

## לולב וערבה פרק רביעי סוכה

(fol.54a) **משנה א:** לולב וערבה ששה ושבעה. תהלל ותשמחה שמונת. סוכה ונסוך המים שבעה. ותהלל ותשמחה ששה: לולב שבעה כיצד יום טוב הראשון של חג שחל להיות בשבת לולב שבעה ושאר כל-הימים ששה:

**Mishnah 1:** *Lulav* and willow six and seven<sup>1</sup>; *Hallel* and joy eight<sup>2</sup>. *Sukkah* and water libation seven<sup>3</sup>, and the fife five and six<sup>4</sup>. When is the *lulav* seven? If the first day of Tabernacles falls on a Sabbath, the *lulav* is taken seven times; on all other days six<sup>5</sup>.

**משנה ב:** ערבה שבעה כיצד יום שביעי של ערבה שחל להיות בשבת ערבה שבעה ושאר כל-הימים ששה:

**Mishnah 2:** How the willow seven? If the seventh day of willow falls on a Sabbath, the willow is seven {days}, on all other days six<sup>5</sup>.

1 The entire Chapter only refers to the service in the Temple. The willow twigs referred to here are not those tied to the *lulav*; these are subsumed under the name of *lulav* and are not mentioned further, just as the myrtle branches are not mentioned. The willow twigs are large ones used around the altar, as described in Mishnah 4. The numbers mentioned refer to the number of days the corresponding action is required. If the Sabbath of the holiday week was not the first day, the willow twigs to surround the altar were not brought on the Sabbath.

2 These apply both on the seven days of Tabernacles and on the additional final holiday (*Num.* 29:35) which is separate from Tabernacles.

3 Since no Sabbath violation is possibly

connected with these, they are obligatory all seven days of Tabernacles.

4 The fife accompanying the nightly festivities of drawing the water for next day's libation, impossible both on the full holiday and on the Sabbath.

5 If the first day of the holiday is a Sabbath, the use of the *lulav* in the Temple is prescribed by *Lev.* 23:40 and therefore supersedes any possible Sabbath violation. But the Sabbath on any other day of the holiday week has precedence and prevents the taking of the *lulav*. Similarly, the willows to surround the altar were carried on the seventh day even if it was a Sabbath since one holds that on that day it is a biblical command, as explained in the Halakhah.

(54b line 38) לולב וערבה ששה ושבעה כול'. רבי זעורה רבי אילא רבי יסא בשם רבי יוחנן. ערבה הלכה למשה מסיני. ודלא כאבא שאול. דאבא שאול אומר. ערבה דבר תורה. וערבינחל שתים. ערבה ללולב וערבה למקדש. רבי בא רבי חייה בשם רבי יוחנן. ערבה וניסוד המים הלכה למשה מסיני. ודלא כרבי עקיבה. דרבי עקיבה אומר. ניסוד המים דבר תורה. בשיני ונסכיהם. בשישי ונסכיה: בשביעי כמשפטים. מ"ם יוד מ"ם מים. רבי חייה בר בא בעא קומי רבי יוחנן. ועכשיו למה הן חורשין בזקניות. אומר ליה. בשעה שניתנה הלכה לקד ניתנה. שאם ביקשו לחרוש יחרוש. רבי בא בר זבדא בשם רבי חונייא דברת חורן. ערבה וניסוד המים ועשר נטיעות מניסוד הנביאים הם. מה ופליג. רבי יוסי בירבי בון בשם לוי. קד היתה הלכה בגדם ושכחיה ועמדו השניים והסכימו על דעת הראשונים. ללמדך שפל דבר שנותנין נפשם בית דין עליו סופו להתקיים בגדן כמה שנאמר למשה בסיני. ואתיא כהיא דאמר רבי מנא. כי לא ידבר רק הוא. ואם רק הוא. מלך. למה. שאין אתם יגיעין בו. כי הוא חייכם. אימתי הוא חייכם. בשעה שאתם יגיעים בו. רבי יוחנן אומר לרבי חייה בר בא. בבלייא. תרין מילין סלקון בדיכון. מפשיטותא דתעניתא וערובתא דיומא שביעיא. ורבנן דקיסרין אמרין. אף הך מקוזה.

1 זעורה | ש זעירא | אילא | ש לא 2 או' | ש אמ' 3 חייה | ש חייה 5 חייה | ש חייה 6 בא | ש אבא 7 לכך | ש כן | יחרוש | ש יחרושו | זבדא | ש זבדי | חונייא | ש חוניה 8 מניסוד | ש מניסוד | הנביאים | ש הנביאים הראשונים 10 שנותנין נפשם בית דין | ש שבת דין נותנין נפשם | ש בידם | כהיא | ש כן 11 - | ש מכס 12 בא | ש הוא 13 יגיעים | ש יגיעין | בדיכון | ש בדיכון | וערובתא | ש וערבתא

"Lulav and willow six and seven," etc. <sup>6</sup>Rebbi Ze'ira, Rebbi Ila, Rebbi Yasa in the name of Rebbi Johanan: The "willow"<sup>1</sup> is practice going back to Moses on Mount Sinai. This is against Abba Shaul<sup>7</sup>, since Abba Shaul said, the willow is a word of the Torah: *and brook willows*, two. One willow for the *lulav*, the other willow for the Temple. Rebbi Abba, Rebbi Hiyia in the name of Rebbi Johanan: willow and pouring water are practice going back to Moses on Mount Sinai<sup>8</sup>. This is against Rebbi Aqiba<sup>9</sup>, since Rebbi Aqiba said the pouring of water is a word of the Torah: On the second day *and their libations*<sup>10</sup>. On the sixth say, *and its libations*<sup>11</sup>. On the seventh day, *and its rules*<sup>12</sup>. מ י מ spells "water". Rebbi Hiyia bar Abba asked before Rebbi Johanan, why does one now plough because of old trees<sup>13</sup>? He said to him, when the practice was established it was given so that when they desired to plough they might plough. Rebbi Abba bar Zavda in the name of Rebbi Onias from Hauran: Willow, water libation, and ten saplings<sup>14</sup> are institution of the prophets<sup>15</sup>. Do they disagree? Rebbi Yose ben Rebbi Abun in the name of Levi: That was the current practice; they forgot it, but the later ones got up and agreed to the opinion of the earlier ones to teach you that everything the

court insists on will come to be in the end just as Moses was told on Sinai, as Rabbi Mana said, *for it is not an empty word*<sup>16</sup>, if it is empty it is *from you*. Why? Because you do not exert yourselves. *Because it is your life*; when is it your life? At the time that you exert yourselves. Rabbi Johanan said to Rabbi Hiyya bar Abba: Babylonian, two things came from you<sup>17</sup>, prostrating oneself on the fast day<sup>18</sup>, and the willow of the seventh day<sup>19</sup>. The rabbis of Caesarea say, also the moving<sup>20</sup>.

רבי סימון מפקד לאילין דמחשבין. והבון דעתכון דלא תעבדון לא תקיעתא בשבתא ולא ערבתא בשבתא. ואין אדחיקתון עבדון תקיעתא ולא תעבדון ערבתא.

Rebbi Simon ordered those who computed<sup>21</sup>, be careful not to put the *shofar* blowing on the Sabbath nor the willow on the Sabbath. And if you are in trouble, put the *shofar* blowing on the Sabbath but do not put the willow on the Sabbath.

6 This paragraph is copied in *Ševi'it* 1:7 (Notes 48-58,  $\Psi$ ).

7 Halakhah 3:3, Babli 34a.

8 Babli 34a.

9 In *Sifry Num.* 250 the argument is given in the name of R. Jehudah ben Bathyra, with different arguments ascribed to R. Aqiba and R. Nathan. The argument notes that in *Num.* 29 the sacrifices for the different days of Tabernacles are given in stereotyped language; the words noted are deviations from the usual *וּנְסַחַשׁ* and *וּנְסַחַח*. R. Aqiba's argument is presented differently in the Babli, *Zevahim* 110b.

10 *Num.* 29:19.

11 *Num.* 29:31.

12 *Num.* 29:33.

13 This refers to the problem that Mishnah *Ševi'it* 1:1 prohibits ploughing an orchard in the summer preceding a Sabbatical year, when it is noted immediately that this rule is no longer followed but one ploughs until the New Year. If the prohibition was instituted

by Moses, how could a later generation rule against it? (Cf. *Ševi'it* 1:1, Note 7.)

14 The rule (Mishnah *Ševi'it* 1:7) that ten tree saplings planted over a surface area of a *bet seah* (5'000 square cubits) may be tended up to New Year's Day.

15 Babli 44a; *Moed qatan* 3b.

16 *Deut.* 32:47.

17 They are Babylonian customs introduced into Palestine.

18 Prostrating oneself in the re-enactment of the High Priest's service on the Day of Atonement (*Avodah zarah* 4:1, Note 18).

