Introduction

Those familiar with the research and teaching of Professor Joseph Ward Goering, whom this volume honours, are aware of the breadth and depth of his scholarship. His studies have spanned subjects from the rarified arguments of medieval philosophers about transubstantiation to the evolution of the English village parish, and have plumbed canon law, theology, romance, and art. There is, nonetheless, constancy in their form: attention to the manuscript tradition of the texts; consideration of the nuances of the Latin; alertness for wit and unexpected turns in reasoning; delight in surprises; faith in the recurrence of truth and beauty throughout the sweep of centuries. Whether in prose, in the classroom, or in scholarly gatherings, he has brought to students and colleagues the medieval world he knows so well with gentleness, wry humour, clarity and curiosity. Joe's influence is fully manifest in the studies that comprise this volume. Some of them present for the first time editions of unpublished texts. Others provide appended charts and tables to assist further research. But just as Joe's own work always advances well beyond the technical to the analytical, so do the essays here probe larger and deeper questions about the sources, and the authors and world that produced them. Each adds tesserae to the contours of the mosaic Joe has outlined for our understanding of medieval education and pastoral care.

We have imposed distinctions and divisions on this corpus. The first part of the volume concentrates especially on the work of the medieval schoolmen and their craft, as they dared to ask about everything from angels to optics, with intellectual rigour and refined methods. The second traces the impact of advanced education on the judges, administrators, and clergy who strove to apply their learning in their various ministrations to the matters within their orbit of influence or power. The third reveals some of the impact of those efforts to disseminate the fruits of knowledge and experience among inevitably unpredictable and even unruly recipients, and the force of extra-curricular knowledge and experience in shaping the culture inhabited by masters, mendicants, miscreants, mystics, monks, and many others. While the objects of

these studies vary, we see reflected in them what Joe has brought to our work: what Jennifer Carpenter identifies as a charism used in the service of others, and what Robert Sweetman names as a wonder that is a call. Through these essays, there thread sets of shared reference points, overlapping and intersecting perspectives, and a coherence that we attribute to Joe's invitation to scholars to perceive a progression, or perhaps a perpetual motion, that we have named "from learning to love."

I. *Masters, Schools, and Learning*

The medieval schoolmen knew that there is a profound connection between learning and love. Indeed, their anxiety was that the two would perhaps be uncoupled, and there would be practitioners of learning who lacked love, or, as they called it, charity. Not only would such faithlessness engender pride, but also it could compromise the process of learning, itself. Thierry of Chartres, in a formulation made popular long ago by Jean Leclercq, wrote that "wisdom is the integral comprehension of the truth; without love it cannot be attained, or at best it is barely attained." The inherent problem, then, for the masters of the medieval Schools was how to advance students from learning to love, or how to teach them the art of learning to love, as well as to love learning. The first section of this volume brings to view the masters and their world of teaching and learning. Driving their efforts was the intellectual proposition that, as Cecilia Panti notes concisely, set God as "the maximum object of love" (101). No matter the subject, sources, logic, or degree of contention, the object – even if unspoken – was always the understanding and love of God, and it is that which gives medieval learning its consistent and distinctive character. To consider such a destination as singular and seemingly simple, however, would be to miss the richness of the academic life of the twelfth to fifteenth centuries that is revealed in these essays, a life that still offers a freshness undimmed by centuries of subsequent pedagogy. The authors in the first section of this volume all respond to Joseph Goering's long-standing invitation to step into the novelty of medieval academe, to take the opportunity to follow medieval arguments now forgotten, to study medieval methods for acquiring and imparting knowledge and for seeking truth.

The names of the thirteenth-century masters who surface in these pages are well-known to those who have listened to or studied with Joe: the redoubtable Richard Fishacre, master at Oxford; his fellow Dominican Robert Kilwardby, master at Paris and then regent at Oxford; Richard Rufus of Cornwall, also of

Paris and Oxford, instigator of the teaching of the natural sciences in the university curriculum; his teacher Alexander of Hales, the first Franciscan to teach at Paris and the "irrefutable teacher" (*doctor irrefragibilis*); and, of course, Robert Grosseteste, master at Oxford and then Bishop of Lincoln (whose works Joe has translated collaboratively with Frank Mantello). Even this short list, drawn from the larger swarm of masters our authors discuss, exposes an academic milieu that bridged the English Channel easily and often: the essays by Alexander Andrée, Tuija Ainonen, Cecilia Panti, Andrew Traver, and James Long show the frequent crossings and relocations of masters at sites in northern France and England, with Paris and Oxford as particularly strong magnets. The strength of the Parisian attraction over centuries is confirmed in the studies of Lindsay Bryan, Andrew Traver, and Chris Nighman. Lest we forget the further reach of the medieval schools, Michèle Mulchahey, Blake Beattie, and Kimberly Rivers take us to Toulouse, Avignon, and Salamanca. The masters are found in communities of Cistercians (Franklin Harkins, Tuija Ainonen), Franciscans (Cecilia Panti), and Dominicans (Michèle Mulchahey); the identity of the two latter as both mendicants and masters at times excited considerable debate (Andrew Traver).

Much more than common connections and communities bound medieval masters and students into a coherent whole. They shared a deep and wide mode of reading Scripture, shaped most especially by the ubiquitous influence of the *Sentences* of Peter Lombard, a text which Joe himself used as the basis for an undergraduate seminar, in a curricular event perhaps unique in modern university offerings. Essays in this volume demonstrate how hard it is to overestimate the importance of the *Sentences* in medieval learning. Composed in the mid-twelfth century as a comprehensive commentary on Scripture and all attendant matters, the *Sentences* were already within a decade or so after their publication the object of intense study. Here, James Long and Franklin Harkins investigate examples of the commentaries on Lombard's commentary that show both how medieval masters understood the *Sentences*, and how they applied its ideas to newly-posed problems. Long's essay reveals debates over *Sentences* 1.36, the enigma of "whether all things are in God's essence or in God through essence...," and the density of medieval excavations of that topic through layers of reasoning about Platonic forms (multiple) and God's essence (singular, not to say unique), and how to understand the relations between forms and essence, an especially tricky question when it comes to God. Also drawing upon the Lombard's work, the Cistercian masters of Harkins's essay grappled with *Sentences* 1.45–47 ("On the will of God, which is called the one and eternal essence"

and "That the will of God concerning man is always fulfilled"), producing a commentary that delved into analysis of precept, prohibition, counsel, permission, and operation, as well as the antecedent and consequent will. Not only the sophistication of their work, but also their energy in doing it is captured in the commentary's note, "When the reading of the *Sentences* has come to an end ..., none but the mute auditor ... can fail to exult with a jubilant 'O!'" (143–44).

