

Fernanda Maffei

Preliminary Remarks on the Technical Language of the Bilingual Glossaries of Cicero

Introduction

The bilingual glossaries of Cicero¹ belong to a wider range of scholastic tools² used to teach Latin as a second language to Greek native speakers in the eastern part of the Roman Empire. The reason for the spreading of these tools must be sought in the diffusion of Latin language in the eastern part of the Empire. The reforms established by Diocletian (284–305 CE) were crucial in this respect; they brought a high bureaucratisation to the Empire: in fact, people working in prefectures, dioceses and provinces had to become well acquainted with the Roman law and Latin language. This reform was meant, in Diocletian's intention, to provide a common element for bureaucrats and offices throughout the Empire and enhance its cohesion.³ It is worth noting that half of the documentary Latin papyri can be dated to the fourth century, as well as literary and juridical ones.⁴

From Egypt, in the form of papyrus rolls or papyrus and parchment codices, come many bilingual and digraphic⁵ educational tools: alphabets and grammars,⁶ conversation manuals, fables⁷ and glossaries. In most cases, the text is disposed in

1 I will refer to the papyri by quoting them according to the edition by Internullo 2011–2012 and following the order proposed in his edition, while I will quote the passages from the *Catilinarians* according to the edition by Maslowski 2003.

2 For a detailed list of these materials, see Dickey 2016, esp. 179–196; there were also bilingual, but non digraphic tools; see Radiciotti 1997, 112, with further bibliography.

3 Cf. Gaebel 1969–1970, 293–296, and Rochette 1997, 167–174; for the role of Diocletian in the spread of Latin language, see Rochette 1997, 117; a deep analysis about the spread of Latin in documentary papyri from the Diocletian period can be found in Fournet 2019.

4 See Fournet 2019, 74; 86–89; Garcea/Scappaticcio 2019; Nocchi Macedo 2021, 144.

5 From now on, with the term bilingual, I will refer to bilingual and digraphic texts. However, there are bilingual but monographic glossaries in both Greek (P. Oxy. XXXIII 2660, third cent.) and Latin scripts (P. Louvre inv. E 2329, fifth cent.). Kramer 1984, 1379–1380, defines this phenomenon as “bilinguismo imperfetto”, referring to the fact that those who made use of such tools did not need to learn to write in that language, but were interested in learning how to speak it. Cf. also Radiciotti 1997, 112–113.

6 On Latin grammatical texts on papyrus, see Scappaticcio 2015.

7 On Latin and bilingual fables on papyrus, see Scappaticcio 2017.

narrow columns,⁸ with the Latin one on the left side and the corresponding Greek word-by-word translation on the right side. Among the glossaries, three typologies can be so far identified: the alphabetical ones, in which the words are ordered alphabetically; the thematic ones,⁹ which are organised in sections concerning coherent word groups, according to their semantic sphere; finally, there are glossaries related to specific authors of Latin canon. Only the latter typology did not make it into the Middle Ages and is not included in the *Hermeneumata Pseudodosithea-na*.¹⁰

Only Virgil and Cicero are dealt with in the surviving bilingual glossaries:¹¹ eleven glossaries on the *Aeneid* are preserved, datable between the fourth and sixth centuries;¹² the four glossaries of the *Catilinarians* belong to the same period.¹³

As Ammirati has already pointed out, certain codicological and palaeographical features can be found in the bilingual glossaries on authors as well as in the fragments of legal content from the same time span.¹⁴ As for the Ciceronian glossaries, it has been noted by Internullo¹⁵ that the *titulus* above the abbreviation through *compendium* of the *praenomen* *L(uc)i* is not typical of the literary *codices* from the fifth century, but of those of technical-legal content; these similarities reveal the common substratum of this type of texts, produced within the provincial bureaucracy. Ammirati¹⁶ pointed out that from a textual point of view, author's glossaries have not yet been explored in their relationship with coeval juridical manuscripts.

Starting from these considerations, the present study has three aims: first, to single out the technical and juridical language and its translation in the Ciceronian

8 According to the list in Dickey 2015, 815–817, only four documents are in a facing-page format. It is important to stress that, in such a typology of texts, the position of the language is crucial: on the left there is the main language, while on the right there is the translation; see Ammirati/Fressura 2017 about the palaeographical features of the glossaries transmitted on papyrus.

9 They are the majority in the papyrological finds; cf. Dickey 2012, 11.

10 On the *Hermeneumata*, see below.

11 There is a difference between the two authors: in some cases, Virgilian glossaries do not bear the whole text, but only selected words, i.e. P. Oxy. VIII 1099 (MP³ 2950, *Leuven Database of Ancient Books* [LDAB] 4162); on the contrary, every Ciceronian glossary bears the whole text of the *Catilinarians*.

12 See Fressura 2017, 9.

13 As for Greek, the only classical author featured in bilingual glossary is Isocrates (*Ad Nicoclem*): TBrux inv. E8507 (III^{ex}) 2.15–16; P. Berol. Inv. 21245 (IV), 2.7–8. Cf. Ammirati 2015b, 52.

14 Ammirati 2018, 84–85.

15 Internullo 2011–2012, 92 n. 270, and 105.

16 Ammirati 2018, 91.

glossaries; secondly, to make a comparison with the *Hermeneumata*¹⁷ and the papyri, both documentary and juridical,¹⁸ with the aim of underlining the effective use of these glossaries; finally, to highlight the importance of Cicero with the respect to the educational environment in the eastern part of the Empire.

Cicero in Egypt: An Overview

Cicero is one of the few Latin authors whose tradition can be followed back into antiquity, sometimes due to the orator himself.¹⁹ The material evidence consists of palimpsests²⁰ and papyri. The main difference between these two groups of manuscripts is that the palimpsests feature many kinds of Cicero's works, such as letters, philosophical works, speeches and furthermore *scholia*, while the papyri bear only speeches.²¹

Among the more than 1500 Latin papyri extant,²² few are literary texts, especially about classical authors.²³ Besides rare exceptions, many of the papyri featuring Latin classical authors fit with the so-called *Quadrige Messii*.²⁴ thirty-seven documents bearing Virgil,²⁵ eleven bearing Cicero, seven bearing Sallust²⁶ and two bearing Terence,²⁷ hence, it is easy to assume that they probably belong to

¹⁷ See below.