19 Using separate willow twigs on the seventh day of Tabernacles in the prayers for winter rains. Confirmed in the Babli, 44a.

20 According to J. Levy, the root is קָזַח "to push aside, to move". It refers to the calendar rule given by R. Simon in the following. It is established in Mishnah *Roš Haššanah* 2:11-12 that rabbinic Judaism permits a computed calendar which may

deviate from the exact astronomical data. This is used to make sure that the Day of Atonement be neither Friday nor Sunday, since in those cases it would be difficult either to prepare a meal for breaking the fast or one to prepare for the fast. The calendar rules allow for one more condition. One prefers that New Year's day not be on a

Sunday, to make sure that the seventh day of Tabernacles not be on the Sabbath, rather than New Year's Day (and the first day of Tabernacles) not be on the Sabbath, since outside the Temple the *shofar* may still be blown on the Second Day of the New Year.

21 The calendar.

(fol. 54a) **משנה ג:** מצות לולב ביצד. כל־העם מוליכין את לולביהן להר הבית והחוננין מקבלין מידן וסודרין אותן על גג האצטבה והזקנים מניחין את שלחן פלשפה ומלמדיו אותן לומר כל־מי שמוגיע לולבי בידו תרי הוא לו מתנת. משכימין ובאין החוננין מנורקין לפניהן והן מחמטפין ומכין איש את חברו. וכשראו בית דין שהיו באין לידי סכנה התקינו שיהא כל־אחד ואחד נוטל בביתו:

**Mishnah 3:** How is the order of the *lulav*<sup>22</sup>? Everybody brings their *lulav* to the Temple Mount; the beadles accept from them and arrange them on the roof of the stoa<sup>23</sup>; but the Elders deposit theirs in the lodge<sup>24</sup>. One teaches them<sup>25</sup> to say, it should be a gift to anybody into whose hands my *lulav* will come. They come early and the beadles throw them before them<sup>26</sup>, and they grab and hit one another. When the Court saw that it involves danger they instituted that each person should take it in his house.

22 The way the *lulav* was taken in the Temple if the first day of Tabernacles was a Sabbath. Then the *lulav* could be moved anywhere on the Temple Mount, but in the city of Jerusalem it could not be brought from a private into the public domain. Therefore it was necessary to bring the *lulavim* to the Temple Mount on Friday.

23 The double stoa enclosing the Temple Mount.

24 People who could not be expected to

hold their own in the throng of the next morning.

25 Since on the first day nobody can fulfill his obligation with a *lulav* which is not his own property, and nobody could expect to receive his own *lulav* on the next day, it was necessary that each single worshipper donate his own *lulav* to whomever it would reach.

26 The *lulavim* before the multitude.

(54b line 59) **הלכה ב:** רבי יעקב דרומיאיא בעי. מתניתא דלא כרבי דוסא. דרבי דוסא אמר. בשחרית אדם צריך לומר. כל-מה שילקטו העניים היום מבין העמרין הבקר הרי הוא הבקר. רבי יודה אומר. לעיתותי ערב. וחכמים אומרים. אין הבקר אנסים הבקר. שאין אנו אחראין לרמאים. תמן את אמר. אין הבקר אנסים הבקר. והכא את אמר. הבקר אנסים הבקר. אמר רבי לעזר. תמן על דעתו הוא מבקר. ברם הכא על כרחו הוא מבקר. אמר רבי חנניה בריה דרבי הילל. ויאות. תדע לך שהוא כן. שכבר חילופיו בידו.

רב מפקד לדבית רב אתי. רב המנונא מפקד לחבריא. כד תהוון יהבין מתנה ביומא טבא לא תהוון יהבין לה אלא לדעת גמורה. כהדא. רב הונא יהב אתרוגא מתנה לבריה. אמר ליה. אין יומא טבא יומא דין הרי הוא לך מתנה. ואין למחר הרי הוא לך מתנה.

**Halakhah 2:** Rabbi Jacob the Southerner asked, does the Mishnah contradict Rabbi Dosa? For “Rabbi Dosa said, in the morning a person has to say, everything which the poor will collect today between the sheaves is ownerless property. Rabbi Jehudah says, in the evening. But the Sages say, a declaration of abandonment under duress is not an abandonment, because we are not responsible for cheaters.”<sup>27</sup> There you are saying, a declaration of abandonment under duress is not an abandonment, but here you are saying, a declaration of abandonment under duress is abandonment. Rabbi Eleazar said, there he declares ownerless by his own will, here he declares ownerless against his own will. Rabbi Hananiah the son of Rabbi Hillel said, this is correct. You have to know that this is so since already his replacement is in his hand<sup>28</sup>.

Rav commanded to the House of Rav; there came Rav Hamnuna commanding the colleagues, if you are giving a gift on the holiday<sup>29</sup>, only give it fully explicit. As the following: Rav Huna gave an *etrog* to his son. He told him, if today is holiday<sup>30</sup> it is a gift to you, and if it is tomorrow it is a gift to you.

27 Tosephta *Peah* 2:5, Yerushalmi *Ma'aser Šeni* 5:1 (Notes 31-37), Babli *Bava qamma* 69a/b. R. Dosa and R. Jehudah want to prevent the poor from sinning if they are collecting on the farmer's field more than they are entitled to; therefore they recommend that the farmer declare anything the poor take against the biblical rules as

abandoned. The Mishnah here does not contradict R. Dosa, but the Sages who disagree with R. Dosa. Therefore, “contradict R. Dosa” must be read as “contradict the *baraita* known as R. Dosa's.”

28 It is less of an abandonment than an involuntary exchange.

29 The *lulav* which must be the personal property of the worshipper on the first day of the holiday.

30 Because in Babylonia before the publication of the rules of calendar computation one had to observe all holidays

as two days since knowledge of the declaration of the first of Tishre and first of Nisan may not have arrived there before the 15th, he had to make it clear that the transfer of property was intended to be valid in any case.

(fol. 54b) **משנה ד:** מצות ערבה ביצד. מקום היה למטה מירושלם ונקרא מוצא ויורדין לשם ומלקטין משם מורבת של ערבה וכו' אין וזקפין אותן בצדי המזבח וראשיהן כפופין על גבי המזבח. ותקעו ותריעו ותקעו. בכל יום מקיפין את המזבח פעם אחת ואומרים אָנָּה יי' הושיעה נָּא. אָנָּה יי' הצליחה נָּא. רבי יהודה אומר אָנָּה יי' הושיעה נָּא. אָנָּה יי' הושיעה נָּא. אותו היום מקיפין את המזבח שבע פעמים. בשעת פטירתן מה הן אומרים יופי לך מזבח יופי לך מזבח. רבי אליעזר אומר ליה ולך מזבח ליה ולך מזבח:

**Mishnah 4:** How is the order of the willow? There was a place below Jerusalem called Moṣa. They descended there to collect willow branches, and come and erect them on the sides of the altar, their heads bent on the altar. They trumpeted straight, treble, and straight. Every day they surround the altar once and say, *please, Eternal, please save; please, Eternal, please let succeed*<sup>31</sup>. Rabbi Jehudah says, *Ani wahu please save, ani wahu please save*<sup>32</sup>. On that day<sup>33</sup> they surround the altar seven times.<sup>34</sup> What are they saying when taking leave? Beauty for you, altar, beauty for you, altar. Rabbi Eliezer says, to the Eternal and you, altar, to the Eternal and you, altar.

31 Ps. 118:25.

32 The spelling וְהָא is confirmed by Maimonides's autograph Mishnah. In his interpretation the reference is to *Deut* 32:39: *I, I am He, and no power competes with me*.

33 The seventh day of Tabernacles.

34 This part of the Mishnah is not discussed in the Halakhah; it is not in Maimonides's autograph of the Mishnah nor in the Babli (45b) it seems to be a *baraita*.

(54b line 71) **הלכה ג:** מהוא מוצא. ממציא. אמא רבי תנחומא. קלוינא הנה שמה.

**Halakhah 3:** What is Moṣa<sup>35</sup>? Memsia<sup>36</sup>. Rabbi Tanḥuma said, its name was Colonia<sup>37</sup>.

35 In the bottom of the valley North of Jerusalem, near the water.

36 This name is unexplained. It cannot be identified with a place מצא (in Galilee) mentioned in versions of the *baraita* about

the borders of the Land (*Ševi'it* 6:1, Tosephta *Ševi'it* 4:11, *Sifry Deut.* 51), but missing in the mosaic from the synagogue of Rehov.

37 A colony of Roman veterans.

72) (54b line 54b) בר קפרא אמר. ונבנהו אחת עשרה אמה. אמר רבי יוסה. מתניתא אמרה כן. וראשיהו כפופין לצדדי המזבח. רבי זעורא שלח שאיל לרבי דניאל בריה דרב קטינא. שמעת מאביד טעונה ברכה וניטלת בפני עצמה ויש לה שיעור. אתא רבי איבו בר נגרי בשם רב חונה ואמר טעמא. טעונה ברכה וניטלת בפני עצמה. ויש לה שיעור לא שמעתי. תמן אמרין. רב ששת ורב נחמן בר יעקב. חד אמר. שלשה בדי עליו. וחורנה אמר. אפילו בד אחד.