The Lombard, as he was known, had his own intellectual lineage. Blake Beattie reminds us that he knew the work of Gratian, the shadowy (and possibly composite) compiler of the canon law text that stood alongside the *Sentences* as definitive: the *Decretum* or, to give its full title, the *Harmony of Discordant Canons*. In that observation is encapsulated a point that Joe has often elucidated and that the essays here confirm: the distinction between theology and law in the medieval Schools should not be drawn too firmly. Tuija Ainonen discusses a collection of distinctions to aid in the study of the liberal arts that is connected to the canonist Bernard of Pavia; Andrew Traver shows that the theologian William of Saint-Amour incorporated into his *Collectiones catholicae* (which Traver describes as essentially an anti-mendicant *summa*) citations of canon law alongside biblical quotations. Likewise, the enormously popular florilegium of Thomas of Ireland that was then adapted by Peter of Blois, the topic of Chris Nighman's essay, cited Gratian alongside the *Glossa ordinaria* to Scripture and the theological *Florilegium angelicum*. Blake Beattie contributes even more surprising evidence that canon law could be transposed into a different key: he describes a sermon that was composed almost entirely from Gratian's *Decretum*. Beattie notes that reading the *Decretum* for purposes other than legal education fits into the larger context of learning and its goals: from the *Decretum*, and its numerous citations of patristic and theological authors, lawyers could learn theology, just as "Gratian" had learned theology by studying a collection of *sententiae* from northern France, before Peter Lombard's compilation entered the curriculum.

The union of the study of the divine and the mundane – even earthy – study of law reflects the trend in the medieval schools to teach what Joe and his mentor, Leonard Boyle, have called "practical theology": a type of learning that brought the celestial mysteries to earth for the practical purposes of pastoral care. It might be said that the work of the masters was practical on two levels. First, there was the practical need to develop methods for making the material accessible to readers, and to reduce potentially soul-endangering confusion. While dialectic and debate were vibrant components of medieval education, there was also, perhaps paradoxically, a strong and commonly held

belief that the authoritative texts themselves should be in harmony; their truths would complement, rather than contradict, each other. Thus, as Alexander Andrée explains in his essay on unpublished biblical commentaries from the school of Laon, a primary activity alongside classroom lecturing was the *collatio sententiarum*, to produce a concordance of discordant opinions – the very practice exemplified in Gratian's *Decretum*. The magisterial reconciliation was then transmitted as an aid to learning. The problem of how to understand God's will, noted above, in particular with respect to evil and human free will, had tangled Abbot Héribrand of St Lawrence (a saint whose feast day has often been celebrated by a gathering of the *schola* chez Goering!) at Liège and Rupert of Deutz in debate, and it was the task of Anselm of Laon, argues Andrée, to bring both harmony to the text and peace-making to the dispute – in other words, to bring love through the methods of learning.

The interest in making texts accessible to readers generated a powerful set of new techniques and tools for readers, some of which are now taken for granted as the typical scholarly apparatus, and some of which are peculiarly medieval. In the early thirteenth-century collections of distinctions compiled by Durand of Huesca, Petrus Capuanus, and Ralph of Longchamp, there is, Tuija Ainonen argues, "a textual culture, and an approach to explaining the uses and meanings of words" (50). The sections or articles of these texts were alphabetized, had cross-references to other articles, and were often accompanied by lists of feast-days on which sermons drawing upon the articles might be preached. Between the mid-thirteenth century and the mid-fifteenth century, Cistercian manuscripts transmitted a handy abridgement of the *Sentences* in a text known as the *Filia magistri*, and also masters' notes and "helpful interlinear glosses," Franklin Harkins observes (130). By the fifteenth century, sufficient thought and praxis had been dedicated to teaching and learning that a professor of canon law at Salamanca could compose a treatise entitled *Ars et doctrina studendi et docendi*, signifying, as Kimberly Rivers points out, that written pedagogical aids had moved beyond glossing to independent treatises on how to learn. The prescribed techniques for reading well, requiring multiple readings, each with a different purpose, speed, associated activity of explication and note-taking, and analytical mode, will make any teacher smile.

The practicality of the masters extended far deeper than their strategies for helping students read, listen, and remember what they had read or heard. The project of conveying profound, abstract, hard-won knowledge about the divinely created and ordered world to others made teaching a ministry. As Lindsay Bryan, Cecilia Panti, Tuija Ainonen, and Blake Beattie note explicitly,

and others imply, much of the teaching was directed to preachers. The responsibility for ensuring that those preaching were properly informed was, ultimately, the responsibility to protect the entire Christian people from erroneous belief, from a jeopardized salvation. The distance between the rarified discussions of the divine essence and the town and parish churches could seem great, were it not for the bright thread of practical formation leading to those altars. Such formation, Franklin Harkins proposes, was the context for the *Filia magistri*: "this updated abridgement [of the *Sentences*] had a wide appeal and great utility for the more basic education and pastoral formation of monks, mendicants, and canons 'on the ground' in various religious houses and schools across Europe until the early modern period" (125). Michèle Mulchahey's examination of Dominican use of the word "master" shows how the meaning of the title was weighted toward pastoral significance: masters were confessors, father figures, shepherds, as she puts it, in a "relationship, not professional status" as they mentored and ministered in a collective endeavor (207). The task of the masters, as propounded by one Dominican, was "to ignite a little fire of divine love in [the students'] hearts" and "fan the flames of a greater fire" for those already on the way to knowledge (212).