¹⁸ Commonly, papyri containing works by jurists are considered 'literary', but in this case, we want to highlight how the technical language contained in a scholastic author, Cicero, is the same used in works of a technical nature.

¹⁹ For an overview, see Espluga 2016; specifically, on the famous case of the *Pro Ligario*, see Pecere 2010, 184.

²⁰ About the palimpsests, see Lo Monaco 2012.

²¹ See below.

²² Cf. Scappaticcio 2019.

²³ Ammirati 2015a, 12.

²⁴ A scholastic canon of authors to be studied: Virgil and Terence in poetry, Cicero and Sallust in prose; cf. Cassiod. *Inst.* 1.15.7: *regulas igitur elocutionum Latinorum, id est quadrigam Messii, omnimodis non sequare, ubi tamen priscorum codicum auctoritate convinceris; expedit enim interdum praetermittere humanarum formulas dictionum, et divini magis eloquii custodire mensuram* ("Do not, therefore, completely follow the rules of Latin idioms, i.e. the Quadrige of Messius, provided you are convinced by the authority of ancient copies; for sometimes it is right to pass over the rules of human expression and instead keep the arrangement of divine speech"; transl. Halporn/Vessey 2004).

²⁵ For a general overview of the survey of Virgil from East, see Scappaticcio 2013; see also Fresura 2017 about the bilingual glossaries.

²⁶ Cf. Funari 2008.

²⁷ About P. Oxy XXIV 2401, see Nocchi Macedo 2018; about P. Vindob. Inv. L 103, see Danese 1990.

an educational environment. Concerning the dating, Ciceronian papyri reflect the situation of the other Latin literary texts from Egypt: according to the results of a search made through *Trismegistos (TM)*,²⁸ there are sixty in the period between the first and third centuries CE, while there are 177 between the third and sixth centuries CE; regarding Cicero, only one papyrus survives from the first to the third centuries, otherwise the other ten can be referred to the fourth to sixth centuries.

Below, I present a table to give an overview of Ciceronian papyri, about the works handed down, dates, writing and book-form.

	Papyrus	Date (in cent.)	Bookform and Mate- rial	Work	Typology
1	P. Iand. V 90 <i>recto</i>	first	papyrus roll	<i>In Verrem</i> 2.2.3–4	text with reading marks
2	P. Monts. Roca inv. 129–149 + P. Duke inv 798	late fourth	papyrus codex	<i>In Catilinam</i> 1.6–9, 13–33; 2	within a miscellaneous codex
3	P. mil. Vogl. Inv. 1190	late fourth– early fifth	parchment codex	<i>In Verrem</i> 2.5.39–41	columnar text
4	P. Vindob. G 30885 a + e + P. Vindob. L17	fourth– fifth	papyrus codex	<i>In Catilinam</i> 1.16–18, 15 (sic!), 19– 20 + 1.14–15+27	bilingual glossary
5	P. Ryl. Gr. I 61	fifth	papyrus codex	<i>In Catilinam</i> 2.14–15	bilingual glossary
6	P. Vindob. L127	fifth	papyrus codex	<i>In Catilinam</i> 3.15–16	bilingual glossary
7	PSI Congr. XXI.2	fifth	papyrus codex	<i>In Catilinam</i> 1.10–11	bilingual glossary
8	P. Ryl. Gr. 3 477	fifth	papyrus codex	<i>Divinatio in Caecilius</i> 33–37, 44–46	annotated in greek and latin
9	P. Oxy. VIII 1097 + P. Oxy. X 1251 + P. Koln. I 49	fifth	papyrus codex	<i>De imperio Cn. Pompei</i> 60–65, 70– 71; <i>In Verrem</i> 2.1.1–9, 2.2.3; 12; <i>Pro</i> <i>Caelio</i> 26–55	anthology of cicero's speeches

²⁸ <https://www.trismegistos.org/index.php> (seen: 12.12.2020).

Continued

	Papyrus	Date (in cent.)	Bookform and Mate- rial	Work	Typology
10	P. Berol. Inv. 13299 a–b	fifth	parchment codex	<i>Pro Plancio</i> 27–28, 46–47	continuous text
11	P. Cair. Inv. S.R. 3732	fifth	parchment codex	<i>In Catilinam</i> 1.3–4	columnar text
12	PSI I 20	fifth– sixth	papyrus codex	<i>In Verrem</i> 2.1.60–61; 62–63	continuous text

In the table, the papyri from number 4 to 7 are the bilingual glossaries that are the object of this contribution.

I give below a correspondence between the glossaries, the number in the table above and the number referred to them starting from now.

4	P. Vindob. G 30885 a+e	P ¹
5	P. Ryl. I 61	P ²
6	P. Vindob. L 127	P ³
7	PSI Congr. XXI.2	P ⁴

P¹ is considered the most ancient Ciceronian glossary and is the only one written in four columns.²⁹ On one hand, the Latin part of P¹, P² and P³ is written in a primitive minuscule and the Greek part in a majuscule with some minuscule elements; on the other hand, P⁴ presents a Latin New Roman cursive and a Greek cursive, being a good exemplification of the so-called “κοινή scrittoria greco-romana”.³⁰ The only speeches of Cicero that survived as bilingual glossaries are the *Catilinarians*,³¹ but other evidence survives about the presence of Cicero in the education of the Hellenophones in the eastern part of the Empire: P. Ryl. III 477, a bifolium from a papyrus codex containing the *Divinatio in Caecilium* with Greek and Latin *marginalia* related to a different level of education.³²

²⁹ Internullo 2011–2012, 44. As Fressura 2013, 74, pointed out, a link between the number of columns and the antiquity of a glossary does not exist.

³⁰ Internullo 2011–2012, 30; see also Cavallo 2005.

³¹ See in this respect Internullo 2011–2012, 36, with whom I agree.