Bar Qappara said, they<sup>38</sup> are eleven cubits high. Rabbi Yose said, the Mishnah says so, “their heads bent on the altar.”<sup>39</sup> Rabbi Ze'ira sent asking Rabbi Daniel ben Rav Qatina, did you hear from your father that it needs a benediction<sup>40</sup>, is taken alone<sup>41</sup>, and has a minimum? Rabbi Ayvi bar Nagari came in the name of Rav Huna and said with reason that it needs a benediction and is taken alone. Whether it has a minimum I did not hear. There, they are saying Rav Sheshet and Rav Nahman bar Jacob. One says, three leafed branches. But the other said, even one branch<sup>42</sup>.

38 The willow branches taken for the altar, in contrast to those taken with the *lulav*, which are short.

39 Since the altar was 10 cubits high, the willows had to be appreciably larger in order to bend over. Babli 45a.

40 A special benediction, “praise to You, Eternal, King of the Universe, Who sanctified us with His commandments and commanded us to take willow branches.”

41 No *lulav* in the hands of the Cohanim

circling the altar (as well as in the hands of the congregants during the prayers for rain, cf. Note 19).

42 It is clear that the Galilean authors Bar Qappara and R. Yose speak about the ceremony in the Temple. From the parallel in the Babli, 44b - 45a, it seems that the Babylonian authors, from R. Ze'ira to Rav Nahman, speak about the ceremony in the synagogue, where on the seventh day a separate bunch of willow twigs is taken

3) (53c line 53c) תני. ובעלי מומין. רבי שמעון בן לקיש בעא קומי רבי יוחנן. בעלי מומין נכנסין בין האולם ולמזבח. אמר ליה. כשירים היו.

It was stated: Bodily defective ones<sup>43</sup>. Rabbi Simeon ben Laqish asked before Rabbi Johanan, may bodily defective ones enter between the altar and the Temple entrance<sup>44</sup>? He told him, they were qualified<sup>45</sup>.

43 Since nobody but priests are permitted to enter the inner courtyard with the altar, by necessity only priests may circle the altar, and bodily defective priests are excluded from Temple service (*Lev.* 21:16-24).

44 It is stated in Mishnah *Kelim* 1:9 that bodily defective priests may not enter the

space between altar and Temple entrance.

45 The rule of Mishnah *Kelim* 1:9 is rabbinic but the rite of the willows is a tradition ascribed to Moses; in this case the defective priests are qualified since the rite is not a sacrificial service. Babli 44a.

(54c line 5) רבי אבהו בשם רבי יוחנן. כיני מתניתא. אני והו הושיעה נא. [אני והו הושיעה נא.]

אמר רבי אבהו. לך לישעיה לנך. לך יודיה. דרש רבי בא סרונגיה. והושיע יי את-אהל הוהה בראשונה. והושיע כתיב. דרש רבי זבדי. כי עתה תצא מן מקרה ושכנת בשדה. ושכנת בשדה. חנניה בן אחי רבי יהושע אומר. אולי יי אלהיך אשר הוצאתיך מארץ מצרים. הוצאתך כתב.

רבי ברכיה רבי ירמיה בשם רבי חייה בר בא. דרש לוי בר סיוסי בנהרדעא. ויראו את אהלי ישראל ותחת רגליהם כמעשה לבנת הספיר וכעצם השמים לטוהר: זו עד שלא נגאלו. אבל משנגאלו (אין דרכה תינתן) [אין דרכה של לבנה להינתן] שם היא נתונה. אמר רבי ברכיה. מעשה אין כתוב כאן אלא כמעשה. היא וכל-ארגליה שלה. (היא והסל והמגרפה.) [היא וכל-פרקמטיא שלה. אמר רבי מישא. בבבל כתיב כמראה אבן-ספיר ובמצרים כתיב כמעשה] לבנת הספיר. ללמדך שכל שם קשה מן חלבינה כד שיעבדה שלבבל היה קשה משעבדה שלמצרים. תני בר קפרא. עד שלא נגאלו ישראל ממצרים היתה רשומה ברכיע. משנגאלו עוד לא נראית ברכיע. מה טעם וכעצם השמים לטוהר: שמיא כד אינון יקיון מן ענין.

תני בשם רבי ליעזר. עבודה זרה עברה עם ישראל בים. מה טעם. מפני עמך אשר פדית לך ממצרים גוים ואלהיו. אמר לו רבי עקיבה. חס ושלום. אם אומר את כן נמצאת עושה את הקודש חול. מה תלמוד לומר אשר פדית לך ממצרים. כביכול כאילו עצמך פדית.

Rabbi Abbahu in the name of Rabbi Johanan: So is the Mishnah, אני והו, please save. [Ani wahu please save.]<sup>46</sup>

Rabbi Abbahu said, *for you as help for us*<sup>47</sup>. For you is recognized<sup>48</sup>. Rabbi Abba from Saronga, and the Eternal will first save the tents of *Jehudah*<sup>49</sup>. It is written “he saved.”<sup>50</sup> Rabbi Zibai explained, *for now leave*



*the city and dwell in the field*<sup>51</sup>, my *Shekhina* is in the field<sup>52</sup>. Hananiah the son of Rabbi Joshua's brother says, *I am the Eternal, your God, Who led you out of the land of Egypt*<sup>53</sup>, it is written "who was led out with you."<sup>54</sup>

<sup>55</sup>Rebbi Berekhia, Rabbi Jeremiah in the name of Rabbi Hiyya bar Abba: Levi bar Sisi explained in Nahardea: *They saw the God of Israel and below His feet like the work of a brick of sapphire, and like the true sky in purity*<sup>56</sup>. That is, before they were freed. But after they were freed, (it was not its way to be put) [where usually the brick is put]<sup>57</sup> there it is put. Rabbi Berekhia said, it is not written here *the work*, but *like the work*, it and all its tools<sup>58</sup>, (it and the basket and the rake.)<sup>59</sup> [it and all its merchandise. Rabbi Miasha said, in Babylonia it is written<sup>60</sup>, *like the looks of sapphire stone*, but in Egypt it is written, *like the work of a brick of sapphire*. To teach you that just as the stone is harder than the brick, so the servitude of Babylonia was harder than the servitude of Egypt. Bar Qappara stated, before Israel was rescued from Egypt it<sup>61</sup> was traced in the sky; after they were rescued it was no longer seen in the sky. What is the reason? *and like the true sky in purity*, the sky if it is empty of clouds.

<sup>62</sup>It was stated in the name of Rabbi Eliezer, an idol crossed with Israel through the Sea. What is the reason? *Before Your people which You redeemed for Yourself, peoples and his god*<sup>63</sup>. Rabbi Aqiba said to him, Heaven beware! If you are saying so it turns out that you profane the holy. Why does the verse say, *which You redeemed for Yourself*? If it were possible to say, as if You redeemed Yourself.

46 The corrector's addition in brackets has to be deleted. R. Abbahu notes that the text of the Mishnah, reading *הוה*, has to be corrected to *הוה*. Both *אני* and *הוה* are of the 72 secret names of God which can be derived from *Ex. 14:19-21*, 3 verses of 72 letters each, which have to be written boustrophedon, the first and last from left to right and the middle one from right to left, and then read from top to bottom. (Rashi 45a on the Mishnah; cf. the author's *The Scholar's Haggadah*, p. 300, Note 244.)

47 *Ps. 80:3*.

48 The reading of the text is unsafe and its meaning unclear. In line with the following homilies, the presumed meaning is that God liberated Himself by liberating Israel from Egypt.

49 *Sach. 12:17*.

50 Meaning: He saved Himself.

51 *Mica 4:10*.

52 A homily on the word *ושכנת* which is revocalized *ושכנת* "My Presence", the field being a simile for the desert.

53 *Ex.* 20:2.

54 There is no textual evidence for a missing letter in this word.

55 Most of this paragraph also is in *Lev. rabba* 23(8), *Cant. rabba* 4(17).

56 *Ex.* 24:10.

57 The sapphire brick was at God's feet as symbol of the enslavement of Israel; after their freeing it was no longer necessary but took its place in the Heavenly Temple. The corrector's text in brackets is that of the Midrashim.

58 Greek *εργαλεία* "tools of trade".

59 The scribe's text in parentheses is confirmed by the Midrashim. The remainder of the text up to the statement of Bar Qappara is not in the parallel sources.

60 *Ez.* 1:26.

61 The brick of sapphire.

62 *Mekhilta dR. Ismael Ba 14, Beshallah Wayissa 1; Sifry Num. 84, partially Tanhuma Ki Tissa 14.*

63 *2S.* 7:24.