In the medieval Schools, therefore, there was a developed heuristic for arriving at the essentials of knowledge. Some masters encapsulated it in easily remembered aphorisms, verses, or lists: Ralph of Longchamp, one of Ainonen's collectors of distinctions, appended to each article a mnemonic poem, summarizing the distinctions for that article; Kimberly Rivers draws attention to the verses for remembering the *principia* (the names of texts, used in citations) of the titles in the five books of Pope Gregory IX's collection of decretals, the *Liber extra*, and also the common verse describing in general the contents of that foundational work of canon law: "Iudex, iudicium, clerus, sponsalia, crimen/ hec tibi designant que quinque volumina signant" (279). Joe's students may think (and even repeat to their own students) Joe's counsel to historians to remember Rudyard Kipling's verse, "I keep six honest serving-men (they taught me all I knew)/ Their names are What and Why and When/ And How and Where and Who."

The unaccented but crucial word in that verse is "honest". The preoccupation of the medieval masters, at least as an ideal, was the pursuit of truth. This notion often surprises modern students, accustomed as they are to intellectual practices that privilege uncertainty, relativism, agnosticism, multiplicity in perspectives, and pragmatism. The words of the medieval masters, however, are clarion calls to their fellows: "he whose duty is to teach should not teach any-

thing against the truth" (45), "the Truth that leads to salvation" (216). The medieval masters could also name with conviction the routes to knowing truth: Grosseteste, Martin Pickavé reports, taught how to distinguish fact from opinion, how to factor in contingency, predestination, grace, disposition, free will, necessity, rationality and prophecy in the assessment of truth-values. The trope, borrowed from Macrobius, of the "Golden Chain" stretching from angels to inanimate objects and ranking them in a sequence of superiority and degeneration (happily, in some constructions placing evil angels below good men), provided but one means of evaluating the realities and truths of propositions, as Panti's explanation of the debates over it shows. Fishacre's appeal to it led him to reflect upon the understanding of complex entities possible for us and for God, as complexity increases in the less-known created forms; thus, concludes Fishacre, "all things are numbers, and all consist of numbers," and, as Long summarizes, "understanding and loving are not two actions in God, but one" (151).

Medieval ideas of truth, then, are no simple positivism. As noted earlier, the medieval masters shared a vision of the highest truth that they sought to see; that vision supported audacious enquiry into matters such as the Divine Will, the Divine Mind, and perfection itself, enquiries here recounted with various approaches by Andrée, Harkins, Pickavé, Panti, Long, Traver. Although supremely abstract, the absence of artifice and the integrity of their vision are evident in the often overlapping imagery the masters employed to try to explain how the abstractions actually operated. In a very real world, theology was a very real science. Among the most lovely explanations are those that use light and colour as the evidence for divine operations. Richard Rufus of Cornwall describes the passage of a ray of light from the sun striking an object at the same instant, or not, to explain the workings of God's essence; Fishacre describes the different properties of "rays emanating from the same star" as they reach nearer and more distant points (148). As Pickavé paraphrases Grosseteste, "... grace and free choice behave like light and colour. When sunlight shines through coloured glass the effect on an illuminated body can be called either a coloured glimmer or a glimmering colour. The point is that both the sunlight and the colour of the glass are simultaneous and joint causes of the entire effect and that they have produced it together in one work, namely through the light ray emerging from the coloured glass. If this is how grace and free choice interact, grace does not take away from the efficaciousness of human free choice, but rather promotes it" (81).

In such expositions are beauty and an understanding of the relation between God and the soul. The transformation of that learning into love lies

in the extension of knowledge of order, virtue, grace, mercy, and freedom into relations with others, in order to bring truth and justice. Truth is the necessary foundation for justice, as the medieval masters knew. The *De instructione et consolatione novitiorum,* composed by a Dominican master of novices, which had at one point prescribed the mental exercise of envisioning a cloister as a figurative compound for spiritual discipline, later returns to that imagined cloister for a second circuit, this time to learn comportment in the presence of others. "A friar's every action should reflect the laws of justice," explains Mulchahey, "… the obligation to behave justly towards himself, to act justly in his relationship with God, justly to his neighbour, and justly with regard to the proper order of the activity itself" (216). In the fourteenth century, Nighman demonstrates, arbitration of truth and wisdom had become so engrained in academic practice that an author could confidently claim for himself the authority to act as arbiter. Yet, as Nighman explains, that authority was still framed in the context of the chain of being: truth came from the Holy Spirit. This interest in truth and justice persisted: Juan Alfonso de Benavente, the author of the treatise on teaching and learning discussed by Kimberly Rivers, "thinks one should study law not in order to acquire riches or vainglory but in order to be edified and to edify others, to defend the poor in court lest they be oppressed, and to know truth and justice" (272). A charming practice he commends to students is to keep a little notebook of *sententiae* that resonate for them; the notebook is called the "book of truths" (288).

One sees in all these masters, in the schools where they taught, and in the learning they propounded, a fierce engagement with their craft and the art that infused their lives, and a preservation of core beliefs. Catching a whiff of Grosseteste, Cecilia Panti finds in the "little question" probed by Ralph Hegham "a fresh and joyful outlook on life, a hymn to the dignity of being alive and being human" (105). Perhaps more than anyone, the preachers, confessors, and judges of the later middle ages engaged the question of human dignity and human experience. The second section of this anthology shows "practical theology" becoming truly practical: a set of case studies explores how the knowledge of the schoolmen flowed into the streets, parish churches, and courts, thus touching the lives of men and women of every social status and profession.