³² McNamee 2007, 473–478.

The *Hermeneumata Pseudodositheana* and the Roman Law

For our purposes, it is crucial to underline that a large group of people who studied Latin in the eastern part of the Empire did so in order to learn jurisprudence³³ and consequently obtain a better social position due to a job in the Roman administration.³⁴ Therefore, it is easy to imagine the key role of Roman Law in the *curriculum studiorum* and, in addition, to understand why a large quantity³⁵ of juridical papyri survived.

The *Hermeneumata Pseudodositheana*³⁶ (from now on, HP) are a collection of ancient bilingual language learning material; they survived the Middle Ages in the western part of the Empire, due to their usefulness to Latin speakers learning Greek. Numerous papyrus scraps, however, testify to the fact that much of the HP material was used in antiquity and late antiquity by Hellenophones learning Latin; moreover, it is possible to link these scraps to a specific redaction of the HP.³⁷ Their origin can be fixed, on the basis of their content, to the Imperial Age especially between the first and the third centuries CE.³⁸

The HP have a very complex tradition, since they are featured by many manuscripts and in nine different versions; moreover, different text typologies belong to the HP: alphabetic and thematic glossaries, *colloquia*, fables, mythological (Genealogy of Hyginus and a book-by-book summary of the *Iliad*), philosophical (*Responsa sapientum, interrogationes et responsa sapientum*),³⁹ Delphic precepts) and legal texts.⁴⁰

³³ In 239 CE we find the first attestation of a school of Roman law in the eastern part of the Roman Empire, in Beirut; cf. Rochette 1997, 167–168; moreover, cf. *orator* and *iuris peritus* in the *Edictum Pretiis* by the Emperor Diocletian, Lauffer 1971, 124–124; 242.

³⁴ According to Signes Codoñer 2013, 85, already quoting Goetz, there are many terms belonging to the semantic sphere of law and administration in the *Hermeneumata*.

³⁵ Ammirati 2010, 55; see also Fournet 2019, 86.

³⁶ At first stages of studies, these have been considered as a product of the teaching activity of Dositheus, a grammarian who wrote a bilingual grammar; cf. Flammini 1990, 3–5, for a summary of the question; about the *Hermeneumata*, see Dickey 2012, 16–56, with further bibliography.

³⁷ Dickey 2017, 212.

³⁸ Dickey 2012, 50.

³⁹ “Replies of wise men”, “Questions and replies of wise men” (unless otherwise indicated, all translations have been made by the author).

⁴⁰ All the text typologies belonging to the *Hermeneumata Pseudodositheana*, listed in relation to their redaction, can be found in Dickey 2012, 29.

Heterogeneous texts pertain to this latter typology:

- Thematic glossaries concerning numerous aspects of juridical life: *de magistratibus*, *de legibus*, *de civitatibus/de civitate*, *de negotiis forensibus*, *de militibus/de militia*;⁴¹
- The *Sententiae Hadriani*,⁴² belonging only to the *Hermeneumata Leidensia* and to the *Hermeneumata Stephani*, are a group of legal judgments made by Emperor Hadrian,⁴³ which can be related to the judgment made by King Solomon;⁴⁴
- The *Tractatus de manumissionibus*,⁴⁵ concerning the different practices of emancipation from slavery;⁴⁶ it is transmitted by the *Hermeneumata Leidensia* and the *Fragmentum parisinum* (Paris. Lat. 6503, ninth century);
- Some *Colloquia*,⁴⁷ as Dickey recently pointed out, concern legal aspects showing forum and trial scenes: *Monacensia-Einsidlensia* (4), *Celtis* (73–76), *Harleianum* (24 a–e) and *Montpessulanum* (5a–b).⁴⁸

Moreover, HP are an important source of knowledge regarding the functioning of education in antiquity and late antiquity, not only due to their bilingual structure but also to their content. In our case, in addition to providing us with information about the key role of jurisprudence in ancient studies, they testify to how Cicero was read and studied in classrooms.⁴⁹ For instance, in the *Colloquium Celtis* 37–38 there is a list of literary genres and authors read at school by advanced students and in this ‘canon’ we find the *Actiones Tullianae* (38a).

41 “About magistrates”, “About law”, “About the state”, “About the activities in the law-court”, “About soldiers / about the military service”.

42 “Judgment of Hadrian”; cf. Flammini 1990, 13–16.

43 The interest in Emperor Hadrian is testified, among papyri, also by the *Hadrianus of Montserrat*, belonging to P. Monts. Roca inv. 162–165; none of the *Sententiae* is similar to the Tale of Hadrian in the content; see Gil/Torallas Tovar 2010.

44 Dickey 2017, 213.

45 “Treatise on the emancipation from slavery”.

46 About the Greek translation of the term *manumissio*, see Stornaiuolo 2019, 46 n. 8; about the *manumissiones* in Latin papyri, see *ibid.*, 47–48.

47 The *Colloquia* are bilingual conversation manuals, regarding various aspects of everyday-life in antiquity. A new edition, with a commentary, of all the *Colloquia* belonging to the HP was recently made by Dickey in two volumes: Dickey 2012 and 2015.

48 Concerning the legal texts included in the *Colloquia*, see Dickey 2014.

49 Cf. also *Corpus Inscriptionum Latinarum* (CIL) IV 4208: *si ti[b]i Cicero dol[et], vap[u]labis* (“If you dislike Cicero, you will be beaten”), another witness of Cicero in the classrooms.