אֹתוֹ הָיוּ מְקִיפִין אֶת הַמִּזְבֵּחַ שֶׁבַע פְּעָמִים. אָמַר רַבִּי אֶחָא. וַיָּכַר לִירִיחוֹ. (54c line 25)

"On that day<sup>33</sup> they surrounded the altar seven times." Rabbi Abba said, a remembrance of Jericho.

**משנה ה:** כִּמְעִשְׁהוּ בַחֹל כִּךְ כִּמְעִשְׁהוּ בַשַּׁבָּת אֵלֶּא שֶׁהָיוּ מְלַקְטִין אוֹתָהּ מִעֶרֶב שַׁבָּת מִנִּיחִים אוֹתָן בְּגִינִיּוֹת שֶׁל זָהָב כְּדֵי שֶׁלֹא יִכְמוֹשׁוּ. רַבִּי יוֹחָנָן בֶּן בְּרוּקָה אוֹמֵר הָרִיזוֹת שֶׁל דָּקֶל הָיוּ מְבִיאִין וְחוֹבְטִין עַל גִּבֵּי הַמִּזְבֵּחַ וְאוֹתוֹ הָיוּ הָיָה נִקְרָא יוֹם חִיבוּט הָרִיזוֹת: מִיָּד הַתְּיַנּוּקוֹת שׁוֹמְטִין אֶת לִילְבֵּיהֶן וְאוֹכְלִין אֶתְרוּגֵיהֶן:

**Mishnah 5:** As one does it on a weekday one does it on the Sabbath, only that one collected them<sup>64</sup> on Sabbath Eve and keeps them in golden vats so they should not wilt. Rabbi Johanan ben Beroqa says, they brought palm branches<sup>65</sup> and struck them on top of the altar<sup>66</sup>; the day was called "day of striking palm branches." Immediately<sup>67</sup> the children untie their *lulavim* and eat their *etrogim*.

64 The willow branches.

65 Fully open palm branches, in contrast to the tube-like *lulav*.

66 This is the reading of most Mishnah mss. (including Maimonides's autograph) and the quote from the Babli by R. Isaiah

from Trani. But in the Babli (Munich ms. and *editio princeps*) the reading is: On the floor near the altar.

67 After the end of services on the morning of the seventh day of Tabernacles.

(54c line 26) **הלכה ד:** לא אמר אלא קטן. הא גדול לא. לא כן אמר רבי אבינא בשם רב. אתרוג שנפסל ביום טוב הראשון מותר לאוכלו. אמר רבי יוסה. תמן הוא אינו ראוי לצאת בו. אחרים ראויין לצאת בו. ברם הקא לא הוא ולא אחרים יוצאין בו.

**Halakhah 4:** He said only minors, therefore not adults<sup>68</sup>. Did not Rabbi Avinna say in the name of Rav, if an *etrog* became disqualified on the first day of the holiday one is permitted to eat it? Rabbi Yose said, there<sup>69</sup> while he cannot use it to fulfill his obligation, others might use it to fulfill their obligation. But here neither he nor others can use it to fulfill their obligation.

68 Since only children may eat their *etrog* after services on the seventh day.

69 The seventh day is the last day *lulav* and *etrog* are taken. Since the *lulav* may be taken all day long, the same *lulav* could be

used by others; it is not food and remains reserved for its religious use. But a disqualified *etrog* cannot be used for any religious action, it is not reserved for any use other than food.

(fol. 54b) **משנה ו:** ההלל והשמחה שמונה ביצד. מלמד שאדם חייב בכבוד יום טוב האחרון של חג בשאר כל-ימות החג. סוכה שבגעה ביצד נמור מלובל לא יתיר סוכתו אבל מוריד הוא את הכלים מן המנחה ולמעלה בשביל כבוד יום טוב האחרון:

**Mishnah 6:** How *Hallel* and joy eight? This shows that a person is obligated to honor the last day of the festival like all other days of the festival<sup>70</sup>. How the *sukkah* seven? If he finished eating one may not undo his *sukkah* but one removes his vessels after afternoon prayers in honor of the last day of the festival<sup>71</sup>.

70 As stated in the Halakhah, *Hallel* is obligatory on all holidays except the last day of Passover, and an obligatory sign of holiday enjoyment is the consumption of

meat; in Jerusalem of the holiday sacrifice.

71 On which there is no obligation of *sukkah*.

(54c line 30) **הלכה ה:** תני. שמונה עשר יום ולילה אחד קורין בהן את ההלל בכל-שנה. שמונת ימי החג ושמונת ימי החנוכה ויום טוב של עצרת ויום טוב ראשון של פסח ולילה.

**Halakhah 5:** It was stated<sup>72</sup>: On eighteen days and one night one recites the *Hallel* every year. The eight days of Tabernacles, the eight days of

Ḥanukkah, the holiday of Pentecost, and the first day of the holiday of *Pesaḥ* and its night.

72 Tosephta 3:2. In the Babli this is an name of R. Simeon ben Jošadaq [*Arakhin* Amoraic tradition by R. Joḥanan in the 10a, *Ta'anit* 28b (*Soferim* 20:9)].

(54c line 32) רבי זעורא עולא בר ישמעאל בשם רבי לעזר. שלמי חגיגה ששחטון מערב הרגל אינו יוצא בהן ידי חובתו ברגל. והתני. חגיגת ארבעה עשר יוצאין בה משם שמחה ואין יוצאין בה משם שלמים. אמר רבי זעורה. תיפתר. בששחטה ברגל. אמר רבי בא. אם בששחטה ברגל אין זו חגיגת ארבעה עשר. מאי כדון. אמר רבי זעורה. עד דאנן תמן שמעתנה. עולא בר ישמעאל בשם רבי לעזר. כד סלקינו הכא שמעתנה. רבי חייה בשם רבי לעזר. והיית אף שמח: לרבות לילי יום טוב (האחרון) (הראשון) לשמחה. אי יכול אף לילי יום טוב (הראשון) (האחרון). תלמוד לומר אף. אף חלק. רבי חייה בשם רבי לעזר. ושמחת בתגד. משאת מתחייב בחגיגה את מתחייב בשמחה. התיבון. והתנין. ההלל והשמחה שמונה. הגע עצמך שחל יום הראשון להיות בשבת. לשוחטון מערב הרגל אין את יכול. דאמר רבי זעורא עולא בר ישמעאל בשם רבי לעזר. שלמי חגיגה ששחטון מערב הרגל אינו יוצא בהן ידי חובתו ברגל. לשוחטון ברגל אין את יכול. שפבר למדנו שאין חגיגה דזוהא את השבת. אימתי אמרו. ההלל והשמחה שמונה. אמר רבי יוסה. קיימה רב אבדומי נחיתה בכהנים [ו] בשעיר.

1 יעורא | ח יעורה 2 והתני | ח והא תני 3-4 אמר... כדון | ח [...] 4 דאנן | ח דאנא 5 שמעתנה | ח שמע תנא | ח סלקין | ח סלקית הכא | ח להכא שמעתנה | ח שמע תנא 6 | ח | 7 | ח | - אף חלק | ח או חלף 8 והתנין | ח והא תנין 10 יעורא | ח יעורה 11-12 את השבת | ח שבת 12 אבדומי | ח אבדומא - | ח אבל לא בעופות ולא במזוזות. דכת' זבח.

<sup>73</sup>Rebbi Ze'ira, Ulla bar Ismael in the name of Rebbi Eleazar: With pilgrimage well-being offerings which were slaughtered on the eve of a festival one does not satisfy his obligation for the pilgrimage<sup>74</sup>. Rebbi Abba objected, was it not stated: With the pilgrimage offering of the Fourteenth one fulfills the obligation of joy but one does not fulfill the one of well-being offerings<sup>75</sup>? Rebbi Ze'ira said, explain it that he slaughtered it on the holiday. Rebbi Abba said, if he slaughtered it on the holiday it is not a festival offering of the Fourteenth. What about it? Rebbi Ze'ira said, when we still were there, we heard stated Ulla bar Ismael in the name of Rebbi Eleazar. When we came up to here we heard stated, Rebbi Hiyya in the name of Rebbi Eleazar: *only be joyful*<sup>76</sup>, to add the night of the (last) [first]<sup>77</sup> festival day for joy. Or maybe also the nights of the (first) [last] day of the festival? *Only split*<sup>78</sup>. Rebbi Hiyya in the name of Rebbi Eleazar: *and you shall be joyous*

on your festival of pilgrimage<sup>79</sup>. When you are obligated for a sacrifice of pilgrimage you are obligated for joy<sup>80</sup>. They objected, did we not state, *hallel* and joy eight? Think of it, if the first day of the holiday falls on a Sabbath! He cannot slaughter on the eve of the holiday since Rabbi Ze'ira, Ulla bar Ismael in the name of Rabbi Eleazar said, with pilgrimage well-being offerings which were slaughtered on the eve of a festival one does not satisfy his obligation for the pilgrimage. He cannot slaughter on the holiday since we already have learned that the pilgrimage offering does not push aside the Sabbath<sup>81</sup>. When did they say, *Hallel* and joy eight? Rabbi Yose said, Rav Eudaimon the emigrant explained it for Cohanin and the goat<sup>82</sup>.