II. *Pastors, Judges, and Administrators*

Masters were not insulated from affairs of state, nor from the great debates over the integration of the religious and secular spheres at the highest levels of

power. The catch-phrase "*libertas ecclesiae*" – the right to staff churches by means other than through appointments made by powerful laity – ran through eleventh-century Italy, discussed by Kate Cushing, to thirteenth-century England, as explained by Jason Taliadoros. Roman and canon law traditions emanating from the schools as a pan-European *ius commune* underpinned the doctrine of ecclesiastical liberty in even such a monument of royal law as Magna Carta, Taliadoros argues, pointing to the late twelfth-century *Liber pauperum* of Master Vacarius, written in the 1170s or 1180s, as an antecedent to ideas expressed in the Great Charter. Vacarius's likening the free election of bishops to freedom of choice and consent in marriage opened a simile that both set forth political theory and also affirmed the very practical, strenuously negotiated provisions of Magna Carta for protecting dowries, widows and orphans, debtors, and those with feudal obligations. From the accumulation of specific immunities in Magna Carta coalesced commitment to the rule of law, the right to resist tyranny, and the importance of procedure in the delivery of justice. Taliadoros shows how the texts and ideas that "originated in the schools, nascent universities, ecclesiastical households, and also the courts of Angevin England" found dissemination through men who were "not strictly speaking 'lawyers', yet [whose] careers and writings intersected with legal theory and practice" and also men who were "lawyers yet engaged in matters outside the strictly legal context" (384). Their opinions informed the courts of kings.

Also at the apex of political power, popes engaged in efforts to implement Christian ideals in monastic, mendicant, and episcopal settings, joining academic ideals and worldly practice. The role of the popes is signaled by Cushing's and John Ott's observations about the impact of Pope Leo IX (r. 1049–1054) on both monastic and secular clergy. As Ott shows in his analysis of the Council of Reims in 1049, where Leo presided, that influence could be remarkably direct, personal, and have wide-reaching effect, as stories that took shape around the figures at the council spread and were replicated in England as well as in northern France. Mark Johnson notes the importance of the decree of Pope Honorius IV that allowed Dominicans to preach, hear confessions, and assign penances anywhere, opening the diocesan borders to new religious traffic. Looming over the thirteenth century, of course, is Innocent III, in this anthology represented by the recognition given to the Fourth Lateran Council, over which Innocent presided, as a watershed. Generations of Joe's students learned to appreciate the breadth and depth of religious and social formation traceable to canon 21 of Lateran IV, prescribing universal confession of sins to parish priests, under the guarantee of the seal of secrecy, and annual reception of the Eucharist.

Joe showed his students and readers the enormous implications of the canon's opening words, "Omnis utriusque sexus fidelis … ." *Everyone* above the age of discretion was to have pastoral care, administered by more or less gifted priests. The mechanisms for providing such care had to operate on a massive scale, in a wide range of situations. The techniques for educating both ministers and recipients of pastoral care show both creativity and subtlety. As Marc Cels observes, "in the absence of a seminary system, parochial clergy were expected to keep and refer to copies of synodal statutes, some of which included penitential tracts, for practical instruction on administering confessions" (395). Cels directs attention to the statutes issued around 1218 by Richard Poore, bishop of Salisbury and former student of Paris masters, statutes that were reissued a decade later and borrowed by other English bishops, exemplifying one of the ways in which university-educated clergy shaped pastoral care at the parochial level. At about the same time, Paul of Hungary, a master of canon law at Bologna before entering the Dominican Order, composed a summa that, Mark Johnson proposes, could well have been used to prepare his *confrères* for their newly authorized roles as free-roaming preachers and confessors. Shortly after, a version appeared that stripped out the academic citations of the details of canon law, suggesting that the processes of popularizing and producing a text more efficiently in order to transfer its content to the streets had begun. The treatise *De faciebus mundi* of William of Auvergne, a former student and regent in theology at Paris before becoming bishop, also shows the energies of the early thirteenth-century clergy in transforming the ideals of Lateran IV into practical instructions for vivid preaching and instruction in penitential theology; as Winston Black notes, nearly a quarter of the treatise treats the topics of penance and contrition, confession, and satisfaction, shaped to serve different audiences, from the advanced students and masters to the parish priest.

The extent to which penitential piety suffused pastoral care, again at all levels of society, should not surprise, but the creativity and liveliness in its development may. Ott's description of the "semi-judicial" use of public confessions by Pope Leo to discipline simoniacs at the Council of Reims and the miraculous punishments for those who were not truthful shows the force of penitential practices in the mid-eleventh century. That force is also fully evident in Robert Grosseteste's letter to a clerical friend involved in an illicit sexual relationship, which Frank Mantello presents as "exhortations to repentance … rarely … equalled" (443), and which surely made readers besides the original recipient quiver. Bella Millett's Middle English preachers, represented in ser-

mon collections from the late twelfth and early thirteenth centuries, assisted in penitential education by offering a scheme of the correspondence of bodily pain to bodily sins, in which sins of the head were met with pains as of a crown of thorns, and so forth. Philip Slavin's Lollard preachers also helpfully supplied explanations linking penance to lived experience, in their use of agricultural metaphors for performing penance: sowing and reaping, ploughing and harrowing. Once William of Pagula's popular *Oculus sacerdotis* was published in the 1320s, as Siegfried Wenzel shows, a weight of tradition – from patristic writings, scholastic authors such as Peter Lombard, Alexander of Hales, and Thomas Aquinas, and the popular Golden Legend – was available for preachers and priests to mine for information about the Last Judgment and spiritual techniques to prepare for it, including confession and the *viaticum*. Even the late medieval English consistory courts, such as that of Ely, discussed by Charles Donahue, considered a penitential option in adjudicating cases of defamation.

In the intersection of pastoral care and judgment was an inherent tension, as Cels observes, between individual and social interests, and between the injunction to forgive and the need to seek justice. Cels' exploration of pastoral efforts to obtain reconciliation between parishioners in conflict, as would seem to be clearly prescribed in the scriptural passage read at the beginning of Lent, shows the ambiguous understanding of making peace. Greta Austin finds similar ambiguities and uncertainties threading through the texts drawn from Burchard of Worms that Ivo of Chartres cites as pertaining to the theory of just warfare, violence, and death from unnatural causes. Donahue's investigation of the defamation cases in the Ely register reveals the interest that "middling people" – bakers, leather-dressers, tailors, butchers, servants – had in claiming justice against the assaults on their reputations that were likely a result of community tensions. The Romano-canonical procedures used to address the dually civil and ecclesiastical offense of defamation tipped the process in the majority of cases toward settlements, a form of peace-making, even recorded as "pax." Ott notes the similarity in some respects of the Council of Reims to the "peace councils" of the eleventh century. Clearly, the vicissitudes of desires to attain peace and to find victory resisted simple and consistent applications of pastoral care, and show the very complexity of the pastoral project.