Lemmata

In order to emphasise the link between Ciceronian bilingual glossaries on papyrus and juridical education in the eastern part of the Roman Empire, as first step, I selected in the text of the glossaries the technical lemmata, words pertaining to the juridical practice or environment. I will present the selected lemmata following alphabetical order, specifying for each one the line in the papyrus and the extract from the *Catilinarians*. Subsequently, I will give a general discussion of the technical meaning on the basis of the lexicographic resources. I will highlight in what section of HP⁵⁰ the lemma can be found and then I will discuss its presence in the documentary and juridical papyri. The mark ‘~’ between two words has to be meant as ‘corresponds to.’⁵¹

– *abdico*

P³ *recto* l. 1: [*abdicavit*] ~ απεκηρυξ[εν]⁵²

Cic. *Cat.* 3.15: *Tamen magistratu se abdicavit.*⁵³

The term does not occur in the HP; however, it is well attested among other glossaries of the *CGL*: for instance, *CGL* II 3.11–13. The specific meaning of ‘resign from a charge’ in the syntagm *abdicare magistratu* is pointed out in the *Thesaurus Linguae Latinae* (*ThLL*) I 54 53, quoting this passage from Cicero. The same expression can be found in the *Vocabularium Iurisprudentiae Romanae* (*VIR*) I.59–60.

– *carcer*

P¹ *frg.* 3 *recto* l. 98: *a carce]re* ~ απο φρουρας⁵⁴

Cic. *Cat.* 1.19: *Sed quam longe videtur a carcere atque a vinculis abesse debere.*⁵⁵

⁵⁰ I choose to quote the HP following the edition in the *CGL* by Goetz, except when there are recent editions, i. e. Flammini 2004 for the *Hermeneumata Leidensia* and Dickey 2012 and 2015 for the *Colloquia*. Note that Goetz prints the transcription of manuscripts, hence in his edition in many cases there are not diacritics.

⁵¹ Körte 1920, 260.

⁵² “He resigned office”.

⁵³ “He was nevertheless permitted to resign his office”; transl. Berry 2006.

⁵⁴ “From prison”.

⁵⁵ “But how far away from prison and chains do you think a man ought to be?”; transl. Berry 2006.

This lemma occurs, among papyri, only in P. Vindob. L. 110 (= *TM* 65155; *LDAB* 6397),⁵⁶ a still unidentified Latin legal text with Latin *marginalia*, containing a juridical handbook on criminal law: *catenatus esse debet non tamen ut in carcere agat nisi suspecta sit persona*.⁵⁷ The annotation lies in the right margin of the text. In the HP, the word can be found only in the thematic sections concerning *de civitate*: *CGL* III 306.26 (*Hermeneumata Montpessulana*) and *CGL* III 353.48 (*Hermeneumata Stephani*). No-one of the Greek translation of the HP matches the one in the Ciceronian glossary, however there are some attestations of the term *φρουρά* meaning ‘prison’.⁵⁸ The *Hermeneumata Montpessulana* has a double translation: *εἰρκτή* (in the manuscript we find *Ιρκτη*, an error of *iotacism*) and *φυλακή*;⁵⁹ in the *Hermeneumata Stephani* the term is glossed as *λάξ*, an adverb meaning ‘with the foot’.⁶⁰ Maybe, the compiler of the glossary had in mind the similar word *λαξεία* ‘quarrying’,⁶¹ referring to the punishment.

– *clarissimus vir*

P³ *recto*, l. 3: [*clarissimo vir*]o ~ [τ]ω λ[αμ]προτατω ανδρι⁶²

Cic. *Cat.* 3.15: *ut quae religio C. Mario, clarissimo viro, non fuerat*.⁶³

Among documentary papyri, this syntagm occurs many times, both in the singular and plural form; furthermore, it can be found in an abbreviated form, for instance: *vu cc. (viris clarissimis)* in P. Abinn. 63, l. 1 (ca 350 CE), or *vc (virum clarissimum)* in P. Ryl. IV 615, l. 2 (fourth–fifth cent.). The syntagm can be found frequently as a form of address both in Latin literature⁶⁴ and in documentary papyri, e.g. *Chartae Latinae Antiquiores (ChLA)* XII 527 l. 1 (third–fourth cent.). Moreover, this superlative pertains to the language of official documents.⁶⁵ Among juridical papyri, the expression occurs in P. Vindob. L 59 + 92 (*TM* 64631= *LDAB* 5862) *verso* col. II ll. 35–36, Marcianus, *Institutiones* 1.2.⁶⁶ The HP bear *clarissimus* in the *recensio Lei-*

56 See also McNamee 2007, 511–512, but a new edition of the text is currently in progress by Marco Fressura and Dario Mantovani in the frame of ERC Project REDHIS (<http://redhis.unipv.it/>).

57 “Nevertheless, unless a person is suspected he should not be chained in order to go to prison”; transl. McNamee 2007.

58 Internullo 2011–2012, 74.

59 See below, *custodia*.

60 Cf. *Greek-English Lexicon (LSJ)* s.v. *λάξ*.

61 Cf. *LSJ* s.v. *λαξεία*.

62 “To the most illustrious man”.

63 “No such scruple prevented the illustrious Gaius Marius”; transl. Berry 2006.

64 Dickey 2002, 147.

65 Harrauer 1982, 218.

66 A new edition with introduction and commentary is Fressura/Mantovani 2018.

densis, in the *Hadriani sententiae* (Flammini 2004, 70 1791) referring to the *praefectus*, but the Greek translation does not correspond to the one in the Ciceronian glossary: in fact, we find ἐπισημότατος. In the thematic glossary concerning *de magistratibus* of the *Hermeneumata Stephani*, there is the equivalence λαμπρότατος ~ *clarissimus*, implying ἀνὴρ ~ *vir*. The same correspondence can be found in Mason 1974, 65.