73 This paragraph also is *Hagigah* 1:4 (n).

74 A pilgrimage to the Temple on the occasion of one of the three festivals of pilgrimage brings with it the obligation for two kinds of sacrifices. The first is the "elevation offering of appearance", in response to the commandment (*Ex. 34:20*): *They shall not appear empty-handed before My presence*. The second is a family sacrifice with the full name שְׁלֵמֵי הַגִּיטָה "pilgrimage well-being offering", usually shortened to הַגִּיטָה "pilgrimage offering", in response to the commandment to be joyous on the festival of pilgrimage, since when there is a possibility of sacrificing the eating of well-being sacrifices is an act of joy (*Deut. 27:7*). But this must be a sacrifice on the holiday, not in preparation for the holiday. Babli *Pesahim* 70b, bottom.

75 The pilgrimage offering of the Fourteenth is an additional sacrifice on the 14<sup>th</sup> of Nisan, together with the *Pesah* sacrifice. Since the *Pesah* is to be eaten after the main meal, the meat for the main course is provided by the additional well-being offering. Since the meal is taken in the night of the holiday, it contributes to

the enjoyment of the holiday, but it is not a sacrifice on the holiday. Babli *Pesahim* 70a. (Cf. the author's *The Scholar's Haggadah*, pp. 248-249.)

76 *Deut. 16:15*.

77 The (scribe's text) is confirmed in *Hagigah*; the [corrector's] is from *Sifry Deut. 142*. The clause *only be joyful* seems unnecessary since the preceding verse already commands to enjoy the festival of Tabernacles. It is read to mean that the final day, which no longer belongs to Tabernacles, only has the obligation of joy, but none of the two sacrifices which already were obligatory on Tabernacles. Therefore by the argument presented for the offering of the Fourteenth, the last day may be celebrated with meat from a sacrifice brought on the preceding day. The corrector's text is irrelevant for the discussion here, it refers the sacrifice of the Fourteenth to the 14<sup>th</sup> of Tishre, to provide food for the initial meal of the holiday.

78 In *Hagigah*: "or inverse." The text here is the Babli's, 48a.

79 *Deut. 16:14*.

80 Therefore no sacrifice on the eve of a

holiday can be obligatory.

81 Since no fixed date is given in the verse for these sacrifices, they cannot be brought on a Sabbath.

82 If the first day is a Sabbath, all required holiday sacrifices are brought on the altar. They all are holocausts except for the goat

as purification offering whose meat is eaten by the Cohanim. But since it is a Sabbath, it may not be cooked or roasted for private use and the meat must be eaten raw. The Babli *Pesahim* 71a holds that eating raw meat is no joy.

(54c line 48) סוכה שבעה ימים. גמר מלכל לא יתיר סוכתו אכל מוריד הוא את הכלים מן המנחה ולמעלה בשביל פסח יום טוב האחרון. רבי אבא בר קהנא רב חייה בר אשי בשם רב. צריך אדם לפסול סוכתו מבעוד יום. רבי יהושע בן לוי אמר. צריך לקדש בתוך ביתו. רבי יעקב בר אבא בשם שמואל. קדש בבית זה ונמלך לוכל בבית אחר מקדש. רבי אבא רבי חיננא בשם רב (הושעיה). מי שסוכתו עריבה עליו מקדש בלילי יום טוב האחרון בתוך ביתו ועולה ואוכל בתוך סוכתו. אמר רבי אבון. ולא פליגי. מה דאמר רב. בשלא היה בדעתו לוכל בבית אחר. מה דאמר שמואל. בשעה בדעתו לוכל בבית אחר. אמר רבי מנא. אתנא דשמואל פרי חייה וידרבי הושעיה כרבי יהושע בן לוי. אמר רבי אימי. זאת אומרת שהן נחלקין בפירות.

1 מלכל | ב מלאכול | 2 ולמעלה | ב ולמעלה | ב חייה | 4 לוכל | ב לאכול | ב צריך לקדש | 5 רב (הושעיה) | ב ר' יהושע R' הושעיה בלילי | ב לילי | 6 אבון | ב אבין דאמר | ב דמר לוכל | ב לאכול | 7 מה דאמר | ב ומה דמר לוכל | ב לאכול | 8 חייה | ב חייה R' הושעיה | ב ר' יהושע אימי | ב אמי | 9 שהן נחלקין | ב שנחלקין

<sup>83</sup>“How the *sukkah* seven? If he finished eating one may not undo his *sukkah* but one removes his vessels after afternoon prayers in honor of the last day of the festival.” Rabbi Abba bar Cahana, Rav Hiyya bar Ashi in the name of Rav: A person must make his *sukkah* invalid as long as it is still day<sup>84</sup>. Rabbi Joshua ben Levi said, a person must make *Qiddush*<sup>85</sup> inside his house<sup>86</sup>. Rabbi Jacob bar Aha in the name of Samuel: If one made *Qiddush* in one house and changed his mind to eat in another house he must make *Qiddush*<sup>87</sup>. Rabbi Aha, Rabbi Hinenia in the name of Rav (Hoshaiah)<sup>88</sup>: He who loves his *sukkah* makes *Qiddush* of the last holiday in his house and eats in his *sukkah*<sup>89</sup>. Rabbi Abun said, they do not disagree. What Rav said was, if he did not have the intention to eat in another house. But what Samuel said was if he had the intention to eat in another house. Rabbi Mana said, Samuel comes like Rabbi<sup>90</sup> Hiyya and Rabbi Hoshaiah like Rabbi Joshua ben Levi. Rabbi Immi, this implies that they disagree explicitly<sup>91</sup>.

83 A copy of this paragraph is in *Berakhot* 6:6 (Notes 185-196, א).

84 In Israel, where holidays are kept only one day, if a person wants to use his *sukkah* on the last day of the festival he has to make sure not to violate the biblical injunction not to add to the biblical commandments (*Deut.* 4:2). If the *sukkah* becomes disqualified, it may be used later. It may not be made disqualified until after the afternoon snack eaten there on the seventh day.

85 The sanctification of Sabbath and holidays (cf. *Berakhot* Chapter 8; also the author's *The Scholar's Haggadah*, pp. 209-227.)

86 On the last day of the festival, irrespective of the place of the meal.

87 Samuel's formulation in the Babli *Pesahim* 101a is: there cannot be *Qiddush*

except at the place of the holiday meal.

88 Scribe's text, wrongly deleted by the corrector and therefore missing in the printed edition. The author's note in *Berakhot* 6:6, Note 191, has to be corrected accordingly.

89 In direct contradiction to Samuel's statement.

90 Read: Rav.

91 Since Rav Ḥiyya bar Ashi requires that one disqualify the *sukkah* for the last day, he must hold that one makes *Qiddush* for the last day in the *sukkah* if one desires to use the *sukkah*, and this follows Samuel.

92 While all sources read the last word as בפירות one has to read בפירות. The error must be an early one, from a region where the distinction between /tʰ/ ת and /sh/ ש was not heard.

מִשְׁנָה ז' נִסּוּךְ הַמַּיִם שֶׁבָּעָה בַּיָּצֵד. צְלוּחִית שֶׁל זָהָב מִחֻזָּקֶת שְׁלֹשֶׁת לִזְזִין הָיָה מְמֵלֵא מִן הַשְּׁלוֹחַ. הַגִּיעוּ לְשַׁעַר הַמַּיִם תִּקְעוּ וְהָרִיעוּ וְתִקְעוּ. עָלָה בְּכָבֶד וּפְנָה לְשִׁמּוֹאֵל וּשְׁנֵי סִפְּלִים שֶׁל כֶּסֶף הָיוּ שָׁם. רַבִּי יְהוּדָה אָמַר שֶׁל כִּיד הָיוּ אֵלֶּא שֶׁהָיוּ מוֹשְׁחָרִין מִפָּנֵי הָיִין וּמִנּוֹקְבֵין כְּמִין שְׁנֵי הוֹמָמִין דָּקִין אֶחָד מְעוֹבָה וְאֶחָד מִידֵּךְ כְּדִי שִׁיְהוּ כָּלִים בְּבֵת אֶחָת.

**Mishnah 7:** How was the water libation seven days? He<sup>93</sup> was filling a golden flask holding three *log*<sup>94</sup> from the Siloam. When they<sup>95</sup> reached the Water Gate they blew the trumpet straight, treble, and straight. He ascended the ramp and turned to his left. There were two silver bowls there; Rabbi Jehudah said that they were of lime but were darkened because of the wine. They had holes like two nostrils, one wide and one narrow so that both should finish at the same time<sup>96</sup>.