The same variety of situations, audiences, and clergy is evident in another area of pastoral care: preaching. Whereas Blake Beattie's canon lawyer was preaching in the context of a liturgy for the papal court at Avignon, Philip Slavin's Lollards were, he suggests, preaching accessible sermons in the vernacular to agricultural workers in rural parishes. Mark Johnson notes that the skill

of Reginald of Orléans, the Dominican who preached in Bologna before being sent to Paris, was so compelling that students and masters of the faculty of law flocked to enlist in the Order of Preachers. Bert Roest finds equal popularity among late medieval Franciscan preachers, whom he describes as "international stars," whose preaching constituted a form of "entertainment" through its use of theatrics, calumny, and satire; he observes that Rabelais was a former Franciscan, and that *Pantagruel* drew upon homiletic precedents. Looking to the sermon-writer Joe's extensive scholarship brought to light, William de Montibus, Bella Millett suggests that the Middle English preaching she discusses fulfilled "Hillbilly's" admonition that less learned priests could at least memorize written sermons to repeat to their flocks; the vernacular sermons bridged the gap between the more learned and less learned clergy. The awareness that medieval homilists had of different audiences, as well as different levels of skill among those preaching, is also discussed by Winston Black: the tropes prescribed in the *ars praedicandi* of William of Auvergne were developed to appeal to different occupations or experience, as when the rite of confession is likened variously to a medical examination, or a legal process, or the delivery of the accounts of an estate.

The art of preaching exemplifies the passage of the learning of the schools to the ministration of love: manuals for guiding preachers and sermons show scholastic methods for providing structure in a text, with divisions, distinctions, prothemes and themes, exempla and proofs. These traditions are evident, Millett demonstrates, in vernacular sermons that drew directly from Latin models. Preaching was far from static, however; the essays here show a range of experimentation in the effort to touch and educate. Slavin's study of English sermons, both Lollard and orthodox, proposes that preachers were both "theologiz[ing] the countryside" and developing a "ruralization of the Scriptures" (513) as they explored the language and imagery of the agricultural and pastoral environment. In a different vein, Johnson's study of Paul of Hungary's *Summa* shows how pastors might be instructed in the techniques learned in law school for assessing the moral gravity of various transgressions. Combining attention to audience and scholastic practices, William of Auvergne's treatise on rhetoric and preaching, *De faciebus mundi*, tells preachers that good sermons marry truth to understanding: like a marriage, the presence of "a large, faithful, and appreciative audience" strengthens the marriage; preachers should therefore bring "probable and relevant proofs, examples, and parables to marry the audience's understanding to evangelical truth with due solemnity and simplicity" (422). By the sixteenth century, scholastic conventions, while still

embedded in homiletic practices, also display adaptation to new, humanistic ideas for effective communication, especially under the influence of Erasmus's treatise (1535) on preaching.

The creative energy that these authors brought to their work bursts forth in the imagery they find, shape, refine, and test. Slavin's preachers, attuned to changing seasons and the cycle of planting and harvesting, knew that the grain of wheat must die before the green blade rises, and found in that metaphor the concise expression of loss and hope, death and life that Christian faith presents. Their appeal to the three-field system as an allegory for doctrine, used by both Lollards and Catholics, adds a startling new dimension to standard accounts of medieval technology. The metaphor of stony soil and the need to set the plough right in spiritual life evoke a smile among those who have heard Joe murmur about stony ground and seen his delight in the sight of a John Deere tractor. The optical expertise of the schools, noted above in Grosseteste's simile of light and grace, recurs in the sermons described by Slavin. William of Auvergne gives an exquisite explication of seeing through a glass darkly, "but then face to face" (1 Cor. 3:12): the mirror joins the face of our intellect to the face of God and the appearance of God, and our intellect, when fitted to the mirror that holds God's image, will reproduce the likeness clearly. The faces in the glass are the figures and images of the world that are signs to guide the faithful; the book of nature is filled with such signs. Grosseteste's letter to his erring friend, here edited and annotated by Mantello, also draws upon the phenomenon of reflection, in its cognitive sense, in his admonition to extinguish with the water of reflection "both the devil's sulphurous breath and the funeral pyre of lewdness" (447). The vivacity of Grosseteste's depiction of Rumour, who goes on a veritable rampage from earth to heaven, is matched by the vividness of the signs of the Last Judgement detailed by William of Pagula, summarized by Wenzel, as fire and a great voice initiate the series of eclipse, brightening moon, rising dead, and the appearance of accusers and witnesses before the glorified Christ with the instruments of his torture displayed. To prepare for the event, the early fifteenth-century preacher John Mirk, who drew at times upon Grosseteste's writings, counseled priests to recall the story of the archer and the nightingale, the bird who keeps itself awake "by placing its breast against a sharp thorn," the thorn of contemplating the torments of hell (467).

Counterpoised to the confrontations of human frailty, failures, danger, darkness, and damnation are the steadfast declarations of love. The intensity of Grosseteste's excoriation of his friend makes his assurance all the more compelling, when he tells his friend to know the love of Christ and of Christian

charity, a love that never fails. Slavin's preachers speak of the dew of charity; William of Auvergne thought charity was "the heat of life." The theme of the "new man," who emerges from the penitential process, threads through the works of these authors. Performing that love personally was essential to birthing the "new man," and the structured encounters provided in liturgies or speech acts of a council, as Ott's perspective on speech and silence illustrates, were sites of personal performance of devotional, ministerial, or disciplinary intentions framed in love.