– *consul*

P¹ frg. I recto l. 19: *consulis* ~ του υπατου⁶⁷

Cic. Cat. 1.16: *Quae quidem quibus ab te initiata sacris ac devota sit nescio, quod eam necesse putas esse in consulis corpore defigere.*⁶⁸

P² recto l. 15: *a consule* ~ [απο υπατου]⁶⁹

Cic. Cat. 2.14: *Sed indemnatus innocens in exilium eiectus a consule vi minis esse dicitur.*⁷⁰

The word *consul* has many occurrences in Latin documentary papyri; it is attested, especially in abbreviated form *co(n)s(ulibus)*,⁷¹ in the dating *formulae*, both in Latin and bilingual documents as a part of the text itself or added at a later stage.⁷² In both Ciceronian papyri, *consul* is glossed as ὑπάτος. This word, as Mason points out, does not belong to the Greek language of administration, like the others adapted for the Latin context;⁷³ indeed the first attestation of the term, as an adjective, can be found in Homer where it is an epithet of Zeus.⁷⁴ Subsequently, the shift from adjective to noun, implying the term ἀνὴρ, allowed the birth of the noun, to designate the Roman magistrate and with this meaning is used, according to the *Thesaurus Linguae Graecae* (TLG), starting from Plutarch.⁷⁵ The original belonging to the religious semantic sphere is confirmed, in the *Hermeneumata*, by the presence of ὑπάτος ~ *consul* in the section Θεων λοινον ~ *deorum reliquorum* (CGL III 290.11); elsewhere in the *Hermeneumata*, the matching ὑπάτος ~ *consul*, as well as *consul* ~ ὑπάτος, can be found five times in the sections *de mag-*

67 “Of the consul”.

68 “With what special rites you must have consecrated and dedicated it I do not know, for you to plunge it into the body of a consul”; transl. Berry 2006.

69 “By the consul”.

70 “But that an innocent man has been driven into exile without trial by the violent threats of the consul”; transl. Berry 2006.

71 Cf. *ThLL* s.v. *consul* IV 562 47–80; about the abbreviation and their function in documentary papyri, see Gonis 2009, 170–171.

72 Iovine 2019, 157–159.

73 Mason 1974, 165.

74 Hom. *Il.* 5.756: Ζῆν’ ὑπατον Κρονίδην ἐξείρετο καὶ προσέειπε (“and made question of Zeus most high, the son of Cronos, and spoke to him”; transl. Murray 1978).

75 Cf. Mason 1974, 165–169; about the Greek translation of *consul*, see also *ThLL* IV 563 1–5.

istratibus ~ περί ἀρχόντων (CGL III 28.15; 182.28; 275.50; 297.52; 362.37, respectively *Leidensia*, *Monacensia*, *Einsidlensia*, *Montpessulana* and *Stephani*). Occasionally, we find the word transliterated in Greek characters and in abbreviated form.⁷⁶

– *custodia*

P¹ frg. II *recto* l. 105: *custodia* ~ φυλακῆς⁷⁷

Cic. *Cat.* 1.19: *Sed quam longe videtur a carcere atque a vinculis esse debere qui se ipse iam dignum custodia iudicavit?*⁷⁸

This section deals with Catiline's attempts to place himself under the judicial custody of private citizens: firstly Manius Lepidus, then Cicero himself and Quintus Metellus, who both refused, and finally Marcus Metellus (or Marcellus).⁷⁹ The lemma is glossed as φυλακή in the HP as well as in the Ciceronian glossary.⁸⁰ Among Latin papyri, the term occurs in the documents related to the Roman army, in particular daily reports, e.g. *ChLA* X 454, ll. 26–27 *recto* (third cent.),⁸¹ or in the so called *acta diurna*, i.e. *ChLA* IV 270, l. 5 (225–275 CE)⁸². In this field, *custodia* means 'to be in charge of watching over something or someone'.⁸³ In this respect, we find the word also in the thematic section of HP pertaining *de militia*: CGL III 352.77 (*Hermeneumata Stephani*). The other sphere concerning *custodia* is the juridical one,⁸⁴ found in the passage from Cicero quoted above; it is not clear if in the *Hermeneumata Stephani* section *de civitatibus* (CGL III 353.49) the word has to be meant as 'house arrest'⁸⁵ or as '*custodia Urbis*'.⁸⁶ In my opinion, it is reasonable to believe that the first meaning is suitable, since the previous word in the glossary is *carcer*.

⁷⁶ Mason 1974, 9.

⁷⁷ "Guard".

⁷⁸ "But how far away from prison and chains do you think a man ought to be who has already himself come to the conclusion that he needs to be kept under guard?"; transl. Berry 2006.

⁷⁹ Dyck 2008a, 101; Maslowski 2003, 21.

⁸⁰ See also *ThLL* IV 1555, 13.

⁸¹ See Salati 2020, 29; 32–34; 37–39; 43; 46–47; 49–50.

⁸² See Salati 2020, 11–15; 17; 19; 124.

⁸³ For instance, see *ThLL* s.v. IV 1556 2 and 1556 10.

⁸⁴ *VIR* I 1552 35–53; 1553 1–7.

⁸⁵ In this respect, see *Oxford Latin Dictionary (OLD)* s.v. *custodia* 6, where the passage from Cicero is quoted as an example.

⁸⁶ *ThLL* IV 1556 85.

– *custos*

P⁴ verso l. 15: [*custo*]di huius urbis ~ φυλακτω ταυτης της πολεως⁸⁷

Cic. Cat. 1.11: huic ipsi Iovi Statori, antiquissimo custodi huius urbis.⁸⁸

Firstly, I would like to underline that, in the glossary, the syntagm *Iovi Statori antiquissimo* is missing, probably because the compiler did not consider it useful for the students.⁸⁹ The Greek translation does not match with the one in the HP, indeed φυλακτω might be “una forma eteroclita, con tema in o, del dative di φυλάκτης” or a scribal error.⁹⁰ The HP have *custos* only in the thematic section about *de militia*: Flammini 2004, 61.1573 and CGL III 208.29, in both cases the word is in the plural form glossed as φυλακῆς. The same translation can be found in ThLL IV 1572.10. This evidence matches the content of Latin papyri: among them, indeed, the word appears mainly in documents dealing with Roman army. For instance, *Roman Military Records on Papyrus* (RMR) I 58 (ca 90 CE), a report concerning soldiers and their charge,⁹¹ frg. 2 verso, l. 4 has *armorum custos*⁹² and l. 8 has *custos domi Ploti*.⁹³ In this typology of document, the term can be found in abbreviated form, for example *a(rmorum) c(ustos)* in ChLA IV 272 l. 6 (87 CE) or *armoru* (sic) *cus(todi)* in T. Vindon. 38 l. 1. The syntagm *armorum custos* is discussed also in ThLL IV 1574, 75–77 and in VIR I 1154, 32.