93 The priest selected to pour the water on the altar.

94 About 1.6 l.

95 The procession accompanying the priest. The trumpets were blown by priests in the Temple domain. The Water gate was

the South-Eastern entrance to the Temple Mount.

96 The holes for the water libation were smaller than those for the wine libation since

the viscosity of the wine is larger than that of the water. It therefore is presumed that

the viscosity of the wine was approximately constant through the years.

54c line 60) **הלכה ו:** אָמַר רַבִּי יוֹסִי בֶן הַחִינָה. כְּדִי לַעֲשׂוֹת פּוּמְפִי לְדָבָר. יוֹסִי בֶן חֲנִינָה בָּשֵׁם מְנַחֵם יוֹתֶפְיִיָּה. דְּרַבִּי עֲקִיבָה הִיא. דְּרַבִּי עֲקִיבָה אָמַר. נִסּוּדָּהּ הַמֵּיִם דְּבַר תּוֹרָה.

**Halakhah 6:** Rabbi Yose ben Ḥanina stated, to make a procession<sup>97</sup> on the occasion. Yose ben Ḥanina in the name of Menaḥem from Yodfat: *It is Rabbi Aqiba's* Yose ben Ḥanina<sup>98</sup>, since Rabbi Aqiba said, the water libation is a word from the Torah<sup>9</sup>.

97 Latin *pompa*, Greek πομπή “solemn procession”.

occurring outside the Temple precinct which otherwise would be rabbinically forbidden.

98 The Mishnah, which on a holiday permits trumpet blowing for something

Also the amount of 3 *log* is derived from biblical libations; *Zevahim* 110b.

54c line 62) תַּמָּן תִּתְּנֶנּוּ. רַבִּי לָעֶזֶר אוֹמֵר. אִף הַמְּנִסָּד מֵיִם בָּהֶגַּ בְּחוּץ חֵיב. אָמַר רַבִּי יוֹחָנָן. כָּל־שִׁטָּת רַבִּי לָעֶזֶר כְּשִׁטַּת רַבִּי עֲקִיבָה רַבּוֹ. כְּמָה דְּרַבִּי עֲקִיבָה אָמַר. נִסּוּדָּהּ הַמֵּיִם דְּבַר תּוֹרָה. כֹּן רַבִּי לָעֶזֶר אוֹמֵר. נִסּוּדָּהּ הַמֵּיִם דְּבַר תּוֹרָה. אֵית תַּנְיִי תַנִּי כְּשֵׁם רַבִּי אֶלְעָזָר. צְרִיד שְׁיָהָא מִלּוּיָן לָשֵׁם הַחֵג. אֵית תַּנְיִי תַנִּי כְּשֵׁם רַבִּי לָעֶזֶר. אֵינוּ צְרִיד שְׁיָהָא מִלּוּיָן לָשֵׁם הַחֵג. מָאן דְּאָמַר. צְרִיד שְׁיָהָא מִלּוּיָן לָשֵׁם הַחֵג. רַבִּי לָעֶזֶר כְּרַבִּי עֲקִיבָה. וּמָאן דְּאָמַר. אֵינוּ צְרִיד שְׁיָהָא מִלּוּיָן לָשֵׁם הַחֵג. רַבִּי לָעֶזֶר כְּרַבִּי יוֹחָנָן. כָּל־שִׁטָּת רַבִּי לָעֶזֶר כְּשִׁטַּת רַבִּי עֲקִיבָה רַבּוֹ. כְּמָה דְּרַבִּי עֲקִיבָה אָמַר. נִסּוּדָּהּ הַמֵּיִם דְּבַר תּוֹרָה. כֹּן רַבִּי לָעֶזֶר אוֹמֵר. נִסּוּדָּהּ הַמֵּיִם דְּבַר תּוֹרָה. מָה נֶפֶק מִבִּיעוּהוֹן. אָמַר רַבִּי זְעוּרָא. וְהוּא שְׁנִיסָדָּהּ שְׁלֹשֶׁת לֹגִין בְּכָנִים וְשְׁלֹשֶׁת לֹגִין בְּחוּץ. אֵית תַּנְיִי תַנִּי. יֵשׁ לָהּ שִׁיעוּר. וְאֵית תַּנְיִי תַנִּי. אֵין לָהּ שִׁיעוּר. מָאן דְּאָמַר. יֵשׁ לָהּ שִׁיעוּר. פְּטוּר. וּמָאן דְּאָמַר. אֵין לָהּ שִׁיעוּר. חֵיב.

There, we have stated<sup>99</sup>: “Rebbi Eleazar<sup>100</sup> says, also one who pours a libation of water on Tabernacles outside of the Temple is liable<sup>101</sup>.” Rebbi Johanan said<sup>102</sup>, the entire system of Rebbi Eleazar is the system of his teacher Rebbi Aqiba. Just as Rebbi Aqiba said, the water libation is a word from the Torah, so Rebbi Eleazar is saying, the water libation is a word from the Torah. There are Tannaim who state in the name of Rebbi Eleazar, it is necessary that the filling be for the holiday; there are Tannaim who state in the name of Rebbi Eleazar, it is not necessary that the filling be for the



holiday<sup>103</sup>. He who said, it is necessary that the filling be for the holiday, Rabbi Eleazar following Rabbi Aqiba; he who said, it is not necessary that the filling be for the holiday, Rabbi Eleazar following the rabbis. This you cannot say since Rabbi Johanan said, the entire system of Rabbi Eleazar is the system of his teacher Rabbi Aqiba. Just as Rabbi Aqiba said, the water libation is a word from the Torah, so Rabbi Eleazar is saying, the water libation is a word from the Torah. What is the difference between them? Rabbi Ze'ira said, only if he poured three *log* inside and three *log* outside<sup>104</sup>. There are Tannaim who state, there is prescribed measure; there are Tannaim who state, there is no prescribed measure. He who said that there is prescribed measure, not liable<sup>105</sup>; he who said there is no prescribed measure, liable<sup>106</sup>.

99 Mishnah *Zevahim* 13:6.

100 The Tanna, ben Shamua.

101 As a matter of principle, any sacrifice outside the Temple conducted in the way it is biblically prescribed for the Temple is a deadly sin and if performed inadvertently makes the person liable for a purification sacrifice. To state that making a water libation outside the Temple creates such a liability for the performer is stating that the libation in the Temple is biblically prescribed.

102 Babli *Zevahim* 110b.

103 Since anything sacrificed on the altar needs a dedication, and using Temple vessels for not dedicated contents is sinful, if the water libation is a biblical requirement it needs a Temple vessel and dedication of

the water at the moment of filling for the holiday. If the water libation is tradition, it does not have to be drawn for its purpose from the start.

104 This statement is elliptic. It can be read parallel to a statement of R. Simeon ben Laqish in the Babli *Zevahim* 110b as stating that since in the Temple the libation is only valid if it is of exactly three *log* (a quarter of a *hin*, the smallest admissible libation of wine, *Num.* 15:4), also outside it creates liability only if it is exactly 3 *log*.

105 If the measure is not exactly 3 *log*, since inside the Temple this is a biblical obligation.

106 In any amount, since inside the ceremony is tradition, not Scripture.

הַיְסוּד. מֵה טַעַם בְּקִדְּשׁ הַסֹּד נִסְדָּךְ שֶׁכֶּר לִי. (54c line 75) יוֹסִי בַר אֲשִׁינָן בָּשֵׁם רַבִּי שְׁמַעוֹן בֶּן לָקִישׁ. צְרִיכִין הַסְּפָלִים לַהֲיֹת פְּקוּקִין בְּשַׁעַר

Yose Bar Ashian in the name of Rabbi Simeon ben Laqish: The bowls have to be plugged at the moment of pouring. What is the reason? *In the sanctuary pouring a libation of shekhar to the Eternal*<sup>107</sup>.

107 Babli 49b. For the cryptic quote of Num. 28:7 it is explained first in *Sifry Num.* 143 that the repetition הסך הסך includes not only libations of wine but also those of water; it is added in the next paragraph that שכר therefore cannot be interpreted only by the Hebrew connotation of “intoxicating

drink” but also (in parallel with the Arabic שכר) “to be abundantly full (of milk), thanks, gratitude”. [Babli *Sotah* 49b, *Tanḥuma Pinḥas* 12, *Pesiḳta Rabbati* 17 (ed. Ish-Shalom 80 a/b), *Pesiḳta dRav Cahana et qorbani laḥmi* (ed. Buber Note 20).]