The quest for interaction prompted advice to bring vibrancy to sermons by preaching them from memory, rather than reading them, as Millett notes; the scholastic exercises described by Rivers for memorizing material are paralleled by this recognition of the value of memorization for the pulpit. The desire to stir souls with fresh imagery and allegories brought the intellectual skills of scholars to the parishes and piazzas where preachers strove to keep faith burning. The third section of this collection moves to further exploration of the frameworks for performance, remembering, symbols and signification, and penitential growth in the communities of clergy and laity of all statuses who participated in Christian life.

III. *Liturgy, Piety, and Exempla*

As Joe has argued, spiritual education reached medieval Christians largely through social practice, as Pamela Beattie reminds us, or, as Jennifer Carpenter puts it, through "a lived reality, rather than a formal theology" (651). Social practice engaged the heart, mind, and body, in order to guide the soul. Processions, for example, were an opportunity for active participation in rehearsing historical, devotional, and somatic knowledge of Christian belief: Richard Gyug shows us the processions of the two separate communities of monks around Montecassino, who met for a shared meal and liturgies on the third day of Easter, and also the processions for the translations of relics, with spectacular floats, or for papal elections, with musicians and decorated streets; Andrew Reeves describes the assemblies of the faithful, often deliberately including the poor and vulnerable, processing at many sites throughout Europe on Palm Sunday, while singing and waving branches to commemorate Christ's entry into Jerusalem and the beginning of Holy Week. What is noteworthy is how thoroughly, and with what shrewdness and subtlety, medieval writers examined and understood the significance and effects of such participation. Social practice was both performed and theorized.

Central to the understanding of spiritual processes was medieval appreciation of memory and its workings. Anticipating current scholarship on memory and its relation to the needs of the present, medieval authors reflected on the familiar yet mysterious use of repositories of memory, acts of remembering, and commemorative performances in orienting and moving humans to the desired love of God. Just as scholastics developed mnemonic devices for mastering academic material, as noted above, so did performers have mnemonic tools. Stephan Dusil and Katherine Hill suggest that the neumes in a manuscript of canon law that has an embedded liturgy for visiting the sick indicate use by a community with such a large repertoire of music to be mastered that visual cues were needed to remind the singers of the vocal patterns of the melodies. Readers of this anthology will find in their essay a line of music that can be sung! Numbers helped to organize knowledge of the virtues and vices, the commandments, and the sacraments. Embedded in the sweeping romance written by Ramon Llull to edify potential penitents, Pamela Beattie observes, are frequent uses of mnemonic numeration: seven sins, seven virtues; three powers of the soul; the fifteen duties of the cardinal bishops accorded with the fifteen verses of the Gloria. Llull sometimes combined numbered lists with spatial images; his description of a fair palace with the Ten Commandments inscribed on the doors, with personifications inside, exemplifies the scholastic practice of constructing a memory palace, while situating it in a popular literary form.

Mnemonic devices were not only practical and instrumental in their didactic and pedagogic aims, but often designed to plumb the deep structures of memory. The branches waved in the Palm Sunday processions, as Christian authors read them, had scriptural associations rich in anticipatory memories: they were typological figurations of the olive branch that signalled the end of the Flood; or the psalm's fruitful olive tree in the house of God, in the words of William Peraldus (another author well-studied by Joe); or the palms of victory in a triumphal *adventus* celebrating victory over sin, as expounded in the processional liturgy for the cathedral of Notre Dame in Paris. These were conscious ploys in memory-making. Ramon Llull knew that the three powers of the soul were memory, understanding, and will; hence, directing the soul entailed directing memory. Albertus Magnus, points out Robert Sweetman, identified the intentional use of memory as one of the distinctions between humans and animals: animals have memory, but only humans recollect, and investigate meaning through recollection. It is through the calm processes of memorial contemplation that humans perceive "the wonderful and the imitable" (642).

Deliberate and willing manipulation of mental faculties to connect real and tangible experience to religious knowledge opened a vast arena of somatic participation in piety. Performance was not the singular domain of preachers and teachers; faith could be physically manifested in any human body. The metaphors for religious significance transcended ornamentation or analogy, and became incarnate in the very elements of the human physique, such as blood, and the heart through which the blood courses. In those substances could be discerned what Jennifer Carpenter calls "embodied grace" (647). Carpenter and Sweetman describe a veritable hydraulic system of somatic soulfulness, in which, for Carpenter, the liquidity of grace – grace which flows, imbues, inundates – can exert such pressure when it wells up that the heart is moved to desire, or, for Sweetman, the pressure on the heart of memorial suggestion arouses "spiritual irascibility and concupiscence" (631). The emotions that are set in motion by such pressures find expression in laughter and, most prominently, tears.

In a number of the essays, the expression of emotion through tears is so powerful that it becomes an essential part of the sacrament of penance. As Sean Otto explains, traditions about the repentance of Mary Magdalen, known as the quintessential sinner redeemed, focus on her tears as proof of contrition, to the point that for Geoffrey of Vendôme, the tears sufficed sacramentally, without the rite of auricular confession to a priest: "In all cases, prayers expressed by tears are better than those expressed by words" (724 n26). Tears validated the "amendment of hearts" identified throughout these essays as the central objective of pastoral care, and were part of the answer to the question investigated by Pamela Beattie: how does one actually turn toward the love of God? Her analysis of Llull's novel shows that the depictions of a penitential life for each level of society were linked by the prominent imagery of tears, expressing the reciprocal motions (and emotions) of contrition and forgiveness, and also replicating baptismal cleansing. For Llull, as Beattie explains, tears were a precondition for love, and for the union of the lover and the beloved. The relationship was complex: when the Beloved judged, the lover wept, before the Beloved re-created glory for the lover, so that, as Jacopone da Todi put it, "A new creature is born in Christ: / I hasten to put on the new man …" (687). The effusion of tears had meaning because, as Carpenter demonstrates, the container of the human body held together the physical and the spiritual: fleshly organs, such as the heart, and their abstract correlatives, such as the soul, and the divine gift of grace.