– *exilium*

P² recto l. 13: in exilium ~ [εις] εξορισμ[ον]⁹⁴

Cic. Cat. 2.14: sed indemnatus innocens in exilium eiectus a consule vi.⁹⁵

P² verso l. 31: [in exilium ~ εις] εξορισμον⁹⁶

Cic. Cat. 2.15: dicatur sane eiectus esse a me, dum modo eat in exilium.⁹⁷

Among papyri, the term occurs only in the *Corpus Papyrorum Latinarum* (CPL) 74 (TM 62359 = LDAB 3524) recto, l. 23: *si iud(ices) pedanei pecunia corru[pti] dicantur*;

87 “To the guardian of this city”.

88 “To this Jupiter Stator, the god who from the earliest times had stood guard over our city”; transl. Berry 2006.

89 Manfredi 1995, 9.

90 Internullo 2011–2012, 119.

91 Cf. Salati 2020, 30; 32.

92 “Guardian of weapons”.

93 “Guardian of Plotius’ house”.

94 “In exile” or “exiled”.

95 “But that an innocent man has been driven into exile without a trial by the violent threats of a consul”; transl. Berry 2006.

96 See note 93.

97 “So by all means let it be said that I have forced him into exile – just so long as that is where he goes”; transl. Berry 2006.

*ple]rumq(ue) a p(rae)side aut curia s[ubmoventur aut in exilium mittuntur].*⁹⁸ This scrap contains the *Sententiae* 5.24–25 by the jurist Paulus and can be dated to the fifth century. Concerning the HP, the word can be found only in the *Hadriani Sententiae*, in both the redaction *Leidensis*, Από εξορίας ~ *ab exilio* (Flammini 2004, 71, 1811), and *Stephani*, *Ab exilio* ~ Από ἐξορισμοῦ (*CGL* III.388.24); only the second translation matches the glossary of the *Catilinarians*. The Greek translation⁹⁹ in the glossary matches only the one in the *Hermeneumata Stephani*, while ἐξορίας is quoted by the *Thesaurus Linguae Latinae* besides φυγαδεΐα.¹⁰⁰ The lemma pertains to the semantic field of law because it is a punishment for some crimes: *minimae poene sunt relegatio, exilium, opus publicum, vincula*¹⁰¹ (Paul. 5.712).¹⁰²

– *indemnatus*

P² *recto* l. 11: *sed indemnastus* ~ [αλλ] ακατακριθείς¹⁰³

Cic. *Cat.* 2.14: *sed indemnatus innocens in exilium eiectus a consule vi.*¹⁰⁴

The term does not occur either in the papyri or in the HP; this passage from Cicero is quoted by *ThLL*, s.v. *indemnatus* VII 2314, 55.

– *innocens*

P² *recto* l. 12: *innocens* ~ [ανα]ίτιος¹⁰⁵

Cic. *Cat.* 2.14: *sed indemnatus innocens in exilium eiectus a consule vi.*¹⁰⁶

The word is missing from Latin papyri; nevertheless, it can be found twice in the HP: once in the thematic section *de moribus humanis* of the *Monacensia* (*CGL* III 178.1) and one in the *Colloquium Celtis* (Dickey 2015 76a). In both cases, the translation matches the Ciceronian glossary.

98 “If the subordinate judges will be considered corrupted by money, generally, they are pushed away by the provincial governor or the assembly or they are banished”.

99 According to the *LSJ*, there is a difference between ἐξορία and ἐξορισμός; the first term refers to the life in exile or isolation, while the second one is the act of sending someone beyond the frontier.

100 *ThLL* V 1484.39–40.

101 “The lightest punishments are banishment, exile, forced labour, chains”.

102 Cf. *VIR* II 695, 36–38.

103 “But guiltless”.

104 “But that an innocent man has been driven into exile without a trial by the violent threats of a consul”; transl. Berry 2006.

105 “Innocent”.

106 “But that an innocent man has been driven into exile without a trial by the violent threats of a consul”; transl. Berry 2006.

– *iudicium*

P¹ fr. 1+ fr. 4 verso l. 46: *iudicium* ~ κριτήριο¹⁰⁷

Cic. *Cat.* 1.17: *huius tu neque auctoritatem verebere nec iudicium*¹⁰⁸ *sequere nec vim pertimescens?*¹⁰⁹

We find the word four times in the HP, once in the *Colloquia* (*Colloquium Monacensium-Einsidlensium*, Dickey 2012 4a–p: κριτήριο ~ *iudicium*) and three times in the thematic sections (*Hermeneumata Leidensia*, Flammini 2004, 55.1410: Κρίσις ~ *iudicium*, *Hermeneumata Montepessulana* CGL III 336.41: κριτήριο ~ *iudicium*, *Hermeneumata Einsidlensia* CGL III 276.57: κριτήριο ~ *Iudicium examen* and κρίσις κρίμα ~ *iudicatio iudicium*). The thematic sections of HP in which we find the term *iudicium* are an excellent example of the interaction between school and law: indeed, they are *de studiis*, *de forensibus negotiis*, *de legibus*.¹¹⁰ The HP offer three different Greek translations of this word. The one that occurs the most is κριτήριο: its technical meaning of ‘court judgement’ pertains also to Greek papyri.¹¹¹ In the *Hermeneumata Einsidlensia* it has a double translation: besides *iudicium* there is *examen*, which figuratively can be meant as *actus iudicandi*.¹¹² Κρίμα is the translation most related to the branch of law, indeed it has only technical meaning: ‘decree, legal decision, question, lawsuit’.¹¹³ Finally, we find Κρίσις, as a translation of *iudicatio*; its first meaning ‘distinguishing’, but sometimes it is meant as ‘result of a trial’.¹¹⁴ Among juridical papyri, the term is attested in BKT X 30 (= *TM* 64538 = *LDAB* 5766), a Latin legal treatise on criminal law dated to fourth–fifth centuries at frg. I fol. I verso l.6: *sunt et acta iudicia publica · gravis exsecutionis p(er) provincias*.¹¹⁵ Moreover, the word occurs several times in BGU II 611 (= *TM* 66432 = *LDAB* 7682), a papyrus roll containing the *Oratio in senatu habita* by the Emperor Claudius about justice reform.¹¹⁶ The word occurs also in documentary papyri, i. e. the petition addressed by Abinnaeus to the Emperors Constantius II and Constans (340–342 CE), P. Abinn. 2, l. 12 bis: *ex suffragio eos pr[omotos]*

107 “Judgement”.