54d line 1) **הלכה ז:** תני רבי יוסי אומר. השית היה נקוב עד התהום. מה טעם. ויעזקהו ויסקלנה ויטענהו שורק ויבן מגדל בתוכו. זה ההיכל. ויקב חצב בו. זה המזבח. וגם יקב. זה השית. רבי שמעון אומר. מעשה שמנים היו. לפי שהיו מעשה שמנים יכול לא היו נאים כמעשה ידי אומן. תלמוד לומר חמוקי יריכין: כמנו חלצים מעשה ידי אומן: נאים היו יותר ממעשה ידי אומן: תני. אמר רבי לעזר בירבי צדוק. לול קטן היה בין האולם ולמזבח. אחת לשבעים שנה היו פירחי כהונה יורדין ומעלין אותו בקדושה שהיה קרוש כעגולי דבילה ובאין ושורפין אותו בקדושה. כשם שהיה נישכו בקדושה כך היתה שריפתו בקדושה. אמר רבי ראה שהתפסדת התורה לשון חיבה לשון שיבועה לשון שיקרות. רבי יודה בר לקנה בשם רבי שמואל בר נחמן. משחרב בית המקדש פסק יין קרוש ופסקה זכוית לבנה. מהו זכוית לבנה. שהיתה מתקפלת.

**Halakhah 7:** It was stated<sup>108</sup>: “Rabbi Yose says, the basis was perforated down to the abyss. What is the reason? <sup>109</sup>*He turned it up, removed its stones, planted precious vine, and built a tower in its midst, this is the Temple, and a wine-press he excavated in it, this is the altar. And also an altar, that is the basis.*” Rabbi Simeon says, it was work of Heaven. Since it was work of Heaven, maybe it was not beautiful like artist’s work? The verse says, *the roundnesses of your hips are like hoops, formed by artist’s hands*<sup>110</sup>; they were more beautiful than those formed by artist’s hands. It was stated<sup>108</sup>: “Rabbi Eleazar ben Rabbi Šadoq said, a small opening was between the Temple Hall and the altar. Once in seventy years young priests climb down and bring it<sup>111</sup> up in sanctity since it was congealed like fig cakes; they come and burn it in sanctity. Just as its pouring was in sanctity, so its burning was in sanctity.” Rabbi said, the Torah let you grasp an expression of love, an expression of

fullness, and an expression of inebriation<sup>112</sup>. Rabbi Judah bar Laqqara in the name of Rabbi Samuel bar Nahman: Since the Temple was destroyed, congealing wine disappeared, and white glass disappeared. What is white glass? It was flexible.

108 Tosephta 3:15; Babli 49a.

109 *Is.* 5:2.

110 *Cant.* 7:2.

111 The congealed remainders of the wine poured on the altar as libations.

112 Cf. Note 107, explanation of שֶׁכֶּר.

(fol. 54b) **משנה ח:** מערבין של מים ומזרחין של יין. עיריה של מים בתוך של יין או של יין לתוך של מים יצא. רבי יהודה אומר כלוג היה מנסך כל-שמונה. ולמנסך אומרים לו הגבה את ידך שפעם אחת נסך על רגליו ותרמוהו כל-העם באתרוגיהם:

**Mishnah 8:** The Western one<sup>113</sup> for the water, and the Eastern one for the wine. If he poured the water into that for the wine or wine into that for the water, he accomplished his duty. Rabbi Jehudah says, one *log* he was pouring all eight days<sup>114</sup>. One says to the one pouring, lift your hand, since once he<sup>115</sup> poured on his feet and all the people stoned him with their *etrogim*.

113 The bowl for the libations.

115 A Sadducee objecting to the pouring of

114 One *log*, not three; for eight days, not seven.

water not justified in the Pentateuch.

(54d line 14) **הלכה ח:** הוון בעיין מימר. המעובה שלמים והמידק של יין. דאמר רבי יונה בשם רבי אימי. נקב שאינו מוציא מים מוציא יין. ושאינו מוציא יין מוציא שמן. ושאינו מוציא שמן מוציא דבש. ואפלו תימר חילופין. דרבי יהודה היא. דרבי יהודה אמר. מלוג היה מנסך כל-שמונה. רבי שמעון בן לקיש בעא קומי רבי יוחנן. הקדימן לזבח מה הן. נסכן בפילה מה הן. לא נסך היום מהו שנינסך למחר. אמר ליה. נישמעינה מן הדא דאמר רבי אילא בשם רבי יסי. ונסכיה. אחד נסכי מים ואחד נסכי יין. הדא אמרה. הקדימן לזבח פשר. נסכן בפילה פשר. לא נסך היום לא נסך למחר. על שם. עבר יום עבר קרבנו.

**Halakhah 8:** They wanted to say that the large {hole}<sup>116</sup> was for water, the small one for wine, for Rabbi Jonah said in the name of Rabbi Immi: A hole which does not let pass water passes wine, what does not let pass wine passes oil, does not let pass oil passes honey. And even if you say it is the

other way<sup>117</sup> around, is that not Rabbi Jehudah's? And Rabbi Jehudah said, a *log* he was pouring all eight days<sup>118</sup>. Rabbi Simeon ben Laqish asked before Rabbi Johanan: If he preceded them before the sacrifice, what<sup>119</sup>? If he poured in the night, what? If he did not pour today may he pour the next day? He said to him, let us hear from the following which Rabbi Ila said in the name of Rabbi Yasa: *And its libations*<sup>120</sup>, the same for libations of water as for libations of wine<sup>122</sup>. This implies that if he preceded them before the sacrifice, it is qualified. If he poured in the night, it is qualified. If he did not pour today he may not pour the next day, because if the day passed, its sacrifice passed.

116 In the bowl mentioned in Mishnah 7.

117 If one confirms by experiment that the more viscous fluid requires a larger hole, Babli 48b.

118 The entire part of Mishnah after R. Jehudah's statement also is R. Jehudah's. Since he states that the volume of water is one third of the volume of wine, it is obvious that the hole of the water bowl must be much smaller than that of the wine bowl if both bowls should simultaneously empty. For the Babli 48b his bowl must be smaller.

119 If pouring the water is an independent sacral act it cannot be performed before the morning daily sacrifice nor after the evening daily sacrifice. If it is an appendix to the sacrifices like the libations of wine it can be performed any time, including the night following the day. Babli *Ta'anit* 2b.

120 *Num.* 29:31, the text for the sixth day of Tabernacles.

121 Pouring the water follows the rules of pouring wine; it has the status of an accessory action.

(54d line) רבנן מרבדים במים וממעיטין בימים. רבי יהודה מרביע במים ומרבה בימים.

The rabbis increase the water and decrease the days; Rabbi Jehudah decreases the water and increases the days<sup>114</sup>.

אית דבעי מימר. היא דפרה היא דסופה היא דכיפורים. רבי סימון לא אמר כן. אלא או דפרה ודסופה חד ודכיפורים חד. או דפרה ודכיפורים חד ודסופה חד. מאן דאמר. לא באו ימים קלים עד שמות. תלתייהו עבד. מאן דאמר. יצא חוטמו מן תולעים וקמין פרסת עגל בתוך מצחו. כמאן דאמר. או דפרה ודסופה חד ודכיפורים חד. או דפרה ודכיפורים חד ודסופה חד. צווחה עליהו העזרה. צאו מיכן צאו מיכן בני עלי. טימאתם בית אלהינו. בו ביום נקמה קרן המזבח ונתנו עליו גוש של מלח שלא יהא נראה כפגום. שכל-מזבח שאין לו קרן וסובב ויסוד פגום הוא.

בְּעֵין קוֹמֵי רַבִּי אֲבָהוּ. וְהָאֵלֶּיךָ לְכָפֹר בְּקוֹדֶשׁ  
עַד-צֹאתוֹ. אֲפִילוּ אוֹתָן שֶׁכְּתוּב בָּהֶן וְדָמוֹת פְּנֵיהֶם פָּנֵי אָדָם לֹא יִהְיוּ בְּאֵהָל מוֹעֵד בְּבֹאוֹ לְכָפֹר  
בְּקוֹדֶשׁ. אָמַר לוֹן. בְּשָׁעָה שֶׁהָיָה נִכְנָס כְּדָרְכּוֹ.

<sup>122</sup>Some want to say, he was the same for the Cow<sup>123</sup>, on Tabernacles, and on the Day of Atonement<sup>124</sup>. Rabbi Simon does not say so, but either the Cow and Tabernacles were one and Atonement one, or Cow and Atonement were one and Tabernacles one. He who said, after a short time he died, he did all three. He who said, his nose gushed out worms and something like a calf's hoof grew in his brain, follows him who said, either Cow and Tabernacles were one and Atonement one, or Cow and Atonement were one and Tabernacles one. The Courtyard cried about them, get out of here, sons of Eli, you defiled our God's Temple. "On that day, the corner of the altar was damaged and they put a block of salt there lest it should look deficient since any altar without corner, or walkway, or base is damaged."<sup>125</sup>

They asked before Rabbi Abbahu: Is it not written<sup>126</sup>, *nobody shall be in the Tent of Meeting during his coming to atone in the sanctuary until he leaves*, not even those about whom it is written<sup>127</sup>, *the shapes of their faces are human shapes* shall not be in the Tent of Meeting? He answered them, if he enters following normal rules.