Explanations of doctrine that drew upon descriptions of dynamic processes, such as biological conditions and emotional expression, stressed the

importance of movement in spiritual life: the stirring of the soul was essential to its transformation for the better. The intended effect of the Palm Sunday liturgies described by Reeves, with their processional movement, was to instigate an internal passage from sin to righteousness, and to bring hearts nearer to God. Their resonance with the movements of the Hebrews crossing the Jordan to approach the Promised Land aligned them with the medieval practice of pilgrimage as a movement, in which progression through geographical spaces is linked to the soul's progression toward love of God. Filled with transformations and spiritual adventures, Ramon Llull's *Book of the Lover and the Beloved* presents as a romance the ideal penitential life, the product, Pamela Beattie notes, of the author's own pilgrimages to Rocamadour and Compostela as well as his academic studies in Cistercian and Dominican communities. The place of Rocamadour in medieval sacred geography is echoed in a story noted by Kristen Allen, in which the Virgin of Rocamadour answers the prayers of a gambler who has lost his church. Like Llull's romance, Dante's *Commedia*, here studied by Allen, uses the figure of a traveller to explore spiritual transformation and its surprises: Llull's penitent advances through his tears to the home with his beloved God; Allen's comedic gambler, whose soul hung upon the ministry of Fortune, might find either despair or a joyful *theologia ludens*.

Joe's approach to medieval romances and stories, shown in his book *The Virgin and the Grail: Origins of a Legend* (2005), is to show how stories are part of the social practices binding communities. As Sweetman explains, thirteenth-century Dominicans had grasped that while authorities – with their academic divisions, distinctions, causes, effects, and reasons – give access to content, stories move the heart of the learner, and conserve trustworthy, communal experience. Stories, or *exempla*, are remembered, and show deeds and figures that can be examined by the teller and the listener in an equalized relationship. Use of particulars, rather than abstractions, opens gates of inventiveness and local connection to larger histories and views. As they are told and retold, the dynamism of lived experience informs their meanings, which flow in sometimes diverging streams or form different layers of tradition.

These processes are evident in the studies of Mairi Cowan on the Life of St Kentigern and David Winter on the story of Becket's "faithless wolves." Not coincidentally, both examples come from Celtic areas in uneasy cultural relationships with their dominating Anglo-Norman neighbours. As their stories were told and retold, the forms and possible meanings of those stories shifted; as Winter observes, meaning depends not only on the performance, but also on the audience. In the late twelfth century, when Jocelin of Furness was com-

missioned to write a Life of the Scottish St Kentigern, there were not only both oral and written tales already circulating, but also a complex context of Cistercian devotion to the Virgin Mary, in addition to political efforts to assert either the independence or dependence of Glasgow on the See of York. Negotiating the expectations of the Glaswegian audience and external expectations or stances, Cowan argues, Jocelin produced a finely-tuned and sometimes oddly-tuned text. Similarly, the tale of Becket's wolves touched upon complicated issues of Welsh identity, the stereotypes of the Welsh propagated by outsiders, and the tensions of militarized borderlands in the late twelfth and early thirteenth centuries.

Winter's reading of the *exemplum* of Becket's wolves, who perform penance in a "forest discipline" for having killed members of their own species when loyally serving under Becket's command, raises the point that political and social conflict "spill[s] over into ... intellectual and devotional worlds" (609). The inventiveness of story-tellers, chroniclers, and designers of liturgical events was not merely for elegance and entertainment. Lived experience and social practice incorporated frictions within communities, institutions, kingdoms. Perhaps especially because histories and liturgies brought together people of different status and allegiances, discerning their place in the context of Christian ideals evoked rich and sometimes subtle solutions. The gestures and rituals recorded in chronicles, argues Richard Gyug, show how political and social relations could be expressed in somatic signs, as when lay lords and monastic associates processed together in an *adventus*, or when a chronicler described how Charlemagne prostrated himself before the cross, kissed the feet of the monks of San Vincenzo and was admonished by them about "the service of God, the love of justice, [and] the defence of churches" (564). Winter finds in the *exemplum* of the wolves an ambivalent exploration of strategies for enduring colonial rule. The invocation of penance, he proposes, was intended to heal the deep wounds of dislocation, degradation, and internecine violence.

Sometimes a story or trope is vigorously re-interpreted to support a polemical stance, as when the contrition of Mary Magdalen was adduced to refute the validity of auricular confession to an ordained priest, as Otto shows in his study of Wyclif's preaching on penance. By tracing the long history of changing elaborations of the story of the Magdalen, Otto reveals how the seams of tradition could be opened to insert interpretations that conveyed particular doctrinal stances. Even the metaphors for understanding doctrine shift according to social context: Carpenter draws attention to the introduction of similes explaining grace as money, with attendant metaphors of guarding, gaining,

secretly hoarding, and using in transactions, in the midst of the commercialism of the Low Countries in the thirteenth century. The pressure of that commercialism on pastoral activity also created, especially among Franciscans, an anxiety over wealth and poverty that found expression in the *lauda* (described by Pamela Beattie as "a kind of popular counterpart to the solemn liturgical hymns of the church") of Jacopone, when he sang that the bread of the Eucharist had among its functions to bring communicants closer to their neighbours (686). That same anxiety, seen through a different lens, animates Dante's gamblers, whose financial security hangs in the balance, and whose losses may lead to spiritual despair as well as material deficits. In a twist on Boethius's representation of Fortuna, Dante's figure of Fortune, as God's minister, impartially – even arbitrarily – distributes wealth and power to those who engage without care for monetary gain in their games. The continuity of mendicant theology in the *Commedia*, Beattie suggests, was "the culmination of the process of exploring theology in poetry begun by St Francis" (689).

Such evolution in the details and directions of extra-scriptural narratives and metaphors shows, even if indirectly, popular participation in the formation of religious tradition, in the context of social, political, and personal experiences. Sweetman thinks that Etienne de Bourbon left open the question of whether edifying *exempla* were lived or narrated, but the very question shows how narrow the space between experience and understanding seemed to Etienne. Participation in a life of devotion, participation in liturgy, participation in narration of signs and wonders, participation in contemplation all contributed to a collective understanding of tradition and truth. For Sweetman's Dominicans, *exempla* found their way into the heart, where *admiratio* could turn into *imitatio*, and *bona conversatio* became contagious.