108 About the *iudicium* in this passage, see Dyck 2008a, 41.

109 “Will you not then respect her authority, defer to her judgement or fear her power”; transl. Berry 2006.

110 “About studies”, “About the activities in the law-court”, “About law”.

111 *LSJ* s.v. κριτήριο.

112 *ThLL* V 1164 b; “the action of judge”.

113 *LSJ* s.v. κρίμα.

114 *LSJ* s.v. κρίσις.

115 “There are, additionally, public judgements, that imply severe punishments through the provinces”.

116 Cf. Buongiorno 2010, 207.

*fuiſſe me vero iudicio sacro...*¹¹⁷ The term can be found in abbreviated form, for instance in P. Ant. I 22 (fourth cent.), a Latin legal treatise by an unidentified jurist: col. II recto l. 6: *iud(icum)*.

– *iudico*

P¹ frg. 2 + frg. 3 verso l. 106: *iudic]averit* ~ ἐκρίνευ¹¹⁸

Cic. Cat. 1.19: *sed quam longe viderur a carcere atque a vinculis esse debere qui se ipse iam dignum custodia iudicarit?*¹¹⁹

Firstly, it has to be noted that the papyrus bears a different and simpler *lectio*.¹²⁰ The verb κρίνω is semantically related to all the Greek translations of the term *iudicium* discussed above, although it has different meanings: ‘chose’, ‘decide a contest’, ‘give a judgment’.¹²¹ In the HP, the lemma can be found only in the *Hadriani sententiae*, in both the redactions *Leidensis* (Flammini 2004, 72) and *Stephani* (CGL III 388.8); their translation matches the one in the Ciceronian glossary. Among juridical papyri, the term occurs in BKT X 30 (TM 64538 = LDAB 5766), a Latin legal treatise on criminal law, l. 11 recto (fourth–fifth cent.) *iudicando*.¹²² In the documentary papyri, the verb is attested rarely, e.g., in ChLA 42 1212, l. 4: *rogo domine [dig]num me iudices*.¹²³

– *lex*

P¹ frg. 1+ fr. 3 recto l. 70: *leges* ~ νομους¹²⁴

Cic. Cat. 1.18: *tu non solum ad neglegendas leges et quaestiones verum etiam ad evertendas perfringendasque valuisti*.¹²⁵

This is a very common word in documents from Egypt; plenty of documentary typologies on papyrus, indeed, need to specify the law which states the rule they refer to, e.g. P. Mich. III 169, a bilingual birth certificate dated to 145 CE: *ideoque*

117 Cugusi 1992, II, 336; “they were promoted by a decision, but I through a sacred judgment”.

118 “Judged”.

119 “But how far from prison and chain do you think a man ought to be who has already himself come to the conclusion that he needs to be kept under guard?”; transl. Berry 2006.

120 All the mediaeval manuscripts have *iudicarit*, apart from the Harleianus 2682; cf. Maslowski 2003, 21.

121 LSJ s.v. κρίνω.

122 The whole line is poorly preserved and there are only few letters before *iudicando*, hence I do not quote the passage.

123 “I beg you, lord, to assume that I am worthy”.

124 “Laws”.

125 “You have managed not merely to ignore the laws and the courts, but to overturn and shatter them”; transl. Berry 2006.

[s]e has testationes · interposuisse dixit quia lex [Ae]lia Sentia · et Papia Poppaea [spu]rio[s] spuriasve in albo p[ro]fiteri ve]tat.¹²⁶ For the same reason, the lemma can be found several times in papyri of legal content, e.g. PSI XI 1182, containing the *Institutiones* by Gaius and dated to the sixth cent.: frg. I recto, ll. 180–181: *sicuti lex XII [t]abular(um)*.¹²⁷ Sometimes, we find the word in abbreviated form, both in documentary and juridical papyri, e.g. P. Oxy IV 720 (247 CE), l. 14: *leg(e)* and CPL 74 (= TM 62359 = LDAB 3524) *Paulus sententiae* 5.24–25 (fifth cent.), recto l. 20: *leg(e)*. Among the HP, the word is attested only in the thematic section, specifically: *de legibus* (CGL III 276.26), *de negotiis forensibus* (CGL III 336.40) and *de magistratibus* (CGL III 362.66).¹²⁸

– *quaestio*

P¹ fr. 1+ fr. 3 recto l. 71: *et questiones* ~ και εξετασι[ς]¹²⁹

Cic. *Cat.* 1.18: *tu non solum ad neglegendas leges et quaestiones verum etiam ad evertendas perfringendasque valuisti*.¹³⁰

In the juridical field, the word has many meanings: ‘examination of witnesses, often accompanied by torture in the case of slave’, ‘judicial investigation’ and an ‘ad hoc or, after 149 BCE, a standing commission appointed to try cases of public crime’.¹³¹ Among juridical papyri, the word is attested few times: P. Strasb. 6B, fifth cent. (= TM 62945 = LDAB 4137) col. II l. 17: *q(uaesti)onis fuisse ut*¹³² the *Disputationes* by Ulpian and PSI XIII 1348, p. 3 l. 29 *de satisdando qu(aestio)ni*,¹³³ a Greek legal text with Latin technical term and quotations. The term occurs very frequently among the Albertini tablets,¹³⁴ in the monophthongised form *questionem*.

– *vindico*

P¹ frg. 2+frg. 3 recto l. 91: *et ad vindican]dum* ~ και προ[ς] το εκδικιν¹³⁵

Cic. *Cat.* 1.19: *Et ad vindicandum fortissimum fore putasti*.¹³⁶

126 “And she said that she had employed these written testimonies for this reason, because the Aelian-Sentian and the Papian-Poppaeian laws forbid that illegitimate sons and daughters be registered in the public record”; transl. from <https://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.mich;3;169> (seen: 15.01.2021).