122 This paragraph is from *Yoma*, Halakhah 1:5, Notes 213-222.

123 Where the Sadducees insisted that the Cohen who burns the Red Cow must be pure from the preceding sundown. However, it is difficult to square what is reported in Tosephta *Parah* 3:8 with what is presumed here: "It happened that a Sadducee was pure from the preceding sundown when he came to burn the Cow, but Rabban Johanan ben Zakkai realized it; he came and leaned both of his hands on him and told him, Sir High Priest, how wonderful you are as High Priest, go and immerse yourself. He went down and immersed himself. After he came back he grated his earlobe and said to him,

Ben Zakkai, when I shall be free to deal with you; he answered him, if you will be free. It was not three days before they put him in the grave."

Biblical impurity is only original impurity and derivative impurity in the first degree. Rabbinic impurity has derivative impurity in the second degree for unwashed hands, third degree impurity for heave, and fourth degree for sacrifices. Therefore, the intrinsically pure Ben Zakkai (who before the destruction of the Temple was not Rabban), by putting his second degree impure hands on the priest defiled the latter for *sacra* and forced him to immerse himself in a *miqweh*. Our sources seem to describe

the Sadducee position correctly; cf. Dead Sea Scrolls fragment 4Q394, lines 16-18.

124 Reported in Yoma 1:5, Note 211. He followed Sadducee doctrine in bringing the incense into the Holiest of Holies, and died soon after.

125 Tosephta *Sukkah* 3:16; Babli 48b .

126 *Lev.* 16:17.

127 *Ez.* 1:10. If the offending priest was hit on his head by a calf's foot it must have been by one of the four-headed angels seen by Ezechiel whose feet are calves' feet (*Ez.* 1:7).

**משנה ט:** פִּמְעִישָׁהּ בַּחֹל כֶּךָ פִּמְעִישָׁהּ בַּשֶּׁבֶת אֵלֶּא שֶׁהָיָה מִמֶּלֶא מְעִרֵב שֶׁבֶת הַבַּיִת שֶׁל זָהָב שְׂאִינָהּ מְקוּדָּשֶׁת מִן הַשִּׁילּוֹחַ וּמִנִּיחָהּ בַּלְשָׁכָה. נִשְׁפָּכָה אוֹ נִתְגַּלְתָּה הָיָה מִמֶּלֶא מִן הַכִּיּוֹר שְׁחֵמִים וְהָיָן הַמִּגְדָּלִים פְּסוּלִין מֵעַל גַּבֵּי הַמִּזְבֵּחַ:

**Mishnah 9:** As it was done on a weekday it was done on the Sabbath, except that on Friday he filled a non-sanctified barrel<sup>128</sup> from the Siloam and deposited it in the lodge. If it was spilled or became uncovered<sup>129</sup> he filled from the basin since water or wine which remained uncovered are disqualified from being put on the altar.

128 The sacrificial day starts in the morning, and all remainders from the previous day become disqualified at that time. The Sabbath starts on the preceding evening; the water must be drawn on Friday. If pouring the water libation were an independent sacrificial action, the water in a Temple vessel would become disqualified at the end of the night. Since it was established (Note 121) that the water libation is an accessory action, the water

would not become disqualified even in a Temple vessel; the profane vessel is used to give the water ceremony a boost in status.

129 Wine or water left uncovered and unsupervised becomes forbidden for health reasons lest a snake living in the house drink from it and on this occasion leave some poison in the fluid. The rules about this are given in *Terumot* 8:5-7. If it becomes unusable for humans it is unbecoming to use it for Heaven.

**הלכה ט:** לָמָּה לִי שְׂאִינָהּ מְקוּדָּשֶׁת. וְאַפִּילוּ מְקוּדָּשֶׁת. לֹא כֵן אָמַר רַבִּי אֶחָא רַבִּי חִינְנָא בְּשֵׁם רַבִּי יְסָא. וְקִדְּשֶׁתְּ אֶת־הַמִּזְבֵּחַ וְהָיָה הַמִּזְבֵּחַ קָדֹשׁ קְדָשִׁים: מֵהַ מִּזְבֵּחַ אֵינוֹ מְקֻדָּשׁ אֲלֵא בְדַעַת אִף הַכֹּלִים לֹא יִקְדָּשׁוּ אֲלֵא בְדַעַת. חִזְקִיָּה אָמַר. שְׁלֹא יְהוֹ אוֹמְרִין. רָאִינוּ מִים שְׁנִיתִמְלֵאוּ לְקִידּוּשׁ יָדַיִם וְרִגְלַיִם נִפְסְלוּ בְלִינָה. דְּבֵית רַבִּי יִצְחָי אֲמָרִין. שְׁלֹא יְהוֹ אוֹמְרִין. רָאִינוּ מִי הָחָג נִפְסְלוּ בְלִינָה. רַבִּי יוֹחָנָן אָמַר. מִפְּנֵי מְרָאִית הָעִין. וְלֹא יִדְעִין אִין כְּהֵדָּא דְחִזְקִיָּה אִין כְּהֵדָּא דְרַבִּי יִצְחָי דְּבָרֵי הַכֹּל. רַבִּי פְּדָת בְּשֵׁם רַבִּי הוֹשַׁעְיָה. מִי סוּסָה נִפְסְלוּ בְלִינָה. רַבִּי אֲבוּנָה. כָּל־שְׂאִינָה מִמֵּינוֹ לְמִזְבֵּחַ אִין הַלְחָנָה פּוֹסְלָת בּוּ.

**Halakhah 9:** Why non-sanctified? Even if it is sanctified! Did not Rebbi Aḥa, Rebbi Ḥinena say in the name of Rebbi Yasa, *you shall sanctify the altar; then the altar will be most holy*<sup>130</sup>. Since the altar only sanctifies with intention, so vessels should only sanctify with intention<sup>131</sup>. Ḥizqiah said, that they should not say, we saw that water filled for the sanctification of hands and feet become disqualified by staying overnight<sup>132</sup>. In the House of Rebbi Yannai they said, that they should not say, we saw that water filled for Tabernacles become disqualified by staying overnight<sup>133</sup>. Rebbi Joḥanan said, because of the evil impression; but we do not know whether following Ḥizqiah or according to everybody's opinion following Rebbi Yannai. Rebbi Pedat in the name of Rebbi Hoshai: The water for a deviant wife becomes disqualified by staying overnight<sup>134</sup>. Rebbi Abuna: anything of whose kind nothing possibly is for the altar cannot become disqualified by staying overnight<sup>135</sup>.

130 Ex. 40:10.

131 The verse starts: *anoint the altar and all its vessels*, which implies that the power of sanctification is the same for the altar and its vessels. Since it is forbidden to bring profane (not dedicated) matter to the altar, profane matter remains profane also on the altar. This proves that the altar and therefore the sanctified vessels only sanctify with dedication.

132 Since sanctification of hands and feet must be with water from a Temple vessel, the water becomes disqualified at daybreak. The problem is that people will say that they saw the water becoming disqualified and

nevertheless used for libation, they will wrongly conclude that disqualified water may be used on the altar.

133 Again, and be used nevertheless.

134 *Soṭah* 2:2, Note 114. This is a matter of dispute. There is an opinion that the water has to be taken from the water basin in the Temple. Any water taken from there and sanctified in a Temple vessel belongs to the service of that day and becomes disqualified by the next dawn. But according to the opinion that the water may come from outside sources, this need not be the case.

135 Disputing R. Pedat in principle.

הוון בעיי מימר. עבר והביא קשר. תנא רבי יושע דרומי קומי רבי יונה. (54d line 48)  
 שהמים והיין המגולין פסולין מעל גבי המזבח. מה טעם. ושהאלות מרצהן מרמאותים  
 ממשקה ישראל. מדבר שהוא מותר לישראל. עד כדון מים. ין. אמר רבי שובתי. המשמן  
 אלהים ואנשים.

They wanted to say, if he transgressed<sup>136</sup> and brought it is qualified. Rabbi Joshua the Southerner stated before Rabbi Jonah that uncovered water and wine are disqualified<sup>137</sup> from the altar. What is the reason? *And one sheep from 200, from the drink of Israel*<sup>138</sup>, from something permitted to Israel<sup>139</sup>. So far water, wine? Rabbi Sabbatai said, *which gladdens God and men*<sup>140</sup>.

136 And brought uncovered wine or water to the altar.

137 In any case.

138 Ez. 45:15.

139 While a prophet cannot prescribe, he can present authoritative practice. Since uncovered water is forbidden to Israel, it is

absolutely disqualified for the altar.

140 *Jud.* 9:13, referring to wine. Since drinking uncovered wine, even if filtered to remove the poison, leaves people with fear and does not gladden; it is disqualified for all religious observances.