by them.

In many ways, Rwandans in 1994 were children of their time. A fascination with private radio stations, an active role of women, a tendency toward individual-

310 This contradicts Benda, *Test*, 180 (quote).
311 See Grant, "Noise".
312 For example, see Dumas, *Génocide*, 86.

ism and extrovert emotionalism and the drive for mass consumption even if one could not afford it (as most items that were robbed were fashionable consumer goods) were internationally shared experiences that came here into play under horrific circumstances, and these tendencies influenced some of the events.

The new order was not only loudly announced, it was also noisy and emphatic in itself. No wonder, then, that some survivors shuddered years afterward from hearing unknown people talk loudly[313] and that many survivors moved from dispersed houses into densely settled villages – official post-1994 villagization programs mainly covered Tutsis – and/or spent less time with their neighbors than before the mass murders.[314] Some even refused to talk for some time, or periodically, or said that they initially lost their speech.[315]

Important elements of what became the new social order for some months in 1994 were later politically and legally suppressed. Therefore, threatening ways of behavior toward survivors in the years to follow were silent (in anonymous letters) or, if loud, only acted out at night, when people would stone houses, knock at doors and windows or scream and then run away to not be identified.[316] Demonstrating that some social forces opposed the post-1994 political order, this was menacing, but no longer overt, reminders that aggressive social claims still existed.

Dealing with a different time period and place, the following chapter will use sound history again to expose the complex social interaction involved in mass violence even in a case that appears straightforward at first sight.

313 Account by Berthe Mwanankabandi, Hatzfeld, *Nur*, 175.

314 Hatzfeld, Zeit, 200; Dumas, Génocide, 86; for resettlement programs, see Bigagaza et al., "Land Scarcity", 75–76.

315 African Rights, *Rwanda*, 846, and account by Fortunata Ngirabutware, ibid., 350; account by "Angelique Isimbi", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 166.

316 Accounts by "Angelique Isimbi" and "Mugabo Arnaud", Totten and Ubaldo, *We*, 166, 186–189.