127 “As the laws in the Twelve Tables”.

128 “About law”, “About the activities in the law-court”, “About magistrates”.

129 “And the courts”.

130 “You have managed not merely to ignore the laws and the courts, but to overturn and shatter them”; transl. Berry 2006.

131 OLD s.v. *quaestio*.

132 “The inquiry was about”.

133 “The discussion about giving a guarantee”.

134 Cf. Courtois *et al.* 1952.

135 “In order to punish”.

According to the *OLD*, the term has various technical meanings: ‘to claim as one’s property’, ‘to claim as free’, referred to the practice of the *manumissio ex vindicta*¹³⁷ and to punish. The passage from Cicero has to be meant in this last way. Among the HP, the word is attested only in the *Hadriani sententiae* in both their redactions: *Leidensis* (Flammini 2004 69, 1770) and *Stephani* (CGL III 387.31) with the same Greek translation as the Ciceronian glossary.

Conclusion

I give here a table to collect all the data assembled during my research: they are the starting point for my conclusions.

Lemma in Cicero’s glossaries	<i>Hermeneumata Pseudodositheana</i>				Papyri	
	Thematic glossaries	<i>Hadriani sententiae</i>	<i>Tractatus de man- umissionibus</i>	<i>Colloquia</i>	Juridical papyri	Documentary papyri
<i>abdico</i>						
<i>carcer</i>	x				x	
<i>clarissimus vir</i>	x	x			x	x
<i>consul</i>	x				x	x
<i>custodia</i>	x					x
<i>custos</i>	x					x
<i>exilium</i>		x			x	
<i>indemnatus</i>						
<i>innocens</i>	x			x		
<i>iudicium</i>	x			x	x	
<i>iudico</i>		x			x	
<i>lex</i>	x	x	x		x	x
<i>quaestio</i>					x	x
<i>vindico</i>		x				

¹³⁶ “You thought to be [...] very active in punishing”; transl. Berry 2006.

¹³⁷ “Emancipation through rod”; cf. *Oxford Classical Dictionary* (OCD) s.v. *freedman* and bibliography.

The first evidence of an existing link, in the eastern part of the Empire, between the teaching of jurisprudence and Cicero's production lies in the nature itself of his works which survive from Egypt: as mentioned below, in fact, among the Ciceronian papyri we find only speeches.¹³⁸ The speeches surviving from papyrus scraps, additionally, nearly correspond to the choice made by the grammarians: according to the index of the *CGL*, the most quoted speeches are the *Verrines*, the *Catilinarians*, *Pro Cluentio* and *Pro Caelio*.¹³⁹

Looking at the table above, on one side, we immediately note that only two lemmata (*abdico* and *indemnatus*) are completely absent from the scrutinised texts; on the other side, it is remarkable that the remaining twelve words occur in the legal texts at least once. Moreover, among these twelve lemmata, eleven can be found both in the HP and papyri.

Reading the data in the table, starting from the text typologies, we easily note that all of them contain many technical words matching those in the Ciceronian glossaries; however, there are two exceptions in this respect: the *Tractatus de manumissionibus* and the *Colloquia*. In my opinion, this lack can be explained with their own nature: the *Tractatus* is a very specific juridical text, concerning a single aspect of the private law, consequently the majority of its technical words (i.e. *manumissio*, *manumittere*, *ingenuus*, *libertus*, *vindicta*) pertain only to that kind of text and not to juridical texts at all. Concerning the *Colloquia*, they are a kind of learning material about almost every aspect of daily life, as a result the space devoted to juridical texts is minimal.

The term that occurs the most over all the text typologies is *lex*, followed by *clarissimus vir*, *iudicium* and *consul*. In addition, we find *lex*, *clarissimus vir* and *consul* frequently attested in their abbreviated form: abbreviations and symbols are typical of technical language and specific typology of documents and sometimes they appear in *formulae*. The need of the officers to write more documents in a smaller amount of time is the reason for the spread of abbreviated words, especially of the most used.

Furthermore, another aspect is noteworthy: the words *consul* and *clarissimus vir*, in their abbreviated form, can be frequently found in the bilingual reports of proceedings.¹⁴⁰ They are a common documentary typology in Late Antique Egypt and use code-switching: the frame (date, place, introduction of the speakers) is in Latin, the body is in Greek and the *sententia* is both in Greek and Latin.¹⁴¹

¹³⁸ It is necessary to underline that Papyrology is a science that evolves constantly, hence my considerations fit the present status of our knowledge about Ciceronian papyri.

¹³⁹ See De Paolis 2000, 47.

¹⁴⁰ A list of these documents can be found in Thomas 1998, 132–133.

¹⁴¹ Adams 2003, 383–390; Fournet 2019, 76–79.

These documents are the best example of the interaction between the two languages: the official parts, pertaining to the administration are in Latin, the language of power; the body, otherwise, pertaining to common citizens is in Greek. The *sententia* is the official result of the trial and, of course is in Latin but accompanied by a Greek translation or resume, to be understood even by Hellenophones. The reason for the bilingual reports of proceedings is nearly the same as the bilingual glossaries: both the phenomena, indeed, are linked to the Diocletian reforms.¹⁴²

Beside the glossaries, another evidence of the link between Cicero and the learning of Roman law is P. Ryl. III 477, especially the note, written both in Latin and Greek, about the *indictum*, a crime committed by two people together.¹⁴³

Consequently, it is possible to assume, in my opinion, that it is not a coincidence that, among the lemmata selected for our purpose, the words most attested in the bilingual scholastic texts are those more attested among documentary papyri, also in their abbreviated form: the major need of people capable to write Latin documents concerning juridical aspects was linked to the increase of bilingual scholastic tools and the Ciceronian glossaries are a good example of this phenomenon.

¹⁴² See the introduction to this study.

¹⁴³ Concerning bilingualism and juridical papyri, see Ammirati 2018.