Among the touchstones of devotion for both the learned and the less learned were the accounts of the appearances of the Virgin Mary. Llull dedicated a major section of his novel to the *Ave Maria* prayer, prescribing each phrase as a focal point for meditation, enriched with *exempla* describing the Virgin's miracles. As another instance of attaching tradition to contemporary concerns, Llull reads the fruit of Mary's womb as a reference to the schools for missionaries, who should learn foreign languages there. The Life of the mystic Lutgard of Aywières composed by the Dominican Thomas of Cantimpré reports that the Virgin assured Lutgard that grace would "accumulate from day to day" in her, as a valuable commodity (654). In keeping with the objections of Thomas of Cantimpré to dice-playing, other authors presented *exempla* of gamblers who defamed the Virgin and suffered the consequences, although, in

a charming exemption, the image in a church of the Virgin bowed every time a gambler who had refused to deny her passed by. In a remarkable example of *admiratio* turning to *imitatio*, the Life of Kentigern explains that because of her intense devotion to the Virgin and her faith that Christ's conception was miraculous, Kentigern's mother thought that she had conceived Kentigern miraculously and as a virgin.

The intersections between lay piety, popular traditions, organized missions, institutional interests, and the learning of the schools were so numerous and extensive that, as Reeves and Beattie note, commonly-held notions that the laity had only a passive role in medieval liturgy, or that "popular" and "clerical" culture were quite distinct, are demonstrably false. The evidence in some manuscripts of the *Decretum* of Burchard, bishop of Worms, the collection of 1785 canons compiled to set legal norms in his diocese, attests to the symbiosis of the needs and desires of the laity and the responses of the clergy: the neumes Dusil and Hill report are in the portion of the *Decretum* for ministry to the sick and dying. The music to be quickly recalled and performed would have been sung in the home of the afflicted, where the priest would have blessed the house, sung psalms and the litany, given the opportunity for confession, and administered the *viaticum*. Here was a liturgy held in the intimacy of domestic space. The common experience of liturgies integrated secular and religious spheres in other ways, as well. Liturgical language and references permeate the accounts of chroniclers, as Gyug shows, because liturgy and history were so conceptually intertwined that each was framed in the mode of the other. Liturgies, stories, and devotional practices were forms of learning that wove together beloved images and memories to touch affectively the souls to be moved.

These intersecting spheres of activity and interest have consistently been at the heart of Joe's teaching and scholarship. In *William de Montibus (c. 1140–1213): The Schools and the Literature of Pastoral Care* (1992), as in other studies, Joe offered seminal observations and a framework for examining the connection of the schools to pastoral ministry. The conclusions of Reeves and Beattie affirm Joe's suggestion that "[p]erhaps we can imagine 'learned' and 'popular' religion not as two separate and distinct categories but as the two ends of a spectrum" (x). It was also the "practical aspect of scholasticism" that Joe signaled as "beginning to receive its due" (40) and that he explained by showing how the texts composed by masters to guide their students engendered not only new genres of scholastic texts, but also an enormous outburst of new texts for pastoral instruction in preaching, catechizing, administering the sacraments, and hearing con-

fessions and assigning penances. Techniques for organizing and committing to memory essential points of doctrine are adumbrated in Joe's discussion of the *summa* of Thomas Chobham, which synthesized theology, canon law, and local legislation into "one of the most accessible works of practical theology produced in the Middle Ages" (83). Chobham used the figure of the Ten Commandments as a device for thinking about the vices and virtues, and correlated them to the ten plagues of Egypt, to help priests make their decisions in cases of conscience. In his presentation of Richard of Wetheringsett's *Summa Qui bene presunt*, Joe directed us to the transmission of authoritative teaching known from the schools "under the guise of a guide for preaching" (86). Richard, like authors discussed in this volume, used "distinctions, similitudes, *exempla*, and mnemonic verses" (91).

Authors and compilers such as Thomas Chobham and Richard of Wetheringsett, argued Joe, represented a body of schoolmen and pastors who made tangible and practicable the prescriptions of the Fourth Lateran Council. Those prescriptions were "but reflections of a widely felt and inchoate desire to apply the fruits of contemporary scholarship to the pastoral care of souls" (94). By looking at the works of the masters who wrote prior to the Fourth Lateran Council, such as Peter the Chanter and William de Montibus, and those who wrote after the Council, such as Thomas and Richard, and their successors over the centuries, such as William of Pagula, we can trace an arc of entwined intellectual, social, and cultural history. The role that clergy played in ecclesiastical courts and in shaping legal principles also brought into society the teachings of the schools, for, as Joe observed, a bishop such as Hugh of Lincoln thought that without highly educated assistants, a bishop would be seriously hindered in his obligation to deliver justice in his court.

From a variety of sites and pens, therefore, flowed the poems, treatises, statutes, judgments, commentaries, *summae*, *exempla*, and letters that the authors explore in this collection, to carry forward Joe's ideas and to look back to his work. Joe wrote that "[t]he popularization of learned theology, and the extension of this learning to those who lacked the interest or the opportunity to pursue a long and arduous course of study in the schools, deserves careful investigation" (57). We trust that the essays in this volume show how intently his students and colleagues have noted that counsel. He has encouraged us all to consider, with honest curiosity, the ways in which medieval education and pastoral care touched everything else: it does make sense to put grace and money in the same sentence, and colonial dominion and penance, and the Virgin and gambling, and music and memory. As he wrote of William de Montibus,

"William was thought to have imitated the bees in drawing raw materials from diverse fields and transforming these into delightful nourishment stored in the honeycombs of his treatises" (xii). Joe has laid essential foundations for our understanding of the myriad ways in which the work of the schoolmen passed into the hands and minds of pastors, and thence into the hearts of the laity, to then be poured into stories and traditions that made their way to the pastors and schoolmen, in an ever-swirling dance of ideas, memories, and will. The present volume shows how right he was. We and the contributors offer it in sincere appreciation of his learning, so generously shared, and with our love.

THE EDITORS